

WEBVTT

NOTE duration:"01:25:28"

NOTE recognizability:0.876

NOTE language:en-us

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:02.556 OK, welcome to the evening Ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:02.556 --> 00:00:04.826 seminar series for the program

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:04.826 --> 00:00:07.236 for Biomedical Ethics at Yale.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:07.240 --> 00:00:08.520 My name is Mark Mercurio.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:08.520 --> 00:00:10.392 I'm direct for the program and

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:10.392 --> 00:00:12.300 I'm delighted you're here and I'm

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:12.300 --> 00:00:14.106 delighted to to introduce our guest

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:14.106 --> 00:00:15.904 speaker in just a moment to let

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:15.904 --> 00:00:18.652 you know how this is going to work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:18.652 --> 00:00:21.340 As always, Doctor Solomon will speak

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:21.340 --> 00:00:23.988 for about 45 minutes, give or take some,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:23.988 --> 00:00:25.896 and then we'll have plenty of time

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:25.896 --> 00:00:27.378 for question and answer, comment.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:27.378 --> 00:00:29.520 And I'm going to ask you to put your

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:29.581 --> 00:00:31.645 questions and comments through the Q&A.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:31.650 --> 00:00:33.930 A function on zoom and I'll be monitoring.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:33.930 --> 00:00:35.598 I'll read those to Millie and

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:35.598 --> 00:00:37.370 we'll have a terrific discussion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:37.370 --> 00:00:38.370 We'll have a hard stop.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:38.370 --> 00:00:39.646 As always at 6:30,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:39.646 --> 00:00:41.951 so please forgive me if there was

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:41.951 --> 00:00:44.226 something you were hoping to say and

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:44.226 --> 00:00:46.804 I didn't get to you or hoping to ask.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:46.810 --> 00:00:48.258 Does the CME information.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:48.258 --> 00:00:50.430 Karen will be putting through the

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:50.500 --> 00:00:52.530 chat portion of the zoom as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:52.530 --> 00:00:53.808 So welcome and I think we'll

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:53.808 --> 00:00:55.090 go ahead and get started.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:55.090 --> 00:00:57.414 Let me introduce please our guest tonight.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:57.420 --> 00:00:59.548 I'm so pleased that that my friend

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:00:59.548 --> 00:01:01.680 Millie has been here before she is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:01.680 --> 00:01:05.089 A longstanding friend of our program and

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:05.089 --> 00:01:08.938 a major figure in the world of bioethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:08.940 --> 00:01:10.780 And I'll let me tell you a little

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:10.780 --> 00:01:12.369 bit about our Mildred Solomon.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:12.370 --> 00:01:13.950 Education Doctor is the president

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:13.950 --> 00:01:15.214 of the Hastings Center,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:15.220 --> 00:01:17.344 the nation's founding Bioethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:17.344 --> 00:01:19.502 Research Institute, and I would say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:19.502 --> 00:01:20.594 probably the leading bioethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:20.594 --> 00:01:21.898 think tank in the country.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:21.900 --> 00:01:24.492 She's also a professor of global health and

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:24.492 --> 00:01:26.628 social medicine at Harvard Medical School,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:26.630 --> 00:01:28.940 where she directs the school's

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:28.940 --> 00:01:30.326 Fellowship in Bioethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:30.330 --> 00:01:31.980 Dr Salman's research is focused on

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:31.980 --> 00:01:33.828 the ethics of end of life care,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:33.830 --> 00:01:35.060 organ transplantations,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:35.060 --> 00:01:36.290 medical professionalism,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:36.290 --> 00:01:39.144 responsible conduct of research, and.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:39.144 --> 00:01:40.326 Evidence based medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:40.326 --> 00:01:42.296 She served on numerous committees,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:42.300 --> 00:01:44.076 including the National Academy of Sciences,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:44.080 --> 00:01:45.226 Engineering and Medicine,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:45.226 --> 00:01:46.754 the World Economic Forums,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:46.760 --> 00:01:49.300 Global Futures Council on Technology,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:49.300 --> 00:01:52.356 the US Secretary of Health and Human Services

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:52.356 --> 00:01:54.740 Advisory Committee on Oregon Transplantation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:54.740 --> 00:01:55.892 and several others.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:55.892 --> 00:01:58.196 She's frequently cited in the mainstream.
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:01:58.200 --> 00:02:00.156 Media included the Wall Street Journal,
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:00.160 --> 00:02:02.496 NPR, and the New York Review of Books,
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:02.500 --> 00:02:03.992 The Daily Beast forms,
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:03.992 --> 00:02:05.510 Science News, the scientist,
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:05.510 --> 00:02:06.280 and others.
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:06.280 --> 00:02:08.205 She's a frequent public speaker
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:08.205 --> 00:02:09.419 at many places.
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:09.420 --> 00:02:12.353 Most notably at the Yale University School
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:12.353 --> 00:02:15.170 of Medicine program for Biomedical Ethics,
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:15.170 --> 00:02:17.370 she holds a BA from Smith College and
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:17.370 --> 00:02:19.328 a doctorate in educational research
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:19.328 --> 00:02:21.124 methods from Harvard University.
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:21.130 --> 00:02:22.042 We are absolutely delighted
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:22.042 --> 00:02:23.182 that you're with us tonight.
NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:23.190 --> 00:02:26.410 Doctor Solomon to speak to us about

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:26.410 --> 00:02:28.450 some ethical issues during the

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:28.450 --> 00:02:30.425 pandemic and the lessons learned.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:30.430 --> 00:02:32.320 I'm going to turn her over to

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:32.320 --> 00:02:33.590 NYU doctor Millie Salzman.

NOTE Confidence: 0.829944534375

00:02:33.590 --> 00:02:34.508 A warm welcome.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:35.590 --> 00:02:36.950 Thank you so much Mark.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:36.950 --> 00:02:39.254 It is it's really a pleasure to be here

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:39.254 --> 00:02:41.623 and I love all the opportunities that we

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:41.623 --> 00:02:43.838 take to have collaborations between the

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:43.838 --> 00:02:46.382 Yale program and the Hastings Center.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:46.390 --> 00:02:48.240 So it's really a treat.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:48.240 --> 00:02:49.920 Mark asked me to reflect on the lessons

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:49.920 --> 00:02:51.599 to be learned from the pandemic,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:51.600 --> 00:02:53.484 and I'm going to offer some

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:53.484 --> 00:02:55.461 reflections and then I look forward

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:55.461 --> 00:02:57.423 to a robust discussion with many

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:57.423 --> 00:02:59.460 of you later in the session.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:02:59.460 --> 00:03:01.335 I also want to acknowledge

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:01.335 --> 00:03:02.835 and thank Danny Passia,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:02.840 --> 00:03:04.640 who is a program manager and a research

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:04.640 --> 00:03:05.998 assistant at the Hastings Center.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:06.000 --> 00:03:07.460 You aren't seeing her,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:07.460 --> 00:03:08.555 but she's fundamental.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:08.560 --> 00:03:10.168 She's going to be advancing my

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:10.168 --> 00:03:11.930 slides and she and I'll probably

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:11.930 --> 00:03:13.820 be talking in front of everyone.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:13.820 --> 00:03:16.977 So thank you, Danny for your help.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:16.980 --> 00:03:19.668 I want to start first with

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:19.668 --> 00:03:22.230 the positive side of things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:22.230 --> 00:03:24.370 Science really came through.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:24.370 --> 00:03:27.580 With safe and effective vaccines and

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:27.672 --> 00:03:30.308 now some promising therapeutics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:30.310 --> 00:03:32.370 This took massive investment on

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:32.370 --> 00:03:35.002 the part of government with strong

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:35.002 --> 00:03:37.482 private Public Partnerships which were

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:37.482 --> 00:03:40.380 essential for the vaccine development.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:40.380 --> 00:03:41.379 For its part,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:41.379 --> 00:03:43.044 government was willing to provide

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:43.044 --> 00:03:44.751 payment guarantees to industry so that

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:44.751 --> 00:03:46.490 if their attempts did not pan out,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:46.490 --> 00:03:48.674 they would still be assured of payment.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:48.680 --> 00:03:51.439 And for the most part, there was two.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:51.439 --> 00:03:53.731 There was good international

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:53.731 --> 00:03:55.450 cooperation among scientists.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:55.450 --> 00:03:57.820 We now have M RNA technologies

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:03:57.820 --> 00:04:00.289 that promise to be useful for

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:00.289 --> 00:04:02.707 a very wide range of viruses,
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:02.710 --> 00:04:04.918 and we have new antiviral treatments
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:04.918 --> 00:04:06.390 packs loaded in particular,
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:06.390 --> 00:04:08.890 and an increasing number of
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:08.890 --> 00:04:12.180 diagnostic tests so well done science.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:12.180 --> 00:04:14.798 And yet more than two years in,
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:14.800 --> 00:04:18.090 we still face enormous challenges.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:18.090 --> 00:04:20.190 More than 20% of Americans
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:20.190 --> 00:04:21.870 have not been vaccinated.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:21.870 --> 00:04:24.024 Almost half of all US adults
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:24.024 --> 00:04:26.563 who did receive the first two
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:26.563 --> 00:04:29.128 vaccinations have not gotten boosters,
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:29.130 --> 00:04:32.770 so their facilitating viral mutation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:32.770 --> 00:04:34.996 And while so far the mutation seemed
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:34.996 --> 00:04:37.040 to be increasing transmissibility,
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:37.040 --> 00:04:39.912 but not affecting severity of illness that

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:39.912 --> 00:04:42.648 might simply be the luck of the draw.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:42.650 --> 00:04:45.398 Viruses can just as easily mutate

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:45.398 --> 00:04:47.814 in ways that exacerbate their

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:47.814 --> 00:04:49.806 lethality as diminish it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:49.810 --> 00:04:52.594 and so long as large numbers

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:52.594 --> 00:04:54.450 of people remain unvaccinated,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:54.450 --> 00:04:56.430 we are creating the conditions

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:56.430 --> 00:04:58.410 for the virus to evolve.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:04:58.410 --> 00:05:00.585 This threatens everyone of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:00.585 --> 00:05:02.325 unvaccinated and vaccinated since

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:02.325 --> 00:05:04.715 many of those who are vaccinated

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:04.715 --> 00:05:06.227 may still become infected,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:06.230 --> 00:05:08.998 and they will be especially at risk if

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:08.998 --> 00:05:11.230 the mutations enable vaccine escape.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:11.230 --> 00:05:14.406 And of course a large number of people.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:14.410 --> 00:05:17.020 Millions of people who are immune
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:17.020 --> 00:05:19.220 compromised or remain at risk.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:19.220 --> 00:05:22.895 So vaccine refusal is a huge and
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:22.895 --> 00:05:25.849 lingering problem and one that I'm
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:25.849 --> 00:05:29.430 going to return to later in the talk.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:29.430 --> 00:05:32.652 We also have not addressed the
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:32.652 --> 00:05:34.682 tension between national sovereignty
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:34.682 --> 00:05:37.538 on the one hand and international
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:37.538 --> 00:05:39.250 obligations on the other.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:39.250 --> 00:05:41.332 While the wealthy countries have been
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:41.332 --> 00:05:43.210 the direct beneficiaries of science,
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:43.210 --> 00:05:45.408 we have done precious little to help
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:45.408 --> 00:05:47.470 low and middle income countries.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:47.470 --> 00:05:50.907 Only 6% of people on the African
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:50.907 --> 00:05:53.520 continent have been vaccinated.
NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:53.520 --> 00:05:55.680 Of course, that's a moral problem.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:55.680 --> 00:05:57.836 It's also something all of us in

NOTE Confidence: 0.96321315

00:05:57.836 --> 00:05:58.760 the developed world

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:05:58.820 --> 00:06:00.360 should be concerned about,

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:00.360 --> 00:06:02.677 just on the basis of self interest.

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:02.680 --> 00:06:05.641 Viral mutation is a direct result of the size

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:05.641 --> 00:06:08.659 of the population able to host the virus.

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:08.660 --> 00:06:11.018 The more hosts, the more mutations,

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:11.020 --> 00:06:13.185 because each and every transmission

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:13.185 --> 00:06:14.917 opportunity is an opportunity

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:14.917 --> 00:06:16.670 for the virus to evolve.

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:16.670 --> 00:06:19.580 And this requires not just more

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:19.580 --> 00:06:22.410 generous sharing of our vaccines,

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:22.410 --> 00:06:25.270 which we must do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:25.270 --> 00:06:28.390 but much more fundamental action.

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:28.390 --> 00:06:31.072 We need to share intellectual property

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:31.072 --> 00:06:33.519 and help those countries build
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:33.519 --> 00:06:35.847 their own manufacturing capacities.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:35.850 --> 00:06:38.069 Over the first part of the pandemic,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:38.070 --> 00:06:39.048 North America,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:39.048 --> 00:06:41.004 Europe and India successfully
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:41.004 --> 00:06:42.960 ramped up their manufacturing
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:43.026 --> 00:06:44.810 manufacturing capabilities,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:44.810 --> 00:06:46.710 but we have to help.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:46.710 --> 00:06:50.110 In Africa and in South and Central America,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:50.110 --> 00:06:53.350 so that they too have their
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:53.350 --> 00:06:55.510 own capacity for manufacturing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:55.510 --> 00:06:59.170 They they also need help building
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:06:59.170 --> 00:07:01.000 basic healthcare infrastructure.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:07:01.000 --> 00:07:03.400 And in many places where it doesn't exist,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:07:03.400 --> 00:07:03.924 and again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572

00:07:03.924 --> 00:07:06.020 that's a role that we can play that

NOTE Confidence: 0.900532326428572
00:07:06.083 --> 00:07:07.907 would be extremely facilitative.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:10.190 --> 00:07:12.340 Of course, our unwillingness to
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:12.340 --> 00:07:15.518 see the plight of others is not
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:15.518 --> 00:07:18.666 only an unwillingness to care for
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:18.666 --> 00:07:21.546 the other across national borders.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:21.550 --> 00:07:23.590 But it's a huge and troubling
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:23.590 --> 00:07:25.540 reality within our own country.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:25.540 --> 00:07:28.150 The pandemic had a vastly
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:28.150 --> 00:07:30.238 disproportionate impact on communities
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:30.238 --> 00:07:33.018 of color and indigenous tribes.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:33.020 --> 00:07:35.210 It laid bare, thus systemic
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:35.210 --> 00:07:37.400 racism and health inequities that
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:37.475 --> 00:07:39.630 we've known about for decades.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:39.630 --> 00:07:41.470 Hopefully these realities will
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638
00:07:41.470 --> 00:07:44.230 create an authentic call for action.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:44.230 --> 00:07:45.976 How authentic. We don't know yet.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:45.980 --> 00:07:48.340 Hopefully the response will be
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:48.340 --> 00:07:50.700 authentic and not long lasting,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:50.700 --> 00:07:54.066 but that remains to be seen.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:54.070 --> 00:07:55.178 For the most part,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:55.178 --> 00:07:56.563 these kind of failures that
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:56.563 --> 00:07:57.610 I've been listing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:57.610 --> 00:07:59.840 The mainly the failure to
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:07:59.840 --> 00:08:02.070 see the suffering of others.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:02.070 --> 00:08:06.354 The failure to accept vaccines and non
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:06.354 --> 00:08:08.790 pharmaceutical interventions like masks,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:08.790 --> 00:08:11.275 our failures to act in
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:11.275 --> 00:08:12.766 mutually supportive ways,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:12.770 --> 00:08:15.442 their failures to recognize
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:15.442 --> 00:08:16.778 our interdependence.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:16.780 --> 00:08:18.360 And they're also failures

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:18.360 --> 00:08:20.335 to resist our need for.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:20.340 --> 00:08:23.500 Let's call it immediate gratification.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:23.500 --> 00:08:24.571 I'm going to say a little bit

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:24.571 --> 00:08:25.548 about what I mean by that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:25.550 --> 00:08:26.969 In a second,

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:26.969 --> 00:08:29.334 these problems haven't risen from

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:29.334 --> 00:08:32.559 lack of knowledge or imagination,

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:32.560 --> 00:08:34.975 nor even primarily from lack

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:34.975 --> 00:08:36.424 of financial resources.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:36.430 --> 00:08:38.830 They're driven by distrust

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:38.830 --> 00:08:41.830 and self interest rather than

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:41.830 --> 00:08:44.199 reciprocity and mutual support.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:44.200 --> 00:08:46.640 The result.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:46.640 --> 00:08:49.208 Has been the erosion of social

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:49.208 --> 00:08:51.990 cohesion and trust in one another.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:51.990 --> 00:08:53.124 In government,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:53.124 --> 00:08:57.660 in science and in expertise of all kinds.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:57.660 --> 00:08:59.418 So I guess to summarize that,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:08:59.420 --> 00:09:03.109 that point is that these problems are
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:03.109 --> 00:09:06.890 not problems of inadequate knowledge.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:06.890 --> 00:09:10.880 But of inadequate action shaped
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:10.880 --> 00:09:13.274 by problematic values.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:13.280 --> 00:09:15.058 That's what I want to talk about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:15.060 --> 00:09:18.990 What values have we deprioritized?
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:18.990 --> 00:09:21.222 What values have we allowed to
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:21.222 --> 00:09:23.370 languish in our body politic?
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:23.370 --> 00:09:25.127 So let's take up a few examples.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:25.130 --> 00:09:26.918 Danny that now we're going to
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:26.918 --> 00:09:28.570 get to the first slide.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:28.570 --> 00:09:31.797 For years we have allowed our public
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:31.797 --> 00:09:33.870 health infrastructure to languish

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:33.870 --> 00:09:36.168 when COVID hit most States and

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:36.168 --> 00:09:37.700 counties had insufficient surveillance

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:37.757 --> 00:09:39.589 and contact tracing capabilities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:39.590 --> 00:09:40.022 I mean,

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:40.022 --> 00:09:41.750 I don't need to tell that to you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:41.750 --> 00:09:44.252 This audience is largely an audience

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:44.252 --> 00:09:46.950 of the of healthcare professionals

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:46.950 --> 00:09:48.910 who know better than anyone.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:48.910 --> 00:09:52.650 We didn't have adequate equipment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:52.650 --> 00:09:55.950 not adequate support.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:55.950 --> 00:09:56.979 Personal protective equipment

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:56.979 --> 00:09:58.694 and ventilators should have been

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:09:58.694 --> 00:10:00.409 stockpiled and even though they were,

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:00.410 --> 00:10:01.890 their viability wasn't checked,

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:01.890 --> 00:10:04.110 so all that should have happened.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:04.110 --> 00:10:05.352 All those shortages.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:05.352 --> 00:10:07.422 All that putting our healthcare
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:07.422 --> 00:10:09.450 professionals at risk was avoidable.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:09.450 --> 00:10:12.546 We have known for years that
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:12.546 --> 00:10:15.082 pandemics were coming and really
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:15.082 --> 00:10:18.028 good guidance was already out there
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:18.030 --> 00:10:20.286 in the form of major reports by the
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:20.286 --> 00:10:21.721 National Academy of Medicine and
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:21.721 --> 00:10:23.618 key states like the New York State
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:23.677 --> 00:10:25.357 Task Force on Life and the law.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:25.360 --> 00:10:26.644 There was good guidance.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:26.644 --> 00:10:28.570 Out there on how to prepare
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:28.632 --> 00:10:30.360 the diseases were different,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:30.360 --> 00:10:33.024 but most of this advice was
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:33.024 --> 00:10:35.487 similar and converged on the
NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:35.487 --> 00:10:37.879 ethical requirement to prepare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:37.880 --> 00:10:41.756 Be prepared is a moral requirement

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:41.760 --> 00:10:44.504 prepared by stockpiling equipment

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:44.504 --> 00:10:45.876 anticipating manufacturing

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:45.876 --> 00:10:47.934 chokeholds using tools,

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:47.940 --> 00:10:50.152 especially federal tools available

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:50.152 --> 00:10:53.442 for bringing production to scale by

