

WEBVTT

NOTE duration:"01:30:06"

NOTE recognizability:0.841

NOTE language:en-us

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:02.190 --> 00:00:04.030 Well, welcome to the kickoff

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:04.030 --> 00:00:06.180 session for this academic year of

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:06.180 --> 00:00:07.730 the Evening Ethics Seminar series

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:07.730 --> 00:00:09.693 for the program for about medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:09.693 --> 00:00:11.685 ethics at Yale School of Medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:11.690 --> 00:00:12.910 My name is Mark Mercurio.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:12.910 --> 00:00:15.158 I'm the director of the program and on

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:15.158 --> 00:00:17.359 behalf of Sarah Hall and Jack Hughes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:17.360 --> 00:00:19.088 our associate directors, and Karen Colby,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:19.090 --> 00:00:20.910 our manager, I welcome you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:20.910 --> 00:00:23.448 I'm delighted that you're here tonight.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:23.450 --> 00:00:25.130 The program for Biomedical Ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:25.130 --> 00:00:26.090 as many of you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:26.090 --> 00:00:28.110 but I know many of you are also knew this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:28.164 --> 00:00:30.089 twice a month during the academic year,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:30.090 --> 00:00:32.118 and we have evening ethics seminars.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:32.120 --> 00:00:34.136 We share this space, if you will,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:34.140 --> 00:00:36.438 with the with the Yale Pediatric  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:36.438 --> 00:00:38.494 ethics program and various one group  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:38.494 --> 00:00:40.420 or the other sponsors these seminars.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:40.420 --> 00:00:41.878 It doesn't much matter to you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:41.880 --> 00:00:45.814 You can find the the schedule on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:45.820 --> 00:00:47.412 biomedicaethics@yale.edu and of course  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:47.412 --> 00:00:50.830 we have a wide mailing list and we send  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:50.830 --> 00:00:53.077 out notifications of these things as well.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:53.080 --> 00:00:56.048 And you're cordially invited to attend as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:56.048 --> 00:00:59.758 many as your schedule and interest dictate.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:00:59.760 --> 00:01:02.250 There has.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:02.250 --> 00:01:03.630 It's been an amazing summer.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:03.630 --> 00:01:05.814 Much has happened in the few months

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:05.814 --> 00:01:08.210 that we were off offline with the

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:08.210 --> 00:01:09.670 program for biomedical ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:09.670 --> 00:01:10.670 And as I think everybody

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:10.670 --> 00:01:11.670 on this call is aware,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:11.670 --> 00:01:12.408 of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:12.408 --> 00:01:14.991 the the jobs decision by the US

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:14.991 --> 00:01:16.803 Supreme Court has had tremendous

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:16.803 --> 00:01:18.458 impact and implication and has

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:18.458 --> 00:01:20.489 led to widespread discussion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:20.490 --> 00:01:23.106 including a series of seminars and

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:23.106 --> 00:01:25.790 webinars here at Yale University.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:25.790 --> 00:01:27.870 My friend Katie Cashell over

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:27.870 --> 00:01:29.534 at the law school.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:29.540 --> 00:01:31.772 Has been one of the major players in

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:31.772 --> 00:01:33.849 putting all of this together as well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:33.850 --> 00:01:36.006 and she's one of our speakers tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:36.010 --> 00:01:39.022 There have been sessions that focused  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:39.022 --> 00:01:42.057 on how this decision is going to what,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:42.057 --> 00:01:44.206 what the legal nuances of this are,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:44.210 --> 00:01:45.488 what the influence this is going  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:45.488 --> 00:01:47.290 to be on the medical profession,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:47.290 --> 00:01:49.144 what this is going to do for public health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:49.150 --> 00:01:50.480 There's all sorts of different  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:50.480 --> 00:01:52.210 discussions that have been had tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:52.210 --> 00:01:52.585 Specifically,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:52.585 --> 00:01:54.835 what we're going to try and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:54.835 --> 00:01:56.869 focus on are the ethical,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:56.870 --> 00:01:59.822 ethical issues at work as well as the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:01:59.822 --> 00:02:01.589 ethical implications of this and so.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:01.590 --> 00:02:04.608 Tonight's session on the ethics of

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:04.608 --> 00:02:07.549 abortion and abortion law is really.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:07.550 --> 00:02:09.475 Focused as to some extent on the

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:09.475 --> 00:02:11.119 Dobbs decision and on Roe V Wade,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:11.120 --> 00:02:12.590 which is of course been overturned,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:12.590 --> 00:02:15.145 but also on the question of abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:15.150 --> 00:02:17.185 which has plagued ethicists for

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:17.185 --> 00:02:19.897 as long as ethicists have been

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:19.897 --> 00:02:22.306 having conversations over many,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:22.306 --> 00:02:24.130 many, many years.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:24.130 --> 00:02:24.620 I have.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:24.620 --> 00:02:25.110 I'm very,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:25.110 --> 00:02:26.933 very pleased with the Group of people

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:26.933 --> 00:02:28.685 we were able to assemble tonight,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:28.690 --> 00:02:29.812 and I'm going to introduce them

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:29.812 --> 00:02:31.464 to you one at a time to let you

NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:31.464 --> 00:02:32.570 know how the night will work.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:32.570 --> 00:02:34.850 We have 4 speakers tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:34.850 --> 00:02:37.874 Each will speak for roughly 10 to 15 minutes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:37.880 --> 00:02:41.984 And then at about 6:00 o'clock or so,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:41.990 --> 00:02:43.682 the speakers will finish and then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:43.682 --> 00:02:45.435 I will moderate a Q&A session  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:45.435 --> 00:02:47.409 and I invite you to send your  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:47.409 --> 00:02:48.931 questions or comments in through  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:48.931 --> 00:02:50.406 the Q&A function on zoom.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.886840163

00:02:50.410 --> 00:02:53.410 I'll then read the questions to the panelists  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:02:53.410 --> 00:02:55.846 at 6:30. I will wrap it up.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:02:55.850 --> 00:02:56.522 So if you're wondering  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:02:56.522 --> 00:02:57.530 how long does this go on,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:02:57.530 --> 00:03:00.750 it goes on until 6:30 and then we will stop.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:00.750 --> 00:03:02.619 So I apologize, I know in advance  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:02.619 --> 00:03:04.532 because I know many of you won't

NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:04.532 --> 00:03:06.330 be able to get your questions in.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:06.330 --> 00:03:07.968 I expect it's going to be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:07.968 --> 00:03:08.787 a great presentation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:08.790 --> 00:03:10.262 Word rate presentations followed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:10.262 --> 00:03:12.102 by a very interesting discussion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:12.110 --> 00:03:14.287 so let me get right to it,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:14.290 --> 00:03:16.000 please, by starting out to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:16.000 --> 00:03:17.710 introduce my friend and colleague,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:17.710 --> 00:03:18.715 attorney Katie Kraschel,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:18.715 --> 00:03:20.725 who is the Executive director of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:20.725 --> 00:03:22.540 the Salomon Center for Health Law  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:22.540 --> 00:03:24.410 and Policy at Yale Law School,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:24.410 --> 00:03:26.930 where she also Co teaches the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:26.930 --> 00:03:28.610 reproductive rights and Justice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857  
00:03:28.686 --> 00:03:29.720 Project Clinic.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:29.720 --> 00:03:31.605 Katie Scholarship focuses on the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:31.605 --> 00:03:32.736 intersection of reproduction,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:32.740 --> 00:03:35.720 gender, bioethics, and health policy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:35.720 --> 00:03:38.024 She holds a bachelor's degree in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:38.024 --> 00:03:39.560 biochemistry from Mount Holyoke  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:39.620 --> 00:03:41.576 College and a law degree from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:41.576 --> 00:03:42.554 Harvard Law School.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:42.560 --> 00:03:44.725 She also completed Harvard Law  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:44.725 --> 00:03:46.457 School's Fellowship in bioethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:46.460 --> 00:03:48.091 And Katie has been a long standing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:48.091 --> 00:03:50.298 friend of the program for biomedical ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:50.300 --> 00:03:51.330 And we're delighted you could  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:51.330 --> 00:03:52.395 join us again tonight, Katie.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:52.395 --> 00:03:53.100 And with that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:53.100 --> 00:03:54.510 I will turn this over to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885772257142857

00:03:54.563 --> 00:03:55.790 attorney Katie Kraschel.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856159828571428  
00:03:57.730 --> 00:03:58.894 Thanks mark. It's always a pleasure  
NOTE Confidence: 0.856159828571428  
00:03:58.894 --> 00:04:00.649 to get to be part of the discussion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.856159828571428  
00:04:00.650 --> 00:04:02.670 I'm going to go ahead  
NOTE Confidence: 0.856159828571428  
00:04:02.670 --> 00:04:05.450 and share my screen here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.856159828571428  
00:04:05.450 --> 00:04:09.170 Hopefully this will run smoothly.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.856159828571428  
00:04:09.170 --> 00:04:12.215 Can you all see my the screen?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.856159828571428  
00:04:12.220 --> 00:04:13.170 Mark, can you see it?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9120194533333333  
00:04:15.830 --> 00:04:16.916 Yes, ma'am, we can see it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:04:17.030 --> 00:04:18.287 OK, great, excellent.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:04:18.287 --> 00:04:22.469 So I will try to be brief this evening.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:04:22.470 --> 00:04:24.423 Many of you who have been part of this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:04:24.423 --> 00:04:26.093 series have heard from me previously  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:04:26.093 --> 00:04:28.091 and I'm really excited about the other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:04:28.091 --> 00:04:30.002 speakers that you'll get to hear tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:04:30.010 --> 00:04:32.354 Just my sort of boring disclaimers that I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:32.354 --> 00:04:34.690 provide at the beginning of the of talks,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:34.690 --> 00:04:37.266 especially on this topic that I wear a

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:37.266 --> 00:04:40.350 lot of different hats at the law school,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:40.350 --> 00:04:43.430 at the within the university and in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:43.430 --> 00:04:45.809 community and just want to clarify.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:45.810 --> 00:04:48.792 That the views that I share in

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:48.792 --> 00:04:50.759 the presentation is my own.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:50.760 --> 00:04:54.638 OK, so today I I'm my first.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:54.640 --> 00:04:56.638 My charge today is sort of to set up,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:56.640 --> 00:04:58.476 set the stage for the discussion

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:04:58.476 --> 00:05:01.185 and to provide a brief overview of

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:05:01.185 --> 00:05:03.077 the bioethical under underpinnings.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:05:03.080 --> 00:05:03.562 Specifically,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:05:03.562 --> 00:05:06.936 I'll focus on the two major precedential

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:05:06.936 --> 00:05:09.839 cases that were overturned in Dobbs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667

00:05:09.840 --> 00:05:11.980 Roe V Wade and Casey.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:11.980 --> 00:05:14.584 And I'll describe what many people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:14.584 --> 00:05:17.054 thought the court might do in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:17.054 --> 00:05:19.357 jobs that would respond to many of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:19.357 --> 00:05:21.860 the criticisms of the reasoning.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:21.860 --> 00:05:25.135 Or the ethical reasoning that underlie  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:25.135 --> 00:05:27.895 a lot of the reasoning in those cases.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:27.900 --> 00:05:30.126 And then I'll touch on what the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:30.126 --> 00:05:31.900 court ultimately said in Dobbs,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:31.900 --> 00:05:34.540 and what it tells us about the legal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:34.540 --> 00:05:36.513 terrain and the ongoing ethical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:36.513 --> 00:05:38.578 debates that we're in today,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:38.580 --> 00:05:40.638 and how we consider the earliest  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:40.638 --> 00:05:42.957 stages of life and the bodily  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788533929166667  
00:05:42.957 --> 00:05:44.705 autonomy of pregnant people.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222  
00:05:47.490 --> 00:05:49.690 And and so at first,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:05:49.690 --> 00:05:52.287 I start here with the Dobbs decision.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:05:52.290 --> 00:05:53.970 This is what, as Mark mentioned,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:05:53.970 --> 00:05:55.590 what brings us here today.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:05:55.590 --> 00:05:57.460 And as you can see,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:05:57.460 --> 00:05:59.350 the court held that the US  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:05:59.350 --> 00:06:00.610 Constitution does not confer  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:06:00.673 --> 00:06:02.275 a right to abortion and that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4838505222

00:06:02.280 --> 00:06:04.120 it overruled Roe and Casey.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9263482475

00:06:05.630 --> 00:06:06.538 So first, let's go  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:06.550 --> 00:06:10.123 back to 1973, when the court held  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:10.123 --> 00:06:12.481 that the US constitutions right to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:12.481 --> 00:06:15.526 privacy found in the 9th and 14th  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:15.526 --> 00:06:17.322 amendments encompassed a women's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:17.322 --> 00:06:19.663 right decision to end pregnancy and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:19.663 --> 00:06:22.860 how that the ban on abortion at stake  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:22.860 --> 00:06:25.685 in that case was unconstitutional.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:25.690 --> 00:06:27.531 In Roe. The court was very careful

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:27.531 --> 00:06:29.527 to note that the right to abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:29.527 --> 00:06:31.659 was not absolute and that the state's

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:31.659 --> 00:06:33.454 interest and potential life must

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:33.454 --> 00:06:35.368 be balanced against the pregnant

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:35.368 --> 00:06:37.280 persons interest in autonomy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:37.280 --> 00:06:40.448 Equality and bodily integrity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:40.450 --> 00:06:42.550 In its most simple framing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:42.550 --> 00:06:44.310 the bioethical debate about abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:44.310 --> 00:06:46.666 in the United States and in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:46.666 --> 00:06:48.528 Supreme Court has long been a debate

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:48.528 --> 00:06:50.560 of balancing these two interests

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:50.560 --> 00:06:52.268 the individual persons interest

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:52.268 --> 00:06:54.794 and deciding their fate of their

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:54.794 --> 00:06:57.290 body and deciding whether or not

NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:06:57.376 --> 00:07:00.112 to remain pregnant against the the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:07:00.112 --> 00:07:02.983 stated interest of the state in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:07:02.983 --> 00:07:05.383 protecting life wherever the state  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91353904

00:07:05.383 --> 00:07:07.898 would argue that interest would begin.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:11.350 --> 00:07:13.554 So subsequently, in 1992,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:13.554 --> 00:07:15.758 the Supreme Court decided  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:15.758 --> 00:07:17.350 another abortion case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:17.350 --> 00:07:18.714 Planned Parenthood V Casey,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:18.714 --> 00:07:20.419 often just referred to in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:20.419 --> 00:07:22.750 shorthand as Casey, that held up.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:22.750 --> 00:07:25.494 It upheld rose right to abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:25.494 --> 00:07:28.062 as found specifically in the 14th  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:28.062 --> 00:07:30.149 amendment of the US Constitution,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:30.150 --> 00:07:32.646 due process clause, and a doctor.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:32.650 --> 00:07:35.940 And it adopted a standard relying on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091

00:07:35.940 --> 00:07:38.014 viability that pregnancy that states

NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:38.014 --> 00:07:40.420 can't impose an undue burden on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:40.496 --> 00:07:42.920 the right to terminate a pregnancy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:42.920 --> 00:07:44.865 Such that complete bans on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:44.865 --> 00:07:46.810 abortion before viability were an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:46.883 --> 00:07:49.219 unconstitutional infringement on rights  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:49.219 --> 00:07:51.555 articulated in the Constitution.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:51.560 --> 00:07:52.916 As the court said,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:52.916 --> 00:07:54.611 viability marks the earliest point  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:54.611 --> 00:07:57.126 at which the state's interest and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:57.126 --> 00:07:58.818 fetal life is constitutionally  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:07:58.818 --> 00:08:00.869 adequate to justify a legislative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855560740909091  
00:08:00.869 --> 00:08:02.819 ban on non therapeutic abortions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385  
00:08:05.390 --> 00:08:08.009 So to bring it back to where we were  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385  
00:08:08.009 --> 00:08:10.486 in that in Casey, as I mentioned,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385  
00:08:10.486 --> 00:08:12.950 the court found that the 14th amendment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:13.020 --> 00:08:14.940 of the Constitution is sort of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:14.940 --> 00:08:17.249 where this right to abortion lives,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:17.250 --> 00:08:18.506 specifically in the substantive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:18.506 --> 00:08:19.448 due process clause,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:19.450 --> 00:08:22.546 which I have highlighted here on my slide.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:22.550 --> 00:08:24.580 So this is where there's been a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:24.580 --> 00:08:26.930 lot of debate about whether or not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:26.930 --> 00:08:29.054 the right to abortion really lives  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:29.123 --> 00:08:30.858 in the US Constitution and whether  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:30.858 --> 00:08:32.543 or not the federal government  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:32.543 --> 00:08:34.357 should provide this sort of floor.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:34.360 --> 00:08:37.816 Against states who have enacted  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849874054615385

00:08:37.816 --> 00:08:39.150 restrictive abortion laws.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:08:44.100 --> 00:08:50.036 So along came came Dobbs. So the law is.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:08:50.040 --> 00:08:52.644 And what makes Dobbs so important is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:08:52.644 --> 00:08:54.834 that the case was squarely challenging

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:08:54.834 --> 00:08:57.340 what was held in Roe and Casey.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:08:57.340 --> 00:08:59.868 The law at issue in Dobbs was in

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:08:59.868 --> 00:09:01.842 Mississippi is Mississippi law that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:01.842 --> 00:09:04.392 bans abortion at 15 weeks viability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:04.400 --> 00:09:06.476 The gestational age at which the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:06.476 --> 00:09:08.498 fetus can survive outside a person's

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:08.498 --> 00:09:10.493 uterus is around 23 or 24 weeks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:10.500 --> 00:09:11.968 So the Mississippi law.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:11.968 --> 00:09:14.170 And it sort of unambiguously flew

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:14.238 --> 00:09:16.398 in the face of the standard set by

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:16.398 --> 00:09:18.581 row and interpreted by Casey since

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:18.581 --> 00:09:20.939 15 weeks as well before viability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:20.940 --> 00:09:24.055 So the issue of viability is not

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:24.060 --> 00:09:26.548 the in the Dobbs case was not the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:26.548 --> 00:09:28.977 first time that people have many

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:28.977 --> 00:09:31.137 have critiqued the standard set  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:31.137 --> 00:09:33.935 forward in row and as interpreted by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:33.935 --> 00:09:36.618 Casey anti abortion since the 1980s.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:36.618 --> 00:09:38.340 Ethicists, lawyers, physicians,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:38.340 --> 00:09:38.786 academics,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:38.786 --> 00:09:41.016 and advocates alike to have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:41.016 --> 00:09:43.604 criticized it as being insufficient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:43.604 --> 00:09:46.820 or ethically incoherent demarcation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:46.820 --> 00:09:48.878 after which the state interest in fetal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:48.878 --> 00:09:50.739 life is sufficiently significant to tip.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:50.740 --> 00:09:53.498 Balance in favor of the state against  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:53.498 --> 00:09:55.213 the pregnant person's interest  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:55.213 --> 00:09:57.498 in bodily autonomy and equality.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:57.500 --> 00:09:58.940 The Supreme Court has repeatedly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:09:58.940 --> 00:10:00.856 opted not to list a particular  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:00.856 --> 00:10:02.540 time and fetal development,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:02.540 --> 00:10:04.700 and instead stuck with viability

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:04.700 --> 00:10:05.996 as a concept.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:06.000 --> 00:10:06.474 So,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:06.474 --> 00:10:07.896 among other things,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:07.896 --> 00:10:10.740 viability and the time and development

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:10.824 --> 00:10:13.640 at which a fetus is able to survive

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:13.640 --> 00:10:15.358 outside of a person's uterus has

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:15.360 --> 00:10:17.880 changed even since Roe passed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:17.880 --> 00:10:20.880 Others have noted that the idea of viability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:20.880 --> 00:10:22.998 Not tethered to any part of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:22.998 --> 00:10:24.410 the Constitution and States

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:24.475 --> 00:10:26.080 and especially in the 19,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:26.080 --> 00:10:31.010 have passed laws on claims.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:31.010 --> 00:10:33.170 Or have passed laws to define

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:33.170 --> 00:10:34.610 viability in different ways.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:34.610 --> 00:10:37.550 So many have argued for a long time

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:37.550 --> 00:10:40.045 that the viability line demarcation

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:40.045 --> 00:10:43.476 at which the state can no longer

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:43.476 --> 00:10:46.430 put in place total bans on abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:46.430 --> 00:10:48.919 was an unworkable standard.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:48.920 --> 00:10:51.328 So when we think about what an

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:51.328 --> 00:10:52.918 alternative to that may be,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:52.920 --> 00:10:55.020 some states have passed laws

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:55.020 --> 00:10:56.766 based upon the claims that there

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:56.766 --> 00:10:58.659 is a moral duty to prevent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:10:58.660 --> 00:11:00.640 for example fetal pain and that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:00.640 --> 00:11:03.036 the fetus on claims that the fetus

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:03.036 --> 00:11:05.052 can feel pain at pre viability

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:05.052 --> 00:11:06.753 stages of development such that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:06.753 --> 00:11:09.081 they would argue a ban on abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:09.081 --> 00:11:10.986 is appropriate prior to viability

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:10.986 --> 00:11:13.242 based upon the moral duty to

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:13.242 --> 00:11:15.240 prevent the fetus from feeling pain.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:15.240 --> 00:11:17.155 Now peer review studies have

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:17.155 --> 00:11:18.304 refuted claims that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:18.310 --> 00:11:20.370 Fetal pain is really experienced

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:20.370 --> 00:11:21.606 at these stages,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:21.610 --> 00:11:24.508 but I provide this example as a

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:24.508 --> 00:11:26.228 moral justification that people

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:26.228 --> 00:11:28.622 have provided in support of for

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:28.622 --> 00:11:30.936 for arguing for abortion bans

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:30.936 --> 00:11:32.490 earlier in gestation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:32.490 --> 00:11:33.890 as many of you have probably heard.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:33.890 --> 00:11:35.006 Also we've had,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:35.006 --> 00:11:36.494 we've heard heartbeat bands,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:36.500 --> 00:11:38.330 which are generally abortion bands,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:38.330 --> 00:11:41.348 at approximately 6 weeks Jason gestation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:41.350 --> 00:11:42.720 which notably is about two  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:42.720 --> 00:11:44.439 weeks after a person might know  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8058157

00:11:44.439 --> 00:11:45.599 that they are pregnant.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:11:48.570 --> 00:11:51.714 So with the viability being sort of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:11:51.714 --> 00:11:54.177 high viability being this hot button,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:11:54.180 --> 00:11:59.160 very heavily criticized and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:11:59.160 --> 00:12:02.513 Watts written about viability as a morally  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:02.513 --> 00:12:05.329 justifiable and legally coherent standard.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:05.330 --> 00:12:07.605 For years. There were a couple of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:07.605 --> 00:12:09.382 outcomes that many scholars thought  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:09.382 --> 00:12:11.584 might happen in the DOPS case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:11.590 --> 00:12:13.408 so one which I intentionally crossed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:13.408 --> 00:12:15.668 out because it was not what happened?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:15.670 --> 00:12:18.030 Would it be to uphold Roe and get  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:18.030 --> 00:12:20.389 rid of the viability standard?

NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:20.390 --> 00:12:22.350 That is, that the court could have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:22.350 --> 00:12:24.600 held that the Constitution in the 14th  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:24.600 --> 00:12:26.628 amendment per Roe and Casey might  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:26.690 --> 00:12:28.790 still protect the right to abortion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:28.790 --> 00:12:29.300 But this?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:29.300 --> 00:12:31.340 Specific 15 week ban that was at issue  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:31.395 --> 00:12:33.586 in the case doesn't impinge on that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:33.586 --> 00:12:35.462 right because viability is no longer  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:35.462 --> 00:12:37.214 the standard that the state interest  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:37.214 --> 00:12:38.814 might best earlier in development,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:38.814 --> 00:12:41.371 but that there was still a constitutionally  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:41.371 --> 00:12:43.507 protected right to abortion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:43.510 --> 00:12:46.366 We saw that Justices Gorsuch and Roberts  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:46.366 --> 00:12:48.550 were very asked questions suggesting that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429  
00:12:48.550 --> 00:12:51.420 they were looking for an alternative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:51.420 --> 00:12:55.050 point in development in oral arguments,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:55.050 --> 00:12:57.486 and you can see here with the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:57.486 --> 00:12:59.310 quote that I've included.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:12:59.310 --> 00:13:00.740 That Justice Gorsuch seemed to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:13:00.740 --> 00:13:01.884 be sort of asked,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:13:01.890 --> 00:13:03.745 trying to elicit from the people arguing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.784460273571429

00:13:03.745 --> 00:13:05.669 the case in alternative standard.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:07.940 --> 00:13:09.250 And as you can see,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:09.250 --> 00:13:11.428 even in his concurrence, Justice Roberts,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:11.430 --> 00:13:14.062 one of the more moderate of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:14.062 --> 00:13:16.489 conservative members of the Supreme Court,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:16.490 --> 00:13:18.626 said that there is a clear path to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:18.626 --> 00:13:20.752 deciding this case correctly without over  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:20.752 --> 00:13:23.298 ruling Roe all the way down to the studs,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:23.300 --> 00:13:25.544 recognize that viability line must be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:25.544 --> 00:13:27.879 discarded as the majority rightly does,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:27.880 --> 00:13:30.834 and leave for another day whether to

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:30.834 --> 00:13:33.936 reject any right to an abortion at all.

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:33.940 --> 00:13:35.796 Again, that's not how the case went down,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:35.800 --> 00:13:38.752 but to specifically focus on the

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:38.752 --> 00:13:41.284 bioethical arguments underpinning a lot

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:41.284 --> 00:13:43.699 of US jurisprudence around abortion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:43.700 --> 00:13:45.040 For the past 50 years,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:45.040 --> 00:13:48.250 there was a lot of discussion

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:48.250 --> 00:13:49.320 about viability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:49.320 --> 00:13:50.500 So as I mentioned,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:50.500 --> 00:13:51.975 this is the hypothetical outcome.

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:51.980 --> 00:13:54.535 #1 didn't happen as scholars were talking

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:54.535 --> 00:13:56.718 about different things that could happen.

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:56.720 --> 00:13:58.670 Hypothetical outcome #2 was to

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:13:58.670 --> 00:14:01.144 overturn overturn rate Roe on the

NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:01.144 --> 00:14:02.968 basis that there was no abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:02.968 --> 00:14:04.959 right found in the Constitution.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:04.960 --> 00:14:07.970 And that is in fact what happened.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:07.970 --> 00:14:08.232 Again,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:08.232 --> 00:14:10.328 it that the court held that the Constitution  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:10.328 --> 00:14:12.085 does not confer a right to abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:12.090 --> 00:14:14.590 and that Roe and Casey were or overruled  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:14.590 --> 00:14:16.480 and the authority to regulate abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:16.480 --> 00:14:18.583 should be returned to the States  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875253894

00:14:18.583 --> 00:14:20.159 and their elected representatives.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:23.080 --> 00:14:25.726 So today you can find any  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:25.726 --> 00:14:28.319 number of maps similar to this.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:28.320 --> 00:14:29.804 This happened to just be the one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:29.804 --> 00:14:31.539 I took a screenshot of today,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:31.540 --> 00:14:33.844 tracking the status of various abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:33.844 --> 00:14:35.820 restrictions across the United States.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:35.820 --> 00:14:37.288 As you can see,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:37.288 --> 00:14:39.490 there's a pretty dark red region

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:39.570 --> 00:14:41.978 of the country in the South where

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:41.978 --> 00:14:44.771 it would be very difficult to find

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:44.771 --> 00:14:47.291 to get access to legal abortion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:47.300 --> 00:14:50.370 And as you can see on the map on the right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:50.370 --> 00:14:52.395 there are there's ongoing litigation

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:52.395 --> 00:14:55.459 that is a very dynamic situation changing

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:55.459 --> 00:14:58.826 everyday about which laws have been enjoyed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:14:58.830 --> 00:15:00.372 meaning they cannot be enforced while

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:00.372 --> 00:15:03.175 the court, while the case is pending

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:03.175 --> 00:15:06.060 and where lawsuits have been filed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:06.060 --> 00:15:08.800 Some of the bands go as far as to say

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:08.878 --> 00:15:11.398 that life begins at fertilization,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:11.400 --> 00:15:14.520 and so that's another issue that we can

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:14.520 --> 00:15:18.439 I'd be happy to discuss discuss in the Q&A.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:18.440 --> 00:15:20.505 I know that Professor Cohen is also

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:20.505 --> 00:15:22.735 planning to talk a bit about the moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:22.735 --> 00:15:25.298 status of an embryo and what what the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:25.298 --> 00:15:27.793 Dobbs decision means for continuing

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:27.793 --> 00:15:29.710 bioethical discussions about that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:29.710 --> 00:15:32.110 Again, another map of abortion restrictions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:32.110 --> 00:15:34.147 This one I believe is from the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:34.147 --> 00:15:35.659 Center for Reproductive Rights and

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:35.659 --> 00:15:37.405 I highlight here that it another

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:37.405 --> 00:15:39.523 topic that I'm happy to cover if

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:39.523 --> 00:15:41.003 people have questions about that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:41.010 --> 00:15:45.042 In Connecticut we have passed a abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:45.042 --> 00:15:47.761 provider protective Shield law that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:47.761 --> 00:15:50.218 helps keep to the extent other states

NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:50.218 --> 00:15:52.654 are trying to enforce their abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:52.654 --> 00:15:54.739 restrictive laws outside of their  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:54.739 --> 00:15:56.973 own borders for against physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:56.973 --> 00:15:59.074 or clinicians who are providing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:15:59.074 --> 00:16:02.020 Abortion care that's legal in their state.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:16:02.020 --> 00:16:04.470 Some states have enacted these laws in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:16:04.470 --> 00:16:07.468 order to sort of keep the states judicial  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:16:07.468 --> 00:16:11.476 infrastructure from being used to enforce.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:16:11.480 --> 00:16:14.085 Civil claims or criminal actions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:16:14.085 --> 00:16:16.690 against residents of their state  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:16:16.690 --> 00:16:19.170 when they might usually facilitate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8746124675

00:16:19.170 --> 00:16:21.650 that between two different states.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:24.150 --> 00:16:25.008 So we talked a lot.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:25.008 --> 00:16:26.572 I talked a lot about sort  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:26.572 --> 00:16:27.988 of the viability line.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:27.990 --> 00:16:30.780 And, you know, with the decision

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:30.780 --> 00:16:33.739 really being about the claim that

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:33.739 --> 00:16:36.274 there's no substantive due process

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:36.274 --> 00:16:38.934 right in the US Constitution that

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:38.934 --> 00:16:40.989 protects the right to abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:40.990 --> 00:16:45.350 brings us into the reality of the moral,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:45.350 --> 00:16:46.830 the bioethical problems with

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:46.830 --> 00:16:49.470 that being the law of the land,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:49.470 --> 00:16:52.720 so in denying abortion care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:52.720 --> 00:16:54.574 It is denying the bodily autonomy

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:54.574 --> 00:16:56.186 of people who become pregnant

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:56.186 --> 00:16:58.094 and don't want to be pregnant.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:16:58.100 --> 00:17:00.578 It is an unequal situation for people

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:00.578 --> 00:17:03.480 who are able to get pregnant because

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:03.480 --> 00:17:06.120 there's nothing and among other things

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:06.192 --> 00:17:08.957 and have sort of formal equality sense.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:08.960 --> 00:17:11.720 There's no similar restriction on people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:11.720 --> 00:17:14.318 who are unable to become pregnant.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:14.320 --> 00:17:16.636 And there are also health consequences,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:16.640 --> 00:17:18.700 of course, for denying abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:18.700 --> 00:17:20.096 financial consequences,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:20.096 --> 00:17:21.492 consequences and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:21.492 --> 00:17:22.888 Isn't also,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:22.890 --> 00:17:23.680 of course,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:23.680 --> 00:17:25.655 important to note that there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:25.655 --> 00:17:27.301 is a disproportionate burden  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:27.301 --> 00:17:29.246 and racial justice issues that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:29.246 --> 00:17:31.297 are very important and salient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89637342

00:17:31.297 --> 00:17:33.009 in denying abortion care.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:35.310 --> 00:17:38.486 So on the last, my last second here,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:38.490 --> 00:17:40.506 because I know I'm tied on time,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:40.510 --> 00:17:42.638 I'll just say that I would

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:42.638 --> 00:17:44.780 be happy also to discuss that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:44.780 --> 00:17:48.644 The response from more abortion friendly

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:48.644 --> 00:17:53.370 States and from the federal government,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:53.370 --> 00:17:55.730 that being the SHIELD bus that I mentioned,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:55.730 --> 00:17:57.962 as well as recent action from

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:57.962 --> 00:17:59.971 the federal government under the

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:17:59.971 --> 00:18:01.767 Emergency Emergency medical treatment

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:01.767 --> 00:18:04.698 and Labor Act that requires. Umm.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:04.698 --> 00:18:07.410 Healthcare facilities with emergency

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:07.410 --> 00:18:10.800 departments that participate in federal

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:10.800 --> 00:18:12.380 health programs such as Medicare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:12.380 --> 00:18:14.344 So most emergency departments,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:14.344 --> 00:18:18.000 if not all that they must provide

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:18.000 --> 00:18:19.624 care in emergency situations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:19.624 --> 00:18:22.060 So for the especially in states

NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:22.128 --> 00:18:24.206 where there is no emergency life,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:24.206 --> 00:18:27.044 life exception when the life of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:27.044 --> 00:18:29.498 the pregnant person is at risk,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:29.500 --> 00:18:31.180 the federal government is is doing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:31.180 --> 00:18:33.944 its best at this point under the Biden  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:33.944 --> 00:18:35.388 administration to provide a safe.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:35.388 --> 00:18:36.960 Charge so that at a minimum,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:36.960 --> 00:18:38.472 when someone's life is in danger or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:38.472 --> 00:18:40.398 they're in an emergency medical situation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:40.400 --> 00:18:43.570 they could access abortion care.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:43.570 --> 00:18:44.368 So with that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:44.368 --> 00:18:46.682 I will turn it back over to Mark  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:46.682 --> 00:18:48.577 to introduce our next speaker.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:48.580 --> 00:18:50.404 I will stop my share.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:50.404 --> 00:18:53.914 And welcome all sorts of any questions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6827351075

00:18:53.914 --> 00:18:57.320 that and I'm looking forward to the Q&A.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:18:57.320 --> 00:18:59.040 Thank you so much, Katie.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:18:59.040 --> 00:19:01.254 That was a beautiful job of setting the

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:01.254 --> 00:19:03.438 table for us for the ongoing conversation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:03.440 --> 00:19:05.800 Our next speaker is going to be I,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:05.800 --> 00:19:08.160 Glenn Cohen, and Glenn is the James A

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:08.160 --> 00:19:09.943 Atwood and Leslie Williams professor

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:09.943 --> 00:19:12.199 of law at Harvard Law School,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:12.200 --> 00:19:14.344 as well as the faculty director of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:14.344 --> 00:19:16.398 Peachtree Flom Center for Health Law Policy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:16.400 --> 00:19:18.275 Biotechnology and Bioethics Professor Cohen

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:18.275 --> 00:19:21.442 is one of the world's leading experts on

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:21.442 --> 00:19:23.976 the intersection of bioethics and the law,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:23.980 --> 00:19:25.760 as well as health law.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:25.760 --> 00:19:27.670 He has had a storied.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:27.670 --> 00:19:29.570 Rear He's very involved

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:29.570 --> 00:19:31.470 in government work with,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:31.470 --> 00:19:33.445 he's advised US Vice president  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:33.445 --> 00:19:34.630 on reproductive rights.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:34.630 --> 00:19:36.754 He's reached out widely to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:36.754 --> 00:19:38.844 media and everything from PBS to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:38.844 --> 00:19:40.650 New York Times to Mother Jones.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:40.650 --> 00:19:41.802 I just learned this week that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:41.802 --> 00:19:43.090 Mother Jones was a real person.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:43.090 --> 00:19:46.450 I confess, I never knew that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:46.450 --> 00:19:48.110 Glenn was the youngest professor  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:48.110 --> 00:19:50.125 on the faculty at Harvard Law  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:50.125 --> 00:19:51.877 School when he was first brought  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:51.877 --> 00:19:53.787 to the faculty a few years back,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:53.790 --> 00:19:55.654 and prior to being on the faculty there,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:55.660 --> 00:19:59.125 he was clerking for the US Court of Appeals,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:19:59.130 --> 00:20:00.780 and it was involved in cases

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:00.780 --> 00:20:03.148 that went as far as the Court of

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:03.148 --> 00:20:04.948 Appeals and the US Supreme Court.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:04.950 --> 00:20:07.470 Professor Cohen has a BA in Bioethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:07.470 --> 00:20:09.296 and psychology from the University

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:09.296 --> 00:20:11.655 of Toronto and a JD from Harvard,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:11.660 --> 00:20:12.968 and we are honored and grateful

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:12.968 --> 00:20:14.220 that you've joined us tonight.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93025608

00:20:14.220 --> 00:20:15.388 Glenn, take it away.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:16.320 --> 00:20:17.310 The honor is all mine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:17.310 --> 00:20:19.235 Thank you so much for having me.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:19.240 --> 00:20:19.696 My disclosures.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:19.696 --> 00:20:21.292 So in the ones that are relevant,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:21.300 --> 00:20:23.526 I currently sit on the ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:23.526 --> 00:20:25.739 advisory boards for Lumina and Bayer.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:25.740 --> 00:20:27.276 I've also served in the past

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:27.276 --> 00:20:28.910 on the ACOG Ethics Committee,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:28.910 --> 00:20:30.534 although I don't sit on it now.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:30.540 --> 00:20:33.036 So the day after the Dobbs opinion leaked,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:33.040 --> 00:20:34.500 many wondered what Wright was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:34.500 --> 00:20:35.960 next on the chopping block.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:35.960 --> 00:20:37.313 Justice Alito's opinion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:37.313 --> 00:20:39.117 but not Justice Thomas,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:39.120 --> 00:20:42.144 explicitly said that they're not revisiting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:42.144 --> 00:20:44.160 today cases protecting contraception,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:44.160 --> 00:20:45.582 same-sex sexual intimacy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:45.582 --> 00:20:48.426 Same sex marriage and says quote,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:48.430 --> 00:20:49.926 what sharply distinguishes the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:49.926 --> 00:20:51.796 abortion right from the rights  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:51.796 --> 00:20:53.519 recognized the cases on which Roe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:53.519 --> 00:20:55.270 and Casey rely is something that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:55.270 --> 00:20:56.850 both those decisions acknowledge.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:56.850 --> 00:20:58.820 Abortion to strides with destroys

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:20:58.820 --> 00:21:00.396 with those decisions called

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:00.396 --> 00:21:02.418 potential life with the law at issue

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:02.418 --> 00:21:04.315 in this case regards the life of

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:04.315 --> 00:21:05.905 an unborn human being UN quote.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:05.910 --> 00:21:07.246 And then said quote,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:07.246 --> 00:21:09.688 none of the other decisions cited by

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:09.688 --> 00:21:11.543 Rowan Casey involved the critical

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:11.543 --> 00:21:14.208 moral question posed by abortion UN quote.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:14.210 --> 00:21:15.692 So those of us in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:15.692 --> 00:21:16.433 bioethics community thought.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:16.440 --> 00:21:17.234 Almost immediately,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:17.234 --> 00:21:18.028 well, yes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:18.028 --> 00:21:20.410 that might distinguish same sex marriage,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:20.410 --> 00:21:22.330 but clearly not embryo destruction,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:22.330 --> 00:21:24.157 a key part of stem cell research,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:24.160 --> 00:21:26.194 and how in vitro fertilization that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:26.194 --> 00:21:28.269 IVF is practiced at the moment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:28.270 --> 00:21:29.970 It also raises questions about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:29.970 --> 00:21:31.670 what whether some forms of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:31.737 --> 00:21:33.649 contraception would be regarded,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:33.650 --> 00:21:35.784 by the court at least, as involving  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:35.784 --> 00:21:38.346 the destruction of an unborn life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:38.350 --> 00:21:40.070 When it comes to IVF,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:40.070 --> 00:21:42.350 embryo destruction is extremely common.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:42.350 --> 00:21:44.751 Data collected by the CDC reveals that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:44.751 --> 00:21:47.207 virtually every IVF clinic in this country.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:47.210 --> 00:21:48.986 Provides embryo cryopreservation services,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:48.986 --> 00:21:51.206 which is necessary when there's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:51.206 --> 00:21:53.141 more than one or two embryos  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:53.141 --> 00:21:54.571 produced in a single cycle.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:54.580 --> 00:21:56.344 While most IVF cycles do produce

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:56.344 --> 00:21:58.619 more than two eggs for fertilization,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:21:58.620 --> 00:22:00.615 the current standard of care is to

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:00.615 --> 00:22:02.822 implant no more than two to avoid

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:02.822 --> 00:22:04.437 the risk of multiple pregnancies.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:04.440 --> 00:22:06.330 Those remaining embryos are often

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:06.330 --> 00:22:08.220 destroyed when the parties die,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:08.220 --> 00:22:09.138 when they divorce,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:09.138 --> 00:22:10.974 when they're going to decide they

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:10.974 --> 00:22:12.889 just don't want to have any more

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:12.889 --> 00:22:15.105 children and want to stop paying prior

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:15.105 --> 00:22:17.620 preservation fees about half of all IVF.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:17.620 --> 00:22:19.706 Cycles in the US involve pre implantation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:19.710 --> 00:22:21.570 genetic testing and which sells our

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:21.570 --> 00:22:23.474 biopsy from a developing embryo to

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:23.474 --> 00:22:24.999 determine the health of resulting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:24.999 --> 00:22:27.190 child and those test results when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:27.190 --> 00:22:28.822 they reveal genetic abnormalities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:28.822 --> 00:22:30.454 potentially associated with negative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:30.454 --> 00:22:32.474 health outcomes are often destroyed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:32.474 --> 00:22:34.920 or discarded to use the preferred  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:34.920 --> 00:22:36.436 term in the community.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:36.440 --> 00:22:38.584 So what would happen if a state tried  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:38.584 --> 00:22:40.608 to restrict, directly or indirectly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:40.608 --> 00:22:41.104 IVF?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:41.104 --> 00:22:42.096 In fact,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:42.100 --> 00:22:45.180 Louisiana already has a statute doing so,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:45.180 --> 00:22:47.200 dating all the way back to 1986,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:47.200 --> 00:22:48.340 and it says,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:48.340 --> 00:22:48.720 quote,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:48.720 --> 00:22:50.495 a viable in vitro fertilized

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:50.495 --> 00:22:52.800 human ovum is a juridical person,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:52.800 --> 00:22:54.375 which shall not be intentionally

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:54.375 --> 00:22:56.312 destroyed by any natural or other

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:56.312 --> 00:22:57.837 juridical person or through the

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:57.837 --> 00:22:59.739 actions of any other such person,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:22:59.740 --> 00:23:00.390 UN quote.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:23:00.390 --> 00:23:02.340 Kentucky also has a similar law,

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:23:02.340 --> 00:23:05.217 but it only applies to public institutions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:23:05.220 --> 00:23:07.180 There are vanishingly few cases

NOTE Confidence: 0.702815684

00:23:07.180 --> 00:23:08.748 that have ever discussed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:08.750 --> 00:23:10.660 Whether there are any constitutional

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:10.660 --> 00:23:13.428 rights to use IVF and in what way?

