

WEBVTT

NOTE duration:"01:30:21"

NOTE recognizability:0.841

NOTE language:en-us

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:04.068 So good evening everyone and welcome

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:04.068 --> 00:00:07.214 to our Evening conference in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:07.214 --> 00:00:09.890 program for Biomedical Ethics at Yale.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:09.890 --> 00:00:12.050 My name is Sarah Hall and I am one of

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:12.116 --> 00:00:14.396 the associate directors of the program,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:14.400 --> 00:00:17.088 along with Jack Hughes and we're joined

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:17.088 --> 00:00:19.864 by our program director, Mark Mercurio,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:19.864 --> 00:00:23.480 and we have the honor tonight of welcoming

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:23.564 --> 00:00:26.579 Professor Michael Sandel from Harvard.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:26.580 --> 00:00:29.168 Michael Sandel teaches political

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:29.168 --> 00:00:31.756 philosophy at Harvard University.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:31.760 --> 00:00:33.482 And actually I took his class

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:33.482 --> 00:00:35.640 when I was an undergraduate,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:35.640 --> 00:00:38.296 and that's how I got bitten by the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:38.296 --> 00:00:40.519 philosophy bug and and ended up here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:40.520 --> 00:00:43.020 Now almost 20 years later,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:43.020 --> 00:00:43.959 just before I,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:43.959 --> 00:00:45.837 I go further into his introduction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:45.840 --> 00:00:48.018 I just want to sort of cover  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:48.018 --> 00:00:50.090 some housekeeping about how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:50.090 --> 00:00:51.680 tonight's program is going to work,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:51.680 --> 00:00:54.080 although I think most people probably  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:54.080 --> 00:00:56.700 already know how how we roll.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:56.700 --> 00:00:58.650 But tonight, Professor Sandel  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:00:58.650 --> 00:01:01.618 will be speaking on the order of.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:01.618 --> 00:01:02.674 Maybe 20 minutes,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:02.680 --> 00:01:04.120 maybe a little bit longer,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:04.120 --> 00:01:06.353 but not quite as long as our  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:06.353 --> 00:01:07.708 typical discussions run because

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:07.708 --> 00:01:10.067 you wanted to leave more time for

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:10.067 --> 00:01:11.863 discussion in Q&A during that time,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:11.863 --> 00:01:13.900 if you you should feel free to

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:13.963 --> 00:01:15.925 submit any questions you might have

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:15.925 --> 00:01:18.632 in the Q&A section and we will get

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:18.632 --> 00:01:20.720 to them afterwards after he speaks,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:20.720 --> 00:01:22.976 Mark Mercurio will give a short

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:22.976 --> 00:01:25.174 response and then we're going to

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:25.174 --> 00:01:27.330 open it up to questions which I

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:27.330 --> 00:01:30.176 will moderate along with Mark if it

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:30.176 --> 00:01:31.644 gets particularly spirited, which.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:31.644 --> 00:01:35.434 Which we hope it will and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:35.434 --> 00:01:37.946 and that'll be that we do have a

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:37.946 --> 00:01:40.256 hard stop at 6:30 as you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:40.260 --> 00:01:42.612 and so even if you have the

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:42.612 --> 00:01:44.300 most brilliant burning question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:44.300 --> 00:01:47.148 if it comes in at 6:29 and and we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:47.148 --> 00:01:48.660 still are working on another question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:48.660 --> 00:01:50.140 And unfortunately we'll just have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:50.140 --> 00:01:52.036 to table that for another time.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:52.036 --> 00:01:54.154 But I encourage you to submit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:54.154 --> 00:01:55.519 questions early and often.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:55.520 --> 00:01:57.760 Will try to get to as much as we can,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:57.760 --> 00:01:59.208 and we are very,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:01:59.208 --> 00:02:01.740 very excited to have to hear what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:01.740 --> 00:02:03.820 Professor Sandel. Have to say tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:03.820 --> 00:02:06.802 So without further ado I will  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:06.802 --> 00:02:09.430 introduce him formally so again,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:09.430 --> 00:02:11.262 Michael Sandel teaches political  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:11.262 --> 00:02:13.094 philosophy at Harvard University.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:13.100 --> 00:02:14.892 His books on justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:14.892 --> 00:02:15.340 democracy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:15.340 --> 00:02:17.812 ethics and biotechnology and markets have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:17.812 --> 00:02:20.638 been translated into more than 30 languages.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:20.640 --> 00:02:23.216 He has been described as the world's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:23.216 --> 00:02:25.120 most influential living philosopher.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:25.120 --> 00:02:27.444 His latest book, The Tyranny of Merit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:27.450 --> 00:02:29.136 What's become of the common good,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:29.140 --> 00:02:30.617 was named a best book of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:30.617 --> 00:02:32.310 year by the Guardian Bloomberg,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:32.310 --> 00:02:33.412 New Statesman.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:33.412 --> 00:02:36.167 The Times literary supplement excuse  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:36.167 --> 00:02:39.730 me in Paris and New Weekly in Beijing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:39.730 --> 00:02:41.405 His previous books include the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:41.405 --> 00:02:42.410 case against Perfection,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375  
00:02:42.410 --> 00:02:45.210 Ethics in the age of Genetic Engineering,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:45.210 --> 00:02:46.206 his legendary course.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:46.206 --> 00:02:48.198 Justice was the first Harvard course  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:48.198 --> 00:02:50.356 to be made freely available online and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:50.356 --> 00:02:53.007 has been viewed by 10s of millions of people.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:53.010 --> 00:02:55.062 And again was the brilliant course  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:55.062 --> 00:02:57.953 that I took and made me fall in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:57.953 --> 00:02:59.039 love with philosophy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:02:59.040 --> 00:03:00.102 his BBC series,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:03:00.102 --> 00:03:01.518 the global philosopher explores  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:03:01.518 --> 00:03:03.360 the ethical issues lying behind  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:03:03.360 --> 00:03:04.800 the headlines with participants  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:03:04.800 --> 00:03:06.240 from around the world.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:03:06.240 --> 00:03:07.730 Sandel has been a visiting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86968271375