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:53.442 --> 00:10:55.530 developing guidelines for providing

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:55.530 --> 00:10:58.140 care under conditions of scarcity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:10:58.140 --> 00:11:01.092 And building and sustaining the public

NOTE Confidence: 0.922130638

00:11:01.092 --> 00:11:03.060 health infrastructure necessary for

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:03.134 --> 00:11:06.470 surveillance. We knew what to do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:06.470 --> 00:11:09.230 But we didn't do it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:09.230 --> 00:11:11.086 So I'm going to talk a little bit

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:11.086 --> 00:11:13.630 about why I mean obviously and Danny,

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:13.630 --> 00:11:15.324 I need the next slide for that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:15.330 --> 00:11:19.398 Obviously there's a time scale problem.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:19.400 --> 00:11:23.000 To what I mean by that is to be effective.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:23.000 --> 00:11:25.976 We have to spend money now and keep

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:25.976 --> 00:11:29.209 spending it to sustain readiness for an

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:29.209 --> 00:11:32.260 uncertain benefit sometime in the future.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:32.260 --> 00:11:34.318 And that's what I meant about

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:34.318 --> 00:11:35.690 submitting to instant gratification

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:35.750 --> 00:11:37.598 rather than delaying gratification,

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:37.600 --> 00:11:40.498 we have to spend effort now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:40.500 --> 00:11:43.852 For a future benefit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:43.852 --> 00:11:47.204 Unknown beneficiaries and uncertainty.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:47.210 --> 00:11:49.982 Doing the right thing would require

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:49.982 --> 00:11:53.050 an old fashioned value sacrifice and

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:53.050 --> 00:11:55.150 it would take extraordinary political

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:55.150 --> 00:11:57.691 leadership with integrity to ask the

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909

00:11:57.691 --> 00:11:59.671 current electorate to sacrifice for

NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:11:59.671 --> 00:12:02.249 uncertain benefits and unknown beneficiaries.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:02.250 --> 00:12:04.070 Very often when faced with
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:04.070 --> 00:12:05.890 time scale problems like this,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:05.890 --> 00:12:08.128 we humans do what we do.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:08.130 --> 00:12:10.970 We procrastinate.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:10.970 --> 00:12:14.132 Another reason is that we overvalue
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:14.132 --> 00:12:16.930 some things and undervalue others.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:16.930 --> 00:12:19.504 Our society invests vastly more in
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:19.504 --> 00:12:22.102 cures and rescue medicine than it
NOTE Confidence: 0.909067669090909
00:12:22.102 --> 00:12:24.514 does in prevention and public health.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875
00:12:26.580 --> 00:12:28.292 Of the \$3.6 trillion
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875
00:12:28.292 --> 00:12:30.004 spent on health annually,
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875
00:12:30.010 --> 00:12:33.225 only three percent is directed
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875
00:12:33.225 --> 00:12:36.440 toward public health and prevention.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875
00:12:36.440 --> 00:12:38.736 You know, again, there are many reasons.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:38.740 --> 00:12:41.896 One is that we are culture
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:41.896 --> 00:12:43.474 infatuated with technology.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:43.480 --> 00:12:46.444 Another reason is that there are
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:46.444 --> 00:12:49.017 economic drivers behind rescue but
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:49.017 --> 00:12:51.567 not behind public health readiness.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:51.570 --> 00:12:53.796 Cures capable of rescuing us from
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:53.796 --> 00:12:56.624 disease usually come at least in in this
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:56.624 --> 00:12:59.081 society in the form of medicines and
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:12:59.081 --> 00:13:01.466 devices that are quickly commercialized.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:01.470 --> 00:13:03.914 There's no similar commercial
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:03.914 --> 00:13:06.969 incentive for public health readiness.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:06.970 --> 00:13:08.158 But despite these constraints,
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:08.158 --> 00:13:10.360 I think there are things we can do,
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:10.360 --> 00:13:11.758 and most importantly,
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:11.758 --> 00:13:15.020 we can consciously strive to build a
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:15.102 --> 00:13:17.832 more intriguing cultural narrative that

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:17.832 --> 00:13:21.210 values prevention as much as rescue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:21.210 --> 00:13:23.710 and that would encourage investment

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:23.710 --> 00:13:25.710 and public health infrastructure.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:25.710 --> 00:13:26.808 I'll give you an example of

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:26.808 --> 00:13:27.990 a time that I did that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:27.990 --> 00:13:30.062 and maybe it's a model for something

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:30.062 --> 00:13:32.209 people might adapt in terms of wanting

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:32.209 --> 00:13:34.015 to keep the importance of prevention

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:34.075 --> 00:13:36.385 prominent in people's minds and investment.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:36.390 --> 00:13:37.545 In the future,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:37.545 --> 00:13:39.470 as a young social scientist

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:39.470 --> 00:13:42.100 like it was early in my career,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:42.100 --> 00:13:44.900 I was living in Boston and the

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:44.900 --> 00:13:46.981 Boston newspapers and TV airwaves

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:46.981 --> 00:13:49.781 were covering the story of a toddler

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:49.781 --> 00:13:52.336 who very badly needed a kidney.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:52.340 --> 00:13:53.830 The media story was everywhere
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:53.830 --> 00:13:56.010 and it seemed like the whole city
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:56.010 --> 00:13:57.585 was holding its breath until
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:57.585 --> 00:13:59.320 the kidney could be found for.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:13:59.320 --> 00:14:01.280 Let's call her Amanda.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:01.280 --> 00:14:03.730 Then suddenly a kidney was
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:03.730 --> 00:14:05.139 available and again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:05.140 --> 00:14:07.108 the airwaves were alive.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:07.108 --> 00:14:09.568 That excitement with many commentators
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:09.568 --> 00:14:11.590 beaming at this happy ending.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:11.590 --> 00:14:14.110 But I was wondering who was it
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:14.110 --> 00:14:15.590 a happy ending for?
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:15.590 --> 00:14:17.956 It turns out that Amanda's new kidney
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:17.956 --> 00:14:20.104 came from another toddler whom we
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:20.104 --> 00:14:21.884 shall call Elizabeth whose parents

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:21.884 --> 00:14:24.389 had not secured her into a car seat.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:24.390 --> 00:14:26.966 This was a time before public health had

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:26.966 --> 00:14:29.227 mounted its successful car seat laws,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:29.230 --> 00:14:31.828 and amidst the celebrations for Amanda,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:31.830 --> 00:14:34.902 no one mentioned that Elizabeth's death

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:34.902 --> 00:14:38.275 was most likely preventable if we had

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:38.275 --> 00:14:41.166 had such public health legislation in place.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:41.170 --> 00:14:41.566 Unfortunately,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:41.566 --> 00:14:43.150 messages of prevention just

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:43.150 --> 00:14:45.130 don't have the same appeal.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:45.130 --> 00:14:47.602 They don't engender the same compassion

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:47.602 --> 00:14:49.770 as narratives focused on rescue.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:49.770 --> 00:14:51.946 The need to use car seats is just

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:51.946 --> 00:14:53.766 not as exciting or exhilarating

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:53.766 --> 00:14:56.172 as the truly awesome story of

NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:56.172 --> 00:14:58.341 what biomedical technologies like
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:14:58.341 --> 00:15:00.597 organ transplantation can do.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:00.600 --> 00:15:03.024 I was concerned by the 11 levels of
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:03.024 --> 00:15:04.778 compassion toward these two toddlers,
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:04.780 --> 00:15:06.238 and I wrote an OP Ed,
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:06.240 --> 00:15:07.940 which appeared in the Boston
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:07.940 --> 00:15:09.640 go in the Boston Globe.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:09.640 --> 00:15:12.125 One small drop of my effort to
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:12.125 --> 00:15:14.710 try to focus our attention on
NOTE Confidence: 0.92741877875

00:15:14.710 --> 00:15:17.090 prevention as much as rescue.
NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:19.960 --> 00:15:24.520 A second big area that points out
NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:24.520 --> 00:15:27.460 values that we have not prioritized.
NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:27.460 --> 00:15:30.850 Is the. Profound disregard for
NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:30.850 --> 00:15:33.150 health inequities that that we
NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:33.150 --> 00:15:35.907 see in so many different ways.
NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:35.910 --> 00:15:38.430 One of the major.

NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:38.430 --> 00:15:40.685 Issues the pandemic has raised

NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:40.685 --> 00:15:43.666 for us is COVID-19 terribly

NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:43.666 --> 00:15:46.298 unequal toll on African Americans,

NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:46.298 --> 00:15:47.130 Native Americans,

NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:47.130 --> 00:15:49.080 and the Latin X community

NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:49.080 --> 00:15:50.250 and indigenous people.

NOTE Confidence: 0.887817486

00:15:50.250 --> 00:15:52.618 I said that Native Americans and Latin X.

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:15:54.810 --> 00:15:57.438 People of color live dramatically shorter

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:15:57.438 --> 00:16:00.559 and harder lives in the United States.

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:00.560 --> 00:16:01.676 The average life expectancy

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:01.676 --> 00:16:03.849 for a black man is 68 years old

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:03.849 --> 00:16:05.761 and for a white man it is 76.

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:05.761 --> 00:16:08.288 For black women it is just shy

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:08.288 --> 00:16:12.720 of 76 years for white women, 81.

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:12.720 --> 00:16:14.964 We've known for decades that black

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:14.964 --> 00:16:17.332 Americans face the burdens of chronic

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:17.332 --> 00:16:19.756 illness much earlier than whites and

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:19.756 --> 00:16:21.384 have significantly poorer health

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:21.384 --> 00:16:23.634 outcomes on a number of dimensions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:23.640 --> 00:16:25.620 But throughout the 20th century,

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:25.620 --> 00:16:28.055 we didn't really fully understand

NOTE Confidence: 0.888941865384615

00:16:28.055 --> 00:16:30.490 why there were many hypothesis.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:32.700 --> 00:16:34.420 As important as poverty is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:34.420 --> 00:16:35.905 it's very important,

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:35.905 --> 00:16:38.380 but some thought that poverty

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:38.380 --> 00:16:40.878 alone accounted for the differences

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:40.880 --> 00:16:42.968 we now know that's not true.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:42.970 --> 00:16:45.646 People also hypothesize that it was

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:45.646 --> 00:16:47.821 because African Americans distrusted the

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:47.821 --> 00:16:50.117 healthcare system and came in later for

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:50.117 --> 00:16:52.759 care were more reluctant to have surgery.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:52.760 --> 00:16:54.800 They finally got care when their

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:54.800 --> 00:16:56.160 disease was more advanced,

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:56.160 --> 00:16:58.716 or maybe because they lacked insurance

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:16:58.720 --> 00:17:01.002 or were less able to have time

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:01.002 --> 00:17:03.539 off or didn't have transportation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:03.540 --> 00:17:04.960 These were all guesses.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:04.960 --> 00:17:07.400 You could call them hypothesis, I suppose.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:07.400 --> 00:17:09.380 That were prominent in the latter

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:09.380 --> 00:17:11.189 half of the 20th century.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:11.190 --> 00:17:14.154 It's it's very noteworthy that most

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:14.154 --> 00:17:17.920 of these hypothesis had to do with

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:17.920 --> 00:17:19.627 healthcare professionals perceptions

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:19.627 --> 00:17:23.328 of patients of color and their lives.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:23.330 --> 00:17:26.314 But almost nothing to do with the behavior

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:26.314 --> 00:17:29.880 of the healthcare professionals themselves.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:29.880 --> 00:17:32.856 Then came a landmark report in
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:32.860 --> 00:17:35.068 2002 by the Institute of Medicine,
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:35.070 --> 00:17:38.436 now the National Academy of Medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:38.440 --> 00:17:40.225 And I think the next slide shows
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:40.225 --> 00:17:41.540 it's cover unequal treatment.
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:41.540 --> 00:17:43.452 A very famous report.
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:43.452 --> 00:17:45.842 It's synthesized a whole new
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:45.842 --> 00:17:47.339 generation of research.
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:47.340 --> 00:17:50.600 This new research showed unequivocally
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:50.600 --> 00:17:53.208 an important causal factor.
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:53.210 --> 00:17:55.775 That few people would have
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:55.775 --> 00:17:58.044 expected or accepted without the
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:17:58.044 --> 00:18:00.216 sophisticated studies to back it up.
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:00.220 --> 00:18:02.230 And what was that causal factor?
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:02.230 --> 00:18:05.440 It was implicit physician bias,
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:05.440 --> 00:18:08.120 which results in significant

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:08.120 --> 00:18:11.470 under referral to specialist care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:11.470 --> 00:18:14.188 Unconscious physician bias.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:14.190 --> 00:18:16.074 You unequal treatment documented

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:16.074 --> 00:18:18.429 hundreds of studies that controlled

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:18.429 --> 00:18:21.049 for all those things that people

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:21.049 --> 00:18:22.709 were guessing about earlier.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:22.710 --> 00:18:25.122 The these studies were sophisticated because

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:25.122 --> 00:18:27.550 they controlled for lack of insurance.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:27.550 --> 00:18:29.590 They controlled for differences in

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:29.590 --> 00:18:31.630 patients preferences and for many

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:31.690 --> 00:18:33.620 other factors that were thought

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:33.620 --> 00:18:35.164 to cause unequal outcomes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:35.170 --> 00:18:38.166 Some of those factors did show up

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:38.166 --> 00:18:40.270 as significant, but when you can,

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:40.270 --> 00:18:41.510 they played some role,

NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:41.510 --> 00:18:43.406 but when you controlled for them,
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:43.410 --> 00:18:46.595 there was no no escaping that a
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:46.595 --> 00:18:48.549 significant additional factor was
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:48.549 --> 00:18:51.099 that physicians were referring fewer.
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:51.100 --> 00:18:53.088 Black patients for specialist
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:53.088 --> 00:18:55.076 care than white patients,
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:55.080 --> 00:18:56.748 and therefore African Americans,
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:56.748 --> 00:18:58.833 had less and later utilization
NOTE Confidence: 0.884623432

00:18:58.833 --> 00:19:00.269 of specialty care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333

00:19:03.110 --> 00:19:06.152 Now unequal treatment had 100 page
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333

00:19:06.152 --> 00:19:09.156 appendix which listed hundreds of studies
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333

00:19:09.156 --> 00:19:11.844 that were all confirming this bias.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333

00:19:11.850 --> 00:19:14.613 I'm going to show just one of these studies,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333

00:19:14.620 --> 00:19:15.558 a little going to give you a
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333

00:19:15.558 --> 00:19:16.349 little taste for one of them,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333

00:19:16.350 --> 00:19:19.510 to remind to remind us all of this

NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:19.510 --> 00:19:21.937 important report and to give you a
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:21.937 --> 00:19:24.868 flavor of the the nature of the studies.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:24.870 --> 00:19:26.306 So yes, thanks Danny,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:26.306 --> 00:19:29.250 this is a study by Kevin Schulman,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:29.250 --> 00:19:30.985 John Eisenberg and their college
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:30.985 --> 00:19:32.373 and colleagues from several
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:32.373 --> 00:19:33.580 academic medical centers.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:33.580 --> 00:19:34.792 And also Rand was involved with
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:34.792 --> 00:19:36.473 it and it was published in the
NOTE Confidence: 0.858960810833333
00:19:36.473 --> 00:19:37.848 New England Journal of Medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:19:39.880 --> 00:19:41.688 Epidemiological studies have reported
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:19:41.688 --> 00:19:44.400 differences in the use of cardiovascular
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:19:44.461 --> 00:19:46.777 procedures like cardiac catheterization.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:19:46.780 --> 00:19:48.328 They were reporting differences
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:19:48.328 --> 00:19:50.263 by race and by sex.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:19:50.270 --> 00:19:52.750 But the reasons for these
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:19:52.750 --> 00:19:54.238 differences were unclear.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:19:54.240 --> 00:19:56.795 Solman at all hypothesized that it might
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:19:56.795 --> 00:20:00.178 have to do with physician recommendations,
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:00.180 --> 00:20:02.288 and specifically whether physicians
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:02.288 --> 00:20:05.450 referred all their patients at the
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:05.528 --> 00:20:08.388 same rate for cardiac catheterization.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:08.390 --> 00:20:12.359 So they constructed an online survey with
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:12.359 --> 00:20:15.351 standardized patients played by actors who,
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:15.351 --> 00:20:18.177 in video segments, described their symptoms.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:18.180 --> 00:20:20.745 The physicians were given consistent
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:20.745 --> 00:20:23.290 information about the symptoms, background,
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:23.290 --> 00:20:26.720 health type and severity of coma comorbidity.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:26.720 --> 00:20:29.504 All patients were described as having
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:29.504 --> 00:20:32.508 insurance and as having a family
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:20:32.508 --> 00:20:34.640 history of myocardial infarction.

NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:34.640 --> 00:20:36.728 They made sure to dress the white and
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:36.728 --> 00:20:38.259 black patients in equivalent ways.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:38.260 --> 00:20:38.571 Here.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:38.571 --> 00:20:39.193 For example,
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:39.193 --> 00:20:41.370 in the next slide is what the
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:41.438 --> 00:20:43.058 black patients look like,
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:43.060 --> 00:20:45.210 and they had younger ones
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:45.210 --> 00:20:46.824 described as age 55.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:46.824 --> 00:20:49.740 You can see them in the top row and
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:49.826 --> 00:20:53.570 older ones at age 75 in the bottom row.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:53.570 --> 00:20:55.670 And here I have the white
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:55.670 --> 00:20:57.590 patients looked in the study.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:57.590 --> 00:20:59.718 I think you'll agree they did a
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:20:59.718 --> 00:21:02.248 good job of creating socioeconomic
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286
00:21:02.248 --> 00:21:06.160 and age related equivalents.
NOTE Confidence: 0.940574660714286

00:21:06.160 --> 00:21:08.170 And they asked.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:10.510 --> 00:21:12.358 They presented these videos at A
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:12.358 --> 00:21:14.809 at a meeting of internal medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:14.810 --> 00:21:17.064 I believe it was and asked them.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:17.070 --> 00:21:19.170 Given all this equivalent information,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:19.170 --> 00:21:21.816 asking them who they would recommend
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:21.816 --> 00:21:23.139 for cardiac catheterization.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:23.140 --> 00:21:25.500 The results were really striking.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:25.500 --> 00:21:27.786 Both race and sex were highly
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:27.786 --> 00:21:29.870 significant predictors for rates of
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:29.870 --> 00:21:31.838 referral for cardiac catheterization.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:31.840 --> 00:21:33.928 This was after controlling for all
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:33.928 --> 00:21:35.320 the other potential predictors,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:35.320 --> 00:21:36.848 even controlling for physicians
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:36.848 --> 00:21:38.758 own assessment of the risk,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586519233333333

00:21:38.760 --> 00:21:42.240 they thought each patient presented.

NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:42.240 --> 00:21:44.050 They also found an important
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:44.050 --> 00:21:45.860 interaction between race and sex
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:45.925 --> 00:21:47.585 with black women being referred
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:47.585 --> 00:21:49.670 much less than any other group.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:49.670 --> 00:21:51.651 With the sophisticated ways in which they
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:51.651 --> 00:21:53.350 had controlled for other predictors,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:53.350 --> 00:21:55.998 it was hard to say that anything other
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:55.998 --> 00:21:57.939 than physicians lack of referral
NOTE Confidence: 0.858651923333333
00:21:57.939 --> 00:21:59.969 could account for these differences.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825
00:22:02.110 --> 00:22:04.315 So this introduced the whole
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825
00:22:04.315 --> 00:22:07.878 notion of physician. Bias. Now.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825
00:22:07.878 --> 00:22:09.910 Unequal treatment was focused
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825
00:22:09.910 --> 00:22:13.711 primarily on unequal access to care and
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825
00:22:13.711 --> 00:22:16.059 therefore unequal medical treatment.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825
00:22:16.060 --> 00:22:18.720 It uncovered this individual
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:18.720 --> 00:22:20.715 level unconscious bias.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:20.720 --> 00:22:23.138 But these early 21st century studies
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:23.138 --> 00:22:25.796 and some late 20th century studies
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:25.796 --> 00:22:28.206 couldn't say much of anything.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:28.210 --> 00:22:31.168 About the social determinants of health.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:31.170 --> 00:22:33.558 The structural injustices that
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:33.558 --> 00:22:35.946 disadvantaged communities of color.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:35.950 --> 00:22:39.760 Thanks to social epidemiologists like Nancy
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:39.760 --> 00:22:43.720 Krieger and sociologist like David Williams.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:43.720 --> 00:22:45.764 Also, a legal historian,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:45.764 --> 00:22:47.808 Richard Rothstein and a
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:47.808 --> 00:22:49.560 philosopher Elizabeth Anderson.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:49.560 --> 00:22:52.843 We can now trace the connection between
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:52.843 --> 00:22:55.060 historical and political injustices
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:55.060 --> 00:22:58.156 that in turn create unequal social
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:22:58.156 --> 00:23:01.628 determinants of health and how those

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:01.628 --> 00:23:04.268 ultimately create inequitable health

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:04.268 --> 00:23:06.908 outcomes for African Americans.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:06.910 --> 00:23:09.563 So the early studies were at an

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:09.563 --> 00:23:11.969 individual level of individual bias,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:11.970 --> 00:23:16.566 and the later studies connect a history

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:16.566 --> 00:23:19.906 of discrimination to social inequities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:19.910 --> 00:23:22.814 which in turn are the reason

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:22.814 --> 00:23:24.750 for the health inequities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:24.750 --> 00:23:26.310 I'm going to give you just

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:26.310 --> 00:23:27.350 a couple of examples.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:27.350 --> 00:23:29.206 Historical research shows that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:29.206 --> 00:23:31.062 most African American soldiers

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:31.062 --> 00:23:33.230 returning from World War Two were

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:33.230 --> 00:23:35.360 blocked from access to the GI Bill.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:35.360 --> 00:23:37.688 And they were therefore denied the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:37.688 --> 00:23:39.632 same opportunities for education that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:39.632 --> 00:23:41.618 white Americans got from that bill.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:41.620 --> 00:23:42.496 Think about that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:42.496 --> 00:23:44.885 Think about the role that the GI Bill

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:44.885 --> 00:23:46.873 might have had in your own family.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:46.880 --> 00:23:48.658 I know that in my family it

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:48.658 --> 00:23:49.420 was absolutely critical.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:49.420 --> 00:23:52.884 My dad came back from World War Two.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:52.890 --> 00:23:55.690 And he went to college and later to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:55.690 --> 00:23:57.407 professional school on the GI Bill.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:57.410 --> 00:23:59.830 His education that education paid

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:23:59.830 --> 00:24:02.986 for by a grateful country lifted my

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:02.986 --> 00:24:05.194 whole family into the middle class.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:05.200 --> 00:24:07.448 And is responsible for a lot of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:07.448 --> 00:24:09.059 opportunities I've had in my own life,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:09.060 --> 00:24:12.964 and even in the lives of my kids.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:12.970 --> 00:24:15.330 Those benefits were mostly not

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:15.330 --> 00:24:17.218 available to black returning

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:17.218 --> 00:24:19.078 soldiers and their families.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:19.080 --> 00:24:21.579 Also, the practice of 20th century redlining,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:21.580 --> 00:24:22.650 which we've all heard about,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:22.650 --> 00:24:24.214 has also denied black

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:24.214 --> 00:24:25.778 Americans access to mortgages,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:25.780 --> 00:24:28.062 and that too has had a tremendous

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:28.062 --> 00:24:29.830 ripple effect across generations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:29.830 --> 00:24:32.725 It locked African Americans into

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:32.725 --> 00:24:34.462 residentially segregated neighborhoods

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:34.462 --> 00:24:37.393 with worse schools with which then

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:37.393 --> 00:24:39.937 links to poorer prospects for higher

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:40.009 --> 00:24:42.199 education and well paying jobs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:42.200 --> 00:24:44.252 Not to mention the toll that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:44.252 --> 00:24:46.080 taken by poor housing stock,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:46.080 --> 00:24:47.130 lead contamination,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:47.130 --> 00:24:48.180 food deserts,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:48.180 --> 00:24:53.239 and a lack of safe green recreational spaces.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:53.240 --> 00:24:55.844 We also know that the daily experience
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:55.844 --> 00:24:57.832 of discrimination that black Americans
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:57.832 --> 00:24:59.776 face leads to chronic inflammation,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:24:59.776 --> 00:25:02.529 which in turn leads to the onset
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:02.529 --> 00:25:04.414 of chronic illness roughly 10
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:04.414 --> 00:25:06.670 years ahead of white Americans.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:06.670 --> 00:25:10.366 We now could see that there are multiple
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:10.366 --> 00:25:12.370 interlocking causal explanations,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:12.370 --> 00:25:13.940 including social,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:13.940 --> 00:25:17.080 economic and environmental ones.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:17.080 --> 00:25:18.472 My colleague Tia Powell,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:18.472 --> 00:25:21.280 who heads the bioethics center at Montefiore,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:21.280 --> 00:25:22.955 shared an example with me

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:22.955 --> 00:25:24.295 that makes this point.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:24.300 --> 00:25:25.878 Modify your as you probably know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:25.880 --> 00:25:27.240 is located in the Bronx,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:27.240 --> 00:25:28.920 the poorest most disadvantaged

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:28.920 --> 00:25:31.500 borough in New York City a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:31.500 --> 00:25:32.940 Montefiore pediatric surgeon,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:32.940 --> 00:25:35.820 noticed that her practice was getting

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:35.894 --> 00:25:38.396 far more children with broken bones,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:38.400 --> 00:25:40.544 particularly among black boys,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:40.544 --> 00:25:42.688 than one should expect.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:42.690 --> 00:25:44.910 It would be possible to hypothesize

NOTE Confidence: 0.9015467825

00:25:44.910 --> 00:25:46.020 many reasons right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:25:46.020 --> 00:25:48.256 including nutrition, genetics, neglect.

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:25:48.256 --> 00:25:52.046 But it was determined eventually that the

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:25:52.046 --> 00:25:54.950 main reason was lack of parks and spaces.

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:25:54.950 --> 00:25:56.840 To play, these kids were playing

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:25:56.840 --> 00:25:59.007 on the street and running into

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:25:59.007 --> 00:26:00.687 traffic after errant falls.

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:26:00.690 --> 00:26:02.362 As the story goes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:26:02.362 --> 00:26:04.452 the pediatric surgeon noticed this

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:26:04.452 --> 00:26:07.207 pattern in these young boys and did

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:26:07.207 --> 00:26:09.749 something more than surgery to address it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:26:09.750 --> 00:26:12.084 She worked with the community to

NOTE Confidence: 0.880443818421052

00:26:12.084 --> 00:26:13.640 create green recreational space.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:16.210 --> 00:26:17.710 There are similar efforts

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:17.710 --> 00:26:19.210 unfolding today in Denver,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:19.210 --> 00:26:21.424 where the community is planning on

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:21.424 --> 00:26:23.911 planting hundreds of trees in its

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:23.911 --> 00:26:25.327 most disadvantaged neighborhood.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:25.330 --> 00:26:27.364 They're doing this as an environmental

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:27.364 --> 00:26:29.532 adaptation to global warming because it's

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:29.532 --> 00:26:31.427 been recognized that these segregated

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:31.427 --> 00:26:33.180 areas where historically there's been

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:33.180 --> 00:26:35.126 little to no public investment in trees

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:35.126 --> 00:26:37.914 or parks are experiencing harmful

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:37.914 --> 00:26:41.044 health effects as temperatures rise.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:41.050 --> 00:26:43.084 So the question I'd like to pose to you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:43.090 --> 00:26:45.530 in which I hope we can discuss at the end,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:45.530 --> 00:26:49.401 is how far do health care providers

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:49.401 --> 00:26:51.060 responsibilities actually go?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:51.060 --> 00:26:52.524 I'll share my answer.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:52.524 --> 00:26:54.640 It's that, at a minimum,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:54.640 --> 00:26:56.860 health care providers should be

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:56.860 --> 00:26:58.540 studying disparities in their

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:26:58.540 --> 00:27:00.858 own patient populations and then

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:00.858 --> 00:27:02.577 designing interventions specifically
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:02.577 --> 00:27:05.272 targeted to redressing the observed
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:05.272 --> 00:27:07.812 problems in under referrals, care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:07.812 --> 00:27:10.180 delivery and follow-up services.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:10.180 --> 00:27:12.630 But one can also go beyond care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:12.630 --> 00:27:15.410 delivery into community interventions.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:15.410 --> 00:27:17.495 For you know.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:17.500 --> 00:27:18.820 I've given you a couple examples.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:18.820 --> 00:27:20.710 Another example would be that some
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:20.710 --> 00:27:22.676 health systems are working with lawyers
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:22.676 --> 00:27:24.301 and tenants rights organizations to
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:24.301 --> 00:27:26.224 make sure that landlords respond
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:26.224 --> 00:27:27.556 to environmental threats,
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:27.560 --> 00:27:29.075 undermining Children's Health.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:29.075 --> 00:27:32.105 And some institutions have become so
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:32.105 --> 00:27:34.497 frustrated by repeat bouts of life

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:34.497 --> 00:27:36.312 threatening asthma that they are

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:36.377 --> 00:27:38.165 directly providing air conditioners

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:38.165 --> 00:27:40.847 themselves for the homes of their

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:40.850 --> 00:27:43.530 pediatric patients with asthma.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:43.530 --> 00:27:46.771 So how far do you think healthcare

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:46.771 --> 00:27:48.430 professional responsibilities should go?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:48.430 --> 00:27:51.360 What is reasonable to expect

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:51.360 --> 00:27:53.118 of healthcare organizations?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:53.120 --> 00:27:55.460 What should become a core responsibility?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:55.460 --> 00:27:58.185 Maybe even a professional obligation

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:27:58.185 --> 00:28:00.910 and what should be supererogatory

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:00.995 --> 00:28:02.319 but praiseworthy?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:02.320 --> 00:28:04.770 So let's come back to that in

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:04.770 --> 00:28:05.470 the conversation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:05.470 --> 00:28:07.108 And now I want to enter kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:07.108 --> 00:28:08.790 of the third part of my talk.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:08.790 --> 00:28:10.150 I've already talked about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:10.150 --> 00:28:12.190 You know our emphasis on rescue
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:12.190 --> 00:28:15.088 rather on cure rather than rescue.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:15.090 --> 00:28:17.622 I've talked about a kind of
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:17.622 --> 00:28:18.888 blindness to inequity,
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:18.890 --> 00:28:23.120 and now the third thing I want to talk about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:23.120 --> 00:28:26.736 Is shown in this slide the way in
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:26.736 --> 00:28:29.949 which vaccine refusal shines a light.
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:29.950 --> 00:28:31.966 On what I want to call
NOTE Confidence: 0.86275285875

00:28:31.966 --> 00:28:32.638 unfettered individualism.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:28:38.210 --> 00:28:40.548 One of the fault lines exacerbating distrust
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:28:40.548 --> 00:28:43.266 and making it very hard to figure out how
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:28:43.266 --> 00:28:45.468 to live together has been the challenge
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:28:45.468 --> 00:28:47.883 of navigating an age old ethical tension,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:28:47.890 --> 00:28:50.266 which is always seen in pandemics

NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:28:50.266 --> 00:28:53.229 and is very common in public health.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:28:53.230 --> 00:28:55.535 The tension between individual liberty
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:28:55.535 --> 00:28:59.198 on the one hand and the common good.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:28:59.200 --> 00:29:01.438 There's a long tradition of laws,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:01.440 --> 00:29:04.080 policies, and norms that have recognized
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:04.080 --> 00:29:07.290 that during times of existential threat.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:07.290 --> 00:29:09.846 Like pandemics, the state needs and
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:09.846 --> 00:29:13.187 must have the authority to restrict some
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:13.187 --> 00:29:15.886 liberties demanding quarantine or isolation,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:15.886 --> 00:29:18.646 or cordoning off a region
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:18.646 --> 00:29:20.430 by restricting travel.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:20.430 --> 00:29:22.054 This goes back a really long way.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:22.060 --> 00:29:24.184 I want to share a nice experience I had.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:24.190 --> 00:29:26.206 I was in Dubrovnik,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:29:26.206 --> 00:29:29.422 Croatia several summers ago and my host
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:29.422 --> 00:29:32.690 pointed with great pride to this building.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:32.690 --> 00:29:35.888 The building with the red roof.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:35.890 --> 00:29:38.970 He told me this was the first
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:38.970 --> 00:29:41.542 facility in Europe to quarantine
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:41.542 --> 00:29:44.046 international travelers to Dubrovnik,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:44.050 --> 00:29:44.464 Dubrovnik.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:44.464 --> 00:29:48.190 At that time was the New York City or
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:48.278 --> 00:29:51.383 the Hong Kong of its time a major hub
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:51.383 --> 00:29:54.487 of international trade and travel.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:54.490 --> 00:29:58.096 This building was built for quarantine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:29:58.100 --> 00:30:00.476 In 1377,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:30:00.476 --> 00:30:03.256 more than 600 years ago.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:30:03.260 --> 00:30:05.640 He was proud of this because it
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:30:05.640 --> 00:30:07.733 demonstrated his nation's very early,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:30:07.733 --> 00:30:09.146 though admittedly rudimentary
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667

00:30:09.146 --> 00:30:11.614 understanding of science and of

NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:30:11.614 --> 00:30:13.180 infectious disease transmission,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:30:13.180 --> 00:30:15.413 and because it showed a state governing
NOTE Confidence: 0.892950657666667
00:30:15.413 --> 00:30:17.968 well by acting to protect its population.
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:20.030 --> 00:30:22.286 Today, there's a dangerous
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:22.286 --> 00:30:23.978 misunderstanding of liberty.
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:23.980 --> 00:30:25.033 People are waving.
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:25.033 --> 00:30:27.139 Don't tread on me flags both
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:27.139 --> 00:30:28.599 literally and figuratively,
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:28.600 --> 00:30:30.205 asserting that state requirements to
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:30.205 --> 00:30:33.147 wear a mask or to get vaccinated are
NOTE Confidence: 0.857415774285714
00:30:33.147 --> 00:30:35.267 serious restrictions on their liberty.
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834
00:30:38.270 --> 00:30:42.070 Despite all these this pushback,
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834
00:30:42.070 --> 00:30:44.010 it looked as though.
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834
00:30:44.010 --> 00:30:46.435 Employer mandates might turn the
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834
00:30:46.435 --> 00:30:49.780 tide and get us to a point where
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:30:49.780 --> 00:30:52.216 we had maximum vaccination rates.
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:30:52.216 --> 00:30:54.876 The Biden administration implemented an
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:30:54.876 --> 00:30:58.048 OSHA rule that all employers with 100
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:30:58.048 --> 00:31:00.615 employees or more must require either
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:00.615 --> 00:31:03.387 vaccination or that employees be tested
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:03.387 --> 00:31:05.804 frequently and have negative tests.
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:05.804 --> 00:31:08.364 Of course, some people complained,
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:08.370 --> 00:31:10.594 but in the end rather than lose their
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:10.594 --> 00:31:12.974 jobs or test so frequently that many
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:12.974 --> 00:31:15.480 people were beginning to get vaccinated,
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:15.480 --> 00:31:18.077 the the mandate worked and I became
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:18.077 --> 00:31:21.150 hopeful that the United States would reach
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:21.150 --> 00:31:23.976 a more appropriate level of vaccination.
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:23.980 --> 00:31:27.460 But now, just as it was showing promise,
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:27.460 --> 00:31:29.590 states began passing legislation and
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:29.590 --> 00:31:31.720 their governors drew up executive

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:31.783 --> 00:31:34.170 orders to make it illegal for school

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:34.170 --> 00:31:36.158 districts or county governments to

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:36.158 --> 00:31:38.418 require basic protections like masks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:38.420 --> 00:31:41.744 And some states attempted to stop

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:41.744 --> 00:31:43.960 employers from requiring vaccinations

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:44.044 --> 00:31:45.839 as a condition of work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:45.840 --> 00:31:47.240 Eventually, in January 2022,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:47.240 --> 00:31:48.990 just a few months ago,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:48.990 --> 00:31:52.054 the issue came before the US Supreme Court.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:52.060 --> 00:31:55.522 Which allowed a state prohibition against

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:55.522 --> 00:31:59.388 the OSHA employer mandate to stay in place.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:31:59.390 --> 00:32:01.567 That SCOTUS decision was the end of,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:32:01.570 --> 00:32:02.452 in my view,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:32:02.452 --> 00:32:04.510 of any chance to get very widespread

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:32:04.579 --> 00:32:05.929 levels of vaccination.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:32:05.930 --> 00:32:08.630 The employer mandates were working.
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:32:08.630 --> 00:32:10.214 The states tried to limit them
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:32:10.214 --> 00:32:12.034 and the US Supreme Court allowed
NOTE Confidence: 0.79148834

00:32:12.034 --> 00:32:13.438 the prohibition to stand.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:15.510 --> 00:32:17.274 Similarly, a US District Court in
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:17.274 --> 00:32:18.868 Florida has overturned a federal
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:18.868 --> 00:32:20.668 mass mandate on public transportation
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:20.668 --> 00:32:22.370 that's still being played out.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:22.370 --> 00:32:24.546 I want to also mention because this is
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:24.546 --> 00:32:26.747 an audience of healthcare workers that
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:26.747 --> 00:32:29.489 healthcare worker mandates have stayed in
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:29.489 --> 00:32:32.968 place and have been reaffirmed repeatedly.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:32.970 --> 00:32:35.722 I'm talking about general
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:35.722 --> 00:32:37.262 employment mandates,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:37.262 --> 00:32:40.670 employer mandates in general.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857

00:32:40.670 --> 00:32:43.337 This recent Supreme Court decision on the

NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:43.337 --> 00:32:45.618 federal mandate for employer requirements
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:45.618 --> 00:32:47.543 threatens the federal government's
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:47.543 --> 00:32:49.108 ability to protect the population,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:49.110 --> 00:32:52.200 not just during this pandemic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:52.200 --> 00:32:54.150 But it could vastly limit the
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:54.150 --> 00:32:56.224 federal ability to manage all manner
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:56.224 --> 00:32:57.999 of future public health crises.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:32:58.000 --> 00:33:00.401 Our society is failing to recognize that
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:33:00.401 --> 00:33:03.278 many of the biggest challenges we face,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:33:03.280 --> 00:33:05.720 cross state lines and our
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:33:05.720 --> 00:33:08.204 federal emergencies that require
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:33:08.204 --> 00:33:10.460 coordinated federal assistance.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856073787142857
00:33:10.460 --> 00:33:13.208 And rules for the common good.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:33:15.830 --> 00:33:17.995 These actions taken against vaccination
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:33:17.995 --> 00:33:20.606 and mask mandates are being justified
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:20.606 --> 00:33:22.874 on the basis of liberty claims.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:22.880 --> 00:33:25.176 And in my view these are false claims.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:25.180 --> 00:33:28.140 The ones that are based on a very

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:28.140 --> 00:33:29.740 thin understanding of liberty.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:29.740 --> 00:33:31.388 For hundreds of years,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:31.388 --> 00:33:33.448 political philosophies of all types

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:33.448 --> 00:33:35.627 have recognized that one's rights

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:35.627 --> 00:33:38.177 end where one's actions harm others.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:38.180 --> 00:33:39.815 John Locke, who 17th century

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:39.815 --> 00:33:40.796 writings on liberty,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:40.800 --> 00:33:42.815 were greatly influential on our

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:42.815 --> 00:33:44.830 nation's founders and are on

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:44.897 --> 00:33:46.828 our own Constitution emphasized

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:46.828 --> 00:33:49.768 that liberty is not synonymous