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:13.430 --> 00:23:15.332 Outside the US, we see models

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:15.332 --> 00:23:17.042 of restrictions that some states

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:17.042 --> 00:23:19.130 might be interested in adopting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:19.130 --> 00:23:21.944 In Italy, there's a 2004 law that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:21.944 --> 00:23:23.500 prohibited creating more than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:23.565 --> 00:23:26.603 3 embryos in an IVF cycle and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:26.603 --> 00:23:27.905 prohibited Carisoprodol preservation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:27.910 --> 00:23:29.954 the idea that all would be implanted  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:29.954 --> 00:23:31.870 and none would be cryopreserved.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:31.870 --> 00:23:34.517 That law was ultimately struck down in 2009,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:34.517 --> 00:23:36.779 but in Germany there's a prohibition  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:36.779 --> 00:23:38.980 on the creation of more than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:38.980 --> 00:23:40.645 three embryos per IVF cycle.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:40.650 --> 00:23:42.600 One could imagine a pro-life  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:42.600 --> 00:23:44.550 state passing a similar law.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:44.550 --> 00:23:47.016 In the US, or less likely,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:47.020 --> 00:23:48.322 but also possible,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:48.322 --> 00:23:50.926 requiring any unused embryos to be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:23:50.926 --> 00:23:53.426 available for quote UN quote embryo

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:23:53.426 --> 00:23:55.421 adoption by other individuals as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:23:55.497 --> 00:23:57.837 a constitutional matter post dogs,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:23:57.840 --> 00:24:00.728 those laws seem to me to be constitutional.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:00.730 --> 00:24:02.750 That is Justice Alito's opinion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:02.750 --> 00:24:04.214 for the majority of the court  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:04.214 --> 00:24:06.135 seems to suggest that there is no  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:06.135 --> 00:24:07.630 constitutional problem with that role.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:07.630 --> 00:24:09.525 Even pre Dobbs there were  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:09.525 --> 00:24:11.041 vanishingly few decisions suggesting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:11.041 --> 00:24:12.788 such a constitutional right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:12.790 --> 00:24:14.370 The biggest constraint on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:14.370 --> 00:24:15.950 this happening is politics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:15.950 --> 00:24:18.225 When we look at the polling done  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:18.225 --> 00:24:19.909 about abortion and about IVF,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:19.910 --> 00:24:22.870 we find that many people who are anti  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:22.870 --> 00:24:25.170 abortion are nonetheless pro IVF.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:25.170 --> 00:24:25.451 Nonetheless,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:25.451 --> 00:24:27.418 there is a risk that some of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:27.418 --> 00:24:29.515 these laws might come into being  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:29.515 --> 00:24:30.625 through more inadvertence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:30.630 --> 00:24:32.318 Adoption of personhood language  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:32.318 --> 00:24:34.428 aimed at abortion might sideswipe,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:34.430 --> 00:24:37.734 in some instances, IVF and other processes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:37.740 --> 00:24:39.798 Because this is a bioethics colloquium,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:39.800 --> 00:24:41.361 I'm going to spend the remainder of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:41.361 --> 00:24:43.078 the time on a normative question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:43.080 --> 00:24:45.234 Should those who seek to prohibit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:45.234 --> 00:24:47.163 abortion also seek to prohibit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:47.163 --> 00:24:50.089 embryo destruction as part of IVF or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:50.089 --> 00:24:51.980 other reproductive technology use?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:24:51.980 --> 00:24:53.780 My answer is going to be a maybe.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:53.780 --> 00:24:54.587 I'm a lawyer,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:54.587 --> 00:24:56.840 so it's very common to answer without maybe,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:56.840 --> 00:24:59.189 and it may depend a lot on your theory  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:24:59.189 --> 00:25:01.439 of embryonic or fetal personhood.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:01.440 --> 00:25:02.184 At the start,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:02.184 --> 00:25:03.920 let me just say I'm focused on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:03.976 --> 00:25:06.172 reasons to prohibit IVF that are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:06.172 --> 00:25:07.636 connected to embryo destruction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:07.640 --> 00:25:09.901 There are other reasons I think of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:09.901 --> 00:25:12.240 Leon Cassas the wisdom of repugnance  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:12.240 --> 00:25:14.070 issues about gender roles that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:14.070 --> 00:25:15.900 some conservatives might want to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:15.964 --> 00:25:17.359 ban IVF or restrict IVF,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:17.360 --> 00:25:19.976 but I'm focusing on embryo destruction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:19.980 --> 00:25:21.860 As I've put it elsewhere,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:21.860 --> 00:25:24.380 most individuals who want to prohibit

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:24.380 --> 00:25:26.060 abortion subscribe to something

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:26.122 --> 00:25:28.067 like the two following premises,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:28.070 --> 00:25:29.990 premise 1.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:29.990 --> 00:25:31.784 Fetuses are persons and or get

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:31.784 --> 00:25:34.100 some of the rights of persons from

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:34.100 --> 00:25:35.855 early on in their development,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:35.860 --> 00:25:37.750 particularly a right of inviability,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:37.750 --> 00:25:39.350 that is the right not to be destroyed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:39.350 --> 00:25:41.690 That overwhelmingly good reason.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:41.690 --> 00:25:43.290 2nd premise,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:43.290 --> 00:25:45.080 whatever interest the mother has

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:45.080 --> 00:25:46.870 in protecting her bodily integrity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:46.870 --> 00:25:49.094 protecting her reproductive autonomy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:49.094 --> 00:25:49.650 etcetera,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615

00:25:49.650 --> 00:25:51.705 that doesn't outweigh her fetus

NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:51.705 --> 00:25:53.349 is right of inviolability.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:53.350 --> 00:25:55.230 So I want to suggest those are the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:55.230 --> 00:25:57.488 two main premises behind attempts to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:57.488 --> 00:25:59.648 criminalize abortion and prohibit abortion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:25:59.650 --> 00:26:00.994 Now, what happens though,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:26:00.994 --> 00:26:03.010 when replaces the word fetuses in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:26:03.074 --> 00:26:05.468 those premise with the word early embryos?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:26:05.470 --> 00:26:07.930 Or if you preferred fertilized eggs?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:26:07.930 --> 00:26:08.354 Well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:26:08.354 --> 00:26:10.898 the exact same argument would seem  
NOTE Confidence: 0.811833535384615  
00:26:10.898 --> 00:26:12.170 to justify prohibiting.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:12.170 --> 00:26:12.906 Embryo destruction,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:12.906 --> 00:26:15.114 just as it does in abortion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:15.120 --> 00:26:15.930 That's just that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:15.930 --> 00:26:17.010 If you're against abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:17.010 --> 00:26:19.482 you have a very strong reason to be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:19.482 --> 00:26:21.399 against embryo destruction as well.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:21.400 --> 00:26:23.264 But I want to push further on this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:23.264 --> 00:26:25.134 and look at those two premises and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:25.134 --> 00:26:26.979 discuss why I think it's a maybe.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:26.980 --> 00:26:28.876 Let's start with the second promise,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:28.880 --> 00:26:29.654 the premise.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:29.654 --> 00:26:31.976 That's the idea of bodily integrity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:31.980 --> 00:26:34.316 So many people are surprised when I tell  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:34.316 --> 00:26:36.784 them that the arguments are prohibiting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:36.784 --> 00:26:38.600 embryo destruction are stronger,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:38.600 --> 00:26:40.036 or, if you prefer,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:40.036 --> 00:26:41.472 easier than the arguments  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:41.472 --> 00:26:42.790 for prohibiting abortion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:42.790 --> 00:26:45.126 Why you I say this because the second  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:26:45.126 --> 00:26:46.750 premise about women's autonomy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:46.750 --> 00:26:48.169 about bodily integrity,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:48.169 --> 00:26:49.588 about reproductive autonomy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:49.590 --> 00:26:50.535 is less relevant,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:50.535 --> 00:26:51.795 or in some accounts,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:51.800 --> 00:26:52.126 irrelevant,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:52.126 --> 00:26:54.082 in the case of early embryos  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:54.082 --> 00:26:56.268 that have not yet been implanted.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:56.270 --> 00:26:58.150 While prohibiting abortion requires favoring  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:26:58.150 --> 00:27:01.542 the right of a fetus over the right not to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:27:01.542 --> 00:27:03.750 gestate of the woman seeking an abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:27:03.750 --> 00:27:05.670 that's a bodily autonomy right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:27:05.670 --> 00:27:07.178 There's no controversy countervailing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:27:07.178 --> 00:27:09.830 right to control one's body at issue,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:27:09.830 --> 00:27:11.460 and we're talking about prohibiting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:27:11.460 --> 00:27:12.764 embryos that have been.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:12.770 --> 00:27:13.928 Produced extra corporally,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:13.928 --> 00:27:14.700 that is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:14.700 --> 00:27:16.740 that our sitting outside the body

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:16.740 --> 00:27:18.228 that is prohibiting abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:18.228 --> 00:27:19.716 directly restricts the right

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:19.716 --> 00:27:21.919 not to be a gestational parent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:21.920 --> 00:27:23.489 whereas prohibiting embryo

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:23.489 --> 00:27:25.058 destruction does not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:25.060 --> 00:27:27.085 One more way of putting it is to say

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:27.085 --> 00:27:29.323 the second premise is a very strong

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:29.323 --> 00:27:31.080 reason to support abortion rights,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:31.080 --> 00:27:33.608 but it is weaker when it comes to

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:33.608 --> 00:27:35.408 opposing embryo destruction because

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:35.408 --> 00:27:37.604 prohibitions on embryo destruction

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:37.604 --> 00:27:39.800 don't involve force gestation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:39.800 --> 00:27:41.352 The most famous philosophical

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:41.352 --> 00:27:42.516 defense of abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:42.520 --> 00:27:44.180 based on the second premise,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:44.180 --> 00:27:46.030 comes from Judith Jarvis Thompson's

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:46.030 --> 00:27:48.271 famous article a defense of abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:48.271 --> 00:27:49.916 and her thought experiment about

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:49.916 --> 00:27:52.466 waking up as a human dialysis machine

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:52.466 --> 00:27:54.812 to the world's most famous violinist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:54.820 --> 00:27:57.396 Her argument is aimed at showing that

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:27:57.396 --> 00:28:00.689 even if you believe a fetus is a person.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:00.690 --> 00:28:03.030 The abortion rights should persist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:03.030 --> 00:28:05.550 That is the exact argument that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:05.550 --> 00:28:07.230 unavailable for embryo destruction,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:07.230 --> 00:28:09.960 which doesn't involve forced gestation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:09.960 --> 00:28:12.528 a kind of slavery in an indirect way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:12.530 --> 00:28:14.450 And that's not to say that a party

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:14.450 --> 00:28:16.289 that is aggrieved has no potential  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:16.289 --> 00:28:18.774 rights claim to make against a policy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:18.774 --> 00:28:20.650 that prohibits embryo destruction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:20.650 --> 00:28:22.729 It's just to say that there's a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:22.729 --> 00:28:24.170 harder to characterize argument,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:24.170 --> 00:28:26.408 and maybe less persuasive if individuals  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:26.408 --> 00:28:28.852 were required to make their excess  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:28.852 --> 00:28:30.620 embryos available for adoption.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:30.620 --> 00:28:30.933 Agreed,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:30.933 --> 00:28:32.811 individuals might argue for a violation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:32.811 --> 00:28:35.008 or right not to be a genetic parent.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:35.010 --> 00:28:35.602 That is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:35.602 --> 00:28:37.970 the state is forcing them to allow other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:38.038 --> 00:28:40.336 people to rear their genetic children.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:40.340 --> 00:28:40.683 Here,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125

00:28:40.683 --> 00:28:42.741 the state could respond that the

NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:42.741 --> 00:28:44.164 individuals could have avoided  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:44.164 --> 00:28:45.824 this dilemma by only fertilizing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:45.824 --> 00:28:47.999 the embryos one or two at a time.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:48.000 --> 00:28:49.660 The individual might say, well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:49.660 --> 00:28:50.916 yeah, that sounds great,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:50.916 --> 00:28:52.800 but it would not be economically  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:52.858 --> 00:28:53.740 feasible for me.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:53.740 --> 00:28:55.035 But when we get to that point  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:55.035 --> 00:28:55.590 in the argument,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:55.590 --> 00:28:57.000 you might say we're really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:57.000 --> 00:28:58.766 arguing about now is more in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:28:58.766 --> 00:29:00.256 the style of positive liberty,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:29:00.260 --> 00:29:02.248 a right to become a genetic parent.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:29:02.250 --> 00:29:04.050 That is stymied by the background  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87249140125  
00:29:04.050 --> 00:29:05.250 rule on the fate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:05.310 --> 00:29:08.334 of cryopreserved embryos rather than a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:08.334 --> 00:29:10.350 straightforward negative liberty restriction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:10.350 --> 00:29:12.338 If a state tried to prohibit the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:12.338 --> 00:29:14.520 creation of more than three embryos  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:14.520 --> 00:29:16.625 per cycle and forbade cryopreservation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:16.630 --> 00:29:18.038 that's the German approach.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:18.038 --> 00:29:20.610 In that case too, it seems as though  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:20.610 --> 00:29:22.350 the aggrieved party is really arguing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:22.403 --> 00:29:24.315 about a right to be a genetic parent.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:24.320 --> 00:29:26.084 Their argument might either be of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:26.084 --> 00:29:27.870 this approach is too expensive,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:27.870 --> 00:29:30.022 or that it will stop them from succeeding  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:30.022 --> 00:29:32.248 in IVF before they run out of money.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:32.250 --> 00:29:34.466 That will prevent them from having a child,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:34.470 --> 00:29:36.790 or the number of children they want to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:36.790 --> 00:29:39.470 have via IVF before they run out of money,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:39.470 --> 00:29:40.758 or in the extreme.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:40.758 --> 00:29:42.690 Space before they age out of

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:42.766 --> 00:29:44.068 having viable eggs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:44.070 --> 00:29:45.635 It's not that these claims

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:45.635 --> 00:29:46.887 are not worth anything.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:46.890 --> 00:29:48.528 I'm saying that they're worthy claims,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:48.530 --> 00:29:49.720 just that they're much less

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:49.720 --> 00:29:50.910 clean and in my opinion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:50.910 --> 00:29:52.998 less forceful arguments for

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:52.998 --> 00:29:54.564 countervailing rights claims,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:54.570 --> 00:29:56.550 the classic one regarding forced

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:56.550 --> 00:29:58.530 gestation in the abortion context.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:29:58.530 --> 00:30:00.762 So that's why I think on the second premise,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:00.770 --> 00:30:02.378 embryo destruction is different.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:02.378 --> 00:30:04.388 What about the first premise?

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:04.390 --> 00:30:05.986 So once again, that first premise,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:05.990 --> 00:30:06.480 I'm sorry,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:06.480 --> 00:30:07.705 but a little quickly here,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:07.710 --> 00:30:09.614 is that fetuses are persons and or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:09.614 --> 00:30:11.789 get some of the rights of persons.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:11.790 --> 00:30:13.278 From early on in their development,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:13.280 --> 00:30:15.600 particularly a right of inviability.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:15.600 --> 00:30:17.655 One could argue for prohibiting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:17.655 --> 00:30:19.710 abortion but not prohibiting embryo  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:19.773 --> 00:30:21.888 destruction if one believes there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:21.888 --> 00:30:23.580 are morally relevant differences  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:23.580 --> 00:30:25.879 as to personhood claims for early  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:25.879 --> 00:30:27.689 embryos as opposed to fetus.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:27.690 --> 00:30:30.077 So here the argument for a restriction  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:30.077 --> 00:30:32.183 on embryo destruction is weaker than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:32.183 --> 00:30:33.888 the one for restricting abortion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:33.890 --> 00:30:36.368 See how the two premises move together.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:36.370 --> 00:30:38.566 One premise is stronger on abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:38.570 --> 00:30:40.430 the other premise is stronger

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:40.430 --> 00:30:41.546 on embryo destruction,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:41.550 --> 00:30:43.478 which is quite interesting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:43.480 --> 00:30:44.360 All of this, though,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:44.360 --> 00:30:46.012 is going to depend when it comes

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:46.012 --> 00:30:47.417 to this premise of personhood,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:47.420 --> 00:30:49.298 on the criteria you want to

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:49.298 --> 00:30:50.237 adopt for personhood.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:50.240 --> 00:30:51.635 So I'm going to say a few things now,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:51.640 --> 00:30:54.160 but we can talk more about it during the Q&A.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:54.160 --> 00:30:56.218 What are the different views about when

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:56.218 --> 00:30:58.137 personhood begins in less than 5 minutes?

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:58.140 --> 00:30:58.533 OK,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:58.533 --> 00:30:59.712 here we go.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:30:59.712 --> 00:31:01.677 First one is a view,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:01.680 --> 00:31:03.437 and it's associated with the Catholic Church,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:03.440 --> 00:31:04.324 for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:04.324 --> 00:31:06.976 that personhood begins and indeed is

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:06.976 --> 00:31:09.858 completed at the point of fertilization.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:09.860 --> 00:31:11.110 There's lots of critiques we

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:11.110 --> 00:31:12.360 can discuss about this view,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:12.360 --> 00:31:13.872 but here all I want to say is that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:13.880 --> 00:31:14.969 That's your view.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:14.969 --> 00:31:16.784 There should be no difference

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:16.784 --> 00:31:18.255 between destruction of embryos

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:18.255 --> 00:31:19.627 and destruction of fetuses.

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:19.630 --> 00:31:20.434 That is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:20.434 --> 00:31:22.042 embryo destruction and abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:22.042 --> 00:31:22.846 are equivalent.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:22.850 --> 00:31:24.700 Arrival view is sometimes called  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:24.700 --> 00:31:26.870 the 14 days of development fee,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:26.870 --> 00:31:29.150 as Cynthia Cohen puts it quote.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:29.150 --> 00:31:30.770 Several developments at this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:30.770 --> 00:31:32.390 point are especially significant.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:32.390 --> 00:31:34.438 The first of the cells of the early  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:34.438 --> 00:31:35.812 embryo begin to function either  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:35.812 --> 00:31:38.108 as part of the embryo proper or as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:38.108 --> 00:31:39.584 extra embryonic supporting materials  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:39.584 --> 00:31:41.429 that will be discarded later.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:41.430 --> 00:31:43.152 The second is that it is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:43.152 --> 00:31:44.640 irrevocably settled by this time.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:44.640 --> 00:31:46.964 An embryo proper that is distinct from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.873018867

00:31:46.964 --> 00:31:49.299 the mandarins that nourish it is present.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8953536325

00:31:49.300 --> 00:31:52.116 1/3 is that twinning can no longer occur,

NOTE Confidence: 0.4740068475

00:31:52.120 --> 00:31:54.188 UN quote, since embryos

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:31:54.200 --> 00:31:56.498 used for IVF are never allowed

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:31:56.498 --> 00:31:58.659 to develop anywhere near 14 days.

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:31:58.660 --> 00:32:00.454 If this is the marker of

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:00.454 --> 00:32:02.060 personhood you develop and adopt,

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:02.060 --> 00:32:04.160 you justifiably can draw a distinction

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:04.160 --> 00:32:06.260 between abortion and embryo destruction.

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:06.260 --> 00:32:07.181 For research, though,

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:07.181 --> 00:32:08.716 there's been much more pressure

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:08.716 --> 00:32:10.578 to go beyond the 14 day mark,

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:10.580 --> 00:32:12.530 and this might problematize that

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:12.530 --> 00:32:14.378 kind of research, to be sure,

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:14.378 --> 00:32:16.230 even those who are in favor of the.

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:16.230 --> 00:32:18.960 14 day approach still believe in early

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:18.960 --> 00:32:20.700 embryo deserves special respect,

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:20.700 --> 00:32:22.779 but I think most of them would say that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:22.779 --> 00:32:24.320 special respect is satisfied in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:24.320 --> 00:32:26.396 case when the embryo is made a good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:26.396 --> 00:32:28.188 faith effort to use it for reproduction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:28.190 --> 00:32:29.884 But we can talk a little bit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:29.884 --> 00:32:31.490 more about that during the Q&A.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:31.490 --> 00:32:33.255 Next, there are what are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:33.255 --> 00:32:34.667 called capacity X fees.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:34.670 --> 00:32:36.800 These split between views that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:36.800 --> 00:32:39.300 require that an embryo attain an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:39.300 --> 00:32:42.090 actual capacity X versus having  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:42.090 --> 00:32:44.710 the potentiality for capacity XI.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:44.710 --> 00:32:46.526 Keep saying word X because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:46.526 --> 00:32:47.470 there are different candidates  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:47.470 --> 00:32:48.650 for what you might adopt.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:32:48.650 --> 00:32:49.432 Philosophically speaking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:32:49.432 --> 00:32:51.387 it could be their capacity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:32:51.390 --> 00:32:53.427 X is the ability to feel pain,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:32:53.430 --> 00:32:54.202 embodied consciousness,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:32:54.202 --> 00:32:57.290 to have awareness over the self of time,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:32:57.290 --> 00:32:59.810 to communicate, to experience emotion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:32:59.810 --> 00:33:01.796 to solve new and complex problems.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:01.800 --> 00:33:04.696 Some combination of these and a lot will  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:04.696 --> 00:33:08.036 depend on what version of that X you fill in.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:08.040 --> 00:33:10.470 On some views of actual attainment,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:10.470 --> 00:33:11.940 does the embryo actually have it?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:11.940 --> 00:33:14.871 On some views of capacity X, there is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:14.871 --> 00:33:16.456 difference between fetuses and embryos.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:16.460 --> 00:33:18.128 On the flip side,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:18.128 --> 00:33:20.213 on potentiality views the contrast,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:20.220 --> 00:33:21.785 and by contrast the pictures  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:21.785 --> 00:33:23.037 a lot less clear.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:23.040 --> 00:33:24.044 As Cohen puts it,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:24.044 --> 00:33:25.900 an early embryo is on this view,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:25.900 --> 00:33:27.180 a potential human being.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:27.180 --> 00:33:29.100 And will the normal course of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:29.162 --> 00:33:30.998 events grow into an actional 1?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:31.000 --> 00:33:33.709 And that's why we give it a rights claim.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:33.710 --> 00:33:34.976 That puts a lot of pressure  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:34.976 --> 00:33:36.510 on what we mean by the quote,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:36.510 --> 00:33:39.108 UN quote normal course of events.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:39.110 --> 00:33:41.330 It also puts pressure on the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:41.330 --> 00:33:43.325 question of whether the early  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:43.325 --> 00:33:45.530 embryo becomes the person it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:45.530 --> 00:33:48.010 ultimately develops into or produces.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:48.010 --> 00:33:48.646 That is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:33:48.646 --> 00:33:50.236 the potential to become versus

NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:50.236 --> 00:33:51.710 the potential to produce.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:51.710 --> 00:33:55.006 Is it more like hydrogen and oxygen that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:55.006 --> 00:33:57.669 produce water but don't become water?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:33:57.670 --> 00:34:00.650 Or is it more like me yesterday and me today?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:00.650 --> 00:34:03.548 The me yesterday became the me today.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:03.550 --> 00:34:05.690 Notice this depends on both  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:05.690 --> 00:34:06.546 metaphysical premises,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:06.550 --> 00:34:07.970 but also factual questions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:07.970 --> 00:34:09.745 like the polarity of the.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:09.750 --> 00:34:12.207 Embryo and directions in which it develops.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:12.210 --> 00:34:13.794 There's a ton more to say about this,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:13.800 --> 00:34:14.862 but I want to make sure  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:14.862 --> 00:34:15.820 to be respectful at time,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:15.820 --> 00:34:17.170 so I'm going to stop here  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667  
00:34:17.170 --> 00:34:18.640 just with the idea as to why,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:34:18.640 --> 00:34:20.060 as a normative matter,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:34:20.060 --> 00:34:21.835 questions about embryo destruction and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:34:21.835 --> 00:34:24.255 their relation to abortion are very complex.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.883939099166667

00:34:24.260 --> 00:34:25.028 Thank you very much.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:26.570 --> 00:34:28.790 Thank you so much, Glenn.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:28.790 --> 00:34:30.524 And and I apologize to everybody  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:30.524 --> 00:34:32.432 involved in this talk that I've  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:32.432 --> 00:34:34.172 brought together these four wonderful  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:34.172 --> 00:34:36.168 scholars and then limited them so  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:36.168 --> 00:34:38.261 significantly in the time that they had.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:38.270 --> 00:34:40.948 But I do appreciate the the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:40.948 --> 00:34:42.676 efforts to stick with the time  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:42.676 --> 00:34:44.070 and the conversation thus far.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:44.070 --> 00:34:45.984 Now the third speaker this evening  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:45.984 --> 00:34:47.610 will be Doctor Sarah Hull.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:47.610 --> 00:34:49.680 Sarah is a board certified cardiologist

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:49.680 --> 00:34:51.367 and echocardiographer here at Yale

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:51.367 --> 00:34:52.909 and a well known educator here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:52.910 --> 00:34:54.890 Yeah, she's also an associate director

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:54.890 --> 00:34:56.910 of our program for biomedical.