00:03:07.730 --> 00:03:09.220 professor at the Solon and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.901864103157895

00:03:09.280 --> 00:03:11.302 delivered the tenor lectures on human  
NOTE Confidence: 0.901864103157895

00:03:11.302 --> 00:03:13.785 values at Oxford in the US Sandel has

NOTE Confidence: 0.901864103157895  
00:03:13.785 --> 00:03:15.250 served on the President's Council  
NOTE Confidence: 0.901864103157895  
00:03:15.313 --> 00:03:17.577 on bioethics and is a member of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.901864103157895  
00:03:17.577 --> 00:03:19.337 American Academy of Arts and Sciences,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.901864103157895  
00:03:19.340 --> 00:03:22.236 and without further ado I present to you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.901864103157895  
00:03:22.236 --> 00:03:24.069 Professor Michael Sandel. Take it away.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:24.870 --> 00:03:26.110 Well, thank you Sarah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:26.110 --> 00:03:28.636 Thanks so much and what a thrill it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:28.636 --> 00:03:30.806 is to be introduced by you, Sarah,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:30.806 --> 00:03:33.814 hearkening as you hearken back to the time  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:33.814 --> 00:03:36.706 when you took my my course on trustis  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:36.706 --> 00:03:39.571 as an undergraduate and thanks also to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:39.571 --> 00:03:43.678 mark for for a hosting and convening us.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:43.680 --> 00:03:46.984 When Mark and I first talked about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:46.990 --> 00:03:50.038 what we might discuss this evening,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:03:50.040 --> 00:03:53.036 we came up with the idea of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:03:53.040 --> 00:03:56.160 speaking about my recent book,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:03:56.160 --> 00:03:58.116 that Tyranny of Merit,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:03:58.116 --> 00:04:02.100 but also an earlier book which echoes some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:02.100 --> 00:04:05.932 of the OR anticipate some of the themes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:05.940 --> 00:04:07.800 The book Sarah just now mentioned,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:07.800 --> 00:04:10.280 called the case against perfection.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:10.280 --> 00:04:13.710 Ethics in the age of genetic engineering.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:13.710 --> 00:04:16.965 Now these are two very different books.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:16.970 --> 00:04:19.952 The tyranny of merit is about what's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:19.952 --> 00:04:23.209 gone wrong with meritocracy these days.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:23.210 --> 00:04:26.440 Whereas the case against perfection.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:26.440 --> 00:04:29.765 Is an argument against the use of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:29.765 --> 00:04:32.190 genetic engineering for enhancement  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:32.190 --> 00:04:35.370 rather than for medical purposes,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:35.370 --> 00:04:38.604 but there is a theme that connects  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:04:38.604 --> 00:04:40.948 them and so in these opening remarks,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:40.950 --> 00:04:43.484 I'd like to bring out that theme.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:43.490 --> 00:04:45.786 See if I can make sense of it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:45.790 --> 00:04:50.074 Then I'll be keen to hear what you think.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:50.080 --> 00:04:52.540 So first the tyranny of merit,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:52.540 --> 00:04:56.610 which is the recent book on the face of it,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:56.610 --> 00:04:58.479 to speak of the tyranny of merit,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:58.480 --> 00:04:59.580 is paradoxical.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:04:59.580 --> 00:05:04.260 We normally think of merit as a good thing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:05:04.260 --> 00:05:05.706 Merritt understood as.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:05:05.706 --> 00:05:08.598 Appointing people to jobs and social  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:05:08.598 --> 00:05:11.559 roles based on their being well qualified  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:05:11.559 --> 00:05:14.430 for them who could be against that?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:05:14.430 --> 00:05:16.550 If I need surgery performed,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:05:16.550 --> 00:05:18.776 I want a well qualified surgeon  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:05:18.776 --> 00:05:19.889 to perform it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:19.890 --> 00:05:23.406 That's merit, and that's certainly a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:23.406 --> 00:05:26.669 laudable and necessary form of merit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:26.670 --> 00:05:30.576 So how does merit become a tyranny?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:30.580 --> 00:05:33.766 Becomes a tyranny when it turns  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:33.766 --> 00:05:37.330 into a system of meritocracy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:37.330 --> 00:05:39.430 Now anything that has ocracy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:39.430 --> 00:05:41.530 at the end of it?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:41.530 --> 00:05:44.008 Aristocracy democracy meritocracy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:44.008 --> 00:05:48.964 refers to a system of rule.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:48.970 --> 00:05:52.066 And when merit becomes the system of rule,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:52.070 --> 00:05:54.350 as in a meritocracy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:54.350 --> 00:05:56.630 it becomes a way.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:56.630 --> 00:05:59.770 Of allocating income and wealth,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:05:59.770 --> 00:06:01.621 power and opportunity,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:06:01.621 --> 00:06:02.238 honor,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:06:02.238 --> 00:06:05.594 and social esteem on the basis of

NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:05.594 --> 00:06:07.850 what people are thought to deserve  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:07.850 --> 00:06:10.552 and the basis of what people are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:10.552 --> 00:06:13.558 thought to have earned for themselves.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:13.560 --> 00:06:15.048 Now, meritocracy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:15.048 --> 00:06:21.310 So I'd like to argue has a dark side.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:21.310 --> 00:06:24.478 The dark side is connected to the harsh  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:24.478 --> 00:06:27.509 ethic of success that it generates,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:27.510 --> 00:06:30.070 but let me explain.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:30.070 --> 00:06:33.618 Let's begin by stepping back and having  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:33.618 --> 00:06:38.590 a look at our present civic condition.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:38.590 --> 00:06:40.321 In recent decades.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:40.321 --> 00:06:42.629 The divide between winners  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:42.629 --> 00:06:45.909 and losers has been deepening,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:45.910 --> 00:06:50.290 poisoning our politics, setting us apart.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334  
00:06:50.290 --> 00:06:53.760 This has partly to do with widening  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:06:53.760 --> 00:06:56.310 inequalities of income and wealth,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:06:56.310 --> 00:06:58.980 but it's not only that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:06:58.980 --> 00:07:02.677 It has also to do this divide with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:02.677 --> 00:07:05.065 the changing attitudes toward  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:05.065 --> 00:07:08.050 success that have accompanied the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:08.146 --> 00:07:10.080 widening inequalities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:10.080 --> 00:07:12.992 Those who have landed on top during  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:12.992 --> 00:07:15.580 these recent decades of globalization,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:15.580 --> 00:07:18.324 those who have landed on top have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:18.324 --> 00:07:20.994 come to believe that their success  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:20.994 --> 00:07:22.986 is their own doing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:22.990 --> 00:07:25.370 The measure of their merit,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:25.370 --> 00:07:27.375 and that they therefore deserve  
NOTE Confidence: 0.875704858333334

00:07:27.375 --> 00:07:29.380 the full bounty that the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:07:29.459 --> 00:07:31.179 market bascos upon them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:07:31.180 --> 00:07:32.623 And by implication,

NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:32.623 --> 00:07:36.842 to think that those who struggle those left  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:36.842 --> 00:07:41.504 behind must deserve their fate as well.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:41.510 --> 00:07:45.338 This way of thinking about success.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:45.340 --> 00:07:49.510 Reflect a seemingly attractive ideal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:49.510 --> 00:07:51.670 The ideal of meritocracy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:51.670 --> 00:07:55.909 The principle that says if chances are equal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:55.910 --> 00:07:59.150 The winners deserve their winnings.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:07:59.150 --> 00:08:00.761 That's the key.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:08:00.761 --> 00:08:02.909 Meritocracy is a theory.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:08:02.910 --> 00:08:07.758 It's a principle of deserving Ness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:08:07.760 --> 00:08:11.410 Now, in practice of course.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:08:11.410 --> 00:08:14.400 Chances are not truly equal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:08:14.400 --> 00:08:17.592 Well, you see this if we look  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:08:17.592 --> 00:08:20.352 at university admissions at Ivy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:08:20.352 --> 00:08:23.136 League universities for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:23.140 --> 00:08:25.788 there are more undergraduates.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:25.788 --> 00:08:29.760 Who come from the top 1%?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:29.760 --> 00:08:32.208 Then there are undergraduates who come  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:32.208 --> 00:08:35.228 from families in the entire bottom half.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:35.230 --> 00:08:37.434 Of the country combined,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:37.434 --> 00:08:42.112 bottom half of the income scale so clearly.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:42.112 --> 00:08:46.228 We don't live up to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:46.228 --> 00:08:49.000 meritocratic principles we profess.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:49.000 --> 00:08:52.224 But it's not only that even if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:52.224 --> 00:08:54.184 we had a perfect meritocracy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:54.190 --> 00:08:57.640 even if we could fix the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:57.640 --> 00:08:59.365 inequality of chances.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:08:59.370 --> 00:09:03.444 Still, meritocracy would have a dark side.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:09:03.450 --> 00:09:06.786 The dark side is that meritocracy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:09:06.790 --> 00:09:10.108 is corrosive, but the common good.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:09:10.110 --> 00:09:11.960 The reason it's corrosive of

NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:11.960 --> 00:09:14.465 the common good is connected to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:14.465 --> 00:09:16.325 the attitudes towards success.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:16.330 --> 00:09:19.180 I mentioned a moment ago.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:19.180 --> 00:09:21.580 Meritocracy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:21.580 --> 00:09:24.970 Even if chances were equal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:24.970 --> 00:09:29.056 Would encourage the winners to believe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:29.056 --> 00:09:32.770 their success was their undoing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:32.770 --> 00:09:34.402 Meritocracy induces.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:34.402 --> 00:09:37.666 Kind of meritocratic hubris  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:37.666 --> 00:09:40.114 among the winners.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:40.120 --> 00:09:44.206 And humiliation among those left behind.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:44.210 --> 00:09:47.486 The hubris among the winners consists  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:47.486 --> 00:09:50.306 in the idea I burned it on my own,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:50.310 --> 00:09:53.090 and therefore I deserve it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:09:53.090 --> 00:09:55.946 But this hubris forgets  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:09:55.946 --> 00:09:59.516 the luck and good fortune.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:09:59.520 --> 00:10:02.058 That help us on our way,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:02.060 --> 00:10:04.336 it forgets our indebtedness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:04.336 --> 00:10:08.660 To those who make our achievements possible.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:08.660 --> 00:10:11.348 Family teachers community country.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:11.348 --> 00:10:15.380 The times in which we live.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:15.380 --> 00:10:18.442 Now. It also.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:18.442 --> 00:10:22.108 Has and here's how it becomes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:22.108 --> 00:10:25.369 corrosive of the common good.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:25.370 --> 00:10:27.902 It leads the successful  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:27.902 --> 00:10:31.067 to look down on those.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:31.070 --> 00:10:34.238 Less fortunate than themselves.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:34.240 --> 00:10:36.700 And this matters for politics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:36.700 --> 00:10:38.884 Think about our political  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:38.884 --> 00:10:41.068 moment in recent years.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:10:41.070 --> 00:10:44.838 One of the most potent sources of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:10:44.838 --> 00:10:47.240 populist backlash against a leaps.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:10:47.240 --> 00:10:50.486 Is the sense among many working  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:10:50.486 --> 00:10:54.029 people that elites look down on them?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:10:54.030 --> 00:10:57.138 It's a legitimate complaint.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:10:57.140 --> 00:11:00.825 Because even as globalization brought  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:00.825 --> 00:11:04.769 deepening inequality and stagnant wages.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:04.769 --> 00:11:07.238 Its proponents offered.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:07.240 --> 00:11:11.060 Working people, some bracing advice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:11.060 --> 00:11:12.548 If you want to compete in win in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:12.548 --> 00:11:14.480 the global economy, they said.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:14.480 --> 00:11:16.220 Go to college.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:16.220 --> 00:11:19.973 What you earn will depend on what you learn.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:19.980 --> 00:11:22.220 You can make it if you try.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:22.220 --> 00:11:24.060 These were the meritocratic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571  
00:11:24.060 --> 00:11:25.900 mantras in the book.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:25.900 --> 00:11:29.540 I called them the rhetoric of rising.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:29.540 --> 00:11:33.222 But these elites failed to see the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:33.222 --> 00:11:36.190 insult implicit in their advice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:36.190 --> 00:11:37.974 The insult was this.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:37.974 --> 00:11:40.650 If you didn't go to college,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:40.650 --> 00:11:43.986 and if you're struggling in the new economy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:43.990 --> 00:11:48.298 your failure must be your fault.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:48.300 --> 00:11:51.289 So it's no wonder that many working  
NOTE Confidence: 0.844339681428571

00:11:51.289 --> 00:11:54.080 people turned against meritocratic elite.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:11:56.720 --> 00:11:58.656 So what should we do in the book?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:11:58.660 --> 00:12:01.224 I suggest rethinking 3  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:01.224 --> 00:12:04.429 aspects of our civic life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:04.430 --> 00:12:06.690 The role of higher education,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:06.690 --> 00:12:09.745 the dignity of work in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:09.745 --> 00:12:12.189 the meaning of success.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:12.190 --> 00:12:14.190 We have made and universities

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:14.190 --> 00:12:15.790 have accepted the role.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:15.790 --> 00:12:18.158 We've turned universities into

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:18.158 --> 00:12:21.118 arbiters of opportunity in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:21.118 --> 00:12:24.320 market driven meritocratic society.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:24.320 --> 00:12:27.150 We've turned them into sorting