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:49.768 --> 00:33:53.380 with the license to harm others.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:53.380 --> 00:33:55.588 This quote is a wonderful quote

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:55.588 --> 00:33:57.632 from his writings in 1690.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:57.632 --> 00:33:59.920 Reason teaches all mankind,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:33:59.920 --> 00:34:02.070 who will but consult it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:02.070 --> 00:34:04.506 That being all equal and independent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:04.510 --> 00:34:07.084 no one ought to harm another in his life,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:07.090 --> 00:34:10.830 health, liberty or possessions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:10.830 --> 00:34:13.010 The lives of the immunocompromised,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:13.010 --> 00:34:15.330 for whom the vaccines may be less protective,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:15.330 --> 00:34:17.858 as well as the health of many people

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:17.858 --> 00:34:19.687 contracting long COVID are at stake.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:19.690 --> 00:34:20.242 In fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:20.242 --> 00:34:22.174 all of our health is at stake

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:22.174 --> 00:34:24.275 because so long as there are

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:24.275 --> 00:34:25.687 large populations on vaccinated,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:25.690 --> 00:34:28.070 we may see more and more mutations,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:28.070 --> 00:34:30.260 and some of them may prove
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:30.260 --> 00:34:31.720 more and more lethal.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:31.720 --> 00:34:34.798 But the arguments about liberty are,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:34.800 --> 00:34:35.714 I think,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:35.714 --> 00:34:38.456 to wrongheaded because it's not only
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:38.456 --> 00:34:40.600 that our actions are harming others,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:40.600 --> 00:34:42.140 and so you can't Trump.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:42.140 --> 00:34:43.880 You can't use liberty as your
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:43.880 --> 00:34:45.480 excuse if you're harming others,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:45.480 --> 00:34:48.260 but also it's important to
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:48.260 --> 00:34:51.040 ask what is liberty for?
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:51.040 --> 00:34:53.784 What does liberty for if it's not?
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:53.790 --> 00:34:56.125 To create the conditions in
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:56.125 --> 00:34:57.993 which people can flourish.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:34:58.000 --> 00:35:00.471 And as new variants emerge like the
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:00.471 --> 00:35:02.493 next generation of Omicron's Omicron sub

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:02.493 --> 00:35:04.419 variants that we're seeing right now,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:04.420 --> 00:35:06.576 there is growing likelihood of a return
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:06.576 --> 00:35:08.569 to restrictions on social interaction,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:08.570 --> 00:35:10.202 travel, recreational activities,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:10.202 --> 00:35:12.920 and in person education far
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:12.920 --> 00:35:14.540 from supporting liberty.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:14.540 --> 00:35:17.240 Vaccine refusal is undermining everyone's
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:17.240 --> 00:35:19.720 ability to pursue their life goals,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:19.720 --> 00:35:22.321 which of course is the reason we care so
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:22.321 --> 00:35:24.699 deeply about liberty in the first place.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:24.700 --> 00:35:27.864 Now I don't mean to imply that
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:27.864 --> 00:35:30.699 public policy here is cut and dry.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:30.700 --> 00:35:32.000 You know black or white.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:32.000 --> 00:35:33.728 It's actually very nuanced.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941
00:35:33.728 --> 00:35:36.320 Not all public health measures are
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:36.390 --> 00:35:38.478 reasonable nor self evidently,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:38.480 --> 00:35:40.090 right.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:40.090 --> 00:35:42.729 For us to support limitations on free
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:42.729 --> 00:35:44.589 movement and constraints on liberty,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:44.590 --> 00:35:47.626 the limitations and the constraints should
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:47.626 --> 00:35:50.204 be reasonable and proportionate and
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:50.204 --> 00:35:52.599 not unduly restrict individual rights.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:52.600 --> 00:35:56.740 The keywords here are the qualifiers
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:56.740 --> 00:35:58.683 unduly reasonable, proportionate,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:35:58.683 --> 00:36:01.498 like many criteria in ethics.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:01.500 --> 00:36:03.356 They require careful consideration,
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:03.356 --> 00:36:05.676 and they're not self evident.
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:05.680 --> 00:36:07.368 People can legitimately disagree
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:07.368 --> 00:36:10.869 when a law or policy goes over the
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:10.869 --> 00:36:13.089 line to become unduly restrictive
NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:13.089 --> 00:36:15.740 or unreasonable or disproportionate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:15.740 --> 00:36:18.548 But in order to be able to draw those

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:18.548 --> 00:36:21.698 lines to make any well considered judgments,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:21.700 --> 00:36:24.244 we need to have enough trust in one

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:24.244 --> 00:36:27.098 another to have a meaningful conversation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:27.100 --> 00:36:28.081 In the end,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:28.081 --> 00:36:29.716 government policies may not be

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:29.716 --> 00:36:30.960 acceptable to everyone.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:30.960 --> 00:36:34.180 They rarely are universally accepted,

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:34.180 --> 00:36:36.679 but they should at least be informed

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:36.679 --> 00:36:37.393 by science.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:37.400 --> 00:36:40.210 Discussed and trustworthy venues and

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:40.210 --> 00:36:42.458 include explanations and justifications

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:42.458 --> 00:36:45.516 that are transparent and well explained.

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:45.520 --> 00:36:48.454 And of course we shouldn't just

NOTE Confidence: 0.899124232352941

00:36:48.454 --> 00:36:50.410 do everything scientists tell

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:36:50.499 --> 00:36:52.008 us. Ultimately, questions like to
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:36:52.008 --> 00:36:54.651 lock down or not, or to mandate
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:36:54.651 --> 00:36:56.479 vaccines are political questions.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:36:56.480 --> 00:36:58.982 They should be informed by science, but.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:36:58.982 --> 00:37:01.754 They shouldn't be decided by scientists.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:01.760 --> 00:37:05.174 They should be decided through civic
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:05.174 --> 00:37:07.450 participation and good governance.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:07.450 --> 00:37:11.270 And unfortunately its civic participation
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:11.270 --> 00:37:13.448 that is now threatened by the
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:13.448 --> 00:37:15.350 forces that have undermined trust,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:15.350 --> 00:37:18.932 made all of us vulnerable to
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:18.932 --> 00:37:21.320 conspiracy theories and demagoguery.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:21.320 --> 00:37:24.040 And greatly impeded our ability
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:24.040 --> 00:37:26.216 to manage this pandemic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:26.220 --> 00:37:27.294 Earlier this year,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:37:27.294 --> 00:37:29.084 the Hastings Center examined the

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:29.084 --> 00:37:31.242 erosion of democracy in the United
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:31.242 --> 00:37:33.111 States and offered recommendations
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:33.111 --> 00:37:35.139 for building more robust,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:35.140 --> 00:37:37.330 respectful and inclusive
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:37.330 --> 00:37:38.790 citizen participation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:38.790 --> 00:37:41.438 The next slide shows the cover of our
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:41.438 --> 00:37:43.546 report and I hope you can see the subtitle.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:43.550 --> 00:37:44.510 Let me read it for you.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:44.510 --> 00:37:48.150 It's called democracy in crisis.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:48.150 --> 00:37:51.410 Civic learning and the reconstruction
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:51.410 --> 00:37:54.624 of common purpose by civic learning.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:54.624 --> 00:37:56.714 We meant all the activities
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:56.714 --> 00:37:59.228 by which citizens learn about,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:37:59.230 --> 00:38:00.346 talk about,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:00.346 --> 00:38:03.136 debate and make collective decisions
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:03.136 --> 00:38:04.810 about civic issues.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:04.810 --> 00:38:07.351 This happens at many many levels and
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:07.351 --> 00:38:09.864 takes many forms from classroom debates
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:09.864 --> 00:38:12.666 to community town halls to formal,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:12.666 --> 00:38:13.662 structured deliberations.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:13.662 --> 00:38:16.152 When civic learning is encouraged
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:16.152 --> 00:38:17.390 and practiced,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:17.390 --> 00:38:19.346 people develop habits of the heart.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:19.350 --> 00:38:20.766 In the mind that build trust
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:20.766 --> 00:38:22.600 and a sense of common purpose.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:22.600 --> 00:38:25.480 By doing this thinking together,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:25.480 --> 00:38:26.986 we build trust.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:26.986 --> 00:38:28.994 But citizen participation has
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:28.994 --> 00:38:31.579 been in decline for decades.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:31.580 --> 00:38:33.422 So our report.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:38:33.422 --> 00:38:36.492 Describes a path forward for

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:36.492 --> 00:38:37.720 strengthening it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:37.720 --> 00:38:39.175 First and foremost,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:39.175 --> 00:38:42.395 we take justice to be a basis for
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:42.395 --> 00:38:44.160 civic participation and that means
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:44.233 --> 00:38:47.074 redressing systemic racism as well
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:47.074 --> 00:38:49.759 as the vast material inequality.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:49.760 --> 00:38:53.276 The wealth gap in American Society,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:53.280 --> 00:38:55.332 which has left large numbers of
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:55.332 --> 00:38:57.784 people both black and white living in
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:38:57.784 --> 00:39:01.134 both rural and urban areas in great
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:01.134 --> 00:39:05.269 financial precarity and that vulnerability.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:05.270 --> 00:39:07.208 Predisposes people to
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:07.208 --> 00:39:09.146 resentment against elites.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:09.150 --> 00:39:11.126 And makes them susceptible.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:11.126 --> 00:39:14.948 Makes all of us who feel that
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:14.948 --> 00:39:17.988 susceptible to conspiracy theories.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:17.990 --> 00:39:19.258 Civic learning requires a
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:19.258 --> 00:39:20.526 sense of common purpose,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:20.530 --> 00:39:23.114 but citizens will not have a sense of
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:23.114 --> 00:39:25.043 common purpose when they recognize
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:25.043 --> 00:39:27.063 that their interests are ignored
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:27.070 --> 00:39:29.392 and they and the communities they
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:29.392 --> 00:39:31.780 live in are struggling to survive.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:31.780 --> 00:39:34.060 So the provision of basic public
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:34.060 --> 00:39:35.200 goods like healthcare,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:35.200 --> 00:39:36.538 a quality education,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:36.538 --> 00:39:36.984 food,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:36.984 --> 00:39:39.214 security and housing are essential
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:39.214 --> 00:39:41.687 to building the conditions for
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:41.687 --> 00:39:44.127 civic participation in a democracy.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:39:44.130 --> 00:39:46.452 Our report also acknowledges that the

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:46.452 --> 00:39:48.420 business models of broadcast media,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:48.420 --> 00:39:50.390 the Internet and social media,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:50.390 --> 00:39:52.478 monetize public attention and
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:52.478 --> 00:39:54.566 therefore create strong incentives
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:54.566 --> 00:39:56.470 to share outrageous,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:39:56.470 --> 00:40:00.010 bizarre and conflict provoking information.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:00.010 --> 00:40:02.628 This has to be fixed through regulation
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:02.628 --> 00:40:04.691 or perhaps replaced with business
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:04.691 --> 00:40:07.307 models that create incentives to surface,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:07.310 --> 00:40:09.370 you know more trustworthy information,
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:09.370 --> 00:40:11.446 but it is a huge problem.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:11.450 --> 00:40:12.950 There are many other recommendations
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:12.950 --> 00:40:13.850 in the report.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:13.850 --> 00:40:16.770 Including reforms to science education.
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909
00:40:16.770 --> 00:40:19.464 Beautiful essay on that and the
NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:19.464 --> 00:40:22.789 restoration of civics in school curriculum.

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:22.790 --> 00:40:24.764 I'm not going to try to attempt

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:24.770 --> 00:40:26.906 to summarize all of the essays

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:26.906 --> 00:40:28.330 in this essay set,

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:28.330 --> 00:40:29.800 but the Hastings Center will

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:29.800 --> 00:40:31.623 provide a summary of the findings

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:31.623 --> 00:40:33.709 and the link to the report itself.

NOTE Confidence: 0.892952159090909

00:40:33.710 --> 00:40:36.670 If you contact Schiefer busy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.785410766

00:40:36.670 --> 00:40:41.180 you can see her email VIZIS.

NOTE Confidence: 0.785410766

00:40:41.180 --> 00:40:43.536 At thehastingscenter.org,

NOTE Confidence: 0.785410766

00:40:43.536 --> 00:40:47.358 I also think it's retrievable on my

NOTE Confidence: 0.785410766

00:40:47.358 --> 00:40:50.450 Twitter account and I'll check on that

NOTE Confidence: 0.785410766

00:40:50.450 --> 00:40:53.039 after this talk at Mildred's Salon.

NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818

00:40:55.140 --> 00:40:59.720 So let me let me wrap this up with a summary.

NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818

00:40:59.720 --> 00:41:01.696 I've talked about trust.

NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818

00:41:01.696 --> 00:41:04.660 If we can regain trust in

NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:04.761 --> 00:41:08.570 each other in our government.
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:08.570 --> 00:41:11.426 And in science, then I hope.
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:11.430 --> 00:41:14.706 We will have a strong enough foundation
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:14.706 --> 00:41:18.088 to commit to some core values essential
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:18.088 --> 00:41:20.278 to working together to address
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:20.278 --> 00:41:22.030 collective problems like pandemics.
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:22.030 --> 00:41:26.237 So first I see trust as the
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:26.237 --> 00:41:28.753 primary enabling condition. And.
NOTE Confidence: 0.894350858181818
00:41:28.753 --> 00:41:34.140 If we regain it and build trust. Umm?
NOTE Confidence: 0.965305652727273
00:41:37.370 --> 00:41:39.698 I hope we will be able to rebuild
NOTE Confidence: 0.965305652727273
00:41:39.698 --> 00:41:41.280 public health infrastructure.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625
00:41:43.670 --> 00:41:45.920 I've talked about our failure to
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625
00:41:45.920 --> 00:41:48.672 build it because we have undervalued
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625
00:41:48.672 --> 00:41:51.028 prevention and overvalued cures.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625
00:41:51.030 --> 00:41:54.290 I've also talked about equity
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:41:54.290 --> 00:41:57.450 both within our nation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:41:57.450 --> 00:41:58.602 Think that there's another
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:41:58.602 --> 00:42:00.042 point on the next slide.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:42:00.050 --> 00:42:01.568 Yes, we could advance the slide.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:42:01.570 --> 00:42:03.845 I've talked about equity in three ways,
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:42:03.850 --> 00:42:05.150 equity within our nation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:42:05.150 --> 00:42:07.520 I've just talked a lot about the
NOTE Confidence: 0.922238835625

00:42:07.520 --> 00:42:09.638 wealth gap and about systemic racism.
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:11.710 --> 00:42:14.652 So that we need to address financial
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:14.652 --> 00:42:17.380 precarity and discrimination that
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:17.380 --> 00:42:20.108 breeds distrust and cynicism.
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:20.110 --> 00:42:22.360 I've talked about equity across generations,
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:22.360 --> 00:42:25.846 so that we care about things that might have
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:25.846 --> 00:42:28.506 future benefit for future beneficiaries,
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:28.510 --> 00:42:29.494 not just ourselves.
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:29.494 --> 00:42:31.790 This is critical not just for building

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:31.853 --> 00:42:34.288 public health infrastructure for pandemics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:34.290 --> 00:42:36.390 but it's obvious that that is one

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:36.390 --> 00:42:38.459 of the stumbling blocks for our

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:38.459 --> 00:42:40.299 ability to address climate change.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:40.300 --> 00:42:43.510 And I've talked about equity between

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:43.510 --> 00:42:47.270 nations so that we can provide assists to

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:47.270 --> 00:42:50.072 low and middle income countries so they

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:50.072 --> 00:42:52.354 will have a chance to protect themselves.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:52.360 --> 00:42:54.957 And then I've also talked about rebalancing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:54.960 --> 00:42:57.300 liberty and personal sacrifice so that

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:42:57.300 --> 00:43:00.343 we are willing to accept some modest

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:43:00.343 --> 00:43:03.236 infringements on our liberty in order

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:43:03.236 --> 00:43:07.300 to act on behalf of the common good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:43:07.300 --> 00:43:10.180 With these values in mind.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:43:10.180 --> 00:43:12.084 That's sort of a summary of other

NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:43:12.084 --> 00:43:14.464 things I was trying to the point I was
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:43:14.464 --> 00:43:15.910 trying to make throughout this talk.
NOTE Confidence: 0.93226929

00:43:15.910 --> 00:43:17.917 And and I know that some of it is.
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:21.040 --> 00:43:22.200 I don't know, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:22.200 --> 00:43:23.510 you don't necessarily end up
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:23.510 --> 00:43:25.002 in a happy place. When we,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:25.002 --> 00:43:26.107 when we describe these problems.
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:26.110 --> 00:43:28.524 So I do want to end with
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:28.524 --> 00:43:31.340 a more optimistic message.
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:31.340 --> 00:43:32.876 I've named these threats,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:32.876 --> 00:43:35.180 but there are also important cultural
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:35.245 --> 00:43:37.380 shifts toward a more compassionate,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:37.380 --> 00:43:39.500 inclusive future.
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:39.500 --> 00:43:41.292 And let me name just a few things
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:41.292 --> 00:43:43.398 that do give me a lot of hope
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:43.398 --> 00:43:44.466 despite the alarming growth

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:44.529 --> 00:43:46.057 in white supremacist groups.

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:46.060 --> 00:43:48.124 Recent polls show that a much

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:48.124 --> 00:43:49.949 larger percentage of us than

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:49.949 --> 00:43:51.864 ever before in American history

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:51.864 --> 00:43:54.109 believe that racism is a problem.

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:54.110 --> 00:43:55.506 There's also growing recognition

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:55.506 --> 00:43:57.600 that hourly wages have to rise

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:57.665 --> 00:43:59.795 and even support in some quarters

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:43:59.795 --> 00:44:01.215 across the political spectrum,

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:01.220 --> 00:44:02.624 really across it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:02.624 --> 00:44:04.964 For a universal basic income,

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:04.970 --> 00:44:07.565 because people are recognizing that

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:07.565 --> 00:44:09.641 artificial intelligence and robotics

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:09.641 --> 00:44:12.937 is likely to displace millions of workers.

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:12.940 --> 00:44:13.256 Scientists,

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:13.256 --> 00:44:14.520 as I mentioned before,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:14.520 --> 00:44:16.650 have shared their findings with
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:16.650 --> 00:44:18.354 unmatched speed and collaboration
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:18.354 --> 00:44:20.399 and healthcare professionals have
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:20.399 --> 00:44:22.471 demonstrated enormous fortitude far
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:22.471 --> 00:44:25.268 beyond what should be expected of you.
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:25.270 --> 00:44:27.466 Demonstrating that there is ample goodness,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:27.470 --> 00:44:28.044 compassion,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:28.044 --> 00:44:30.340 and courage among Americans.
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:30.340 --> 00:44:34.215 So I see these as hopeful signs if
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:34.215 --> 00:44:37.157 we can grasp these glimmers of hope
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:37.157 --> 00:44:39.110 and amplify the core values that I've
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:39.165 --> 00:44:40.815 been talking about in this talk,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:40.820 --> 00:44:42.400 I think we can choose.
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:42.400 --> 00:44:45.064 A wiser path and we can build a stronger,
NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:45.070 --> 00:44:48.960 more sustainable and more trustworthy

NOTE Confidence: 0.934033352

00:44:48.960 --> 00:44:51.420 society. That's it, thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.736053741428571

00:44:52.960 --> 00:44:55.088 That was marvelous really. It really was.