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:56.910 --> 00:34:59.997 Ethics Sarah, guys on AB from Harvard

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:34:59.997 --> 00:35:02.020 University and Biochemical Sciences,

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:02.020 --> 00:35:04.018 a masters degree in bioethics from

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:04.018 --> 00:35:05.350 the University of Pennsylvania,

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:05.350 --> 00:35:07.555 where she also received her MD and

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:07.555 --> 00:35:09.400 did her internship and residency,

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:09.400 --> 00:35:11.404 and Sarah did her fellowship in

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:11.404 --> 00:35:13.480 Cardiology here at Yale and Seller.

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:13.480 --> 00:35:15.818 Sarah is a highly respected and beloved

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:15.818 --> 00:35:18.019 educator here at the medical school,

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:18.020 --> 00:35:19.478 and we're very pleased to hear

NOTE Confidence: 0.920810398

00:35:19.478 --> 00:35:21.110 your take on this doctor hall.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:22.660 --> 00:35:24.400 Thank you so much, Mark,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:24.400 --> 00:35:27.208 and thank you as well to Katie and Glenn

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:27.208 --> 00:35:29.859 for your really insightful comments.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:29.860 --> 00:35:32.282 I'm the the last comments about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:32.282 --> 00:35:33.615 the potential personhood claims

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:33.615 --> 00:35:35.503 of the fetus are are going to be

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:35.503 --> 00:35:37.689 a really nice launching point I

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:37.689 --> 00:35:40.321 think as as I shift gears to talking

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:40.321 --> 00:35:42.766 more about medical ethics and also

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:42.766 --> 00:35:46.283 delve into a little bit of of moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:46.283 --> 00:35:48.155 philosophy and anthropology with

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:48.155 --> 00:35:51.388 respect to moral claims that that on

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:51.388 --> 00:35:54.130 personhood that the fetus may have.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:54.130 --> 00:35:57.478 I don't have any.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:57.480 --> 00:35:59.240 Conflicts of interest to disclose.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:35:59.240 --> 00:36:02.131 But I will start by outlining pretty

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:02.131 --> 00:36:05.004 clearly what I I intend to argue

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:05.004 --> 00:36:07.332 with my portion of this panel.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:07.340 --> 00:36:10.026 Which is to say that political or

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:10.026 --> 00:36:11.941 governmental restriction of access to

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:11.941 --> 00:36:13.680 evidence based reproductive healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:13.680 --> 00:36:14.708 including abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:14.708 --> 00:36:17.278 is unethical for several reasons.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:17.280 --> 00:36:19.090 Because it violates the autonomy

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:19.090 --> 00:36:20.176 of pregnant persons,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:20.180 --> 00:36:22.220 because it exposes women to harm,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:22.220 --> 00:36:24.764 and because it exacerbates

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:24.764 --> 00:36:27.308 systemic inequity and injustice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:27.310 --> 00:36:29.446 So, but before I go there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:29.450 --> 00:36:30.927 I I do think it's really important

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:30.927 --> 00:36:32.697 for us to discuss the moral status  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:32.697 --> 00:36:34.795 of the fetus because that that is for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:34.795 --> 00:36:36.930 many a salient considerations in this debate,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:36.930 --> 00:36:39.666 although I will argue that it actually is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:39.670 --> 00:36:42.246 it should not be the central consideration.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:42.250 --> 00:36:44.242 But I think we we need to address  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:44.242 --> 00:36:45.904 it because it is very important  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:45.904 --> 00:36:48.022 with respect to how we think about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:48.022 --> 00:36:49.210 ethical health policy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:49.210 --> 00:36:49.841 So.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:49.841 --> 00:36:54.258 While it is of course the easiest  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:54.258 --> 00:36:56.771 to argue that personhood begins  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:56.771 --> 00:36:58.856 at a clearly demarcated line,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:36:58.860 --> 00:37:01.440 such as conception or fertilization,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:01.440 --> 00:37:04.116 or at the moment of birth,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:04.120 --> 00:37:05.710 I think this really oversimplifies

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:05.710 --> 00:37:07.969 what for many people is a much

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:07.969 --> 00:37:08.890 more complex reality,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:08.890 --> 00:37:11.158 which is to say that there's a

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:11.158 --> 00:37:13.570 lot of Gray zone and continuum

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:13.570 --> 00:37:15.835 in between those two points,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:15.840 --> 00:37:18.330 and and many people don't necessarily

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:18.330 --> 00:37:21.429 ascribe to one of those two moments.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:21.430 --> 00:37:24.294 As a moment where there's a clear line

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:24.294 --> 00:37:26.419 between complete absence of personhood

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:26.419 --> 00:37:28.654 and full conferral of personhood,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:28.660 --> 00:37:30.526 and I think if we interrogate

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:30.526 --> 00:37:31.459 our moral intuition,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:31.460 --> 00:37:33.863 we can really help to to put put words

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:33.863 --> 00:37:35.939 and and a more concrete understanding

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:35.939 --> 00:37:38.199 of of what I'm trying to say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:38.200 --> 00:37:39.664 So let's say that that you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:39.664 --> 00:37:40.980 are on a sinking ship,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:40.980 --> 00:37:44.220 it's sinking very fast and it's a long ship,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:44.220 --> 00:37:46.965 and at one end you have a frozen test  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:46.965 --> 00:37:49.895 tube with five fertilized embryos in it,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:49.900 --> 00:37:51.636 and at the other end you have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:51.636 --> 00:37:52.690 a one month old.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:52.690 --> 00:37:53.013 Baby,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:53.013 --> 00:37:55.597 I think I would be hard pressed to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:55.597 --> 00:37:57.740 believe that anybody on this call  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:37:57.740 --> 00:38:00.387 would hesitate to save the baby if if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:00.387 --> 00:38:02.752 you only have time to save one of them,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:02.752 --> 00:38:04.264 you don't have time to save both  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:04.264 --> 00:38:05.912 and get on that on a lifeboat  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:05.912 --> 00:38:06.832 before the ship sinks.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:06.840 --> 00:38:07.280 I think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:07.280 --> 00:38:08.600 I think everybody would save the

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:08.600 --> 00:38:10.159 one month old baby before they

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:10.159 --> 00:38:11.235 saved the fertilized embryos.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:11.240 --> 00:38:13.976 Because we intuitively we know that

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:13.976 --> 00:38:17.643 that that baby has more of a claim

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:17.643 --> 00:38:20.277 to personhood than those embryos do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:20.280 --> 00:38:21.520 Although at the same time

NOTE Confidence: 0.962392592

00:38:21.520 --> 00:38:22.760 I think that if there

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:22.822 --> 00:38:24.486 were no baby. There and there were

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:24.486 --> 00:38:26.440 just a test tube full of embryos.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:26.440 --> 00:38:29.416 I don't think many people would would say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:29.420 --> 00:38:31.618 Oh well that's just, that's just debris.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:31.620 --> 00:38:33.690 Just like you know this this flag on the

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:33.690 --> 00:38:35.619 ship and you can just let it go down.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:35.620 --> 00:38:37.930 I I think that that many people

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:37.930 --> 00:38:40.382 would make a good faith effort to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:40.382 --> 00:38:43.014 to to take that test tube if it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:43.014 --> 00:38:44.953 were possible to do so and not,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:44.960 --> 00:38:47.745 not compromise the survival of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:47.745 --> 00:38:50.530 for example that that hypothetical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:50.617 --> 00:38:52.979 one month old baby and so again.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:52.979 --> 00:38:54.890 I I think that if we interrogate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:54.959 --> 00:38:56.150 our moral intuition,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:56.150 --> 00:38:58.112 we can understand that there there's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:38:58.112 --> 00:39:00.238 some sort of middle ground between  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:00.238 --> 00:39:02.133 absence of personhood and full  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:02.133 --> 00:39:04.316 personhood for many that that an embryo  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:04.316 --> 00:39:06.830 or a fetus can can lay claim to.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:06.830 --> 00:39:09.950 And I actually find the concept  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:09.950 --> 00:39:10.990 of liminality,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:10.990 --> 00:39:12.660 as described by the anthropologist

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:12.660 --> 00:39:13.328 Victor Turner,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:13.330 --> 00:39:15.976 is really helpful to sort of understand  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:15.976 --> 00:39:18.929 how how we might think about this,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:18.930 --> 00:39:20.526 this sort of Gray zone or this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:20.526 --> 00:39:21.390 in between state, or,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:21.390 --> 00:39:22.290 as Victor Turner would say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:22.290 --> 00:39:23.960 a liminal state or transitional.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:23.960 --> 00:39:25.990 State between absence of personhood  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:25.990 --> 00:39:27.208 and full personhood,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:27.210 --> 00:39:28.645 the concept of liminality is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:28.645 --> 00:39:30.608 often applied to rights of passage  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:30.608 --> 00:39:31.548 during adolescence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:31.550 --> 00:39:33.158 So, for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:33.158 --> 00:39:35.838 an adolescent is really neither  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:39:35.838 --> 00:39:38.248 a child nor an adult,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:38.250 --> 00:39:40.650 and while we legally decide that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:40.650 --> 00:39:44.437 at age 18 we confer a legal status  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:44.437 --> 00:39:46.529 of adulthood onto people,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:46.530 --> 00:39:48.210 we know that it's that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:48.210 --> 00:39:49.300 Actually, it's not a neat,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:49.300 --> 00:39:51.316 discrete line before which someone is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:51.316 --> 00:39:53.970 not an adult and after which someone.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:53.970 --> 00:39:55.438 Someone is an adult.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:55.438 --> 00:39:59.690 But in fact that the the status of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:39:59.690 --> 00:40:01.572 adulthood is is really something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:01.572 --> 00:40:03.137 that's achieved gradually over time.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:03.140 --> 00:40:04.874 And there's no one discrete time  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:04.874 --> 00:40:06.804 point at which you can say someone  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:06.804 --> 00:40:08.238 is or is not an adult.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:08.240 --> 00:40:11.282 And I think the same is true for many  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:11.282 --> 00:40:13.139 individuals when they think about

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:13.140 --> 00:40:15.380 how normatively they would approach  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:15.380 --> 00:40:18.520 the question of of fetal personhood.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:18.520 --> 00:40:19.690 I think, again,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:19.690 --> 00:40:22.917 we can look at our moral intuition to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:22.917 --> 00:40:25.787 to sort of confirm this by considering.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:25.790 --> 00:40:26.332 How?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:26.332 --> 00:40:26.874 How?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:26.874 --> 00:40:30.126 The loss of an intended pregnancy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:30.130 --> 00:40:32.506 would affect people at different stages.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:32.510 --> 00:40:33.851 So for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:33.851 --> 00:40:37.565 the loss of a the miscarriage of a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:37.565 --> 00:40:40.988 seven week embryo is certainly very sad.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:40.990 --> 00:40:42.904 Whereas the miscarriage of a 5  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:42.904 --> 00:40:44.890 month old fetus for whom many  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:40:44.890 --> 00:40:46.804 people may have chosen a name,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:46.810 --> 00:40:49.510 started decorating of a babies room,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:49.510 --> 00:40:50.966 that's really a tragedy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:50.966 --> 00:40:53.150 And then if you compare that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:53.218 --> 00:40:55.210 to the death of a 2 year old.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:55.210 --> 00:40:57.000 Child who has a name,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:57.000 --> 00:40:59.436 who has relationships with other people?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:40:59.440 --> 00:41:01.996 That's a devastating life changing event,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:02.000 --> 00:41:03.938 and I think it's really disingenuous  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:03.938 --> 00:41:06.301 to pretend that all of those things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:06.301 --> 00:41:07.641 are morally equivalent because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:07.641 --> 00:41:10.153 all of them have the same claim to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:10.153 --> 00:41:12.033 personhood I I think that's not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:12.033 --> 00:41:14.631 actually what what most most or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:14.631 --> 00:41:17.080 certainly many people would believe.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:17.080 --> 00:41:19.334 I would also note that we typically  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846

00:41:19.334 --> 00:41:21.386 place very high symbolic value on

NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:41:21.386 --> 00:41:23.432 a person's date of birth rather  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885783286153846  
00:41:23.432 --> 00:41:25.726 than a person's date of conception.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:25.730 --> 00:41:27.060 And that's really a defining  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:27.060 --> 00:41:28.124 aspect of our personhood.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:28.130 --> 00:41:29.402 You know, if you look someone  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:29.402 --> 00:41:30.630 up in their Wikipedia article,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:30.630 --> 00:41:32.046 it says when they were born,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:32.050 --> 00:41:33.388 the date of birth is what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:33.388 --> 00:41:34.890 we use on legal documents.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:34.890 --> 00:41:36.702 We celebrate each other's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:36.702 --> 00:41:37.608 birthdays culturally.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:37.610 --> 00:41:40.594 And so it it at least again seems  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:40.594 --> 00:41:43.698 reasonable that in in many ways we sort  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:43.698 --> 00:41:46.281 of tacitly understand that that full  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276  
00:41:46.281 --> 00:41:48.726 personhood is conferred upon birth.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:41:48.730 --> 00:41:50.458 But that's not to negate the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:41:50.458 --> 00:41:52.410 fact that there may be some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:41:52.410 --> 00:41:53.890 partial or incomplete claims,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:41:53.890 --> 00:41:55.315 or or liminal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:41:55.315 --> 00:41:58.640 Names, as it were to to personhood  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:41:58.640 --> 00:42:00.960 after conception but before birth.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:00.960 --> 00:42:03.680 I I think more importantly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:03.680 --> 00:42:05.860 as has been stated earlier,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:05.860 --> 00:42:08.140 this is really a metaphysical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:08.140 --> 00:42:10.986 question that that is predicated on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:10.986 --> 00:42:13.436 individual values and belief systems,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:13.440 --> 00:42:15.545 and science alone cannot actually  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:15.545 --> 00:42:17.229 decide what the personhood  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:17.229 --> 00:42:19.318 of an embryo or a fetus is.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:19.320 --> 00:42:20.058 And furthermore,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:20.058 --> 00:42:22.272 it's unlikely that we will ever

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:22.272 --> 00:42:24.174 really achieve a robust consensus

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:24.174 --> 00:42:26.004 in our pluralistic society and.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:26.010 --> 00:42:28.450 If we really need to draw a line,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:28.450 --> 00:42:30.669 then we should leave that to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:30.669 --> 00:42:31.963 individual pregnant person who

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:31.963 --> 00:42:33.667 is carrying that embryo or fetus,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:33.670 --> 00:42:36.134 and leave it to that person to

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:36.134 --> 00:42:38.778 decide when when full personhood

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:38.778 --> 00:42:41.638 is conferred upon that fetus.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:41.640 --> 00:42:44.610 I will also just note from a just to

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:44.610 --> 00:42:48.623 provide some data that 93% of abortions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:48.623 --> 00:42:51.577 according to the CDC this is from 2019.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:51.577 --> 00:42:53.012 93% of abortions occur at

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:53.012 --> 00:42:54.800 less than 13 weeks gestation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:54.800 --> 00:42:58.148 and only and under 1% occur after 20 weeks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:42:58.148 --> 00:43:00.620 So for for people who do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:00.710 --> 00:43:02.678 ascribe or agree with,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:02.680 --> 00:43:03.298 ascribe to,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:03.298 --> 00:43:05.770 or agree with this concept of sort of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:05.837 --> 00:43:07.762 a gradual accumulation of personhood  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:07.762 --> 00:43:10.699 claims as the embryo and fetus develops,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:10.700 --> 00:43:13.396 it's worth noting that the vast majority of.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:13.400 --> 00:43:15.945 Of elective terminations of pregnancy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:15.945 --> 00:43:19.592 or or abortions occur in the embryonic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:19.592 --> 00:43:23.162 or very early fetal stages of development.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:23.170 --> 00:43:25.494 So if I'm arguing that we really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:25.494 --> 00:43:27.830 shouldn't use the moral claims of a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:27.830 --> 00:43:30.221 fetus to personhood as a basis for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:30.221 --> 00:43:32.669 public policy in a pluralistic society,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:32.670 --> 00:43:34.130 because it's a metaphysical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:34.130 --> 00:43:35.590 and very personal question,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:35.590 --> 00:43:37.855 what should we base ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:37.855 --> 00:43:39.667 public health policy on?

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:39.670 --> 00:43:41.590 And the first concept is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:41.590 --> 00:43:43.144 is of course the concept of autonomy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:43.150 --> 00:43:45.775 which has been mentioned by by my

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:45.775 --> 00:43:47.884 colleagues or alternate or as I would

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:47.884 --> 00:43:50.201 define that and as many would define

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:50.201 --> 00:43:52.385 it as an individual moral agents,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:52.390 --> 00:43:52.935 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:52.935 --> 00:43:55.660 To self-determination or self governance

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:55.660 --> 00:43:58.460 and as autonomous moral agents,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:43:58.460 --> 00:44:00.290 women should maintain the right

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:00.290 --> 00:44:02.120 to determine how their bodies

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:02.180 --> 00:44:03.560 may or may not be used.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:03.560 --> 00:44:05.700 Full stop.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:05.700 --> 00:44:07.905 Similarly if if again we take an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:07.905 --> 00:44:10.358 example to to help illustrate this,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:10.360 --> 00:44:12.544 if if I am a bone marrow match  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:12.544 --> 00:44:15.569 for my sister who has a terrible  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:15.569 --> 00:44:17.009 hematologic malignancy that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:17.009 --> 00:44:19.356 is severely limiting her life  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:19.356 --> 00:44:21.536 expectancy and she's not expected  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:21.536 --> 00:44:23.590 to live more than a few months.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:23.590 --> 00:44:25.536 Unless I donate my bone marrow and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:25.536 --> 00:44:27.850 there are no other matches out there,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:27.850 --> 00:44:30.406 it's me or it's no one.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:30.410 --> 00:44:32.534 I don't think anybody would argue  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:32.534 --> 00:44:35.049 that I should be compelled by the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81536276

00:44:35.049 --> 00:44:37.429 law to donate my bone marrow to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:37.506 --> 00:44:38.966 her. Now, many people would argue that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:38.966 --> 00:44:40.488 that would be the right thing to do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:40.490 --> 00:44:42.485 that the most ethical thing to do

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:42.485 --> 00:44:44.990 would be to to donate my bone marrow,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:44.990 --> 00:44:47.015 and that it would be to use to use

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:47.015 --> 00:44:48.968 some moral philosophy terminology.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:48.970 --> 00:44:49.994 It would be supererogatory,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:49.994 --> 00:44:52.210 or it would be a good thing to do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:52.210 --> 00:44:53.908 but it would not be obligatory.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:53.910 --> 00:44:56.196 Or my legal or ethical duty

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:56.196 --> 00:44:58.940 to do that no matter what.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:44:58.940 --> 00:45:00.512 And certainly, even if you think

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:00.512 --> 00:45:02.120 that ethically it should be my duty,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:02.120 --> 00:45:03.926 most people would not argue that legally

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:03.926 --> 00:45:05.641 we should compel people to donate their

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:05.641 --> 00:45:07.340 bone marrow or to donate a kidney,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:07.340 --> 00:45:08.236 for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:08.236 --> 00:45:11.372 to individuals who who may need them,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:11.380 --> 00:45:14.134 even if there's no other no other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:14.134 --> 00:45:16.396 available donor that can be identified.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:16.400 --> 00:45:16.968 And similarly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:16.968 --> 00:45:19.648 we can no more compel women to carry an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89734832

00:45:19.648 --> 00:45:21.748 unwanted pregnancy by the same reasoning.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:23.840 --> 00:45:25.228 Another important ethical consideration  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:25.228 --> 00:45:27.959 upon which I think we should base sound  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:27.959 --> 00:45:29.753 and ethical public health policy is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:29.760 --> 00:45:32.525 of course the concept of of beneficence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:32.525 --> 00:45:35.484 and the and the and the similar  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:35.484 --> 00:45:37.594 concept of of harm reduction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:37.600 --> 00:45:39.931 And again, it's it's worth noting that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:39.931 --> 00:45:42.669 abortion is an essential component of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:42.669 --> 00:45:44.897 evidence based reproductive healthcare.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85593524555556