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:27.150 --> 00:12:30.180 machines for opportunity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:30.180 --> 00:12:32.280 But there's a problem with this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:32.280 --> 00:12:34.760 One of the problems is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:34.760 --> 00:12:36.685 Those of us who spend our days

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:36.685 --> 00:12:38.526 in the company, the credentialed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:38.526 --> 00:12:43.010 Can easily forget it, simple fact.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:43.010 --> 00:12:45.722 Most people don't have.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:45.722 --> 00:12:49.112 A four year college degree.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:49.120 --> 00:12:53.768 In fact, nearly 2/3 of Americans do not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:53.770 --> 00:12:57.389 So it's folly to create an economy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:12:57.390 --> 00:13:00.312 That sets us a necessary condition  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:00.312 --> 00:13:03.589 of dignified work in a decent life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:03.590 --> 00:13:08.686 A college degree that most people don't have.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:08.690 --> 00:13:10.910 Encouraging people.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:10.910 --> 00:13:14.054 To go to college is a good thing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:14.060 --> 00:13:15.704 Broadening access for that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:15.704 --> 00:13:19.330 who those who can't afford it is even better.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:19.330 --> 00:13:22.970 But this is not a solution to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:22.970 --> 00:13:25.908 inequalities brought about by globalization.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:25.910 --> 00:13:27.170 So, broadly speaking,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:27.170 --> 00:13:29.690 we should shift our public discourse.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:29.690 --> 00:13:32.390 We should focus less.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:32.390 --> 00:13:35.550 But arming people for meritocratic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:35.550 --> 00:13:38.078 competition and focus more.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:38.080 --> 00:13:40.840 On making life better for those  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:40.840 --> 00:13:43.590 who may lack a diploma.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:43.590 --> 00:13:46.260 But who nonetheless contribute in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:46.260 --> 00:13:49.450 important ways to the common good?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:49.450 --> 00:13:51.328 Through the work they do the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:51.328 --> 00:13:52.267 families they raised,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:52.270 --> 00:13:54.138 the communities they serve.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:54.138 --> 00:13:56.473 This means renewing the dignity

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:56.473 --> 00:13:58.530 of work and putting it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9678859975

00:13:58.530 --> 00:14:01.698 putting it at the center of our politics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:04.480 --> 00:14:09.438 We also so we we need to reconceive

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:09.440 --> 00:14:13.130 the role of the of the dignity of work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:13.130 --> 00:14:14.855 One prompt to doing so

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:14.855 --> 00:14:16.800 comes from our experience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:16.800 --> 00:14:19.670 During the pandemic the pandemic

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:19.670 --> 00:14:22.540 highlighted inequalities that pre existed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:22.540 --> 00:14:25.486 the pandemic, the most vivid being

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:25.486 --> 00:14:28.611 the divide between those of us who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:28.611 --> 00:14:31.188 could work from home and those of us  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:31.188 --> 00:14:33.279 who are either lost their jobs or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:33.279 --> 00:14:35.358 who in order to perform their jobs,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:35.360 --> 00:14:37.052 had to expose themselves.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:37.052 --> 00:14:41.274 The risks on behalf of the rest of us.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:41.280 --> 00:14:42.369 But we did.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:42.369 --> 00:14:46.313 I think there was a kind of turning during  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:46.313 --> 00:14:50.225 the pandemic and opportunity and opening.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:50.230 --> 00:14:52.798 Because those of us able to work from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:52.798 --> 00:14:55.720 home couldn't help but notice how deeply  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:14:55.720 --> 00:15:00.165 we depend on workers we often overlook.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:00.170 --> 00:15:03.425 I'm thinking not only of those who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:03.425 --> 00:15:05.939 worked mightily in the hospitals  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:05.939 --> 00:15:08.509 to care for COVID patients,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:08.510 --> 00:15:11.768 I'm thinking also of delivery workers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:11.770 --> 00:15:14.660 warehouse workers, grocery store clerks,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:14.660 --> 00:15:16.812 home health care providers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:16.812 --> 00:15:18.426 child care workers.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:18.430 --> 00:15:21.011 These are not the best. Paid.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:21.011 --> 00:15:25.498 Or most honored workers in our society.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:25.500 --> 00:15:26.536 And yet,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:26.536 --> 00:15:30.162 during the pandemic we began calling them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:30.170 --> 00:15:34.192 Essential workers nobody in the midst

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:34.192 --> 00:15:36.592 of the pandemic was referring to hedge

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:36.592 --> 00:15:39.222 fund managers as essential workers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:39.222 --> 00:15:41.678 so this could be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:41.680 --> 00:15:44.256 The beginning of a broader public debate

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:44.256 --> 00:15:47.450 about how to bring the pay of those

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:47.450 --> 00:15:50.225 who were calling ascential workers.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:50.230 --> 00:15:53.737 The pay and also the socialist scheme.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:53.740 --> 00:15:56.148 Into better alignment with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:56.148 --> 00:15:59.158 the importance of their work.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:15:59.160 --> 00:16:01.640 But there's something else we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:16:01.640 --> 00:16:03.128 need to reconsider.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:16:03.130 --> 00:16:06.794 We need to reconsider the meaning of success.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90584445