NOTE Confidence: 0.736053741428571

00:44:55.090 --> 00:44:58.350 It was a I mean quite a quite a tour.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:01.000 --> 00:45:02.476 And I appreciate the last bit

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:02.476 --> 00:45:03.890 of optimism because I was I was

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:03.944 --> 00:45:05.652 toward the end kind of looking for

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:05.652 --> 00:45:07.168 something sharp to cut myself with.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:07.170 --> 00:45:08.912 I mean by the end of this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:08.912 --> 00:45:11.584 but but you know, we can run away

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:11.584 --> 00:45:13.279 from it or we can face it right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:13.280 --> 00:45:15.820 That's our, that's our option.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:15.820 --> 00:45:18.868 The idea of sacrificing for the

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:18.868 --> 00:45:21.800 future is such an important one,

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:21.800 --> 00:45:23.991 that that investing in things I mean

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:23.991 --> 00:45:26.095 getting to your initial issue and to

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:26.095 --> 00:45:28.502 the and to the talk about the pandemic
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:28.502 --> 00:45:30.889 is is preparing for the next pandemic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:30.890 --> 00:45:33.587 Well, we're not even through with getting
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:33.587 --> 00:45:36.080 people to invest money that we never pay out.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:36.080 --> 00:45:37.490 You know this this the image
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:37.490 --> 00:45:38.970 of we we've all heard it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:38.970 --> 00:45:40.017 Read and listen.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:40.017 --> 00:45:42.952 Of the old man planting a tree under
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:42.952 --> 00:45:46.050 whose shade he'll never sit to do
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:46.050 --> 00:45:48.675 some things for future generations.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:48.680 --> 00:45:50.180 This was really so nicely done.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:50.180 --> 00:45:53.036 I invite folks to to put your comments
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:53.036 --> 00:45:55.299 or questions into the Q&A portion.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:55.300 --> 00:45:56.800 I see there's already several,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:45:56.800 --> 00:46:01.470 so I'm going to get to it here in my friend.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667

00:46:01.470 --> 00:46:04.140 And see what we have.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667
00:46:04.140 --> 00:46:06.196 Let's begin preparations have
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667
00:46:06.196 --> 00:46:07.738 become very politicized.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667
00:46:07.740 --> 00:46:10.530 What are your suggestions for mobilizing
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667
00:46:10.530 --> 00:46:12.864 desire and overcoming these major
NOTE Confidence: 0.907729076666667
00:46:12.864 --> 00:46:15.270 barriers of our current info demic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:17.260 --> 00:46:20.816 Well. I I can make two comments.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:20.820 --> 00:46:22.128 I mean it's very troubling and
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:22.128 --> 00:46:23.510 it's going to be very hard,
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:23.510 --> 00:46:24.980 but one of the things we've
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:24.980 --> 00:46:26.758 talked a lot about in our report,
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:26.760 --> 00:46:29.748 this democracy of crisis in crisis
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:29.748 --> 00:46:32.548 report is that there's a lot of
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:32.548 --> 00:46:34.630 opportunity at the local level.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:34.630 --> 00:46:35.960 You know, take climate change.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378
00:46:35.960 --> 00:46:36.486 For example.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:36.486 --> 00:46:38.590 There's a lot of efforts to do climate
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:38.643 --> 00:46:40.377 adaptation where you don't have to
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:40.377 --> 00:46:42.409 fight with each other about the cause.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:42.410 --> 00:46:44.606 You don't have to fight over
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:44.606 --> 00:46:46.420 whether it's man-made or not.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:46.420 --> 00:46:49.228 To to make your local community
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:49.228 --> 00:46:51.563 hardier against water rising and
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:51.563 --> 00:46:53.837 and heat and things like that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:53.840 --> 00:46:55.540 So there are some promising
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:55.540 --> 00:46:56.560 examples of where.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:56.560 --> 00:46:57.994 If we just stick to working
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:57.994 --> 00:46:59.605 together to fix a local problem
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:46:59.605 --> 00:47:01.399 that everybody can kind of see,
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:01.400 --> 00:47:03.580 because there is more heat,
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:03.580 --> 00:47:05.700 there is more water rise we need to
NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:05.700 --> 00:47:08.360 fix some things and not fight about our

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:08.360 --> 00:47:10.460 differences around what is causing it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:10.460 --> 00:47:13.500 That is one example.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:13.500 --> 00:47:17.214 Also. One of the essays.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:17.214 --> 00:47:17.610 Actually,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:17.610 --> 00:47:20.362 I wrote this with a a very interesting

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:20.362 --> 00:47:22.807 professor at the Ed school at Harvard.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:22.810 --> 00:47:25.942 We talk about how notions of

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:25.942 --> 00:47:28.030 civic participation have really

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:28.122 --> 00:47:30.558 eroded in the last 30 years.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:30.560 --> 00:47:32.496 It used to be that there were at

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:32.496 --> 00:47:34.252 least three courses on civics in

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:34.252 --> 00:47:35.767 every high school experience for

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:35.767 --> 00:47:37.667 a kid to graduate high school.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:37.670 --> 00:47:39.441 They had three and one of them

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:39.441 --> 00:47:40.810 was problems of democracy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:40.810 --> 00:47:43.008 Where you where nobody was afraid to

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:43.008 --> 00:47:44.883 bring up real controversial issues

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:44.883 --> 00:47:47.475 and discuss them in the classroom.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:47.480 --> 00:47:50.400 It was the material for for the teaching.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:50.400 --> 00:47:53.368 It was it they were real civics examples.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:53.370 --> 00:47:55.285 And then this generation doesn't

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:55.285 --> 00:47:56.434 have that experience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:56.440 --> 00:47:58.360 The whole model of education

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:47:58.360 --> 00:48:01.210 has shifted from having a civic

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:01.210 --> 00:48:03.290 orientation to being financial,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:03.290 --> 00:48:06.034 preparing kids for for earning a living.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:06.040 --> 00:48:07.219 And the there's.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:07.219 --> 00:48:09.970 There's no teaching of that type now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:09.970 --> 00:48:10.534 And of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:10.534 --> 00:48:12.329 now it's gotten even worse in the last month.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:12.330 --> 00:48:14.280 Few months as school and school

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:14.280 --> 00:48:16.133 boards are becoming a place where

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:16.133 --> 00:48:17.630 a lot of these polls,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:17.630 --> 00:48:19.910 the polarization is getting acted out.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:19.910 --> 00:48:23.348 Nevertheless, there there are good examples.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90378

00:48:23.350 --> 00:48:25.730 Of reorienting how we?

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:28.120 --> 00:48:30.220 How we teach kids and prepare

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:30.220 --> 00:48:31.620 kids for for citizenship,

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:31.620 --> 00:48:34.049 but the United States was the first

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:34.049 --> 00:48:36.178 country to have public education

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:36.178 --> 00:48:38.218 to mandate public education.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:38.220 --> 00:48:40.950 Thomas Jefferson said that it was essential

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:40.950 --> 00:48:43.324 for a democracy to have mandatory

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:43.324 --> 00:48:45.586 public education to teach people how

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:45.586 --> 00:48:50.748 to participate in in the in democracy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:50.750 --> 00:48:51.805 And we've just we just

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:51.805 --> 00:48:53.170 have to get back to that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:53.170 --> 00:48:55.704 We have to keep focusing on that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:55.710 --> 00:48:57.066 The other thing is the Internet,
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:57.070 --> 00:48:59.968 the party the question had to do with the
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:48:59.968 --> 00:49:02.428 Internet and and and Miss disinformation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:02.430 --> 00:49:06.330 The Knight Foundation has just invested.
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:06.330 --> 00:49:08.646 Scores of millions of dollars to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:08.650 --> 00:49:08.875 Basically,
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:08.875 --> 00:49:10.900 I don't know if they would use this term,
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:10.900 --> 00:49:12.410 but I think it's fair.
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:12.410 --> 00:49:12.710 Basically,
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:12.710 --> 00:49:14.810 they're trying to create a new field,
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:14.810 --> 00:49:16.850 a new interdisciplinary field
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:16.850 --> 00:49:19.762 of inquiry to help us understand
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:19.762 --> 00:49:22.127 how disinformation gets into our
NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:22.127 --> 00:49:24.127 computers and travels at and

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:24.127 --> 00:49:26.299 what are the factors that make

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:26.379 --> 00:49:29.079 disinformation that facilitate the

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:29.079 --> 00:49:31.779 rapid dissemination of disinformation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:31.780 --> 00:49:33.330 And they're,

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:33.330 --> 00:49:35.708 they're seeding interdisciplinary research.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:35.708 --> 00:49:38.606 About 10 universities to try to really

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:38.606 --> 00:49:40.996 take a careful look at how is this

NOTE Confidence: 0.83229168

00:49:40.996 --> 00:49:43.157 happening and how can it be interrupted.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:49:46.710 --> 00:49:48.178 Thank you next question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:49:48.178 --> 00:49:50.380 How do you reconcile narratives of

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:49:50.449 --> 00:49:52.719 preparedness versus rescue when the

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:49:52.719 --> 00:49:55.442 tangible experience of most Americans of

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:49:55.442 --> 00:49:57.734 color is we demand equitable healthcare?

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:49:57.740 --> 00:49:59.623 Which is the right of all people

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:49:59.623 --> 00:50:01.400 of color versus institutional and

NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:50:01.400 --> 00:50:04.091 interpersonal racist and Q, Anon,
NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:50:04.091 --> 00:50:08.597 and all sectors of American Society?
NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:50:08.600 --> 00:50:11.020 Additionally, would you speak on
NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:50:11.020 --> 00:50:12.956 accountability measures for racist
NOTE Confidence: 0.816031992592592

00:50:12.956 --> 00:50:14.938 healthcare practices and policies?
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:15.610 --> 00:50:17.186 I think I could take the second question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:17.190 --> 00:50:19.400 I think I understand the
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:19.400 --> 00:50:21.610 second question a bit better.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:21.610 --> 00:50:24.250 I think that healthcare systems
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:24.250 --> 00:50:26.813 should be collecting data by
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:26.813 --> 00:50:29.819 race and looking to see if.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:29.820 --> 00:50:32.370 There are differential referrals to
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:32.370 --> 00:50:36.140 specialist care like we saw in the studies
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:36.140 --> 00:50:39.218 that the IOM put out in the early 2000s.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:39.220 --> 00:50:42.020 I think there's an obligation to be
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:42.020 --> 00:50:44.682 collecting data about one's own practices

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:44.682 --> 00:50:47.460 and looking for differences that are

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:47.460 --> 00:50:49.574 shouldn't be there differences by group.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:49.574 --> 00:50:51.602 So I think there's a responsibility

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:51.602 --> 00:50:53.213 of health systems to collect

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:53.213 --> 00:50:55.037 that kind of data and learn,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:55.040 --> 00:50:57.595 learn from their own patterns and let

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:57.595 --> 00:50:59.853 their patterns speak to them when, where?

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:50:59.853 --> 00:51:01.491 There may be trends that you're

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:01.491 --> 00:51:03.170 not you that you don't like.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:03.170 --> 00:51:05.490 I think that's one really

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:05.490 --> 00:51:07.346 big area of accountability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:07.350 --> 00:51:10.600 The Hastings Center just sponsored.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:10.600 --> 00:51:14.880 A HealthEquity summit. We Co.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:14.880 --> 00:51:16.820 Sponsored it with the.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:16.820 --> 00:51:18.790 Association of American Medical Colleges.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:18.790 --> 00:51:20.083 The double AMC.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:20.083 --> 00:51:22.238 The American Medical Association and
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:22.238 --> 00:51:24.957 the American Board of Internal Medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:24.960 --> 00:51:26.598 And we also reached out to nurses.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:26.600 --> 00:51:27.956 The American Nurses Association
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:27.956 --> 00:51:29.990 and all of us work together,
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:29.990 --> 00:51:33.932 and we developed a two day summit on the.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:33.940 --> 00:51:36.860 The first day was on the history of.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:36.860 --> 00:51:38.295 It's what I mentioned in my talk.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:38.300 --> 00:51:41.084 The first day was on the kind of the history.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:41.084 --> 00:51:43.736 What happened in our laws and
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:43.736 --> 00:51:46.401 policies that ended up with
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:46.401 --> 00:51:48.099 such residential segregation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:48.100 --> 00:51:49.660 Why do we have all this
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:49.660 --> 00:51:50.180 residential segregation?
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:50.180 --> 00:51:51.972 It turns out it's not because people

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:51.972 --> 00:51:54.612 like to live near each other it it was

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:54.612 --> 00:51:57.020 actually a consequence of a federal policy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:57.020 --> 00:51:59.540 And we laid that all out in day

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:51:59.540 --> 00:52:01.990 one and David Williams showed the

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:01.990 --> 00:52:04.578 relationship between all that and why

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:04.578 --> 00:52:06.894 that ends up with health inequities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:06.900 --> 00:52:10.530 Day two we had panels on what

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:10.530 --> 00:52:12.555 can be done in research.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:12.560 --> 00:52:14.366 What can be done in clinical care?

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:14.370 --> 00:52:16.316 What can be done in clinical education

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:16.316 --> 00:52:18.319 both for medical and nursing education?

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:18.320 --> 00:52:19.672 So these are recorded.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:19.672 --> 00:52:22.378 We have them all available and I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:22.378 --> 00:52:24.826 the best answer I have for this question

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:24.892 --> 00:52:28.758 is I gave you Schaefer's email address.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:28.760 --> 00:52:30.380 Email her and ask her to
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:30.380 --> 00:52:32.160 send you all these materials.
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:32.160 --> 00:52:33.820 It's 8 hours of programming
NOTE Confidence: 0.90244459625

00:52:33.820 --> 00:52:35.480 at least over 2 days.
NOTE Confidence: 0.868040416666667

00:52:36.990 --> 00:52:38.820 Thank you so much and someone
NOTE Confidence: 0.868040416666667

00:52:38.820 --> 00:52:39.735 actually comments here.
NOTE Confidence: 0.868040416666667

00:52:39.740 --> 00:52:41.540 I'm Carol Montgomery Taylor
NOTE Confidence: 0.868040416666667

00:52:41.540 --> 00:52:43.326 bioethicist from Omaha, NE.
NOTE Confidence: 0.868040416666667

00:52:43.326 --> 00:52:45.506 No question, just appreciation and
NOTE Confidence: 0.868040416666667

00:52:45.506 --> 00:52:47.692 also comments that democracy and
NOTE Confidence: 0.868040416666667

00:52:47.692 --> 00:52:49.537 crisis is available on Amazon.
NOTE Confidence: 0.5625357825

00:52:52.070 --> 00:52:54.050 There you go. Wow.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8528278

00:52:54.180 --> 00:52:56.518 It's also about time. She says that
NOTE Confidence: 0.8528278

00:52:56.518 --> 00:52:58.577 someone addressed the loss of civic
NOTE Confidence: 0.8528278

00:52:58.577 --> 00:53:00.227 mindedness rampant in our time.
NOTE Confidence: 0.688182728

00:53:00.340 --> 00:53:01.850 Thank you for that comment, Carol.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:02.550 --> 00:53:03.501 A question please,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:03.501 --> 00:53:04.769 a significant amount of

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:04.769 --> 00:53:06.249 vaccine refusal has occurred

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:06.249 --> 00:53:07.668 within minority communities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:07.670 --> 00:53:09.236 likely because of lack of trust.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:09.240 --> 00:53:10.464 As you point out,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:10.464 --> 00:53:12.300 how would you balance the need

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:12.368 --> 00:53:14.726 to build trust with vaccine mandates,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:14.730 --> 00:53:16.402 particularly if such mandates

NOTE Confidence: 0.86846291

00:53:16.402 --> 00:53:18.074 were to undermine trust

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:18.990 --> 00:53:21.230 so number one? At first there was a

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:21.230 --> 00:53:23.863 lot of discussion at the beginning of

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:23.863 --> 00:53:26.600 the pandemic that there were worries

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:26.600 --> 00:53:30.037 that black Americans would not be and

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:30.037 --> 00:53:32.676 Native Americans would not be open to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:32.680 --> 00:53:34.480 Vaccine at the same rates as
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:34.480 --> 00:53:36.270 whites because of lack of trust,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:36.270 --> 00:53:40.368 and that's been pretty much disproved.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:40.370 --> 00:53:45.296 Black leaders read Tucson, for example.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:45.300 --> 00:53:49.748 A number of people put together a social
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:49.748 --> 00:53:52.559 marketing campaign of black leaders.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:52.560 --> 00:53:54.770 Encouraging vaccination in the black
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:54.770 --> 00:53:56.538 community and also neighborhood
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:56.538 --> 00:53:57.860 by neighborhood.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:53:57.860 --> 00:54:01.120 Examples of activities like using
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:01.120 --> 00:54:03.280 hairdressers and stuff and and they
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:03.280 --> 00:54:05.837 found they were able to increase
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:05.837 --> 00:54:07.937 black vaccination rates tremendously.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:07.940 --> 00:54:10.298 It was a very successful campaign.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:10.300 --> 00:54:12.420 And so, and they don't.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:12.420 --> 00:54:14.790 They've asked that we stop assuming

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:14.790 --> 00:54:16.900 that it's lack of trust.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:16.900 --> 00:54:19.624 That is the reason there may
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:19.624 --> 00:54:21.440 be lack of access.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:21.440 --> 00:54:23.425 And that when the message
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:23.425 --> 00:54:25.013 comes from people who.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:25.020 --> 00:54:28.476 You look you know who who you identify with.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:28.480 --> 00:54:30.616 You're more likely to to respond,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:30.620 --> 00:54:32.720 so I think there's been a.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:32.720 --> 00:54:34.178 In fact. We've also seen that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:34.180 --> 00:54:36.135 Hope that principle of the
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:36.135 --> 00:54:37.699 message coming from somebody
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:37.699 --> 00:54:40.017 you identify with and you trust,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:40.020 --> 00:54:42.477 is also true in the evangelical community.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:42.480 --> 00:54:44.490 Now we know that evangelicals have
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:54:44.490 --> 00:54:46.360 been very resistant to vaccine,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:46.360 --> 00:54:48.159 but when you start to look closer,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:48.160 --> 00:54:50.050 you can see that there's actually a
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:50.050 --> 00:54:52.360 fissure in in the evangelical community,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:52.360 --> 00:54:54.100 and some were very pro vaccine,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:54.100 --> 00:54:55.584 and some were not.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:55.584 --> 00:54:56.697 And so again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:56.700 --> 00:54:58.884 a leader from inside that community
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:54:58.884 --> 00:55:00.940 itself took it upon himself.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:00.940 --> 00:55:03.492 I'm just blocking out his name to develop
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:03.492 --> 00:55:05.819 a program that answers evangelicals,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:05.820 --> 00:55:06.217 questions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:06.217 --> 00:55:08.202 questions that are cynical about
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:08.202 --> 00:55:10.237 vaccination or cynical about pharmaceutical
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:10.237 --> 00:55:12.553 companies and answers them from within
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:12.553 --> 00:55:14.818 the framework of their own thinking.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111

00:55:14.820 --> 00:55:16.676 And he too has been able to have,

NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:16.680 --> 00:55:17.808 you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:17.808 --> 00:55:19.500 be quite persuasive.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:19.500 --> 00:55:20.910 I don't think vaccine mandates
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:20.910 --> 00:55:22.700 have to just one last point.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:22.700 --> 00:55:25.458 I don't think vaccine mandates have to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:25.460 --> 00:55:26.852 That's a good question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:26.852 --> 00:55:28.592 Like if you mandate something,
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:28.600 --> 00:55:30.760 might you get a?
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:30.760 --> 00:55:32.920 Might you enhance the?
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:32.920 --> 00:55:35.447 The whiplash might there be a whiplash
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:35.447 --> 00:55:38.340 and you might actually undermine trust.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:38.340 --> 00:55:40.460 I think that's worth thinking
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:40.460 --> 00:55:42.156 about and worrying about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.858597829111111
00:55:42.160 --> 00:55:43.920 But my reply would be.
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462
00:55:46.060 --> 00:55:49.732 If we invested more in Health Communications,
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:55:49.732 --> 00:55:52.436 we should be researching.
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:55:52.440 --> 00:55:54.252 I just gave you 2 examples
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:55:54.252 --> 00:55:55.158 of communication style.
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:55:55.160 --> 00:55:57.224 You know the importance of the messenger in
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:55:57.224 --> 00:55:59.577 both the black community and the evangelical.
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:55:59.580 --> 00:56:02.300 I think we should be studying and investing
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:02.300 --> 00:56:04.712 in studying Health Communications and
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:04.712 --> 00:56:06.936 doing Health Communications research.
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:06.940 --> 00:56:09.862 I believe there is probably a
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:09.862 --> 00:56:11.810 message about mandates that
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:11.896 --> 00:56:14.626 people who might otherwise have.
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:14.630 --> 00:56:17.666 Had a reaction against might begin.
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:17.670 --> 00:56:20.586 There might be ways to frame
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:20.586 --> 00:56:23.604 the mandate issue that different
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:23.604 --> 00:56:27.489 groups could identify with better,
NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:27.490 --> 00:56:29.566 you know if we thought about

NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:29.566 --> 00:56:30.950 like you're helping children,

NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:30.950 --> 00:56:32.985 you're helping your relative who's

NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:32.985 --> 00:56:35.020 immune compromised there have to

NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:35.087 --> 00:56:37.138 be a way to design messages that

NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:37.138 --> 00:56:39.994 helps people get the hot get away

NOTE Confidence: 0.924135462

00:56:39.994 --> 00:56:42.120 from this cardboard reaction.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:43.660 --> 00:56:45.500 There are also I mean.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:45.500 --> 00:56:47.066 I think one of the fundamental

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:47.066 --> 00:56:48.455 questions in terms of lessons

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:48.455 --> 00:56:50.219 learned a lesson not yet learned.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:50.220 --> 00:56:52.175 One of the fundamental questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:52.175 --> 00:56:54.472 that so many physicians have asked

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:54.472 --> 00:56:56.672 is how is it that I've cared for

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:56.672 --> 00:56:58.880 this person for the last 30 years?