00:45:44.900 --> 00:45:46.776 And in fact I I really take

NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:45:46.776 --> 00:45:48.540 issue with the term pro-life,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:45:48.540 --> 00:45:51.781 as it's often used as a euphemism  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:45:51.781 --> 00:45:53.850 for pro forced birth.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:45:53.850 --> 00:45:55.850 Because if your policy actually  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:45:55.850 --> 00:45:57.850 is forcing gestation and birth,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:45:57.850 --> 00:45:59.300 that's actually an often an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:45:59.300 --> 00:46:00.750 anti life policy with respect  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:00.809 --> 00:46:02.389 to the pregnant person herself.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:02.390 --> 00:46:04.645 Pregnancy carries several non negligible  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:04.645 --> 00:46:06.900 risks of morbidity and mortality  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:06.970 --> 00:46:08.950 even in otherwise healthy women,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:08.950 --> 00:46:10.990 and these include massive hemorrhage,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:10.990 --> 00:46:11.804 gestational diabetes,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:11.804 --> 00:46:12.211 eclampsia,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:12.211 --> 00:46:14.653 which is a condition characterized by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:14.653 --> 00:46:16.759 dangerously high blood pressure and seizures,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:16.760 --> 00:46:18.825 stroke, sepsis and pulmonary embolism  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:18.825 --> 00:46:21.869 which is a blood clot in the lungs,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:21.870 --> 00:46:24.250 the risk of domestic violence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:24.250 --> 00:46:25.402 Also escalates during pregnancy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:25.402 --> 00:46:27.520 so it can be a safety concern  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:27.520 --> 00:46:29.205 even beyond a medical concern.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:29.210 --> 00:46:31.570 And according to the CDC,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:31.570 --> 00:46:35.168 in 2020 the maternal mortality rate was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:35.170 --> 00:46:39.188 24 deaths per per 100,000 live births,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:39.190 --> 00:46:41.390 compared with only .4 deaths  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:41.390 --> 00:46:42.624 per 100,000 abortions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:42.624 --> 00:46:45.800 So that's a 60 fold difference in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:45.872 --> 00:46:48.506 mortality risk between an abortion and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:48.506 --> 00:46:51.645 carrying a pregnancy to term and and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:46:51.645 --> 00:46:54.546 delivering that that pregnancy and so.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:54.546 --> 00:46:55.124 Again,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:55.124 --> 00:46:59.170 forcing women to stay pregnant and to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:46:59.290 --> 00:47:02.540 deliver a child is is most certainly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:02.540 --> 00:47:06.339 putting her at the risk of additional harm.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:06.340 --> 00:47:07.082 In addition,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:07.082 --> 00:47:08.566 there are certain pre-existing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:08.566 --> 00:47:10.050 conditions that increase the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:10.108 --> 00:47:11.760 risk of pregnancy substantially,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:11.760 --> 00:47:13.316 in particular cardiac disease.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:13.316 --> 00:47:15.261 The American College of Cardiology  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:15.261 --> 00:47:17.222 states that cardiovascular disease is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:17.222 --> 00:47:19.490 the leading cause of maternal mortality  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:19.552 --> 00:47:21.820 and there are certain conditions such  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:21.820 --> 00:47:23.683 as severe pulmonary hypertension that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:23.683 --> 00:47:25.741 can carry a combined maternal and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:25.741 --> 00:47:27.759 fetal mortality rate approaching 50%.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:27.760 --> 00:47:29.848 And actually it's recommended  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:29.848 --> 00:47:33.546 as part of the standard of care  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:33.546 --> 00:47:35.376 to Council consideration of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:35.376 --> 00:47:37.168 pregnancy termination for patients.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:37.170 --> 00:47:38.592 With these conditions,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:38.592 --> 00:47:40.488 who who become pregnant?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:40.490 --> 00:47:40.929 Furthermore,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:40.929 --> 00:47:43.124 the development of certain conditions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:43.124 --> 00:47:45.929 can pit the survival of the fetus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:45.929 --> 00:47:47.903 against the survival of the mother.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:47.910 --> 00:47:48.277 So,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:48.277 --> 00:47:49.011 for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:49.011 --> 00:47:51.213 let's take a young woman who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:51.213 --> 00:47:52.735 recently discovers that she's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:47:52.735 --> 00:47:55.255 pregnant and also is at the same

NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:55.332 --> 00:47:57.337 time diagnosed with an aggressive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:57.337 --> 00:47:59.830 form of breast cancer for which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:47:59.830 --> 00:48:01.750 chemotherapy is recommended without  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:01.750 --> 00:48:04.760 undue delay in order to maximize  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:04.760 --> 00:48:07.410 their chances of survival without.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:07.410 --> 00:48:09.528 Which she would likely have a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:09.528 --> 00:48:11.640 much higher chance of of death.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:11.640 --> 00:48:13.196 Most chemotherapy is absolutely  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:13.196 --> 00:48:15.141 incompatible with the development of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:15.141 --> 00:48:17.479 a fetus because it's very cytotoxic,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:17.480 --> 00:48:19.580 particularly deadly to dividing cells,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:19.580 --> 00:48:21.338 which is of course exactly what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:21.338 --> 00:48:22.740 an embryo and fetus do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:22.740 --> 00:48:25.776 And so by by restricting access  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556  
00:48:25.776 --> 00:48:27.800 to pregnancy termination you're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:27.887 --> 00:48:30.299 basically telling this patient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:30.300 --> 00:48:32.286 that she cannot undergo the the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:32.286 --> 00:48:34.050 evidence based treatment she needs  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:34.050 --> 00:48:35.935 for her life threatening condition,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:35.940 --> 00:48:37.576 but instead she must.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:37.576 --> 00:48:40.576 Serve as a vessel for for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:40.576 --> 00:48:42.826 fetus that she is carrying,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:42.830 --> 00:48:45.038 even though it may very well be that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855935245555556

00:48:45.038 --> 00:48:47.406 that child will grow up without a mother,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:48:47.410 --> 00:48:49.165 and not to mention other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:48:49.165 --> 00:48:50.569 children and other people,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:48:50.570 --> 00:48:54.000 other dependents that this person might have.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:48:54.000 --> 00:48:56.715 And accordingly, many medical societies  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:48:56.715 --> 00:48:59.430 have made statements either expressing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:48:59.502 --> 00:49:02.326 concern about the Dobbs decision or very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:02.326 --> 00:49:04.256 explicit support of abortion rights,

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:04.260 --> 00:49:05.700 underscoring the primacy of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:05.700 --> 00:49:07.500 the health of pregnant persons.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:07.500 --> 00:49:09.160 And these include the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:09.160 --> 00:49:10.405 American Medical Association,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:10.410 --> 00:49:12.180 the American College of Physicians,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:12.180 --> 00:49:13.788 the American College of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:13.788 --> 00:49:14.994 Obstetricians and Gynecologists,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:15.000 --> 00:49:17.118 the American Academy of Family Physicians,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:17.120 --> 00:49:19.140 the American Academy of Pediatrics,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:19.140 --> 00:49:20.692 the American Psychiatric Association,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:20.692 --> 00:49:22.632 the American College of Cardiology,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:22.640 --> 00:49:23.968 and the American Society  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:23.968 --> 00:49:24.964 of Clinical Oncology.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:24.970 --> 00:49:27.010 So while the moral status of a fetus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222  
00:49:27.010 --> 00:49:29.154 may be a metaphysical question upon  
NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:29.154 --> 00:49:31.506 which we may never achieve consensus,

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:31.510 --> 00:49:33.320 there's a very clear consensus

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:33.320 --> 00:49:35.130 in the medical profession that

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:35.191 --> 00:49:37.236 pregnancy is a potentially high

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:37.236 --> 00:49:38.872 risk condition and restricting

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:38.872 --> 00:49:41.068 access to evidence based healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:41.070 --> 00:49:41.846 including abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:41.846 --> 00:49:44.174 is unethical and because it is

NOTE Confidence: 0.764211382222222

00:49:44.174 --> 00:49:45.400 harmful to women.

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:49:48.570 --> 00:49:51.048 I'm going to quote from the American

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:49:51.048 --> 00:49:52.689 Medical Association statement because it

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:49:52.689 --> 00:49:54.785 provides a very nice segue to the last

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:49:54.847 --> 00:49:56.935 consideration that I'd like to discuss,

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:49:56.940 --> 00:49:59.327 which is the consideration of of justice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:49:59.330 --> 00:50:01.507 So I quote from the AMA statement.

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:01.510 --> 00:50:03.340 From June 24th, access to legal

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:03.340 --> 00:50:05.332 reproductive care will be limited to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:05.332 --> 00:50:07.127 those with the sufficient resources,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:07.130 --> 00:50:10.049 circumstances, and financial means to do so,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:10.050 --> 00:50:11.860 exacerbating health inequities by placing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:11.860 --> 00:50:14.270 the heaviest burden on patients from Black,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:14.270 --> 00:50:17.480 Latinx, indigenous, low income, rural.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:17.480 --> 00:50:19.200 And other historically disadvantaged  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:19.200 --> 00:50:20.920 communities who already face  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:20.920 --> 00:50:22.615 numerous structural and systemic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:22.615 --> 00:50:24.167 barriers to accessing healthcare.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:24.170 --> 00:50:26.010 So again, to be clear,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:26.010 --> 00:50:27.928 women we know that women of color  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:27.928 --> 00:50:29.619 and low socioeconomic status are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:29.619 --> 00:50:30.846 disproportionately affected by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:50:30.846 --> 00:50:32.482 restrictions on abortion access,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:32.490 --> 00:50:34.350 and they also already face higher  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:34.350 --> 00:50:36.023 risks of pregnancy related morbidity  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:36.023 --> 00:50:38.261 and mortality due to structural racism  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:38.261 --> 00:50:39.950 and social determinants of health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:39.950 --> 00:50:40.508 For example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:40.508 --> 00:50:42.182 the risk of pregnancy related death  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:42.182 --> 00:50:44.281 is 3 to four times higher for black  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:44.281 --> 00:50:46.144 women than it is for white women  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:46.144 --> 00:50:48.511 in the United States and in 2020,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:48.511 --> 00:50:50.646 the CDC estimated the maternal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:50.646 --> 00:50:52.578 mortality rate for black women  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:52.578 --> 00:50:55.902 at 55 deaths per 100,000.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:55.902 --> 00:50:57.398 Live births.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:57.400 --> 00:50:58.022 Interestingly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:58.022 --> 00:50:59.888 this is because,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:50:59.888 --> 00:51:00.510 again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:00.510 --> 00:51:02.785 I think in recent years we've begun  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:02.785 --> 00:51:04.273 to understand that differences  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:04.273 --> 00:51:06.503 in socioeconomic status do not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:06.503 --> 00:51:08.287 explain away racial inequities,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:08.290 --> 00:51:10.655 and that structural racism persists  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:10.655 --> 00:51:12.547 regardless of socioeconomic status.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:12.550 --> 00:51:14.122 Even when that's corrected.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:14.122 --> 00:51:16.969 And many may remember when Serena Williams  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:16.969 --> 00:51:19.507 was pregnant and delivered her child,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:19.510 --> 00:51:22.030 she had a pulmonary embolism and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:22.030 --> 00:51:24.250 she knew something was wrong.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:24.250 --> 00:51:27.630 She urged her healthcare providers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:27.630 --> 00:51:30.326 To look into this further because she was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:30.326 --> 00:51:32.343 concerned she had a pulmonary embolism  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154  
00:51:32.343 --> 00:51:35.179 and she was dismissed as as a quote crazy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:51:35.180 --> 00:51:37.972 And so even for someone as as famous  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:51:37.972 --> 00:51:40.998 and well respected as Serena Williams,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:51:41.000 --> 00:51:42.638 this is still a problem if black  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:51:42.638 --> 00:51:44.517 women are are not believed and are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:51:44.517 --> 00:51:46.197 are taken less seriously when they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877227573846154

00:51:46.254 --> 00:51:48.089 express concerns about their health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:51:50.120 --> 00:51:52.360 Furthermore, restrictions on abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:51:52.360 --> 00:51:55.160 access again don't eliminate abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:51:55.160 --> 00:51:57.935 they just eliminate safe abortions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:51:57.935 --> 00:52:00.155 for already vulnerable populations.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:52:00.160 --> 00:52:02.698 Again, according to the American College  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:52:02.698 --> 00:52:04.899 of Obstetricians and Gynecologists I quote,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:52:04.900 --> 00:52:06.304 approximately 21 million women  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:52:06.304 --> 00:52:08.059 around the world obtain unsafe,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:52:08.060 --> 00:52:09.652 illegal abortions each year,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.854970093333333

00:52:09.652 --> 00:52:11.642 and complications from these unsafe

NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:11.642 --> 00:52:13.254 procedures account for approximately  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:13.254 --> 00:52:15.132 13% of all maternal deaths,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:15.132 --> 00:52:17.410 nearly 50,000 annually.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:17.410 --> 00:52:20.354 Now, I will note that there are some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:20.354 --> 00:52:22.710 concerns from disability advocates.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:22.710 --> 00:52:24.406 I apologize for the scratching of my dog.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:24.410 --> 00:52:25.607 In the background,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:25.607 --> 00:52:27.602 there are some legitimate concerns  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:27.602 --> 00:52:29.595 from disability advocates that overly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:29.595 --> 00:52:31.475 permissive abortion laws promote a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:31.475 --> 00:52:34.723 form may promote a form of eugenics by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:34.723 --> 00:52:35.938 selectively terminating pregnancies  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:35.938 --> 00:52:37.469 with significant fetal abnormalities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:37.469 --> 00:52:40.120 But I should note that this criticism  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:52:40.120 --> 00:52:42.050 actually ignores the fact that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:42.050 --> 00:52:43.530 some people with disabilities,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:43.530 --> 00:52:45.910 when they are adults themselves,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:45.910 --> 00:52:47.597 may be at increased risk of pregnancy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:47.600 --> 00:52:49.305 Related morbidity or mortality if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:49.305 --> 00:52:51.670 they were to be forced to carry  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:51.670 --> 00:52:52.850 a pregnancy to turn,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:52.850 --> 00:52:54.750 and limiting abortion access may  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:54.750 --> 00:52:56.650 therefore actually harm these disabled  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:56.706 --> 00:52:59.610 people disproportionately as adults as well.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:52:59.610 --> 00:53:00.254 And so,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:00.254 --> 00:53:01.864 while I understand that there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:01.864 --> 00:53:04.616 there is a legitimate concern from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:04.616 --> 00:53:06.329 these disability advocates,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:06.330 --> 00:53:07.890 I would argue that the answer is not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:07.890 --> 00:53:09.788 to force women to carry to term and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:09.788 --> 00:53:11.312 deliver pregnancies when they do not

NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:11.312 --> 00:53:12.824 believe that they and their families  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:12.824 --> 00:53:14.678 can adequately care for the baby,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:14.678 --> 00:53:16.363 but rather to reshape policy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:16.363 --> 00:53:17.679 such that families.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:17.680 --> 00:53:19.888 Feel that they can better care for children,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:19.890 --> 00:53:22.032 and some of this might look like  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:22.032 --> 00:53:23.889 universal maternity and paternity leave,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:23.890 --> 00:53:25.470 universally available childcare that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:25.470 --> 00:53:28.070 commensurate with the needs of children,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:28.070 --> 00:53:29.339 particularly when these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:29.339 --> 00:53:30.608 children have disabilities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:30.610 --> 00:53:33.350 Better investment in infrastructure such  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:33.350 --> 00:53:36.730 as public schools and public safety.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:36.730 --> 00:53:37.942 And so, in summary,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:53:37.942 --> 00:53:39.760 the moral status of the fetus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:39.830 --> 00:53:41.690 cannot be resolved by science,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:41.690 --> 00:53:43.706 and it may not be reasonable to expect  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:43.706 --> 00:53:45.527 a consensus in a pluralistic society.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:45.530 --> 00:53:47.636 So we should allow individuals to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:47.636 --> 00:53:49.874 to decide for themselves rather than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:49.874 --> 00:53:52.190 force our personal beliefs onto others.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:52.190 --> 00:53:53.940 Women are autonomous moral agents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:53.940 --> 00:53:55.580 and decisions about healthcare and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:55.580 --> 00:53:57.643 their bodies should be between them  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:57.643 --> 00:53:59.099 and their healthcare providers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:53:59.100 --> 00:54:00.422 Pregnancy and childbirth may  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:54:00.422 --> 00:54:01.730 expose women to harm.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:54:01.730 --> 00:54:03.650 The can sometimes only be mitigated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:54:03.650 --> 00:54:05.728 by the termination of pregnancy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:54:05.730 --> 00:54:08.410 restrictions to access to evidence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333

00:54:08.410 --> 00:54:09.180 Excuse me?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:09.180 --> 00:54:11.105 Restrictions on access to evidence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:11.105 --> 00:54:12.260 based reproductive healthcare,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:12.260 --> 00:54:13.524 including abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:13.524 --> 00:54:16.684 exacerbate already unjust health disparities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:16.690 --> 00:54:17.356 And finally,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:17.356 --> 00:54:19.021 ethical health policy should have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:19.021 --> 00:54:21.163 the dual aims of ensuring patient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:21.163 --> 00:54:22.968 autonomy and access to evidence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:22.970 --> 00:54:24.542 These standards of care,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:24.542 --> 00:54:25.328 including abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:25.330 --> 00:54:27.646 and also to improving health systems  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:27.646 --> 00:54:29.190 to reduce unintended pregnancies  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:29.249 --> 00:54:31.331 and to reduce barriers to providing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:31.331 --> 00:54:32.719 adequate care to children.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8549700933333333  
00:54:32.720 --> 00:54:33.260 Thank you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:36.030 --> 00:54:38.730 Thank you very much, Doctor Hall.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:38.730 --> 00:54:40.840 And to remind you folks,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:40.840 --> 00:54:43.242 we will have some time at the end to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:43.242 --> 00:54:45.286 if you'd like to add some questions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:45.286 --> 00:54:47.328 through the Q&A function on on zoom.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:47.330 --> 00:54:49.306 But we have one more speaker this evening  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:49.306 --> 00:54:51.188 who is a Professor Jennifer Hurt.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:51.190 --> 00:54:53.110 Jennifer Hurd is the Gilbert L  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:53.110 --> 00:54:54.765 Stark professor of Christian ethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:54.765 --> 00:54:56.345 at the Yale Divinity School.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:56.350 --> 00:54:57.946 She's also a former president of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:57.946 --> 00:54:59.302 the Society of Christian Ethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:54:59.302 --> 00:55:00.754 and she serves on the editorial  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:55:00.754 --> 00:55:02.469 boards of the Journal of Religion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:55:02.470 --> 00:55:05.296 Journal of Religious Ethics and Studies.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8960646283333333

00:55:05.300 --> 00:55:07.166 In Christian ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:07.166 --> 00:55:09.654 professor Hurt received her  
NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:09.660 --> 00:55:11.428 bachelor's degree from Oberlin  
NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:11.428 --> 00:55:13.638 College in Religion and Biology,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:13.640 --> 00:55:15.956 a master's degree from Princeton University,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:15.960 --> 00:55:19.032 and a PhD in religion from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:19.032 --> 00:55:20.056 Princeton University.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:20.060 --> 00:55:20.813 Welcome, doctor herdon.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.896064628333333  
00:55:20.813 --> 00:55:22.570 Thank you so much for joining us.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308  
00:55:23.300 --> 00:55:24.400 Thank you very much, Mark.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308  
00:55:24.400 --> 00:55:25.685 And it's really a pleasure  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308  
00:55:25.685 --> 00:55:26.713 to join this panel.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308  
00:55:26.720 --> 00:55:28.624 But I'd like to add this afternoon  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308  
00:55:28.624 --> 00:55:30.488 is a religious ethical lens on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308  
00:55:30.488 --> 00:55:32.128 this conversation with the view  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308  
00:55:32.128 --> 00:55:34.044 of shedding light on how Christian  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:34.044 --> 00:55:35.844 stances and to a lesser extent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:35.850 --> 00:55:38.058 Jewish stances on abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:38.058 --> 00:55:40.266 have become so polarized.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:40.270 --> 00:55:42.226 Why pay attention to this history?