00:16:06.800 --> 00:16:10.050 To question our meritocratic hubris.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:12.270 --> 00:16:16.290 Do I really deserve the talents  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:16.290 --> 00:16:18.570 that enable me to flourish?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:18.570 --> 00:16:21.490 In a market driven society such as ours,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:21.490 --> 00:16:25.700 or are my talents gifts?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:25.700 --> 00:16:27.184 For which I'm indebted.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:27.184 --> 00:16:30.126 And what about the fact that I live  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:30.126 --> 00:16:32.373 in a society that happens to prize  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:32.373 --> 00:16:34.910 the talents that I happen to have?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:34.910 --> 00:16:40.918 Is that my doing or is that to my good luck?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:40.920 --> 00:16:45.015 Insisting that my success is my do makes it

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:45.015 --> 00:16:48.988 hard to see myself in other people shoes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:48.990 --> 00:16:52.119 Appreciating the role of luck in life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:52.120 --> 00:16:55.921 Appreciating my talents as gifts for which

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:16:55.921 --> 00:17:00.038 I'm indebted can prompt a certain humility.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:00.040 --> 00:17:02.224 Can prompt me to to say

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:02.224 --> 00:17:04.212 and to think that there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:04.212 --> 00:17:07.620 but for the accident of birth or the

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:07.620 --> 00:17:12.470 grace of God or the mystery of fate go I.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:12.470 --> 00:17:17.870 This civic virtue is of humility.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:17.870 --> 00:17:20.330 Is in short supply these days,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:20.330 --> 00:17:25.214 but it seems to me it could be a potent

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:25.214 --> 00:17:28.424 antidote to the meritocratic hubris.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:28.430 --> 00:17:31.150 The harsh ethic of success

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:31.150 --> 00:17:33.326 that drives us apart.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:33.330 --> 00:17:37.986 Now that in very brief compass.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:37.990 --> 00:17:42.796 Is the main argument of the tyranny of merit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:42.800 --> 00:17:45.749 But it's connected.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:45.750 --> 00:17:49.208 To the theme of the earlier book.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:49.210 --> 00:17:52.490 About genetic engineering for enhancement.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:52.490 --> 00:17:55.030 The case against perfection and

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:55.030 --> 00:17:57.980 it's connected in the following way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:57.980 --> 00:17:58.968 what in?

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:17:58.968 --> 00:18:02.426 In describing the connection I will be?

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:02.430 --> 00:18:05.115 Maybe overly telegraphic because I

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:05.115 --> 00:18:09.032 wanted to see what Mark has to say and

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:09.032 --> 00:18:12.930 Sarah and and to begin the discussion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:12.930 --> 00:18:14.850 But in the case against perfection,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:14.850 --> 00:18:18.240 I argue against the use of

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:18.240 --> 00:18:20.630 genetic engineering for purposes

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:20.630 --> 00:18:23.780 that go beyond medical purposes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:23.780 --> 00:18:28.020 To enhance our cognitive abilities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:28.020 --> 00:18:31.807 for example, or those of our children.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:31.810 --> 00:18:35.170 To prescribe off label uses,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:35.170 --> 00:18:37.676 let's say of human growth hormone for

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:37.676 --> 00:18:40.417 kids who don't suffer any abnormality but

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:40.417 --> 00:18:43.230 who want to make the basketball team,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:43.230 --> 00:18:45.310 let's say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:45.310 --> 00:18:49.698 Performing performance enhancing drugs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:49.700 --> 00:18:52.052 Or for that matter,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:52.052 --> 00:18:54.404 genetic alterations for athletes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:54.410 --> 00:18:58.015 Now there is a vast debate in

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:18:58.015 --> 00:19:00.701 biomedical ethics about the moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:00.701 --> 00:19:03.768 status of genetic engineering for

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:03.768 --> 00:19:07.770 purposes of enhancement beyond health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:07.770 --> 00:19:09.680 And.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:09.680 --> 00:19:15.260 For those of us who are critical of that use.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:15.260 --> 00:19:18.224 It's not easy to explain exactly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:18.224 --> 00:19:21.329 what the moral objection consists in.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:21.330 --> 00:19:24.970 One moral objection has to do with fairness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:24.970 --> 00:19:26.506 In an unequal society,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:26.506 --> 00:19:28.426 wouldn't the affluent be able  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:28.426 --> 00:19:30.945 to gain yet more advantages for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:30.945 --> 00:19:33.005 themselves and for their kids?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:33.010 --> 00:19:34.354 In fact,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:34.354 --> 00:19:38.386 might we even inscribe inequality in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:38.386 --> 00:19:41.734 genetically overtime if the affluent had  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:41.734 --> 00:19:44.239 access to an enhancement technologies?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:44.240 --> 00:19:47.568 That others do not.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:47.570 --> 00:19:50.414 That objection could be met in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:50.414 --> 00:19:53.612 principle by providing a form of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:53.612 --> 00:19:56.028 universal healthcare that included  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:19:56.030 --> 00:20:00.378 access to enhancement technologies.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:00.380 --> 00:20:02.080 In the case against perfection,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:02.080 --> 00:20:04.915 I argue that there is a further.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:04.920 --> 00:20:08.290 Deeper object in this objection