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:56:58.880 --> 00:57:01.596 Last 20 years, the last 10 years.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:01.600 --> 00:57:03.000 And I tell this person,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:03.000 --> 00:57:04.300 you really for your own
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:04.300 --> 00:57:05.600 health should get a vaccine,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:05.600 --> 00:57:07.952 and then they see something on on
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:07.952 --> 00:57:10.238 Facebook or they see someone on TV,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:10.240 --> 00:57:11.068 tell them otherwise,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:11.068 --> 00:57:12.724 and that that's enough to plant
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:12.724 --> 00:57:14.478 the doubt that they don't get it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:14.480 --> 00:57:15.680 How is it that one?
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:15.680 --> 00:57:17.285 Trust the stranger that one
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:17.285 --> 00:57:18.569 never even meets physically
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:18.569 --> 00:57:20.267 meets over one's own physician.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:20.270 --> 00:57:22.634 I think that's a question that
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:22.634 --> 00:57:24.688 physicians should be doing everything
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:24.688 --> 00:57:27.118 possible to get the answer to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:27.120 --> 00:57:27.988 How did we lose?

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:27.988 --> 00:57:30.008 How did we, as a profession,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:30.008 --> 00:57:31.376 absolutely lose that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:31.380 --> 00:57:32.060 I mean, I, I mean,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:32.060 --> 00:57:33.698 I see it in my own extended

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:33.698 --> 00:57:35.142 family of people who say, well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:35.142 --> 00:57:37.238 my my pediatrician says going to do this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:37.240 --> 00:57:37.750 But then again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:37.750 --> 00:57:38.940 there's some people who say to that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:38.940 --> 00:57:39.209 Well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:39.209 --> 00:57:40.823 we're the same people that you're

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:40.823 --> 00:57:42.459 believing over your own pediatrician.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863376162

00:57:42.460 --> 00:57:42.770 There's

NOTE Confidence: 0.78028035

00:57:42.780 --> 00:57:44.058 something very damaging

NOTE Confidence: 0.78028035

00:57:44.058 --> 00:57:47.238 going on, and we're losing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78028035

00:57:47.240 --> 00:57:49.148 Trust and expertise of all kinds.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:57:49.420 --> 00:57:51.076 We are, but I have a specific question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:57:51.080 --> 00:57:52.492 You mentioned the evangelicals,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:57:52.492 --> 00:57:55.595 so can you explain to me why in

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:57:55.595 --> 00:57:57.895 particular you talked about vaccine

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:57:57.895 --> 00:57:59.275 resistance among evangelicals?

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:57:59.280 --> 00:58:01.863 Is there a a theory or is there an

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:58:01.863 --> 00:58:03.785 explanation for why this particular

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:58:03.785 --> 00:58:06.143 group of individuals would be resistant

NOTE Confidence: 0.80573143375

00:58:06.206 --> 00:58:08.136 to vaccines compared to others?

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:08.780 --> 00:58:11.114 Perhaps because there was a disproportionate

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:11.114 --> 00:58:13.480 support for Trump among evangelicals,

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:13.480 --> 00:58:16.072 so they were following his lead and he was

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:16.072 --> 00:58:17.970 providing all kinds of disinformation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:17.970 --> 00:58:19.420 Although he wasn't against vaccines,

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:19.420 --> 00:58:20.504 he should get. I mean,

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:20.504 --> 00:58:22.233 this was part of the credit for this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:22.233 --> 00:58:23.619 Yeah, he was booed actually when
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:23.619 --> 00:58:25.230 he finally said no, I'm vaccinated.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:25.230 --> 00:58:27.710 You should get vaccinated too at a rally
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:27.770 --> 00:58:29.706 a few months back and he got booed.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:29.710 --> 00:58:33.732 So yeah, I. There's a kind of
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:33.732 --> 00:58:35.097 mass hysteria going on here.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:35.100 --> 00:58:37.876 I I don't know. I can't answer that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:37.880 --> 00:58:39.038 I just I just don't know.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:39.040 --> 00:58:39.682 But you're right,
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:39.682 --> 00:58:41.770 that is what we have to be looking at.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:41.770 --> 00:58:42.438 Fair enough,
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:42.438 --> 00:58:44.442 I want to find the evangelical
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:44.442 --> 00:58:46.305 program that this Minister did
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:46.305 --> 00:58:48.185 because he took very seriously
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455
00:58:48.185 --> 00:58:50.059 some questions that were coming
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:50.059 --> 00:58:52.171 from their faith tradition and he
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:52.171 --> 00:58:54.790 answered them in their own terms.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:54.790 --> 00:58:56.070 So I will try to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:56.070 --> 00:58:56.950 I will try to locate
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:56.950 --> 00:58:58.050 that and send it to you.
NOTE Confidence: 0.682289542545455

00:58:58.050 --> 00:58:58.460 Mark
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:58:58.830 --> 00:59:01.105 that sounds good. Thank you so much.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:01.110 --> 00:59:02.865 Next question please from the
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:02.865 --> 00:59:04.269 perspective of a practicing
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:04.269 --> 00:59:05.728 clinician and as a researcher.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:05.730 --> 00:59:08.241 Some of this lack of trust and lack of
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:08.241 --> 00:59:10.061 sacrificing for the common good seems
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:10.061 --> 00:59:12.269 like it might contribute to the greater.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:12.270 --> 00:59:14.109 The satisfaction observed
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:14.109 --> 00:59:15.948 in healthcare workers.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857

00:59:15.950 --> 00:59:18.270 Do you have any thoughts on how to

NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857
00:59:18.270 --> 00:59:20.108 publicize this risk to clinician
NOTE Confidence: 0.823230247142857
00:59:20.108 --> 00:59:21.700 well-being and the workforce?
NOTE Confidence: 0.890652929285714
00:59:24.640 --> 00:59:26.932 Well, should we publicize this to
NOTE Confidence: 0.890652929285714
00:59:26.932 --> 00:59:29.432 the clinician to clinicians and the
NOTE Confidence: 0.890652929285714
00:59:29.432 --> 00:59:31.408 healthcare workforce? Or should we?
NOTE Confidence: 0.665631867142857
00:59:33.080 --> 00:59:35.486 Not publicizing it to the clinicians
NOTE Confidence: 0.665631867142857
00:59:35.486 --> 00:59:38.605 rather ohh size it more let people
NOTE Confidence: 0.665631867142857
00:59:38.605 --> 00:59:41.422 know that this that this climate is
NOTE Confidence: 0.665631867142857
00:59:41.422 --> 00:59:43.412 actually burning out the clinicians.
NOTE Confidence: 0.855460765
00:59:43.870 --> 00:59:45.678 I think we should be advertising that I
NOTE Confidence: 0.855460765
00:59:45.678 --> 00:59:47.540 think that's a really good idea, Deborah.
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556
00:59:49.920 --> 00:59:53.270 Nurses. Are the most trusted
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556
00:59:53.270 --> 00:59:55.950 healthcare professionals of all.
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556
00:59:55.950 --> 00:59:57.810 And are also being burned out
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556
00:59:57.810 --> 00:59:59.410 and feeling betrayed at real.
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

00:59:59.410 --> 01:00:01.722 And you know resilience.
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

01:00:01.722 --> 01:00:05.940 I mean and and physicians are being.
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

01:00:05.940 --> 01:00:08.880 You know the pressures are just unbelievable,
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

01:00:08.880 --> 01:00:11.000 so I do think people should know that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

01:00:11.000 --> 01:00:11.317 Absolutely,
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

01:00:11.317 --> 01:00:13.536 I think that's a really good idea.
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

01:00:13.540 --> 01:00:15.234 I don't know how to do that,
NOTE Confidence: 0.904795145555556

01:00:15.240 --> 01:00:16.986 but I think it's a good idea to do.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:17.540 --> 01:00:19.556 You know you would see on the news so
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:19.556 --> 01:00:21.669 often that the worst months of the pandemic
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:21.669 --> 01:00:23.659 so often you would see on the news,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:23.660 --> 01:00:25.640 they show an emergency room.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:25.640 --> 01:00:27.392 They show just the mayhem and they show
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:27.392 --> 01:00:29.065 some nurse walking home at the end of
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:29.065 --> 01:00:30.468 her shift and they interviewed some
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:30.468 --> 01:00:32.154 physician who was exhausted and they

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:32.154 --> 01:00:33.980 would talk about how you know this is

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:33.980 --> 01:00:35.969 really terrible and this, you know. And.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:35.969 --> 01:00:39.054 And once the vaccines came out, of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:39.054 --> 01:00:41.290 then it became to the minds of many,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:41.290 --> 01:00:41.894 myself included,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:41.894 --> 01:00:44.310 twice as terrible because so much of this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:44.310 --> 01:00:46.296 most of that suffering was actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:46.296 --> 01:00:47.318 preventable. Not all of it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:47.318 --> 01:00:48.890 but most of it was actually preventable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:48.890 --> 01:00:50.890 And to see that going on in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:50.890 --> 01:00:52.678 hospitals was just an amazing thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:52.680 --> 01:00:55.039 And I was surprised and discouraged that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:55.039 --> 01:00:57.348 more people weren't weren't moved by that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:57.350 --> 01:00:59.606 But somehow I think they that so many

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:00:59.606 --> 01:01:01.527 folks just flat don't believe it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:01.530 --> 01:01:02.868 They say, well, that's all true,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:02.870 --> 01:01:04.362 but I've also heard.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:04.362 --> 01:01:06.793 I mean, we see we saw some of this in some.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:06.800 --> 01:01:10.085 And and so many things in in the in,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:10.090 --> 01:01:11.106 it may still exist,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:11.106 --> 01:01:13.230 but certainly in the earlier years of the
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:13.230 --> 01:01:14.886 climate change debate there were really,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:14.890 --> 01:01:15.258 you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:15.258 --> 01:01:16.546 there were two sides of the argument.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:16.550 --> 01:01:16.829 Well,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:16.829 --> 01:01:18.782 some scientists say that climate change is
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:18.782 --> 01:01:20.690 occurring and some scientists say it isn't.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:20.690 --> 01:01:20.956 Well,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:20.956 --> 01:01:22.286 that was the simplistic view.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:22.290 --> 01:01:23.350 But then you realize, OK?
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576

01:01:23.350 --> 01:01:25.768 Well, 99 scientists say it is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576
01:01:25.770 --> 01:01:26.748 and there's this one that says,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576
01:01:26.750 --> 01:01:27.690 well, maybe it's not,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8811390576
01:01:27.690 --> 01:01:28.160 you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.804427806
01:01:28.570 --> 01:01:29.595 and that person's paid for
NOTE Confidence: 0.804427806
01:01:29.595 --> 01:01:31.080 it by the oil company. So
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:31.090 --> 01:01:33.046 you got. But then put simply,
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:33.050 --> 01:01:34.538 well, there's two points of view.
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:34.540 --> 01:01:35.368 Well, that's too simple.
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:35.368 --> 01:01:37.360 A way to look at it, I recognize.
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:37.360 --> 01:01:40.360 But but the the fact that that in
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:40.443 --> 01:01:42.948 this particular problem the fact
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:42.948 --> 01:01:45.202 that folks because I I don't,
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:45.202 --> 01:01:47.020 it's a, it's a pretty rare physician
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:47.020 --> 01:01:48.210 who was telling people this
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945
01:01:48.253 --> 01:01:49.567 isn't an issue where don't get,
NOTE Confidence: 0.572131945

01:01:49.570 --> 01:01:51.358 don't get vaccinated that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:01:53.530 --> 01:01:55.266 That that fascinates me and worries me,
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:01:55.270 --> 01:01:56.845 and that's a question that of course,
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:01:56.850 --> 01:01:58.248 if we get the answer to,
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:01:58.250 --> 01:02:00.000 we could fix if we could regain
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:00.000 --> 01:02:01.596 that trust somehow, all right enough
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:01.596 --> 01:02:03.006 to complaining about the trust.
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:03.010 --> 01:02:04.030 Let's hear the next question,
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:04.030 --> 01:02:06.200 one of the lingering legacies of the
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:06.200 --> 01:02:08.290 pandemic is resource scarcity such as
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:08.290 --> 01:02:10.125 recurring shortage of blood products.
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:10.130 --> 01:02:13.650 And now I donated contrast.
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:13.650 --> 01:02:16.122 What lessons have we learned about
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:16.122 --> 01:02:17.770 applying resource allocation frameworks
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:17.826 --> 01:02:20.199 to these shortages in ways that are
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143

01:02:20.199 --> 01:02:21.919 universal and predictable but also

NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143
01:02:21.919 --> 01:02:23.839 take into account the unique factors?
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143
01:02:23.840 --> 01:02:24.743 Of each shortage,
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143
01:02:24.743 --> 01:02:26.850 what are we doing about resource shortage?
NOTE Confidence: 0.734471322857143
01:02:26.850 --> 01:02:27.638 What do we learn?
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:29.030 --> 01:02:31.898 So I think that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:31.900 --> 01:02:34.948 There were efforts all around the
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:34.948 --> 01:02:37.850 country to quickly create guidance.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:37.850 --> 01:02:40.552 For the concern that we were going
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:40.552 --> 01:02:43.360 to be scarce on ventilators and.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:43.360 --> 01:02:46.008 A lot of those issues are very relevant
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:46.008 --> 01:02:49.119 to any other kind of commodity scarcity.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:49.120 --> 01:02:50.710 They happen to be worried about
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:50.710 --> 01:02:52.578 ventilators in the first strokes of this,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:52.580 --> 01:02:55.256 but the reasoning that was published
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:02:55.256 --> 01:02:57.796 there were important pieces in all
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:02:57.796 --> 01:02:59.902 the major medical journals, I think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:02:59.902 --> 01:03:01.974 showed an awful lot of good work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:01.980 --> 01:03:04.100 They also evolved over time,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:04.100 --> 01:03:06.580 especially in two ways.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:06.580 --> 01:03:10.192 One was that people with disabilities

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:10.192 --> 01:03:13.112 became concerned about the first

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:13.112 --> 01:03:15.439 generation of the guidance.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:15.440 --> 01:03:17.106 And I.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:17.106 --> 01:03:21.271 Was because the Hastings Centers

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:21.271 --> 01:03:23.770 for years had.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:23.770 --> 01:03:25.534 Then looked at a lot of ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:25.534 --> 01:03:27.260 issues at the intersection of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:27.260 --> 01:03:29.088 bioethics and disability justice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:29.090 --> 01:03:30.915 I was particularly following the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:30.915 --> 01:03:33.297 concerns that people in the disability

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:03:33.297 --> 01:03:35.245 rights community were raising

NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:35.245 --> 01:03:37.193 about these allocation schemes,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:37.200 --> 01:03:39.606 and so I worked with Matt
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:39.606 --> 01:03:41.210 Winia and Larry Gostin,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:41.210 --> 01:03:43.022 and we produced a prospective in
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:43.022 --> 01:03:44.790 New England Journal of Medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:44.790 --> 01:03:47.359 So we were adding our two cents.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:47.360 --> 01:03:49.028 There was an important two cents.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:49.030 --> 01:03:50.498 I think it was.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:50.498 --> 01:03:51.966 We were suggesting modifications
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:51.966 --> 01:03:53.510 to the allocation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:53.510 --> 01:03:56.090 Themes that were then dominant
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:56.090 --> 01:03:58.160 by paying attention to their
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:03:58.160 --> 01:04:00.230 impact on people with disability,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:04:00.230 --> 01:04:02.530 and we were integrating the
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125
01:04:02.530 --> 01:04:05.246 disability rights people's concerns
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:04:05.246 --> 01:04:09.524 into a guidance on on triage.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:04:09.524 --> 01:04:12.608 Basically, and then a second thing,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:04:12.610 --> 01:04:15.200 I think we learned in the second
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:04:15.200 --> 01:04:17.241 or third generation of these
NOTE Confidence: 0.8963850125

01:04:17.241 --> 01:04:20.840 guidances was that they also could.
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:24.170 --> 01:04:26.980 Discriminate against.
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:26.980 --> 01:04:28.990 Poor people or people of color
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:28.990 --> 01:04:31.479 because they were based on the
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:31.479 --> 01:04:33.524 likelihood of survivability and if
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:33.524 --> 01:04:35.849 poor people or people of color,
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:35.850 --> 01:04:37.678 have chronic illnesses sooner
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:37.678 --> 01:04:41.105 and are sicker than when they're
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:41.105 --> 01:04:43.160 scored for survivability.
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:43.160 --> 01:04:45.265 They they are dinged in
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:45.265 --> 01:04:49.660 the in the scheme and so.
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:49.660 --> 01:04:53.244 People added a way to account for

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:53.244 --> 01:04:56.674 that that had to do with looking at

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:56.674 --> 01:04:58.756 what neighborhoods people lived in and

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:04:58.756 --> 01:05:00.877 taking into account that they might,

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:00.880 --> 01:05:04.576 that they try to counterbalance the impact.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:04.580 --> 01:05:07.880 Also, instead of a raw

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:07.880 --> 01:05:09.200 survivability assessment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:09.200 --> 01:05:11.573 they made it narrower so that it

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:11.573 --> 01:05:14.036 you were likely if you were likely

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:14.036 --> 01:05:16.676 to survive to discharge rather than

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:16.676 --> 01:05:19.610 trying to prognosticate about your longevity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:19.610 --> 01:05:22.634 Since blacks live less long than white,

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:22.640 --> 01:05:25.139 so we made these kind of tweaks

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:25.139 --> 01:05:25.853 and important.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:25.860 --> 01:05:28.610 I don't mean to under, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:28.610 --> 01:05:30.440 undermine their significance with that word.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:30.440 --> 01:05:32.880 We tweaked the the people,
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:32.880 --> 01:05:33.276 quickly,
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:33.276 --> 01:05:34.464 put together guidances,
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:34.464 --> 01:05:36.840 and then they revised them as
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:36.908 --> 01:05:38.888 they got criticized by disability
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:38.888 --> 01:05:41.320 rights and by communities of color,
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:41.320 --> 01:05:43.012 and came out with another generation
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:43.012 --> 01:05:43.576 of guidance.
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:43.580 --> 01:05:45.766 So I don't think that the the
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:45.766 --> 01:05:47.150 guidance is that different.
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:47.150 --> 01:05:49.346 Depending on what the shortages are,
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:49.350 --> 01:05:51.206 the only other thing I'd like to say.
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:51.210 --> 01:05:53.292 Is that even though I've written
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:53.292 --> 01:05:54.333 on this myself,
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:54.340 --> 01:05:57.602 I'm really kind of tired that bioethics
NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:05:57.602 --> 01:06:00.598 is focusing on rationing schemes rather

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:00.598 --> 01:06:04.800 than fighting for more of what is needed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:04.800 --> 01:06:08.110 It's hard, it's hard to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:08.110 --> 01:06:09.586 We don't like to be advocates,

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:09.590 --> 01:06:10.028 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:10.028 --> 01:06:12.656 We think of ourselves as scholars

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:12.656 --> 01:06:15.129 and analysts and not advocates.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:15.130 --> 01:06:17.722 And where is the line between

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:17.722 --> 01:06:19.450 ethical analysis and advocacy?