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:42.230 --> 00:55:43.582 Well, for one thing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:43.582 --> 00:55:45.272 because Jewish and Christian perspectives

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:45.272 --> 00:55:47.207 have been central to the formation

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:47.207 --> 00:55:48.747 of the Western legal tradition,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:48.750 --> 00:55:50.958 and also because self identified Christians

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:50.958 --> 00:55:54.510 still make up 63% of the US population.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:54.510 --> 00:55:54.958 Furthermore,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:54.958 --> 00:55:57.198 the decades long activism of

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:57.198 --> 00:55:58.542 certain Christian groups,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:55:58.550 --> 00:56:00.945 notably Roman Catholics in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:00.945 --> 00:56:02.861 coalition with evangelicals powered

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:02.861 --> 00:56:05.246 the overturning of Roe V Wade,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:05.250 --> 00:56:07.440 and often this anti abortion stance

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:07.440 --> 00:56:09.990 is regarded as the Christian view.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:09.990 --> 00:56:12.192 But in fact Christians and official

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:12.192 --> 00:56:14.449 church bodies today have widely varying

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:14.449 --> 00:56:16.609 views on the ethics of abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:16.610 --> 00:56:17.990 ranging from the United Church

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:17.990 --> 00:56:20.293 of Christ on the on one end of

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:20.293 --> 00:56:22.015 the spectrum with a full throated

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:22.015 --> 00:56:23.997 support for abortion rights through

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:23.997 --> 00:56:25.629 total condemnation of abortion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:25.630 --> 00:56:27.966 And among Jews as well, views are divided.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:27.966 --> 00:56:30.430 There are some Orthodox Jews today who

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:30.493 --> 00:56:33.146 do regard abortion as tantamount to murder.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:33.150 --> 00:56:35.154 But many Orthodox Jews

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:35.154 --> 00:56:36.657 support abortion rights,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:36.660 --> 00:56:37.622 and overall,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:37.622 --> 00:56:40.027 88% of American Jews support  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:40.027 --> 00:56:41.470 strong abortion rights.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:41.470 --> 00:56:43.834 And in fact have brought recently  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:43.834 --> 00:56:46.089 and groups have brought religious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:46.089 --> 00:56:48.364 liberty lawsuits claiming that a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:48.364 --> 00:56:50.512 right to abortion is necessary to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:50.512 --> 00:56:52.819 protect their religious free exercise.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:52.820 --> 00:56:53.610 But overall,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:53.610 --> 00:56:55.980 there's a greater polarization of views,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:55.980 --> 00:56:57.960 and particularly here among Christians,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:56:57.960 --> 00:57:00.402 than it perhaps at any other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:00.402 --> 00:57:02.030 time in the past.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:02.030 --> 00:57:03.488 From early on in their history,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:03.490 --> 00:57:05.070 Judaism and Christianity have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:05.070 --> 00:57:06.650 had a pronatalist stance,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:06.650 --> 00:57:09.090 and is rooted in Genesis,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:09.090 --> 00:57:12.066 in the command to be fruitful and multiply.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:12.070 --> 00:57:14.470 So large families were associated

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:14.470 --> 00:57:16.390 with prosperity and blessing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:16.390 --> 00:57:19.470 and this was joined together with a strong

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:19.470 --> 00:57:22.308 concern for the lives of the vulnerable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:22.310 --> 00:57:26.006 So the Hebrew prophets proclaiming the

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:26.006 --> 00:57:30.610 the call made on persons by widows,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:30.610 --> 00:57:31.012 orphans,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:31.012 --> 00:57:31.816 the poor.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:31.816 --> 00:57:34.228 And we see that being extended

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:34.228 --> 00:57:36.410 to other vulnerable life,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:36.410 --> 00:57:38.624 for example in early Christian efforts

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:38.624 --> 00:57:40.890 to save inference from infanticide,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:40.890 --> 00:57:42.966 which was legal under Roman law,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:42.970 --> 00:57:45.994 and Christian efforts to set up  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:45.994 --> 00:57:48.010 orphanages for abandoned children.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:48.010 --> 00:57:51.356 So how did these views as concern  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:51.356 --> 00:57:54.542 for and vulnerable life play out  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:54.542 --> 00:57:56.750 in relationship to abortion?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:56.750 --> 00:57:58.370 Well, in the Hebrew Bible,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:57:58.370 --> 00:58:01.163 the penalty for injuring a pregnant woman  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:01.163 --> 00:58:04.030 and causing a stillbirth was a fine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:04.030 --> 00:58:05.690 But if the woman died,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:05.690 --> 00:58:07.890 the penalty was a life for a life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:07.890 --> 00:58:09.123 In other words,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:09.123 --> 00:58:10.767 abortion was an offense,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:10.770 --> 00:58:13.038 but it wasn't an offense that was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:13.038 --> 00:58:15.822 seen as on the order of murder and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:15.822 --> 00:58:18.655 only ever seen as acquiring the full  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:18.655 --> 00:58:21.879 moral standing of a born human being.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:21.880 --> 00:58:24.664 It was common among Jewish thinkers

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:24.664 --> 00:58:26.936 to distinguish different stages based

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:26.936 --> 00:58:29.358 on how fully formed the fetus was,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:29.360 --> 00:58:31.860 with moral standing increasing

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:31.860 --> 00:58:33.735 as pregnancy progressed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:33.740 --> 00:58:35.645 Abortion was not considered more

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:35.645 --> 00:58:38.000 ethically insignificant at any stage though,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:38.000 --> 00:58:39.888 and rabbinic Judaism prohibited

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:39.888 --> 00:58:42.720 most abortions except to save the

NOTE Confidence: 0.80276308

00:58:42.799 --> 00:58:44.977 life and health of the mother.

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:44.980 --> 00:58:46.556 Within pre modern Christianity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:46.556 --> 00:58:48.920 fetal life was similarly it was

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:48.984 --> 00:58:51.084 widely taken to have moral standing

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:51.084 --> 00:58:53.299 comparable to a born human being,

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:53.300 --> 00:58:55.520 but only after a particular stage,

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:55.520 --> 00:58:57.710 and typically this was associated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:57.710 --> 00:58:59.462 with quickening quickening usually  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:58:59.462 --> 00:59:01.906 in the 4th or 5th month when the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:01.906 --> 00:59:03.918 woman can first feel the movement.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:03.920 --> 00:59:05.237 Of the fetus.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:05.237 --> 00:59:07.432 In medieval theology this was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:07.432 --> 00:59:09.210 associated with ensoulment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:09.210 --> 00:59:11.807 That meant that it was associated with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:11.807 --> 00:59:13.512 the dualistic metaphysics in which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:13.512 --> 00:59:15.640 the soul was implanted in the body at  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:15.706 --> 00:59:17.906 that particular moment of development.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:17.910 --> 00:59:18.970 And prior to this,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:18.970 --> 00:59:21.449 the fetus was seen as part of the mother,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:21.450 --> 00:59:23.928 not seen as a separate human being.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:23.930 --> 00:59:27.472 So penalties for abortions that that were  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

00:59:27.472 --> 00:59:30.350 procured after quickening were more severe,

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:30.350 --> 00:59:32.510 and we can see very similar things in most  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:32.510 --> 00:59:34.738 of them thinkers with different stages.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:34.740 --> 00:59:37.110 That had to do with perception  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:37.110 --> 00:59:39.550 of how developed the fetus was.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:39.550 --> 00:59:41.846 Abortion to save the life of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:41.846 --> 00:59:44.028 mother was accepted at whatever stage,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:44.030 --> 00:59:46.415 and there were both pharmaceutical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:46.415 --> 00:59:48.800 and surgical procedures that were  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:48.877 --> 00:59:51.052 discussed in medical and theological  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:51.052 --> 00:59:53.916 texts as necessary and as justified  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:53.916 --> 00:59:55.758 under such circumstances.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:55.760 --> 00:59:56.860 But that raises a question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:56.860 --> 00:59:57.308 of course.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
00:59:57.308 --> 01:00:00.613 If a P, if if a fetus post quickening has  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:00.613 --> 01:00:03.277 the moral standing of a born human being,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:03.280 --> 01:00:06.076 how could its killing be justified?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:06.080 --> 01:00:09.410 Well, killing in war was justified  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:09.410 --> 01:00:11.075 within the tradition,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:11.080 --> 01:00:13.565 so the prohibition on killing was a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:13.565 --> 01:00:15.739 prohibition of killing of innocent life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:15.740 --> 01:00:16.348 Of course,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:16.348 --> 01:00:18.780 a fetus would seem to be innocent life,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:18.780 --> 01:00:21.503 but the argument is that a fetus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:21.503 --> 01:00:23.317 whose existence threatens the life  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:23.317 --> 01:00:25.621 of the mother is akin to an insane  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:25.696 --> 01:00:28.180 person charging with a lethal weapon.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:28.180 --> 01:00:28.972 That is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:28.972 --> 01:00:31.348 the fetus or the insane person  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:31.348 --> 01:00:33.900 attacking is subjectively innocent,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:33.900 --> 01:00:36.190 but is objectively an aggressor.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:00:36.190 --> 01:00:38.052 And the aggressor may be killed if

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:38.052 --> 01:00:40.016 that's the only way to protect the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:40.016 --> 01:00:41.678 life of the one being threatened.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:41.680 --> 01:00:43.180 And that is the traditional ground  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:43.180 --> 01:00:44.640 for the argument for abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:44.640 --> 01:00:47.151 to save the life of the mother and is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:47.151 --> 01:00:49.897 found across multiple religious traditions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:49.900 --> 01:00:51.725 So there was concern for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:51.725 --> 01:00:52.820 vulnerable fetal life,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:52.820 --> 01:00:54.908 particularly after quickening or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:54.908 --> 01:00:57.518 after some stage of development.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:00:57.520 --> 01:01:00.400 But concern for fetal life was never only,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:00.400 --> 01:01:00.832 never.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:00.832 --> 01:01:02.128 The whole picture,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:02.128 --> 01:01:04.288 just as significant in shaping  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:04.288 --> 01:01:06.723 attitudes to abortion, was a concern.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:06.723 --> 01:01:09.390 The control over women's sexuality and a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:09.464 --> 01:01:12.098 concern for assurance of male lineage.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:12.100 --> 01:01:13.820 Women were thought to seek  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:13.820 --> 01:01:16.048 abortions in order to conceal non  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:16.048 --> 01:01:17.816 or extramarital sexual activity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:17.820 --> 01:01:19.542 And of course that was true given  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:19.542 --> 01:01:21.293 to the harsh treatment of women  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:21.293 --> 01:01:22.893 who engaged in such activity,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:22.900 --> 01:01:26.400 whether or not it was by choice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:26.400 --> 01:01:28.995 So condemnation of abortion by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:28.995 --> 01:01:31.071 these religious traditions was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:31.071 --> 01:01:34.030 part of a patriarchal system of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:34.030 --> 01:01:36.390 male control over women's bodies.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:36.390 --> 01:01:38.530 Speciality.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:38.530 --> 01:01:38.825 Now,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636

01:01:38.825 --> 01:01:40.005 there are several important

NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:40.005 --> 01:01:41.480 shifts in attitudes to abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:41.527 --> 01:01:42.747 and illegal status of abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:42.747 --> 01:01:44.339 or the over the course of U.S.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:44.340 --> 01:01:44.678 history.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:44.678 --> 01:01:47.720 And I have to skip over all of that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:47.799 --> 01:01:50.442 except to note that as fetal under  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:50.442 --> 01:01:52.346 fetal development was understood,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:52.350 --> 01:01:53.518 more and more quickening  
NOTE Confidence: 0.828241561363636  
01:01:53.518 --> 01:01:55.270 was no longer seen as a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:01:55.333 --> 01:01:57.160 particularly relevant ethical,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:01:57.160 --> 01:02:00.109 ethical dividing line.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:00.110 --> 01:02:04.200 So if we go to the mid 1960s and we see that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:04.200 --> 01:02:06.072 well, in the early 1960s abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:06.072 --> 01:02:07.922 was prohibited in those states except  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:07.922 --> 01:02:09.833 to save the life of the mother.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:09.840 --> 01:02:12.279 But in the mid 1960s this starts to change.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:12.280 --> 01:02:14.863 In tandem with the women's movement and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:14.863 --> 01:02:17.040 changing attitudes towards towards sexuality.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:17.040 --> 01:02:19.125 Women were of course seeking  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:19.125 --> 01:02:20.793 social and legal equality,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:20.800 --> 01:02:22.588 seeking autonomy, making decisions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:22.588 --> 01:02:25.790 And what decisions were more intimate and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:25.790 --> 01:02:28.040 weighty than those concerning pregnancy?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:28.040 --> 01:02:29.945 Who was better situated to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:29.945 --> 01:02:31.469 determine whether a pregnancy?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:31.470 --> 01:02:34.494 Posed a threat to a woman's life and health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:34.494 --> 01:02:37.140 that the pregnant persons themselves,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:37.140 --> 01:02:39.606 and this allowed for the consideration  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:39.606 --> 01:02:41.999 of all of the circumstances  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:41.999 --> 01:02:45.299 involved as casuistry in these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:02:45.299 --> 01:02:47.279 religious traditions required.

NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:47.280 --> 01:02:49.698 Well, what really sparked the Roman  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:49.698 --> 01:02:51.901 Catholic movement against these liberalized  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:51.901 --> 01:02:54.017 abortion laws was contraception.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:54.020 --> 01:02:56.132 The birth control pill was introduced  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:56.132 --> 01:02:58.252 in 1960, it was extremely popular,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:02:58.252 --> 01:03:00.370 and it generated fears among Catholic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:00.430 --> 01:03:02.450 authorities that it would encourage.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:02.450 --> 01:03:04.890 Sexual activity outside of wedlock.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:04.890 --> 01:03:05.490 Mainline Protestants,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:05.490 --> 01:03:06.690 in the other hand,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:06.690 --> 01:03:09.510 embraced it as enabling family planning.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:09.510 --> 01:03:11.545 In this social context of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:11.545 --> 01:03:12.766 liberalizing attitudes towards  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:12.766 --> 01:03:14.489 sexual activity and expression,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:14.490 --> 01:03:17.215 Catholic activists had much greater  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:17.215 --> 01:03:19.940 success mobilizing the faithful against  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:20.014 --> 01:03:22.630 abortion than against contraception.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:22.630 --> 01:03:24.550 Sensitized concern for vulnerable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:24.550 --> 01:03:26.470 and dependent fetal life,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:26.470 --> 01:03:29.088 deeply embedded in the tradition proved to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:29.088 --> 01:03:32.283 be a strong force for mobilization mainline.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:32.283 --> 01:03:32.756 Partisans,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:32.756 --> 01:03:33.702 in contrast,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:33.702 --> 01:03:36.540 deeply committed to women's equality and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:36.611 --> 01:03:38.979 autonomy and embracing contraception,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:38.980 --> 01:03:41.140 focus their attention on these goods.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:41.140 --> 01:03:43.294 And we're increasingly inclined to downplay  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:43.294 --> 01:03:45.359 the moral significance of fetal life,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:45.360 --> 01:03:48.048 regardless of its point of development.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:48.050 --> 01:03:49.790 Catholic leaders focus very heavily  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:03:49.790 --> 01:03:52.269 on the rural claim of fetal life,

NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:52.270 --> 01:03:55.846 and we're increasingly inclined to down.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:55.850 --> 01:03:57.602 Play the anguish and justice is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:57.602 --> 01:03:59.452 produced by a system in which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:03:59.452 --> 01:04:00.997 abortions were safe and available  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:00.997 --> 01:04:03.170 only for the wealthy and educated.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:03.170 --> 01:04:04.032 Evangelical Protestants,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:04.032 --> 01:04:04.463 meanwhile,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:04.463 --> 01:04:06.187 were initially immobilized by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:06.187 --> 01:04:07.830 a completely different issue,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:07.830 --> 01:04:10.301 the issue of the freedom of Christian  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:10.301 --> 01:04:12.150 schools from governmental interference,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:12.150 --> 01:04:14.474 which we are now recognizing to have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:14.474 --> 01:04:16.708 been linked with a racist desire  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:16.708 --> 01:04:18.663 to preserve whites only education.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:18.670 --> 01:04:20.776 But evangelicals, too,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:20.776 --> 01:04:24.988 became eager to defend fetal life,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:24.990 --> 01:04:26.433 and this was.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:26.433 --> 01:04:28.838 Tightly yoked to their anxiety  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:28.838 --> 01:04:29.800 over sexuality.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:29.800 --> 01:04:31.864 So on both sides I think we can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:31.864 --> 01:04:34.039 see that there was a failure to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:34.039 --> 01:04:36.085 address in a concerted way the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:36.085 --> 01:04:38.055 primary reasons that women seek  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:38.055 --> 01:04:41.900 and have throughout human history.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:41.900 --> 01:04:44.128 Lack of better affordable,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:44.128 --> 01:04:46.356 readily available means of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:46.356 --> 01:04:48.874 avoiding pregnancy and lack of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:48.874 --> 01:04:51.079 resources and social support for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:51.079 --> 01:04:53.590 giving birth and raising a child.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:53.590 --> 01:04:55.198 Talk of choice hides the fact  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231

01:04:55.198 --> 01:04:56.670 that for many poor women,

NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:56.670 --> 01:04:58.260 choices are extraordinarily  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:58.260 --> 01:04:59.850 burdened and constrained.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:04:59.850 --> 01:05:02.034 Given the lack of support for bringing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:02.034 --> 01:05:04.510 a pregnancy to term and raising a child.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:04.510 --> 01:05:06.610 This is true around the world.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:06.610 --> 01:05:08.370 According to the Guttmacher Institute,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:08.370 --> 01:05:10.375 abortion rates are actually highest  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:10.375 --> 01:05:12.380 in countries where access to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:12.447 --> 01:05:13.890 abortion is restricted.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:13.890 --> 01:05:15.970 In countries that restrict abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:15.970 --> 01:05:17.486 the percentage of unintended  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:17.486 --> 01:05:19.760 pregnancies and ending an abortion has  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:19.826 --> 01:05:21.806 increased during the past 30 years,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.903594350769231  
01:05:21.810 --> 01:05:25.450 from 36% in 1990 to 94 to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737  
01:05:25.450 --> 01:05:28.550 50% in 2015 to 2019.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:28.550 --> 01:05:30.902 Here in the US, the states in which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:30.902 --> 01:05:33.550 abortion is now illegal are the states in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:33.550 --> 01:05:36.070 which care for maternal health is weakest,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:36.070 --> 01:05:39.110 and this should be a scandal for those  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:39.110 --> 01:05:41.859 promoting a consistent ethic of life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:41.860 --> 01:05:43.560 As Catholic ethicist Christina  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:43.560 --> 01:05:45.260 Traina has recently written,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:45.260 --> 01:05:47.635 neither making abortion legal nor  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:47.635 --> 01:05:50.010 making it illegal addresses the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:50.083 --> 01:05:52.163 conditions that create the desire  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:52.163 --> 01:05:54.760 for abortion in the 1st place.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:54.760 --> 01:05:58.130 Bans will worsen those conditions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:05:58.130 --> 01:06:00.517 What of the rights that never materialized  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:00.517 --> 01:06:02.210 for robust maternal healthcare,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:02.210 --> 01:06:04.450 indeed for universal and comprehensive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:04.450 --> 01:06:06.690 healthcare and adequate social support,

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:06.690 --> 01:06:09.150 including decent wages, childcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:09.150 --> 01:06:11.610 housing and job training?

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:11.610 --> 01:06:13.490 Talk of choice is cheap,

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:13.490 --> 01:06:15.500 and the kind of support that

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:15.500 --> 01:06:16.840 would truly support substantial

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:16.898 --> 01:06:18.348 freedom of choice for all,

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:18.350 --> 01:06:20.635 regardless of income level and

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:20.635 --> 01:06:22.463 racialization may be costly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:22.470 --> 01:06:26.126 but it enables a society worth living in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:26.130 --> 01:06:27.430 And this is, I think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:27.430 --> 01:06:29.602 what those loyal to biblical traditions

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:29.602 --> 01:06:31.816 of concern for the most vulnerable

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:31.816 --> 01:06:34.245 ought to be focusing on right now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94862737

01:06:34.250 --> 01:06:34.800 Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:39.450 --> 01:06:41.130 Thank you so much, Professor Hurton.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:41.130 --> 01:06:42.490 Thanks to all our speakers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:42.490 --> 01:06:44.938 So I'm going to open it up now  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:44.938 --> 01:06:46.769 to questions through the Q&A.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:46.770 --> 01:06:47.842 Please type them in.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:47.842 --> 01:06:50.124 I'm going to take the prerogative of of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:50.124 --> 01:06:51.664 the moderators prerogative asking the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:51.664 --> 01:06:53.690 first question and I'll open this up to,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:53.690 --> 01:06:55.110 to any of our speakers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:55.110 --> 01:06:57.270 So these were wonderful presentations  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:57.270 --> 01:06:59.430 and and I'm truly grateful.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:06:59.430 --> 01:07:01.544 One of the things about the presentation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:01.544 --> 01:07:03.286 that interested me was the question  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:03.286 --> 01:07:04.852 of whether one should seek to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:04.852 --> 01:07:06.546 draw the line and how that line  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:06.546 --> 01:07:08.328 should be drawn in the whole first.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:08.328 --> 01:07:09.758 It starts right with Katie's.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:09.760 --> 01:07:11.584 The very first thing about Justice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:11.584 --> 01:07:13.406 Roberts question about do we have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:13.406 --> 01:07:15.338 something other than viability to go for.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:15.340 --> 01:07:16.900 So an interesting detail which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:16.900 --> 01:07:19.573 which I think a lot of folks on the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:19.573 --> 01:07:21.460 call may know but many may not,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:21.460 --> 01:07:24.616 is that the age of viability,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:24.620 --> 01:07:25.583 if you will,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:25.583 --> 01:07:28.758 has been often referred to it 20 as 24 weeks,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:28.760 --> 01:07:31.140 even now as as recently as a few years ago,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:31.140 --> 01:07:31.900 two or three years ago,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:31.900 --> 01:07:34.164 I taught a class and a colleague that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:34.164 --> 01:07:36.240 told the students that viability is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:36.240 --> 01:07:38.458 24 weeks to which I had to attend say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:07:38.460 --> 01:07:39.426 well, the legislature.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:39.426 --> 01:07:41.680 Just to decide when abortion is legal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:41.737 --> 01:07:43.507 or when abortion becomes illegal,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:43.510 --> 01:07:44.416 but they don't.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:44.416 --> 01:07:45.624 The legislation doesn't really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:45.624 --> 01:07:46.890 decide when viability occurs.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:46.890 --> 01:07:48.731 And the reality is that that for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:48.731 --> 01:07:50.382 there are places that are very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:50.382 --> 01:07:51.990 aggressive at trying to save a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:51.990 --> 01:07:53.707 child at 22 weeks or a fetus at  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:53.707 --> 01:07:55.702 22 weeks or newborn at 22 weeks.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:55.702 --> 01:07:57.790 I should stay and and somewhere  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:07:57.858 --> 01:08:00.294 between 1/3 to 1/2 of those newborns  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:08:00.294 --> 01:08:02.608 that weren't at 22 completed weeks  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:08:02.610 --> 01:08:06.050 survive and and certain centers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:08:06.050 --> 01:08:07.315 And there are certainly many  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333