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:08.290 --> 00:20:11.851 has to do with the way in which

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:11.851 --> 00:20:14.806 the disposition the attitude that

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:14.806 --> 00:20:18.420 animates the drive for enhancement.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:18.420 --> 00:20:22.405 Is corrosive of important human

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:22.405 --> 00:20:24.796 and civic goods?

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:24.800 --> 00:20:27.978 And involves a certain kind of hubris,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:27.980 --> 00:20:31.580 and a certain kind of project of mastery.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:31.580 --> 00:20:34.747 And the assumption that ultimately we

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:34.747 --> 00:20:38.089 are self made and self sufficient.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915867885

00:20:38.090 --> 00:20:42.248 Human persons and that this assumption.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:20:42.250 --> 00:20:44.980 That we are self made and self

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:20:44.980 --> 00:20:47.383 sufficient cuts us off from an

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:20:47.383 --> 00:20:49.948 appreciation of the gifted character

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:20:49.950 --> 00:20:53.478 of our talents and of our children.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:20:53.480 --> 00:20:56.730 End of our human circumstance.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:20:56.730 --> 00:20:58.578 Let me explain.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:20:58.578 --> 00:21:02.700 Take the example of parents.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:02.700 --> 00:21:05.094 Who want the best for their kids,

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:05.100 --> 00:21:08.480 including if it were possible?

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:08.480 --> 00:21:10.376 Enhancing their cognitive abilities

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:10.376 --> 00:21:12.746 or their musical ability so

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:12.746 --> 00:21:14.958 they're they're athletic prowess.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:14.960 --> 00:21:16.550 What would be wrong with this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:16.550 --> 00:21:19.808 apart from the worry about fairness

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:19.808 --> 00:21:23.390 and access to such technologies?

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:23.390 --> 00:21:25.305 Argued that it would be

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:25.305 --> 00:21:26.837 corrosive of the notion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924097784166667

00:21:26.840 --> 00:21:29.128 How children as gifts?

NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:31.280 --> 00:21:34.238 This is the ethic of giftedness,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:34.240 --> 00:21:37.180 that is, the counterweight to the image,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:37.180 --> 00:21:40.036 that we are self made and self sufficient.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:40.040 --> 00:21:42.115 It's a counterweight to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:42.115 --> 00:21:44.008 ethic of mastery that informs,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:44.008 --> 00:21:46.600 so it seems to me the project of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:46.678 --> 00:21:49.218 genetic engineering for enhancement.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:49.220 --> 00:21:51.100 Here's what I mean.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:51.100 --> 00:21:54.650 To appreciate children as gifts.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:54.650 --> 00:21:57.686 Is to accept the mistake come?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:21:57.690 --> 00:22:00.238 Not to treat them as objects of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:22:00.238 --> 00:22:02.813 our design or instruments of our  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:22:02.813 --> 00:22:05.615 ambition or products of our will.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:22:05.620 --> 00:22:09.946 Parental love is not contingent on the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667  
00:22:09.946 --> 00:22:13.729 talents and attributes our children have.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:13.730 --> 00:22:16.166 We choose our friends and spouses  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:16.166 --> 00:22:19.282 at least partly on the basis of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:19.282 --> 00:22:21.158 qualities we find attractive.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:21.160 --> 00:22:23.995 But we do not choose our children.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:24.000 --> 00:22:27.295 Their qualities are unpredictable and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:27.295 --> 00:22:30.590 even the most conscientious parents.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:30.590 --> 00:22:33.240 Can't be held wholly responsible  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:33.240 --> 00:22:36.970 for the kind of child they have.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:36.970 --> 00:22:39.262 This is why parenthood,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:39.262 --> 00:22:42.127 more than other human relationships,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:42.130 --> 00:22:43.382 teaches it,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:43.382 --> 00:22:47.138 teaches what the theologian William May.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.748626126666667

00:22:47.140 --> 00:22:51.268 Calls and openness to the Unbidden.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667

00:22:53.690 --> 00:22:55.988 This is a potent resonant phrase  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667

00:22:55.988 --> 00:22:58.409 and openness to the end didn't.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667