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:19.450 --> 01:06:23.306 But this question makes me want to say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:23.310 --> 01:06:24.960 OK, we've done a lot around

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:24.960 --> 01:06:26.330 rationing in an ethical way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:26.330 --> 01:06:26.579 Now,

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:26.579 --> 01:06:28.571 could we also do a little bit of

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:28.571 --> 01:06:30.402 advocacy to bring attention to these

NOTE Confidence: 0.919248825

01:06:30.402 --> 01:06:32.519 shortages and make sure they get fixed?

NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:32.910 --> 01:06:35.892 OK, let's get to the next
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:35.892 --> 01:06:37.880 question to that point.
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:37.880 --> 01:06:39.805 Doctor Duffy cuts to the chase almost
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:39.805 --> 01:06:42.133 all of what has been identified as
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:42.133 --> 01:06:43.933 necessary to address the current
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:43.933 --> 01:06:46.072 quagmire in America is denied by a
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:46.072 --> 01:06:47.573 political party of former president
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:47.573 --> 01:06:49.338 and possibly the next president.
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:49.340 --> 01:06:51.410 Does the Hastings Center have an
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:51.410 --> 01:06:53.209 obligation to address this threat
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:53.209 --> 01:06:55.315 and its current practice of sowing,
NOTE Confidence: 0.796382172

01:06:55.320 --> 01:06:57.770 distrust and racism in America?
NOTE Confidence: 0.93869095

01:06:59.360 --> 01:07:01.050 We all have a responsibility
NOTE Confidence: 0.93869095

01:07:01.050 --> 01:07:03.436 and we all need to vote the
NOTE Confidence: 0.93869095

01:07:03.436 --> 01:07:05.613 right and we all need to vote.
NOTE Confidence: 0.93869095

01:07:05.620 --> 01:07:07.666 We need to really be present

NOTE Confidence: 0.93869095

01:07:07.666 --> 01:07:09.869 and not look the other way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:12.650 --> 01:07:16.690 That's my answer. We also.

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:16.690 --> 01:07:19.007 Are trying to do that by focusing

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:19.007 --> 01:07:20.750 on civic participation and the

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:20.750 --> 01:07:22.130 conditions that give right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:22.130 --> 01:07:23.178 You know that encourage

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:23.178 --> 01:07:23.964 people to participate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:23.970 --> 01:07:26.231 Vote and other kinds of forms of

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:26.231 --> 01:07:27.967 civic participation and by bringing

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:27.967 --> 01:07:30.085 attention to what's at stake through,

NOTE Confidence: 0.840114972

01:07:30.090 --> 01:07:31.660 for example, our HealthEquity summit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:33.210 --> 01:07:35.802 Thank you. As a physician involved

NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:35.802 --> 01:07:37.530 in public health education,

NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:37.530 --> 01:07:39.630 I was struck that there were times

NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:39.630 --> 01:07:41.059 when public health institutions

NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:41.059 --> 01:07:42.939 gave inaccurate recommendations and
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:42.939 --> 01:07:45.289 attempts to guide public behavior,
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:45.290 --> 01:07:48.290 EG initially saying masking was unnecessary,
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:48.290 --> 01:07:49.920 advising the public to take
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:49.920 --> 01:07:51.224 whatever vaccine was available.
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:51.230 --> 01:07:53.690 When M RNA vaccines were clearly
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:53.690 --> 01:07:55.330 superior to conventional vaccines,
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:55.330 --> 01:07:57.130 what are your thoughts on what,
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:57.130 --> 01:07:58.570 if anything, public health
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:07:58.570 --> 01:08:00.780 institutions and experts can do to
NOTE Confidence: 0.925054528

01:08:00.780 --> 01:08:02.420 avoid contributing to mistrust?
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:04.590 --> 01:08:08.800 Respect the audience I mean.
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:08.800 --> 01:08:11.296 For goodness sakes, that was ridiculous.
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:11.300 --> 01:08:16.130 It was showed such distrust of Americans.
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:16.130 --> 01:08:19.082 And do the homework to figure out if you're
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:19.082 --> 01:08:21.968 I understand they were real worries.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:21.970 --> 01:08:24.574 People had about messages

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:24.574 --> 01:08:26.527 being too complicated.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:26.530 --> 01:08:28.246 But do the homework to figure

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:28.246 --> 01:08:30.159 out how you can message it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:30.160 --> 01:08:31.816 That's why I was saying I would love I.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:31.820 --> 01:08:35.588 I do believe that CDC has just formed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:35.590 --> 01:08:37.966 And resourced center with MCDC that is going

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:37.966 --> 01:08:40.757 to do more Health Communications research.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:40.760 --> 01:08:43.749 I sure hope so because they need.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:43.750 --> 01:08:46.846 They need to treat this like it's a field

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:46.846 --> 01:08:49.945 and study it and put resources into it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:49.950 --> 01:08:52.622 If they were worried that a more complicated

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:52.622 --> 01:08:54.897 message was going to undermine people,

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:54.900 --> 01:08:56.270 they should have researched it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:56.270 --> 01:08:57.134 Focus grouped it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:57.134 --> 01:08:58.862 field tested it and treated it
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:08:58.862 --> 01:09:00.625 like the important thing it was
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:09:00.625 --> 01:09:02.431 to come up with something that
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:09:02.431 --> 01:09:04.106 would help people understand it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:09:04.110 --> 01:09:05.839 But instead they just kind of thought.
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:09:05.840 --> 01:09:07.406 Americans were too stupid to get
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:09:07.406 --> 01:09:09.364 it and didn't do their own homework
NOTE Confidence: 0.872666608

01:09:09.364 --> 01:09:11.373 to shape it into a helpful message.
NOTE Confidence: 0.852416493666667

01:09:12.040 --> 01:09:13.643 Well, was it stupid with the with
NOTE Confidence: 0.852416493666667

01:09:13.643 --> 01:09:15.388 the mask issues was that they were
NOTE Confidence: 0.852416493666667

01:09:15.388 --> 01:09:16.900 concerned the public was too stupid
NOTE Confidence: 0.852416493666667

01:09:16.954 --> 01:09:18.634 or was that they just wanted to make
NOTE Confidence: 0.852416493666667

01:09:18.634 --> 01:09:20.260 sure the public didn't take things for
NOTE Confidence: 0.852416493666667

01:09:20.260 --> 01:09:21.460 themselves that were needed elsewhere.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7699629675

01:09:25.510 --> 01:09:26.938 Here's another question please,
NOTE Confidence: 0.493438291

01:09:26.950 --> 01:09:28.454 that's a good point.

NOTE Confidence: 0.493438291

01:09:28.454 --> 01:09:29.678 Yeah, that's a good point.

NOTE Confidence: 0.895798500833333

01:09:30.720 --> 01:09:32.028 Another question, please,

NOTE Confidence: 0.895798500833333

01:09:32.028 --> 01:09:35.080 do you think the effects of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.895798500833333

01:09:35.159 --> 01:09:37.402 COVID-19 pandemic and particularly

NOTE Confidence: 0.895798500833333

01:09:37.402 --> 01:09:39.757 choices made by national leaders

NOTE Confidence: 0.895798500833333

01:09:39.757 --> 01:09:42.189 in earlier stages will effectively

NOTE Confidence: 0.895798500833333

01:09:42.189 --> 01:09:44.544 translate to lasting policy changes

NOTE Confidence: 0.895798500833333

01:09:44.544 --> 01:09:47.229 to prepare for future pandemics?

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:09:48.650 --> 01:09:50.138 I feel like that's what I was trying

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:09:50.138 --> 01:09:53.158 to say in my talk. You know that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:09:53.160 --> 01:09:55.380 That's our obligation that that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:09:55.380 --> 01:09:58.358 our obligation, and I hope that

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:09:58.358 --> 01:10:00.446 we're organizing ourselves now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:00.450 --> 01:10:03.123 But I don't know that we are so the

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:03.123 --> 01:10:05.620 White House just came out in January.

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:05.620 --> 01:10:08.620 I think it was with a comprehensive plan
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:08.694 --> 01:10:11.220 for for managing the next pandemic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:11.220 --> 01:10:13.056 And and they identified all the
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:13.056 --> 01:10:14.829 things that need to be done.
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:14.830 --> 01:10:20.178 And Elie Adachi ADASHI and Glenn
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:20.178 --> 01:10:23.510 Cohen wrote a piece maybe in JAMA
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:23.510 --> 01:10:25.210 saying great about this report.
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:25.210 --> 01:10:25.920 It's wonderful.
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:25.920 --> 01:10:28.405 It says everything we need to do.
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:28.410 --> 01:10:30.218 And has Congress appropriated
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:30.218 --> 01:10:32.478 the money for it now?
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:32.480 --> 01:10:34.240 And have we geared up?
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:34.240 --> 01:10:36.712 It's going to require enormous coordination
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:36.712 --> 01:10:38.360 across different government agencies.
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:38.360 --> 01:10:39.856 Have we figured out how to do that?
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461

01:10:39.860 --> 01:10:42.128 No, not yet.

NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461
01:10:42.130 --> 01:10:44.250 Yeah, I don't know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461
01:10:44.250 --> 01:10:46.310 so this I'm not trying to get us depressed.
NOTE Confidence: 0.911135261538461
01:10:46.310 --> 01:10:46.580 Mark.
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:10:47.650 --> 01:10:48.814 Well here's another question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:10:48.814 --> 01:10:50.269 Basically along the same lines,
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:10:50.270 --> 01:10:51.866 the same point as someone points
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:10:51.866 --> 01:10:53.871 out other than other than the COVID
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:10:53.871 --> 01:10:55.346 pandemic during the last decade,
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:10:55.350 --> 01:10:58.170 there were five major influenza pandemics,
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:10:58.170 --> 01:11:00.459 and each time we face the same
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:11:00.459 --> 01:11:02.392 problem and deciding who lives
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:11:02.392 --> 01:11:04.148 despite all preparedness plans.
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:11:04.150 --> 01:11:05.480 So what are your recommendations?
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:11:05.480 --> 01:11:08.032 In order not to repeat the same mistake
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222
01:11:08.032 --> 01:11:10.550 over and over and ensure social justice?
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222

01:11:10.550 --> 01:11:12.090 So we're the same?
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222

01:11:12.090 --> 01:11:15.540 Mistake being essentially being unprepared.
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222

01:11:15.540 --> 01:11:16.740 And this is what we've been
NOTE Confidence: 0.732691932222222

01:11:16.740 --> 01:11:17.540 talking about all along.
NOTE Confidence: 0.945343482

01:11:20.090 --> 01:11:22.564 Perhaps we need a leader or a small
NOTE Confidence: 0.945343482

01:11:22.564 --> 01:11:24.872 a small set of leaders that have the
NOTE Confidence: 0.945343482

01:11:24.872 --> 01:11:26.951 trust of the vast majority of people
NOTE Confidence: 0.945343482

01:11:26.951 --> 01:11:29.096 and a willingness to a willingness
NOTE Confidence: 0.945343482

01:11:29.096 --> 01:11:31.112 as you put to sacrifice the pressure
NOTE Confidence: 0.945343482

01:11:31.112 --> 01:11:32.905 for the sake of the future to
NOTE Confidence: 0.945343482

01:11:32.905 --> 01:11:34.555 sacrifice not to plant those trees.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:37.110 --> 01:11:39.180 Comment as an immunocompromised patient,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:39.180 --> 01:11:40.678 I wear a mask at all times
NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:40.678 --> 01:11:41.910 outside of my apartment.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:41.910 --> 01:11:43.590 Even in the building where I live.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:43.590 --> 01:11:45.155 I literally bought a mask

NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:45.155 --> 01:11:47.130 that says it's just a mask.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:47.130 --> 01:11:49.370 There seems to be a big problem

NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:49.370 --> 01:11:50.330 in certain socioeconomic

NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:50.387 --> 01:11:51.927 groups about wearing masks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856275654

01:11:51.930 --> 01:11:55.224 I can see it between types of mega stores.

NOTE Confidence: 0.730074828

01:11:56.730 --> 01:12:01.920 Gently related to social class. Yeah. Umm?

NOTE Confidence: 0.87265858

01:12:07.530 --> 01:12:08.379 There we go.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:10.490 --> 01:12:12.320 I don't know someone comments

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:12.320 --> 01:12:13.418 and outstanding conference.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:13.420 --> 01:12:15.692 They're working on bioethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:15.692 --> 01:12:17.396 and medical setting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:17.400 --> 01:12:19.535 The Pueblos of New Mexico and Navajo

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:19.535 --> 01:12:21.644 Nation have done an excellent job

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:21.644 --> 01:12:23.156 of getting people vaccinated.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6994876175

01:12:23.160 --> 01:12:23.919 It's pointed out.

NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:25.940 --> 01:12:28.304 I am an evangelical and and
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:28.304 --> 01:12:30.520 twice boosted and have gotten.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:30.520 --> 01:12:32.158 Have you shown have you shield?
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:32.160 --> 01:12:34.765 Because I am immunocompromised so
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:34.765 --> 01:12:38.079 there's one individual who tells us that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:38.080 --> 01:12:40.020 And maybe if you want.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:40.020 --> 01:12:40.995 If you're interested,
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:40.995 --> 01:12:42.945 Elizabeth sent us a notice to
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:42.945 --> 01:12:45.375 why you think that within the
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:45.375 --> 01:12:47.007 evangelical community there's a
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:47.007 --> 01:12:48.960 significant resistance to to vaccine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:48.960 --> 01:12:50.577 Or if you think that's even true,
NOTE Confidence: 0.823771795454545

01:12:50.580 --> 01:12:52.687 I guess that that's was your observation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.733609418333333

01:12:54.200 --> 01:12:56.700 But I think there's diversity there. Yeah,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:12:57.350 --> 01:12:59.414 OK, thank you very much for
NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:12:59.414 --> 01:13:00.790 such a compelling talk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:00.790 --> 01:13:02.644 Trust is a main criteria for

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:02.644 --> 01:13:04.390 developing the common good for all.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:04.390 --> 01:13:06.865 How do we come up with a common good

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:06.865 --> 01:13:08.859 paradigm with all our diversities and

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:08.859 --> 01:13:11.070 all the inequities in our society?

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:11.070 --> 01:13:14.358 And we must learn to share rather than

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:14.358 --> 01:13:16.770 sacrifice for individual liberty.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:16.770 --> 01:13:17.370 How do we do that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.907653944

01:13:17.370 --> 01:13:18.546 You got that figured out really?

NOTE Confidence: 0.75091078925

01:13:18.660 --> 01:13:20.345 Yeah, come back next year

NOTE Confidence: 0.75091078925

01:13:20.345 --> 01:13:22.850 and tell you OK, yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:24.840 --> 01:13:25.866 That's a cop says one thing

NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:25.866 --> 01:13:26.930 we can all do is vote.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:26.930 --> 01:13:28.730 I think that's what you said as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:28.730 --> 01:13:30.410 Yes, we have to vote.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:30.410 --> 01:13:32.408 Not a question but a comment.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:32.410 --> 01:13:35.260 The resource you asked about
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:35.260 --> 01:13:37.282 evangelicals of fears and concerns
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:37.282 --> 01:13:39.460 can be found in an excellent
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:39.533 --> 01:13:41.709 statement from the Christian
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:41.709 --> 01:13:43.885 medical and Dental Association.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:43.890 --> 01:13:45.534 Cmda.org explains why
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:45.534 --> 01:13:47.178 vaccinations are important,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:47.180 --> 01:13:49.898 safe and and involves one's responsibility
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:49.898 --> 01:13:52.590 for the common good of society.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:52.590 --> 01:13:54.300 This is from John Plank Hill.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:54.300 --> 01:13:57.492 And so there is this statement from
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:57.492 --> 01:13:59.997 the question medical and Dental
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:13:59.997 --> 01:14:03.111 Association CMA about the vaccines as
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:14:03.111 --> 01:14:06.548 an informational point for all of us.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333

01:14:06.550 --> 01:14:08.670 What recommendation would you have

NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:08.670 --> 01:14:10.366 for changing medical education
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:10.370 --> 01:14:12.405 given these issues with effective
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:12.405 --> 01:14:14.440 public Health Communication as a
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:14.506 --> 01:14:16.948 medical education or I have heard
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:16.948 --> 01:14:18.986 frustration from trainees within this
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:18.986 --> 01:14:21.050 issue and that's a great question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:21.050 --> 01:14:22.060 Teach medical students.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:22.060 --> 01:14:23.635 What do we do differently?
NOTE Confidence: 0.7795218533333333
01:14:23.640 --> 01:14:24.560 What do we do better
NOTE Confidence: 0.836060748
01:14:24.890 --> 01:14:27.902 I I love this question. I mean,
NOTE Confidence: 0.836060748
01:14:27.902 --> 01:14:29.978 I know that medical and nursing
NOTE Confidence: 0.836060748
01:14:29.978 --> 01:14:32.077 education is jam packed and nobody
NOTE Confidence: 0.836060748
01:14:32.077 --> 01:14:34.880 wants to add anything to the curriculum.
NOTE Confidence: 0.755515
01:14:35.250 --> 01:14:36.298 Isn't that the truth?
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796
01:14:37.230 --> 01:14:40.172 But why not? I mean, this should become
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:40.172 --> 01:14:42.548 a criterion in in the same way that
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:42.548 --> 01:14:44.870 you have to show that you know how to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:44.870 --> 01:14:47.150 Do you know a certain kind of diagnosis.
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:47.150 --> 01:14:49.670 You should be able to show that you sit down.
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:49.670 --> 01:14:50.626 You don't stand up,
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:50.626 --> 01:14:52.320 you look the person in the eye.
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:52.320 --> 01:14:53.960 And you make a statement
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:53.960 --> 01:14:55.600 that open is an opener.
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:55.600 --> 01:14:58.355 I mean there there's ways
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:14:58.355 --> 01:15:00.559 to learn communications and.
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:15:00.560 --> 01:15:02.200 I I think we have to do this,
NOTE Confidence: 0.819956796

01:15:02.200 --> 01:15:03.948 especially around vaccine refusal
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:04.320 --> 01:15:06.368 and and, you know, in fairness to the
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:06.368 --> 01:15:08.488 people who lead our educational efforts,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:08.490 --> 01:15:10.178 there is a great deal of effort that
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:10.178 --> 01:15:11.837 is put into teaching our medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:11.837 --> 01:15:14.466 students here at Yale, and I'm sure
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:14.466 --> 01:15:16.394 elsewhere about the communication,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:16.400 --> 01:15:18.640 the communication we learn about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:18.640 --> 01:15:21.504 We teach about both for the medical students
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:21.504 --> 01:15:24.643 and for the residents and Fellows is the
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:24.643 --> 01:15:27.319 one to one communication with a patient.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:27.320 --> 01:15:29.014 There's the other aspect of it which
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:29.014 --> 01:15:30.579 is a communication on a much broader.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:30.580 --> 01:15:31.950 Kyle, that's a good point,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:31.950 --> 01:15:33.740 and every physician doesn't necessarily
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:33.740 --> 01:15:36.090 have to be expert at that home.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:36.090 --> 01:15:37.910 Would wish that there were more of
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:37.910 --> 01:15:40.133 us who were really good at it who
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:40.133 --> 01:15:43.517 could write in the newspaper or go on
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:15:43.517 --> 01:15:46.146 television and really gain the trust.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:46.150 --> 01:15:48.803 And it's frustrating when one sees certain
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:48.803 --> 01:15:50.699 physicians on television who do seem
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:50.699 --> 01:15:52.779 to gain trust and who we look at say?
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:52.780 --> 01:15:54.676 Well, that's one of that's somebody
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:54.676 --> 01:15:56.636 who I really respect. You know?
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:56.636 --> 01:15:58.486 And then you see, you say,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:15:58.486 --> 01:16:00.082 how come people aren't listening to him?
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:00.090 --> 01:16:00.796 My goodness.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:00.796 --> 01:16:03.267 And and then you see someone says
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:03.267 --> 01:16:05.078 something bad about that person.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:05.080 --> 01:16:06.160 Where did that come from?
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:06.160 --> 01:16:08.463 That it's important to to demonize this
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:08.463 --> 01:16:10.520 person because they're promoting vaccines.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:10.520 --> 01:16:12.284 For example, very,
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:12.284 --> 01:16:14.668 very frustrating, to say the least.
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857