01:08:07.315 --> 01:08:08.832 survivors at 22 weeks here and

NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:08.832 --> 01:08:10.014 and at least half or more.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:10.020 --> 01:08:11.983 And half of those born at 23  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:11.983 --> 01:08:13.755 weeks if active resuscitation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:13.755 --> 01:08:15.527 is attempted can survive.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:15.530 --> 01:08:17.294 So viability and Katie you pointed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:17.294 --> 01:08:19.479 this out early on is that that of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:19.479 --> 01:08:21.417 course you know Roe V Wade was a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:21.417 --> 01:08:23.225 long time ago and and so that that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:23.230 --> 01:08:24.625 the technology has changed but  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:24.625 --> 01:08:26.802 where to draw the line and how to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:26.802 --> 01:08:28.254 draw the line is an interesting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:28.254 --> 01:08:30.529 one and if we if we look at the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:30.529 --> 01:08:31.850 gradualist approach to this in terms  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:31.850 --> 01:08:33.479 of a moral status and if moral  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333  
01:08:33.479 --> 01:08:35.184 status increases over the course  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:35.184 --> 01:08:36.802 of gestation nevertheless and Glenn  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:36.802 --> 01:08:38.602 I think it was you forgive me if I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:38.610 --> 01:08:40.528 if it was someone else who raised.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:40.530 --> 01:08:42.214 Judith Jarvis Thompson's argument  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:42.214 --> 01:08:44.740 about the violinist on her scenario  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:44.808 --> 01:08:46.029 about the violinist.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:46.030 --> 01:08:47.906 And the point being that even the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:47.906 --> 01:08:49.642 violinist who we would all agree  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:49.642 --> 01:08:50.806 has full moral status.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:50.810 --> 01:08:51.200 Nevertheless,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:51.200 --> 01:08:53.540 it seems wrong to require that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:53.540 --> 01:08:55.465 person who finds himself tethered  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:55.465 --> 01:08:57.880 to the violinist to remain in bed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:08:57.880 --> 01:09:00.422 for however long it needs to keep  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:09:00.422 --> 01:09:01.487 the violinist alive.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.824173318333333

01:09:01.490 --> 01:09:03.020 And it's an interesting thought experiment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:09:03.020 --> 01:09:05.090 and one that's obviously caught the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:09:05.090 --> 01:09:06.920 imagination of people who study  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:09:06.920 --> 01:09:09.170 these things for decades now.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8241733183333333  
01:09:09.170 --> 01:09:11.026 So I guess my question to the group.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:11.030 --> 01:09:15.041 What I'm leading up to is at what point  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:15.041 --> 01:09:19.220 do you feel abortion should be permitted?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:19.220 --> 01:09:22.188 And this is one of the questions that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:22.188 --> 01:09:24.390 actually came through to me.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:24.390 --> 01:09:27.810 From a colleague from my cell phone is that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:27.810 --> 01:09:29.430 Is it? Should abortion be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:29.430 --> 01:09:31.681 permitted at 38 weeks? At 22 weeks?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:31.681 --> 01:09:34.748 Is there is can any of you see a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:34.748 --> 01:09:37.422 line where it should in fact be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:37.422 --> 01:09:39.840 permitted legally or or ethically?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535  
01:09:39.840 --> 01:09:41.095 Or should it be permitted  
NOTE Confidence: 0.842170535

01:09:41.095 --> 01:09:41.597 throughout gestation?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.884503704

01:09:44.700 --> 01:09:46.890 I'll open up to anybody who wants to jump in.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.884503704

01:09:46.890 --> 01:09:48.724 Does someone want to say where the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.884503704

01:09:48.724 --> 01:09:50.633 line we used to say the lines at  
NOTE Confidence: 0.884503704

01:09:50.633 --> 01:09:52.626 24 weeks and and I think that is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.884503704

01:09:52.626 --> 01:09:54.372 still the case in Connecticut and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:09:55.210 --> 01:09:55.879 maybe I'll start.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:09:55.879 --> 01:09:57.440 So I'll start by saying that you'll  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:09:57.488 --> 01:09:58.976 find very few bioethics and lawyers  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:09:58.976 --> 01:10:00.230 that like the viability line.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:00.230 --> 01:10:01.958 They they liked it since that all their  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:01.958 --> 01:10:03.604 lines might have been worse in terms of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:03.604 --> 01:10:05.187 what was likely to be replaced by it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:05.190 --> 01:10:06.930 And I think Justice Alito's opinion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:06.930 --> 01:10:08.166 you know, has some choice words  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:08.166 --> 01:10:09.865 for it and there's lots of parts of

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:09.865 --> 01:10:11.101 his opinion that I disagree with.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:11.110 --> 01:10:13.030 But this is one place where I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:13.030 --> 01:10:14.669 he's being somewhat fair myself.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:14.670 --> 01:10:15.266 Like viability,

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:15.266 --> 01:10:17.650 I think one of the questions is whether

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:17.708 --> 01:10:20.038 the line ought to be one about time at all.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:20.040 --> 01:10:20.282 Right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:20.282 --> 01:10:21.492 There are multiple lines you

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:21.492 --> 01:10:23.052 could think about when we look

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:23.052 --> 01:10:24.507 comparatively across the world, right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:24.507 --> 01:10:27.076 There are places where instead of shoot,

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:27.080 --> 01:10:29.054 you know, it's a combination of timing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:29.060 --> 01:10:31.726 but it's also about reasons, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:31.726 --> 01:10:33.756 That and review and procedures.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:33.760 --> 01:10:36.640 This idea that if we had a very

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:36.640 --> 01:10:38.988 expansive conception of the health of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:38.988 --> 01:10:41.316 the mother that included mental health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:41.320 --> 01:10:43.084 one might be willing to kind of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:43.084 --> 01:10:44.809 consider a line that's different.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:44.810 --> 01:10:45.851 The absolutist position,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:45.851 --> 01:10:47.933 which I do associate with Judith  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:47.933 --> 01:10:49.616 Jarvis Thompson, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:49.616 --> 01:10:51.581 essentially the idea that while  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:51.581 --> 01:10:53.519 you have a right to,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:53.520 --> 01:10:54.920 an absolute right to unplug  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:54.920 --> 01:10:56.320 at any point of development,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:56.320 --> 01:10:58.030 because the development is irrelevant  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:10:58.030 --> 01:11:00.120 in terms of the personhood of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:11:00.120 --> 01:11:01.725 the individual or conceding the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:11:01.725 --> 01:11:03.009 person or the individual,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476

01:11:03.010 --> 01:11:05.470 and we're talking about unplugging.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:05.470 --> 01:11:07.710 I tend to think of that particular view,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:07.710 --> 01:11:09.490 while kind of very principled,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:09.490 --> 01:11:12.090 is not one that you find of very,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:12.090 --> 01:11:14.330 very many people pushing forward,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:14.330 --> 01:11:15.760 whether that's a political judgment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:15.760 --> 01:11:16.704 Ethical judgment, I think,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:16.704 --> 01:11:17.648 is an open question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.772901813190476  
01:11:17.650 --> 01:11:18.780 but I'm curious other people.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9765589  
01:11:20.660 --> 01:11:24.022 Thank you. Let me share some of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9765589  
01:11:24.022 --> 01:11:25.107 questions that have come through here  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9765589  
01:11:25.107 --> 01:11:26.960 and some of these are, oh, please,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571  
01:11:27.190 --> 01:11:29.306 I just want to piggyback on that, if I may.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571  
01:11:29.306 --> 01:11:31.285 You know, I think I think that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571  
01:11:31.285 --> 01:11:33.905 a an issue that's raised a lot to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571  
01:11:33.905 --> 01:11:36.141 sort of make abortion perhaps much  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:36.141 --> 01:11:38.637 murkier than than it usually is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:38.640 --> 01:11:40.803 And that's why I actually cited the

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:40.803 --> 01:11:43.703 statistics the the fact that under 1% of

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:43.703 --> 01:11:47.930 abortions happen beyond 20 weeks gestation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:47.930 --> 01:11:49.842 And so, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:49.842 --> 01:11:51.836 we talking about viability, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:51.836 --> 01:11:54.420 the the vast majority are going to be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:54.420 --> 01:11:57.370 Almost certainly pre viable and

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:57.370 --> 01:11:59.280 it's it's my understanding.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:11:59.280 --> 01:12:00.462 Although you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:00.462 --> 01:12:03.984 I would love input from our our our

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:03.984 --> 01:12:06.696 gynecology and obstetrician colleagues.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:06.700 --> 01:12:09.418 My understanding is that most of

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:09.418 --> 01:12:12.067 the abortions that happen after that

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:12.067 --> 01:12:14.160 point are not just oopsie Daisy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:14.160 --> 01:12:15.320 I changed my mind.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:15.320 --> 01:12:17.160 I don't want to have a baby anymore.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:17.160 --> 01:12:19.180 These these are these happen

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:19.180 --> 01:12:21.030 because of really devastating fetal

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:21.030 --> 01:12:22.945 abnormalities that are discovered that

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:22.945 --> 01:12:24.810 are either incompatible with life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:24.810 --> 01:12:27.612 Or incompatible with any life other

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:27.612 --> 01:12:31.162 than a short life of of certain

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:31.162 --> 01:12:33.807 suffering and not not extended

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:33.807 --> 01:12:36.894 viability after birth or again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:36.894 --> 01:12:38.264 like a significant threat to

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:38.264 --> 01:12:39.780 the health of the mother.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:39.780 --> 01:12:40.578 But of note,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:40.578 --> 01:12:42.846 if if a pregnancy is desired and the

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:42.846 --> 01:12:44.874 health of the mother is compromised.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:44.880 --> 01:12:46.525 And again, I I want to be clear.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:46.525 --> 01:12:48.475 I'm not an obstetrician or gynecologist,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:48.480 --> 01:12:50.022 so I I would love clarification

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:50.022 --> 01:12:50.793 from my colleagues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:50.800 --> 01:12:52.488 but my understanding is that if a

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:52.488 --> 01:12:54.319 fetus is clearly beyond the point of

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:54.319 --> 01:12:55.992 viability and the pregnancy is very

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:55.992 --> 01:12:57.840 threatening to the health of the mother.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:57.840 --> 01:12:59.898 Then the then the choice doesn't

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:12:59.898 --> 01:13:01.957 become either abortion or carry the

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:01.957 --> 01:13:03.835 pregnancy the term that the choices

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:03.835 --> 01:13:05.875 well do do we undergo expectant

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:05.875 --> 01:13:07.897 management or do we deliver early

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:07.900 --> 01:13:10.749 and manage because you know the fetus

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:10.749 --> 01:13:13.780 is is viable and even though we we

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:13.780 --> 01:13:16.324 we would love to keep in in utero

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:16.324 --> 01:13:17.779 for longer to ensure development

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:17.779 --> 01:13:19.865 we're going to give steroids and

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:19.865 --> 01:13:21.253 surfactant for lung development.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:21.260 --> 01:13:23.304 And again Mark you probably can speak

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:23.304 --> 01:13:24.898 more intelligently about this than I

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:24.898 --> 01:13:26.445 can as a neonatologist but you know

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:26.501 --> 01:13:28.382 we're we're going to do the best we can.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:28.390 --> 01:13:30.525 And so it's so just this idea that

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:30.525 --> 01:13:32.590 there again we we love to hear

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:32.590 --> 01:13:34.788 about this from abortion opponents,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:34.790 --> 01:13:36.590 all these stories of, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:36.590 --> 01:13:37.618 again, partial birth abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:37.618 --> 01:13:39.160 which is not a medical term,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:39.160 --> 01:13:41.064 that's not clear what that even means.

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:41.070 --> 01:13:43.998 But the fact is that the vast majority

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:43.998 --> 01:13:46.495 of abortions happen well before that

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:46.495 --> 01:13:49.033 that that blur of viability because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:49.111 --> 01:13:51.672 it isn't a line, as you pointed out.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:51.672 --> 01:13:54.247 And the ones that do happen late  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:54.247 --> 01:13:56.503 usually are because that that fetus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:56.503 --> 01:13:58.760 is is not going to have.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:13:58.760 --> 01:14:01.035 A very good chance at at anything  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:01.035 --> 01:14:03.122 resembling what most people would would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:03.122 --> 01:14:05.565 call a a life without abject suffering.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:05.570 --> 01:14:06.164 Or again,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:06.164 --> 01:14:07.649 the pregnancy is terminated early  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:07.649 --> 01:14:09.619 because of severe threat to the mother.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:09.620 --> 01:14:11.447 But usually in those cases they try  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:11.447 --> 01:14:13.680 to save the the fetus if if possible.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:13.680 --> 01:14:14.551 So I, I, I,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:14.551 --> 01:14:16.410 I welcome input from neonatology  
NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:16.410 --> 01:14:17.640 and guinot colleagues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:17.640 --> 01:14:18.888 but I just think that's a

NOTE Confidence: 0.788554751428571

01:14:18.888 --> 01:14:19.512 really important distinction.

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:19.520 --> 01:14:20.740 It's not that people are,

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:20.740 --> 01:14:21.802 you know, at 8 months pregnant

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:21.802 --> 01:14:23.026 all the time just deciding, oops.

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:23.026 --> 01:14:24.048 I yeah. I don't want to kid.

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:24.050 --> 01:14:24.614 I'm just going to,

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:24.614 --> 01:14:25.780 I'm just going to have an abortion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:25.780 --> 01:14:26.985 That's I don't think that

NOTE Confidence: 0.789070296

01:14:26.985 --> 01:14:27.708 really reflects reality.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:29.640 --> 01:14:30.352 Thank you. Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:30.352 --> 01:14:32.196 Let me see if I can get you a couple

NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:32.196 --> 01:14:33.600 of questions in here if I could.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:33.600 --> 01:14:35.980 And some of them are specifically legal

NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:35.980 --> 01:14:38.550 questions and I because I wanted us to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:38.550 --> 01:14:40.839 focus more on the ethical issues here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:40.840 --> 01:14:42.358 But there is one legal question  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:42.358 --> 01:14:44.316 that I will ask here because I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:44.316 --> 01:14:45.796 think it's worth asking here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:45.800 --> 01:14:50.258 What's directed for to attorney Kraschel?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:50.260 --> 01:14:52.540 Does Connecticut's law protecting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:52.540 --> 01:14:55.082 physicians also explicitly protect APRN,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9228898866666666

01:14:55.082 --> 01:14:55.868 PA's and midwives?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:14:57.790 --> 01:15:00.106 Yes, it protects the licensed medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:00.110 --> 01:15:02.274 professionals providing healthcare  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:02.274 --> 01:15:04.850 that's legal in Connecticut.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:04.850 --> 01:15:06.830 I will just say, however,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:06.830 --> 01:15:10.930 that it is the shield laws that are in place.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:10.930 --> 01:15:12.925 There's a lot to play out in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:12.925 --> 01:15:14.739 the legal landscape to see how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:14.739 --> 01:15:16.224 strong those Shields will be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:16.230 --> 01:15:17.410 I would not advise that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:17.410 --> 01:15:19.946 I think that the shield laws are bulletproof.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:19.950 --> 01:15:22.162 They are states doing the best to

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:22.162 --> 01:15:24.193 protect the providers and the people

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:24.193 --> 01:15:26.227 seeking abortion care in those states.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:26.230 --> 01:15:27.614 I think they're important.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:27.614 --> 01:15:30.548 Laws that have been passed and put in place.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:30.550 --> 01:15:32.762 And I'm proud of the fact that

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:32.762 --> 01:15:34.728 Connecticut was the first to do it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:34.730 --> 01:15:38.010 But I would just caution that there is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:38.010 --> 01:15:40.378 There are a lot of unknown legal questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:40.378 --> 01:15:43.129 that are probably going to arise when states,

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:43.130 --> 01:15:44.232 for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:44.232 --> 01:15:47.329 start to refuse to honor us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:47.329 --> 01:15:48.007 You know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:48.007 --> 01:15:50.380 a request from another state to issue  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:50.452 --> 01:15:52.738 a subpoena through their usual legal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.716361875

01:15:52.738 --> 01:15:54.178 infrastructure in a given state.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:15:55.360 --> 01:15:56.764 Thank you. Thanks, Katie.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:15:56.764 --> 01:15:58.280 Here's the question, please.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:15:58.280 --> 01:16:00.120 Thinking about forced gestation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:00.120 --> 01:16:01.080 embryo destruction,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:01.080 --> 01:16:03.480 abortion from a rights perspective,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:03.480 --> 01:16:05.600 while some views more strongly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:05.600 --> 01:16:08.300 favored some and more weakly others,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:08.300 --> 01:16:10.380 can't we argue that all of these are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:10.380 --> 01:16:12.378 rooted in the right to decide the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:12.378 --> 01:16:14.420 number and spacing of your offspring?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:14.420 --> 01:16:16.370 Admittedly, this neglects the argument  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:16.370 --> 01:16:19.149 of bioethical issue of life of the fetus.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571

01:16:19.150 --> 01:16:20.922 But we can currently.

NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571  
01:16:20.922 --> 01:16:23.137 We can currently take Thompson's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571  
01:16:23.137 --> 01:16:25.004 argument that the life of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571  
01:16:25.004 --> 01:16:26.684 the fetus does not matter.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571  
01:16:26.690 --> 01:16:27.149 Additionally,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571  
01:16:27.149 --> 01:16:29.444 this right is still separate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571  
01:16:29.444 --> 01:16:31.280 from the legal right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.798306171428571  
01:16:31.280 --> 01:16:31.770 Umm.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:33.670 --> 01:16:35.278 Maybe I'll say a word or two about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:35.278 --> 01:16:36.716 about that right, which this is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:36.716 --> 01:16:38.066 little bit where I said about the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:38.066 --> 01:16:39.778 second premise of the argument, right,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:39.778 --> 01:16:42.975 that the idea of abortion is gestation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:42.975 --> 01:16:45.320 the right not to gestate is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:45.393 --> 01:16:47.325 very strong right we all have.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:16:47.330 --> 01:16:48.758 And Professor Hall,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:16:48.758 --> 01:16:51.346 Dr Hall mentioned this with the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:16:51.346 --> 01:16:53.391 example of force bone marrow  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:16:53.391 --> 01:16:55.228 transplant or blood transfusion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:16:55.230 --> 01:16:57.566 We tend to think we have very strong  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:16:57.566 --> 01:17:00.085 rights over our body and in some ways  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:00.085 --> 01:17:02.042 the rights being asserted by people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:02.042 --> 01:17:04.317 who are who want to restrict abortion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:04.320 --> 01:17:06.084 Is kind of on the same terrain.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:06.090 --> 01:17:07.158 And one can say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:07.158 --> 01:17:09.431 even if I believe that fetuses have a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:09.431 --> 01:17:11.552 very strong rights claim to be protected,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:11.560 --> 01:17:13.108 here's this other rights claim that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:13.108 --> 01:17:14.600 also sounds in bodily autonomy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:14.600 --> 01:17:16.070 and thus the conflict is kind  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:16.070 --> 01:17:17.719 of you have to choose one.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:17.720 --> 01:17:18.230 By contrast,

NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:18.230 --> 01:17:19.760 when you talk about something like  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:19.760 --> 01:17:21.756 a right to control the number of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:21.756 --> 01:17:23.191 offspring and spacing ones offspring,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:23.200 --> 01:17:23.884 for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:23.884 --> 01:17:25.936 these are also real rights claim.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:25.940 --> 01:17:27.800 It just seems to me they're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:27.800 --> 01:17:28.420 defeasibility conditions,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:28.420 --> 01:17:30.820 so when they get trumped and when they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:30.820 --> 01:17:32.705 get overwhelmed comes much sooner than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:32.705 --> 01:17:35.210 when we're talking about a right to control.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:35.210 --> 01:17:35.694 One's body,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:35.694 --> 01:17:37.388 and I think this is most apparent  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:37.388 --> 01:17:38.898 from people who've analogized,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:38.900 --> 01:17:41.498 writes about abortion to 13th Amendment,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:17:41.500 --> 01:17:43.318 anti slavery, rights of to say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:43.320 --> 01:17:46.209 to describe what it is to be a gestating  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:46.209 --> 01:17:49.199 person against one's will as akin to slavery.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:49.200 --> 01:17:51.315 It's just a much stronger, in my view,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:51.315 --> 01:17:53.460 rights claim to say that I have a right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:53.460 --> 01:17:54.940 If I have any rights in the world,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:54.940 --> 01:17:56.350 it is the right not to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:56.350 --> 01:17:57.680 have that happen to me.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:57.680 --> 01:17:59.760 Whereas a right to space out your children.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:17:59.760 --> 01:18:01.496 There's all sorts of ways in which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:18:01.496 --> 01:18:03.533 the law does restrict that or at  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:18:03.533 --> 01:18:05.083 least doesn't support that right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:18:05.090 --> 01:18:06.638 Whether it's the weak coverage we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:18:06.638 --> 01:18:08.430 have for in vitro fertilization,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:18:08.430 --> 01:18:10.710 whether it's social support for parents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:18:10.710 --> 01:18:11.820 those are all positive liberty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818

01:18:11.820 --> 01:18:12.708 versions of the right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:18:12.710 --> 01:18:13.702 But just to say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:18:13.702 --> 01:18:15.190 even if that's a real right,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:18:15.190 --> 01:18:16.660 it's not clear that's a right  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:18:16.660 --> 01:18:18.130 that's good enough to overcome,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:18:18.130 --> 01:18:19.954 a right to protect the fetus for somebody  
NOTE Confidence: 0.766795258181818  
01:18:19.954 --> 01:18:21.389 who believes the fetus is a person.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8884478325  
01:18:22.230 --> 01:18:23.118 Thank you. Thank you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:23.130 --> 01:18:24.858 And if I, if I might also just add  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:24.858 --> 01:18:26.892 on top of that too is that to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:26.892 --> 01:18:28.475 extent there is a constitutionally  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:28.475 --> 01:18:30.270 protected right to parenting decisions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:30.270 --> 01:18:32.250 found in the US Constitution,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:32.250 --> 01:18:33.786 it's also, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:33.786 --> 01:18:36.222 I think most scholars would agree and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:18:36.230 --> 01:18:37.838 Their Supreme Court is that it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:37.838 --> 01:18:39.258 in the substantive due process  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:39.258 --> 01:18:40.430 of the 14th amendment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:40.430 --> 01:18:43.638 So that's in that sort of bundle of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:43.638 --> 01:18:46.412 rights that I would say, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:46.412 --> 01:18:48.998 it becomes sort of disfavored rights  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:48.998 --> 01:18:52.998 perhaps as in the wake of the decision in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:52.998 --> 01:18:56.187 which the court took apart one of them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:56.190 --> 01:18:58.550 And as Professor Cohen mentioned,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:18:58.550 --> 01:19:00.455 Justice Thomas would suggest we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:19:00.455 --> 01:19:02.822 should apply that same reasoning to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:19:02.822 --> 01:19:04.807 other substantive due process rights.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:19:04.810 --> 01:19:06.640 So even if we found.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:19:06.640 --> 01:19:08.940 That that right existed under  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:19:08.940 --> 01:19:10.320 the US Constitution.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:19:10.320 --> 01:19:10.775 Today,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667