01:16:14.668 --> 01:16:16.480 But now I'm getting this depressed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:16:16.480 --> 01:16:19.950 Alright. Hang on here. Umm?
NOTE Confidence: 0.856897612142857
01:16:19.950 --> 01:16:21.540 Uh, so we have more questions.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:23.730 --> 01:16:25.930 There is diversity in my church. This was.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:25.930 --> 01:16:27.430 This was the question about evangelicals,
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:27.430 --> 01:16:28.974 again response from Elizabeth.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:28.974 --> 01:16:30.623 Thank you, Elizabeth, for this.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:30.623 --> 01:16:32.369 There is diversity in my church.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:32.370 --> 01:16:34.926 Only one person of 100 has chosen not to
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:34.926 --> 01:16:37.726 get vaccinated and refused to wear a mask.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:37.730 --> 01:16:40.698 Also we we are having hybrid services and
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:40.698 --> 01:16:42.880 went completely virtual for some time
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:42.880 --> 01:16:45.197 during the early stages of the pandemic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:45.200 --> 01:16:47.426 I think there's a difference between small
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:47.426 --> 01:16:49.356 churches and mega church pastors who
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667
01:16:49.356 --> 01:16:51.505 have sway over larger groups of people,
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667

01:16:51.510 --> 01:16:53.138 including their television audience
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667

01:16:53.138 --> 01:16:55.173 who may have aligned themselves.
NOTE Confidence: 0.920699601666667

01:16:55.180 --> 01:16:56.809 With POTUS 45.
NOTE Confidence: 0.921445277142857

01:16:58.950 --> 01:17:00.854 Thank you, that's very helpful to know
NOTE Confidence: 0.749448528

01:17:01.430 --> 01:17:03.282 that is helpful to know. Now I
NOTE Confidence: 0.749448528

01:17:03.282 --> 01:17:05.418 invite more questions in the Q&A.
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:09.620 --> 01:17:10.982 One person comments.
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:10.982 --> 01:17:13.252 Carol comments that she's Native
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:13.252 --> 01:17:15.816 American and was raised in the city,
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:15.820 --> 01:17:18.932 but she knows many who live on the
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:18.932 --> 01:17:20.839 reservation that were literally
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:20.839 --> 01:17:23.454 dying for access to vaccinations.
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:23.460 --> 01:17:24.915 I mean, that's particularly frustrating
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:24.915 --> 01:17:27.005 to think in the US that there's
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:27.005 --> 01:17:28.739 people who can't get the vaccine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333

01:17:28.740 --> 01:17:29.940 Who want it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333
01:17:29.940 --> 01:17:32.652 It's such a, it seems to those
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333
01:17:32.652 --> 01:17:34.920 who are ill informed like myself.
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333
01:17:34.920 --> 01:17:36.654 I mean, I realize their storage
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333
01:17:36.654 --> 01:17:38.120 and transport issues and such,
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333
01:17:38.120 --> 01:17:39.898 but this isn't this isn't heart surgery.
NOTE Confidence: 0.831175965333333
01:17:39.900 --> 01:17:41.670 This isn't even a vaccine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:41.800 --> 01:17:43.920 I mean, we should try to advertise that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:43.920 --> 01:17:46.258 Could she say some more about that?
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:46.260 --> 01:17:48.624 I mean, why isn't there plenty
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:48.624 --> 01:17:51.310 of vaccine on those reservations?
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:51.310 --> 01:17:52.435 I don't understand.
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:52.435 --> 01:17:54.958 We we have. No shortage here.
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:54.958 --> 01:17:57.754 So, and we have refrigerated trucks.
NOTE Confidence: 0.63587457375
01:17:57.760 --> 01:17:59.410 I just don't get it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9533529
01:18:02.330 --> 01:18:04.792 Well, OK, for that I mean the
NOTE Confidence: 0.9533529

01:18:04.792 --> 01:18:05.780 Indian Health service should
NOTE Confidence: 0.9533529

01:18:05.831 --> 01:18:07.206 be held accountable for that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:10.040 --> 01:18:11.615 You mentioned at the very
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:11.615 --> 01:18:12.875 beginning of your talk.
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:12.880 --> 01:18:14.864 Now Jonathan, because I I I like that
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:14.864 --> 01:18:16.936 maybe you could talk for a minute more
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:16.936 --> 01:18:18.960 on this because our time is nearly up,
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:18.960 --> 01:18:22.956 but I'm interested in your thoughts
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:22.956 --> 01:18:26.910 on the ethical requirement to prepare.
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:26.910 --> 01:18:28.416 To me there seems an analogy.
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:28.420 --> 01:18:31.005 Once again with with the
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:31.005 --> 01:18:33.590 environmental issues that it it
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:33.684 --> 01:18:37.272 speaks to our obligation to the
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:37.272 --> 01:18:40.767 future in terms of what we do now.
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:40.770 --> 01:18:42.650 And I wonder if you wanted to say
NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:42.650 --> 01:18:44.074 anything else about that ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:44.074 --> 01:18:45.574 requirement to prepare kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.91360458

01:18:45.574 --> 01:18:47.328 flesh that out a little bit more.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:18:50.550 --> 01:18:54.246 I, I think that it it it

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:18:54.246 --> 01:18:55.830 engages preparation engages

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:18:55.932 --> 01:18:59.920 with so many moral commitments.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:18:59.920 --> 01:19:02.242 When you prepare, you demonstrate that

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:02.242 --> 01:19:05.250 you feel you have some accountability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:05.250 --> 01:19:08.162 For impacts on future.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:08.162 --> 01:19:11.074 Events on future people.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:11.080 --> 01:19:12.883 Future, it's it's.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:12.883 --> 01:19:15.287 It's a statement almost

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:15.287 --> 01:19:17.090 of your accountability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:17.090 --> 01:19:20.474 And it's also a recognition that

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:20.474 --> 01:19:22.730 your actions are interventions

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:22.821 --> 01:19:24.879 that are determinative.

NOTE Confidence: 0.843904296428572

01:19:24.880 --> 01:19:26.826 It's a it's a form of agency.
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:33.240 --> 01:19:34.900 So it's also preparation I
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:34.900 --> 01:19:37.049 think is going to become more
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:37.049 --> 01:19:38.717 and more important because.
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:38.720 --> 01:19:40.688 People often ask me what do I where
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:40.688 --> 01:19:42.778 do I think bioethics is going?
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:42.780 --> 01:19:45.440 And I think bioethics is.
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:45.440 --> 01:19:47.600 I think the ethical challenges that
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:47.600 --> 01:19:50.489 we're facing now in the 21st century are.
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:50.490 --> 01:19:52.002 Different than the ones we were
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:52.002 --> 01:19:53.470 facing in the 20th century,
NOTE Confidence: 0.841077530666667

01:19:53.470 --> 01:19:54.938 when bioethics was created.
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:19:57.270 --> 01:19:58.870 Maybe not different additional,
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:19:58.870 --> 01:20:01.270 so when bioethics was first created.
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:01.270 --> 01:20:03.202 I mean, I think it's fair to
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:03.202 --> 01:20:05.606 say that we were dealing mostly

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:05.606 --> 01:20:07.614 with individual level concerns.

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:07.620 --> 01:20:11.524 Like the right to die sort of concerns

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:11.524 --> 01:20:14.500 or allocation concerns for rationing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:14.500 --> 01:20:17.019 or, you know, that's.

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:17.020 --> 01:20:19.384 They were things that would affect

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:19.384 --> 01:20:21.940 the decisions that were made would

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:21.940 --> 01:20:24.220 affect an individual very seriously,

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:24.220 --> 01:20:26.566 but they didn't really necessarily affect

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:26.566 --> 01:20:29.254 a population like end of life care or

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:29.254 --> 01:20:30.824 fairness in in organ transplantation

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:30.824 --> 01:20:32.418 that would affect an individual

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:32.418 --> 01:20:34.385 if we didn't have a fair system,

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:34.390 --> 01:20:36.080 it would affect an individual,

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:36.080 --> 01:20:38.088 but the kind we still face those kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:38.088 --> 01:20:39.774 of problems and value ethics still

NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:39.774 --> 01:20:41.466 needs to be thinking about those
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:41.521 --> 01:20:43.418 kind of problems in the 21st century.
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:43.420 --> 01:20:46.150 But now we are facing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:46.150 --> 01:20:51.078 Collective decision problems about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:51.080 --> 01:20:58.310 How we manage our shared environment? So.
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:20:58.310 --> 01:21:02.185 Global warming is the perfect example, right?
NOTE Confidence: 0.817993478

01:21:02.185 --> 01:21:02.980 Umm?
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:04.990 --> 01:21:05.953 Pandemics, shared environment.
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:05.953 --> 01:21:07.879 How are we going to manage
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:07.879 --> 01:21:09.260 the shared environment?
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:09.260 --> 01:21:12.164 Because our policies and our what we do,
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:12.170 --> 01:21:16.490 how we prepare is going to affect all of us.
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:16.490 --> 01:21:18.968 It's going to affect a population level,
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:18.970 --> 01:21:21.058 not just the individuals whose lives
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:21.058 --> 01:21:23.781 will be saved by getting an organ
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:21:23.781 --> 01:21:27.220 that was distributed fairly. So.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:27.220 --> 01:21:29.896 I mean another example is geoengineering.
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:29.900 --> 01:21:32.693 You know they're now proposals to block
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:32.693 --> 01:21:35.719 sunlight in order to manage global warming.
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:35.720 --> 01:21:37.796 So, like planetary interventions
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:37.796 --> 01:21:41.320 that we think it's important to have
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:41.320 --> 01:21:43.948 IRB's for research studies to oversee
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:43.948 --> 01:21:45.700 oversee research with individuals,
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:45.700 --> 01:21:47.956 now we're going to do these actions that
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:47.956 --> 01:21:49.897 are planetary and there isn't anybody
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:49.897 --> 01:21:51.871 that's responsible for oversight of it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:51.880 --> 01:21:55.282 So we're facing what I'm calling
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:55.282 --> 01:21:57.722 collective decisions. Really big.
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:21:57.722 --> 01:22:00.326 Collective decisions that affect
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:22:00.326 --> 01:22:02.279 our shared environment.
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667
01:22:02.280 --> 01:22:04.210 And.
NOTE Confidence: 0.88512846666667

01:22:04.210 --> 01:22:08.350 They require coordination and preparation.
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:08.350 --> 01:22:08.589 And.
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:08.589 --> 01:22:10.262 I just hope we all realized that
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:10.262 --> 01:22:12.234 we just have to work together and
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:12.234 --> 01:22:14.228 that's why these values that I was
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:14.228 --> 01:22:15.728 mentioning I think come into play
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:15.728 --> 01:22:18.635 and are so important that we have.
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:18.635 --> 01:22:19.445 If we're going to do that,
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:19.450 --> 01:22:20.530 we have to think about equity.
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:20.530 --> 01:22:22.288 Obviously, if it's a shared environment,
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:22.290 --> 01:22:23.481 how does what?
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:23.481 --> 01:22:25.069 What are the distributional
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:25.069 --> 01:22:26.770 effects on different groups?
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:26.770 --> 01:22:28.327 And we have to think about the common good,
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:28.330 --> 01:22:31.350 not just the liberty side.
NOTE Confidence: 0.885128466666667

01:22:31.350 --> 01:22:32.220 That's my answer,

NOTE Confidence: 0.851490008888889
01:22:32.710 --> 01:22:34.190 thank you. We have time
NOTE Confidence: 0.851490008888889
01:22:34.190 --> 01:22:35.374 for one more question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.897862715333333
01:22:37.500 --> 01:22:39.095 There are many health care
NOTE Confidence: 0.897862715333333
01:22:39.095 --> 01:22:40.690 facilities that do not mandate
NOTE Confidence: 0.897862715333333
01:22:40.748 --> 01:22:42.258 the vaccine to their staff,
NOTE Confidence: 0.897862715333333
01:22:42.260 --> 01:22:43.445 including clinical practitioners.
NOTE Confidence: 0.897862715333333
01:22:43.445 --> 01:22:45.815 Can you speak about how we,
NOTE Confidence: 0.897862715333333
01:22:45.820 --> 01:22:46.900 as healthcare practitioners
NOTE Confidence: 0.897862715333333
01:22:46.900 --> 01:22:48.700 can allow this to be?
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:22:50.090 --> 01:22:51.970 I just think that's a mistake and I
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:22:51.970 --> 01:22:53.728 think it's a failure of leadership.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:22:53.730 --> 01:22:56.138 I do understand it in small rural
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:22:56.138 --> 01:22:57.949 hospitals where they're the leadership
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:22:57.949 --> 01:22:59.729 is just terrified that they're
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:22:59.729 --> 01:23:02.184 going to have to close, because if
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:02.184 --> 01:23:04.506 they insist upon a vaccine mandate,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:04.510 --> 01:23:06.988 their employees are going to leave.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:06.990 --> 01:23:08.852 And I think we've even had instances
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:08.852 --> 01:23:11.008 of that in rural upstate New York,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:11.010 --> 01:23:12.970 so I understand the pressure on these.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:12.970 --> 01:23:15.626 I. I'm really do. I don't want to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:15.630 --> 01:23:17.208 I don't want to end by,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:17.210 --> 01:23:18.326 you know, just disrespecting.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:18.326 --> 01:23:21.472 How hard it is to be the leader of a
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:21.472 --> 01:23:22.880 healthcare organization where there's
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:22.880 --> 01:23:25.631 that kind of resistance and where there's
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:25.631 --> 01:23:27.616 a shortage of healthcare professionals.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:27.620 --> 01:23:29.495 So if somebody actually leaves
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:29.495 --> 01:23:30.995 because of the mandate,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:31.000 --> 01:23:34.395 you may have to close your doors.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571

01:23:34.400 --> 01:23:36.758 But you know, it's just wrong,

NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:36.760 --> 01:23:37.406 and fortunately,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:37.406 --> 01:23:39.990 even though I was saying that I was
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:40.053 --> 01:23:42.286 sorry to see that the Supreme Court.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:42.290 --> 01:23:47.085 Vitiating the employer mandate in every case,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:47.090 --> 01:23:49.916 health care mandates have been upheld.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:49.920 --> 01:23:51.600 It has to come before the Supreme Court,
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:51.600 --> 01:23:53.476 but in all the other courts lower
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:53.476 --> 01:23:55.238 courts it this has been upheld.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:55.240 --> 01:23:56.945 Everybody recognizes that there is
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:56.945 --> 01:23:58.650 a responsibility that comes with
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:23:58.708 --> 01:24:00.340 being a healthcare professional.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:24:00.340 --> 01:24:02.480 It's part of your job.
NOTE Confidence: 0.900444116428571
01:24:02.480 --> 01:24:03.020 To
NOTE Confidence: 0.449469318875
01:24:03.280 --> 01:24:06.802 have a responsibility to comment being
NOTE Confidence: 0.449469318875
01:24:06.802 --> 01:24:08.840 a citizen in terms of the public,
NOTE Confidence: 0.449469318875

01:24:08.840 --> 01:24:10.170 could we haven't come that
NOTE Confidence: 0.7141447744444444

01:24:10.180 --> 01:24:11.172 end because that's really
NOTE Confidence: 0.7141447744444444

01:24:11.172 --> 01:24:12.412 what it comes down to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7141447744444444

01:24:12.420 --> 01:24:13.320 That question about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7141447744444444

01:24:13.320 --> 01:24:15.120 What should the Hastings Center do?
NOTE Confidence: 0.7141447744444444

01:24:15.120 --> 01:24:17.478 We all have to be citizens
NOTE Confidence: 0.7141447744444444

01:24:17.478 --> 01:24:19.900 and we all have to vote.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7141447744444444

01:24:19.900 --> 01:24:21.048 Here's one quick quick
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:21.060 --> 01:24:22.254 comment and then I'm going to
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:22.254 --> 01:24:23.580 ask you just one last thing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:23.580 --> 01:24:26.577 So this was just thank you, Barbara for this.
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:26.577 --> 01:24:28.491 Richard Russo wrote an excellent article
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:28.491 --> 01:24:30.888 in the Atlantic about the tendency to pay
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:30.888 --> 01:24:32.909 attention to the uninformed Grapevine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:32.910 --> 01:24:34.854 Instead of expertise, he called it
NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667

01:24:34.854 --> 01:24:37.810 the I know a guy syndrome mentality,

NOTE Confidence: 0.815519559166667
01:24:37.810 --> 01:24:41.290 so that's something worth taking a look at.
NOTE Confidence: 0.816698061666667
01:24:39.610 --> 01:24:41.200 Yeah, we should look at that. That's great.
NOTE Confidence: 0.71005199
01:24:41.290 --> 01:24:42.980 And with that, our time
NOTE Confidence: 0.71005199
01:24:42.980 --> 01:24:44.332 is nearly million wanted.
NOTE Confidence: 0.71005199
01:24:44.340 --> 01:24:45.232 There's a final thought
NOTE Confidence: 0.71005199
01:24:45.232 --> 01:24:46.570 you'd like to leave us with
NOTE Confidence: 0.71005199
01:24:46.620 --> 01:24:47.760 before we close the night.
NOTE Confidence: 0.771272501818182
01:24:48.090 --> 01:24:50.561 Let's keep our hopes up even as
NOTE Confidence: 0.771272501818182
01:24:50.561 --> 01:24:52.568 we see the dark. Let's keep.
NOTE Confidence: 0.771272501818182
01:24:52.568 --> 01:24:53.882 Let's keep our hopes up and
NOTE Confidence: 0.771272501818182
01:24:53.882 --> 01:24:55.169 keep on working together.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125
01:24:56.030 --> 01:24:58.046 That sounds good. I thank you so much.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125
01:24:58.050 --> 01:25:00.120 I thank you all for joining us and we'll
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125
01:25:00.120 --> 01:25:02.228 be back again soon with the next one.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125
01:25:02.230 --> 01:25:04.468 You can see our schedule and
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:04.468 --> 01:25:06.114 biomedical ethics at yale.edu.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:06.114 --> 01:25:10.306 If you Google us and we are sometimes
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:10.306 --> 01:25:11.982 blessed, often blessed with wonderful
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:11.982 --> 01:25:14.039 speakers and so that was certainly one
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:14.039 --> 01:25:15.689 of those nights Doctor Millie Solomon.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:15.690 --> 01:25:17.755 Thank you so much for this evening.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:17.760 --> 01:25:19.344 We appreciate it and we say
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:19.344 --> 01:25:20.840 goodnight to you and thanks.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:20.850 --> 01:25:22.630 Thank you.
NOTE Confidence: 0.92758414125

01:25:22.630 --> 01:25:23.770 Thanks everybody, thanks
NOTE Confidence: 0.9027148

01:25:23.770 --> 01:25:28.000 for this opportunity, Mark. See Emily.