01:19:10.775 --> 01:19:14.415 I would query whether or not it would

NOTE Confidence: 0.849078313666667  
01:19:14.415 --> 01:19:17.735 withstand a similar analysis by this court.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:18.920 --> 01:19:20.439 Thank you. Here's a note from one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:20.439 --> 01:19:22.273 of our our maternal fetal medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:22.273 --> 01:19:24.153 colleagues which is worth mentioning.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:24.160 --> 01:19:27.310 Please just want to clarify the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:27.310 --> 01:19:29.488 chemotherapy point we give chemotherapy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:29.488 --> 01:19:31.368 and pregnancy and many cancer  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:31.368 --> 01:19:33.079 chemotherapies are not considered  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:33.079 --> 01:19:35.334 incompatible with supporting the pregnancy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:35.340 --> 01:19:36.782 We need to make sure we get  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:36.782 --> 01:19:37.400 that point correct.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:37.400 --> 01:19:39.392 So Sarah, I I think the point you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:39.392 --> 01:19:41.061 were making stands but but this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:41.061 --> 01:19:43.061 nevertheless is we we don't we we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556  
01:19:43.061 --> 01:19:45.000 want to make sure that people for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:45.000 --> 01:19:46.984 example might be pregnant and also  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:46.984 --> 01:19:48.764 have cancer understand that that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:48.764 --> 01:19:50.260 chemotherapy is not incompatible.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:50.260 --> 01:19:51.910 Necessarily with pregnancy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:51.910 --> 01:19:54.660 with supporting a pregnancy and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:54.660 --> 01:19:57.279 For that clarification.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:57.280 --> 01:19:59.566 This question is directed to you,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:19:59.570 --> 01:20:01.174 Professor Cohen's parent's parents  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:20:01.174 --> 01:20:02.778 have a legal responsibility  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:20:02.778 --> 01:20:04.730 to care for their children.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:20:04.730 --> 01:20:06.282 Does that responsibly extend  
NOTE Confidence: 0.765570287555556

01:20:06.282 --> 01:20:09.309 to a fetus and why or why not?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:10.240 --> 01:20:11.722 Yeah, so let me say two  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:11.722 --> 01:20:13.180 things that one is to say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:13.180 --> 01:20:14.884 and this is now an interesting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:14.884 --> 01:20:16.660 discourse within people who who do this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:16.660 --> 01:20:18.084 who are philosophically interested.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:18.084 --> 01:20:20.619 One of the big critiques of Judith

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:20.619 --> 01:20:22.653 Jarvis Thompson is that it posits

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:22.653 --> 01:20:24.765 the relationship of a stranger to

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:24.765 --> 01:20:26.835 another stranger as opposed to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:26.835 --> 01:20:28.632 relationship of a person to a life

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:28.632 --> 01:20:30.310 that they have fostered and created.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:30.310 --> 01:20:32.308 So there's definitely a strand of

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:32.308 --> 01:20:34.322 critique of the Thompson style argument

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:34.322 --> 01:20:36.492 that says it's not just a random

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:36.492 --> 01:20:38.197 person who's your human dialysis

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:38.197 --> 01:20:40.195 machine or a long lost relative.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:40.200 --> 01:20:41.930 Who needs a blood transfusion?

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:41.930 --> 01:20:44.360 It is a life that you brought into being

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:44.360 --> 01:20:46.846 and put in this potential to be harmed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:46.850 --> 01:20:48.610 and maybe that increases it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:48.610 --> 01:20:49.660 As a second thing I want to

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:49.660 --> 01:20:50.808 say is that the legal matter,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:50.810 --> 01:20:52.100 one of things very interesting

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:52.100 --> 01:20:53.753 is that states that have adopted

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:53.753 --> 01:20:55.323 personhood language are now facing

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:55.323 --> 01:20:57.100 all sorts of interesting questions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:57.100 --> 01:20:58.504 So Georgia, for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:20:58.504 --> 01:21:01.150 is giving a tax credit for dependencies

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:01.150 --> 01:21:03.928 for state law purposes to fetuses.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:03.930 --> 01:21:04.689 And in Texas,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:04.689 --> 01:21:05.954 I believe there was somebody

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:05.954 --> 01:21:07.258 that sounds silly to say it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:07.260 --> 01:21:08.586 but there was somebody who basically

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:08.586 --> 01:21:10.307 claimed that they had a right to be in the.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:10.310 --> 01:21:12.890 High occupancy vehicle lane because

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:12.890 --> 01:21:14.626 they were pregnant, right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:14.626 --> 01:21:16.114 So there were two people in the car.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:16.120 --> 01:21:18.262 So once you start recognizing the

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:18.262 --> 01:21:20.915 personhood of of embryos or fetuses for the

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:20.915 --> 01:21:23.460 purpose of trying to get out of abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:23.460 --> 01:21:24.122 restrict abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:24.122 --> 01:21:26.770 suddenly you have a long list of laws.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:26.770 --> 01:21:28.876 You have to ask how does it apply here?

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:28.880 --> 01:21:30.428 And the one that I think is the most

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:30.428 --> 01:21:31.907 kind of potent and this is something

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:31.907 --> 01:21:33.572 that show good one among others have

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:33.572 --> 01:21:34.872 written about is child endangerment

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:34.872 --> 01:21:36.732 laws and how ingesting drugs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:36.732 --> 01:21:38.202 for example, relates to that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:38.202 --> 01:21:39.366 So that's an area that we've

NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:39.366 --> 01:21:40.317 had a lot of conflict.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:40.320 --> 01:21:40.603 Already,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:40.603 --> 01:21:42.301 and I imagine we'll see more  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81590660625

01:21:42.301 --> 01:21:43.150 conflict going forward.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:44.330 --> 01:21:45.420 Thank you. Thank you, Glenn.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:45.420 --> 01:21:46.332 It's worth pointing out,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:46.332 --> 01:21:48.146 which I think is is known to most  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:48.146 --> 01:21:50.026 or all people, just to remind us  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:50.026 --> 01:21:52.610 that that in terms of the analogy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:52.610 --> 01:21:54.800 no doubts the special relationships  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:54.800 --> 01:21:56.990 carry with them special obligations.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:56.990 --> 01:21:58.450 But but it's also known,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:21:58.450 --> 01:22:00.232 I think that everybody on this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:00.232 --> 01:22:02.128 call that not every pregnancy is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:02.128 --> 01:22:04.048 the result of a voluntary act.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:04.050 --> 01:22:05.610 And that's probably perhaps relevant

NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:05.610 --> 01:22:07.170 to the conversation as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:07.170 --> 01:22:08.802 Another one of my maternal fetal

NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:08.802 --> 01:22:10.290 medicine colleagues wants you to know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:10.290 --> 01:22:12.510 Sarah, that you are correct.

NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:12.510 --> 01:22:14.890 Most late abortions are due to fetal

NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:14.890 --> 01:22:17.420 abnormality. From maternal risk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.736227244

01:22:17.420 --> 01:22:18.020 Umm.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819238053888889

01:22:21.350 --> 01:22:23.030 And another OB colleague wants us to

NOTE Confidence: 0.819238053888889

01:22:23.030 --> 01:22:24.704 know that the majority of abortions

NOTE Confidence: 0.819238053888889

01:22:24.704 --> 01:22:26.204 are done for social reasons,

NOTE Confidence: 0.819238053888889

01:22:26.210 --> 01:22:28.690 not due to severe fetal anomalies or threat

NOTE Confidence: 0.819238053888889

01:22:28.690 --> 01:22:31.790 to the mother, even those after 20 weeks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819238053888889

01:22:31.790 --> 01:22:35.276 So there appears to be a difference

NOTE Confidence: 0.819238053888889

01:22:35.276 --> 01:22:38.918 of opinion perhaps on that. Here is a.

NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:41.530 --> 01:22:43.714 Can you discuss the ethical dilemmas

NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:43.714 --> 01:22:45.170 of physicians in restrictive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:45.226 --> 01:22:46.906 states where they cannot practice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:46.906 --> 01:22:49.090 medicine the way they were trained?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:49.090 --> 01:22:51.214 Now being unable to refer or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:51.214 --> 01:22:52.630 perform abortions in women  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:52.696 --> 01:22:54.366 who need one for physical,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:54.370 --> 01:22:56.350 mental or psychosocial reasons?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:56.350 --> 01:22:58.825 Does anybody want to address?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:22:58.830 --> 01:23:00.696 Obviously this is a I mean,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:23:00.700 --> 01:23:01.690 this is a huge question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:23:01.690 --> 01:23:04.021 but the ethical dilemmas faced by physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:23:04.021 --> 01:23:06.130 where there are legal restrictions?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:23:06.130 --> 01:23:07.972 That prevent them from practicing in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.877927230952381

01:23:07.972 --> 01:23:10.438 a way that they feel is appropriate.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333

01:23:11.310 --> 01:23:12.810 So I I can take that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333

01:23:12.810 --> 01:23:17.312 Umm so you know, I I I think it's it's a

NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:17.312 --> 01:23:19.456 it's a huge ethical dilemma because as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:19.456 --> 01:23:21.730 as I've hopefully persuaded most people,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:21.730 --> 01:23:24.610 restricting access to evidence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:24.610 --> 01:23:26.872 based healthcare causes patient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:26.872 --> 01:23:28.927 harm and violates patient autonomy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:28.930 --> 01:23:32.791 And so telling physicians that or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:32.791 --> 01:23:34.235 other healthcare providers that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:34.235 --> 01:23:36.040 they cannot provide evidence based  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:36.093 --> 01:23:37.793 healthcare that honors their patients  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:37.793 --> 01:23:39.779 wishes with respect to what they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:39.779 --> 01:23:41.635 will or will not do with their own.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:41.640 --> 01:23:44.264 Bodies is is really a violation of of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:44.264 --> 01:23:47.468 some of our core duties as physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:47.468 --> 01:23:49.444 and other healthcare providers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:23:49.450 --> 01:23:53.173 And there have been some calls for civil  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333

01:23:53.173 --> 01:23:55.788 disobedience on an organized scale.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:23:55.790 --> 01:23:56.233 Actually.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:23:56.233 --> 01:23:58.891 That is to say that medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:23:58.891 --> 01:24:01.145 societies should work to provide  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:01.145 --> 01:24:03.671 legal cover for physicians in those  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:03.671 --> 01:24:06.726 states to provide services that are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:06.726 --> 01:24:08.862 medically and ethically warranted  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:08.862 --> 01:24:12.334 even though they are illegal and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:12.334 --> 01:24:16.012 And to provide a robust enough  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:16.012 --> 01:24:19.316 protection with the idea being that if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:19.316 --> 01:24:21.511 there's organized civil disobedience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:21.511 --> 01:24:24.189 amongst an entire profession that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:24.189 --> 01:24:26.492 it's really going to be impossible to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:26.492 --> 01:24:28.378 operationalize laws because you can't put,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:28.380 --> 01:24:29.050 you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:29.050 --> 01:24:31.395 you can't put half of your state

NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:31.395 --> 01:24:33.478 physicians in jail for half of your  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:33.478 --> 01:24:34.970 states OBGYN's in jail, for example.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:34.970 --> 01:24:36.025 It's it's not as applicable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:36.025 --> 01:24:37.074 to all physicians, obviously.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:37.074 --> 01:24:39.558 You know, I as a cardiologist,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:39.560 --> 01:24:40.918 I do not know how to provide  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:40.918 --> 01:24:41.790 that kind of care.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:41.790 --> 01:24:42.981 Although there are,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:42.981 --> 01:24:44.569 there are many cardiologists,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:44.570 --> 01:24:46.175 particularly those who who specialize  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:46.175 --> 01:24:48.718 in the in the care of in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:48.718 --> 01:24:50.183 cardiac care of pregnant women,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:50.190 --> 01:24:51.774 who who do often find themselves in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:51.774 --> 01:24:53.397 role of needing to counsel patients.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:24:53.400 --> 01:24:55.698 And so maybe it's even, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333

01:24:55.698 --> 01:24:57.702 if it's illegal to even counsel  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:57.702 --> 01:24:59.750 patients about pregnancy termination.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:24:59.750 --> 01:25:01.388 Maybe that's an act of civil  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:01.388 --> 01:25:03.069 disobedience that they have to undergo,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:03.070 --> 01:25:04.090 that they have to undertake.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:04.090 --> 01:25:04.634 Excuse me,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:04.634 --> 01:25:06.266 but I think it's also important  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:06.266 --> 01:25:07.510 to understand that, of course,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:07.510 --> 01:25:08.910 these duties don't exist in a vacuum,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:08.910 --> 01:25:11.040 and physicians are often the primary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:11.040 --> 01:25:12.460 breadwinners for their families.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:12.460 --> 01:25:14.620 And, you know, it's it's easy to just say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:14.620 --> 01:25:14.984 yeah, well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:14.984 --> 01:25:16.440 you just have to do the right thing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:16.440 --> 01:25:17.800 And and you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:17.800 --> 01:25:20.405 if that means that you're fined or or

NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:20.405 --> 01:25:22.180 you go to jail, well, then so be it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:22.180 --> 01:25:23.580 That's that's what you have to do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:23.580 --> 01:25:24.303 Well, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:24.303 --> 01:25:25.508 if you're the primary provider  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:25.508 --> 01:25:26.698 for your family as well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:26.700 --> 01:25:28.737 you also have very important obligations to,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:28.740 --> 01:25:30.436 to your children and to your family and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:30.436 --> 01:25:32.057 to other people dependent upon you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:32.060 --> 01:25:32.297 So.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:32.297 --> 01:25:34.193 So I don't think that gives us carte  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:34.193 --> 01:25:35.685 blanche necessarily to tell physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:35.685 --> 01:25:37.939 that they they have to disobey the law.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:37.940 --> 01:25:39.676 But I do think there is a strong  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:39.676 --> 01:25:40.997 argument to be made for that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333  
01:25:41.000 --> 01:25:43.043 I think it does have to be done systemically.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.897348878333333

01:25:43.050 --> 01:25:45.792 An organized way rather than than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:45.792 --> 01:25:47.620 rogue individuals necessarily making  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:47.685 --> 01:25:49.761 making decisions because I think it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:49.761 --> 01:25:52.681 will be much more powerful that way there.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:52.681 --> 01:25:53.403 There's also,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:53.403 --> 01:25:55.569 there have also been interesting calls  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:55.569 --> 01:25:58.166 for we talk about conscientious objection,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:25:58.170 --> 01:26:00.589 but sort of the the OR basically  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8973488783333333

01:26:00.589 --> 01:26:02.990 saying I'm not going to provide this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824

01:26:03.059 --> 01:26:04.759 service because it goes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824

01:26:04.759 --> 01:26:06.034 against my conscience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824

01:26:06.040 --> 01:26:07.272 The idea of conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824

01:26:07.272 --> 01:26:09.340 provision or to say actually it is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824

01:26:09.340 --> 01:26:11.268 it goes against my conscience not to provide  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824

01:26:11.268 --> 01:26:13.090 this care and even though it's illegal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824

01:26:13.090 --> 01:26:15.288 I want to be protected under a

NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:15.288 --> 01:26:16.230 conscientious provision clause,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:16.230 --> 01:26:17.362 much like they're conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:17.362 --> 01:26:17.928 objection clauses,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:17.930 --> 01:26:19.496 so that those are, I think,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:19.500 --> 01:26:22.139 some of the salient ethical dilemmas for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:22.139 --> 01:26:24.630 physicians and other healthcare providers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:24.630 --> 01:26:27.248 And I I'm interested to see how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:27.248 --> 01:26:29.727 that evolves as as we see these,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.881634177058824  
01:26:29.730 --> 01:26:33.550 these laws become implemented.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833  
01:26:35.170 --> 01:26:38.450 Professor hurt, one for you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833  
01:26:38.450 --> 01:26:42.790 How would you respond to someone who said,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833  
01:26:42.790 --> 01:26:46.210 for religious reasons, I believe,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833  
01:26:46.210 --> 01:26:49.955 that a fetus is absolutely the moral  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833  
01:26:49.955 --> 01:26:52.610 equivalent to whether it's in solomont,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833  
01:26:52.610 --> 01:26:56.070 whether it's a you know?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:26:56.070 --> 01:26:58.235 Whether whether it's from scripture  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:26:58.235 --> 01:27:01.629 based or otherwise or or tradition based,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:01.630 --> 01:27:05.090 I believe that this fetus.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:05.090 --> 01:27:08.520 Is the same thing as a 2 month old baby.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:08.520 --> 01:27:13.356 And therefore, not only would I not have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:13.356 --> 01:27:15.232 an abortion myself because it would be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:15.232 --> 01:27:17.498 the same as killing my 2 month old child,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:17.500 --> 01:27:20.220 but I also think that it's my duty,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:20.220 --> 01:27:22.938 my religious duty.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:22.940 --> 01:27:26.596 To fight those who would make that happen.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:26.600 --> 01:27:28.020 Umm.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:28.020 --> 01:27:30.015 If if you were confronted by that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:30.015 --> 01:27:30.870 question by someone,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.72824833

01:27:30.870 --> 01:27:32.180 how would might you respond?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6075354728

01:27:35.200 --> 01:27:37.110 You're muted. You're muted, gentlemen.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:37.120 --> 01:27:38.430 Thank you. It's not a

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:38.430 --> 01:27:39.440 theoretical question. Obviously.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:39.440 --> 01:27:42.800 That's a view that's pretty widely held.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:42.800 --> 01:27:47.614 So I think in part I want to under

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:47.614 --> 01:27:50.484 score that that the traditions that

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:50.484 --> 01:27:53.340 they themselves are embracing has

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:53.420 --> 01:27:56.138 always left room for regarding the

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:56.138 --> 01:27:58.720 fetus as an subjectively innocent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:27:58.720 --> 01:28:02.040 but objectively.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:02.040 --> 01:28:04.686 Guilty aggressor whose life can be

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:04.686 --> 01:28:07.839 ended just like any other aggressor.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:07.840 --> 01:28:10.078 When when life is under threat,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:10.080 --> 01:28:11.712 and in that sense,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:11.712 --> 01:28:13.344 even consistent with regarding

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:13.344 --> 01:28:15.827 the fetus as a full person there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:15.830 --> 01:28:18.890 there is room for there ought to be room

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:18.890 --> 01:28:22.409 for legal abortion in certain circumstances.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:22.410 --> 01:28:24.094 Now that, of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:24.094 --> 01:28:26.620 would provide a very limited justification,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:26.620 --> 01:28:28.954 but I'm also inviting people of

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:28.954 --> 01:28:31.509 faith to delve deeper into their

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:31.509 --> 01:28:33.814 traditions and to recognize that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:33.820 --> 01:28:36.035 There's been shifts in views

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:36.035 --> 01:28:39.297 over time in terms of when we

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:39.297 --> 01:28:42.153 understand what what sort of moral,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:42.160 --> 01:28:44.320 moral stratus we give to

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:44.320 --> 01:28:45.616 developing human life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:45.620 --> 01:28:47.516 And it's not that there is

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:47.516 --> 01:28:49.180 a traditional view on this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:49.180 --> 01:28:52.036 which is the current absolutist position,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:52.040 --> 01:28:53.820 but it's much more complicated.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:53.820 --> 01:28:54.837 And in fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:54.837 --> 01:28:57.210 it may be much closer to something

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:57.283 --> 01:28:59.600 like some of the other views that

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:28:59.600 --> 01:29:01.868 were put out today about, say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:01.868 --> 01:29:04.164 something like a the the 14 day.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:04.170 --> 01:29:04.926 View, perhaps,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:04.926 --> 01:29:07.572 of where we say that there are

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:07.572 --> 01:29:09.707 points at which we could say

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:09.707 --> 01:29:12.003 it's not clear that what we have

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:12.003 --> 01:29:13.735 here is a human individual,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:13.735 --> 01:29:16.500 and that we might want to say

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:16.587 --> 01:29:18.390 that either the notion that you

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:18.390 --> 01:29:20.505 want is either a person or not

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:20.505 --> 01:29:22.493 a person is too crude a moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.87564826

01:29:22.493 --> 01:29:24.267 distinction for us to be working by.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7553490093333333

01:29:25.640 --> 01:29:27.865 Thank you very much professor

NOTE Confidence: 0.7553490093333333

01:29:27.865 --> 01:29:30.809 Hurt and Doctor Hall and Attorney  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:30.809 --> 01:29:33.317 Kraschel and Professor Cohen.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:33.320 --> 01:29:34.643 I thank the four of you very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:34.643 --> 01:29:35.839 much for your time tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:35.840 --> 01:29:37.664 This was I've gotten so many  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:37.664 --> 01:29:39.369 compliments in my through my my  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:39.369 --> 01:29:41.081 texts on my phone and on the Q&A  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:41.139 --> 01:29:42.999 that that this was a wonderful  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:42.999 --> 01:29:44.634 presentation by all four of you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:44.634 --> 01:29:45.619 I thank you so much.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:45.620 --> 01:29:47.672 I thank you all for joining us and we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:47.672 --> 01:29:49.712 have another session coming up in a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:49.712 --> 01:29:52.270 couple weeks with a crew from Saint  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:52.270 --> 01:29:54.240 Justine and Montreal talking about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:54.309 --> 01:29:56.584 how we follow pre term babies so.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:56.590 --> 01:29:57.662 Something different to him.

NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:29:57.662 --> 01:30:00.088 We'll be reaching out to you about that soon.

NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:30:00.090 --> 01:30:01.458 Again, thank you to our speakers

NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:30:01.458 --> 01:30:03.108 and thank you all for joining us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.755349009333333

01:30:03.110 --> 01:30:05.998 And I wish you all a good night.