00:22:58.410 --> 00:23:01.272 It describes a quality of character

NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:01.272 --> 00:23:03.832 and heart that restrains the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:03.832 --> 00:23:06.637 impulse to mastery and control.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:06.640 --> 00:23:10.510 It prompts the sense of life as a gift.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:10.510 --> 00:23:13.390 It helps us see.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:13.390 --> 00:23:17.158 The deepest moral objection.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:17.160 --> 00:23:20.780 To genetic engineering for enhancement  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:20.780 --> 00:23:24.616 lies not in the perfection it seeks,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:24.620 --> 00:23:26.340 but in the human disposition,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.743750236666667  
00:23:26.340 --> 00:23:28.208 it expresses and promotes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:23:30.820 --> 00:23:33.250 The problem isn't that parents  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:23:33.250 --> 00:23:36.270 usurped the autonomy of the child.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:23:36.270 --> 00:23:38.916 It's not as if the child  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:23:38.916 --> 00:23:40.239 could otherwise choose.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:23:40.240 --> 00:23:43.610 Her genetic traits for herself.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:23:43.610 --> 00:23:46.703 The problem lies in the hubris of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:23:46.703 --> 00:23:49.901 the designing parents in their drive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:23:49.901 --> 00:23:53.310 to master the mystery of birth.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:23:53.310 --> 00:23:56.352 Even if this disposition doesn't make  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:23:56.352 --> 00:23:59.200 parents tyrants to their children.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:23:59.200 --> 00:24:00.944 It disfigures the relation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:00.944 --> 00:24:02.688 between parent and child.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:02.690 --> 00:24:06.407 It deprives the parent of the humility.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:06.410 --> 00:24:10.136 And of the enlarged human sympathies.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:10.140 --> 00:24:12.940 That and openness to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:12.940 --> 00:24:16.470 Unbidden can cultivate.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:16.470 --> 00:24:19.554 Now to appreciate children  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:19.554 --> 00:24:22.638 as gifts or blessings.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:22.640 --> 00:24:25.316 Not to be passive in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:25.316 --> 00:24:28.040 face of illness or disease.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:28.040 --> 00:24:32.193 Healing a sick or injured child does  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:24:32.193 --> 00:24:35.458 not override her natural capacities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:35.460 --> 00:24:39.140 It permits them to flourish.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:39.140 --> 00:24:42.408 So although medical treatment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:42.408 --> 00:24:44.859 intervenes in nature.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:44.860 --> 00:24:48.100 It does so for the sake of health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:48.100 --> 00:24:52.300 And so does not represent a boundless  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:52.300 --> 00:24:55.689 bid for mastery and Dominion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:55.690 --> 00:24:59.092 Even strenuous attempts to cure or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:24:59.092 --> 00:25:01.670 treat disease do not constitute  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:25:01.670 --> 00:25:05.046 a kind of Promethean assault.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:25:05.046 --> 00:25:07.950 I'm the given.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:25:07.950 --> 00:25:10.060 The reason?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:25:10.060 --> 00:25:13.105 The reason is that medicine is governed,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:25:13.110 --> 00:25:14.874 or at least guided.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:25:14.874 --> 00:25:17.520 By the norm of restoring and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454  
00:25:17.613 --> 00:25:20.461 preserving the natural human  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870506044545454

00:25:20.461 --> 00:25:23.309 functions that constitute health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.943804871

00:25:25.330 --> 00:25:27.290 Another way of putting this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.943804871

00:25:27.290 --> 00:25:29.250 is to say that medicine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.943804871

00:25:29.250 --> 00:25:32.388 Is a practice with a purpose.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.943804871

00:25:32.390 --> 00:25:36.835 Ority loss that orients and constrains it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:39.550 --> 00:25:42.140 Of course, what counts as good health?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:42.140 --> 00:25:44.700 Or natural human functioning  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:44.700 --> 00:25:47.260 is open to argument.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:47.260 --> 00:25:50.926 It's not only a biological question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:50.930 --> 00:25:53.434 People disagree, for example.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:53.434 --> 00:25:55.938 About whether deafness is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:55.938 --> 00:25:58.389 a disability to be cured.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:25:58.390 --> 00:26:01.282 Or a form of identity and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:01.282 --> 00:26:03.210 community to be cherished.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:03.210 --> 00:26:05.210 But even disagreements such as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:05.210 --> 00:26:07.210 these proceed from the assumption

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:07.273 --> 00:26:08.958 that the point of medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:08.960 --> 00:26:12.684 Is to promote health and to cure.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:12.690 --> 00:26:14.800 Disease.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:14.800 --> 00:26:17.446 Now, some people argue that a

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:17.446 --> 00:26:19.725 parents obligation to heal a

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:19.725 --> 00:26:21.890 sick child implies an obligation

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:21.890 --> 00:26:24.020 to enhance a healthy one.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:24.020 --> 00:26:25.140 To make them better than,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:25.140 --> 00:26:27.735 well to maximize the child's

NOTE Confidence: 0.84339903

00:26:27.735 --> 00:26:30.330 potential for success in life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95125258

00:26:32.410 --> 00:26:35.130 But this is true only.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95125258

00:26:35.130 --> 00:26:39.066 If one accepts the utilitarian idea.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95125258

00:26:39.070 --> 00:26:43.014 That health is not a distinctive human good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95125258

00:26:43.020 --> 00:26:46.478 It's simply 1 means, among others of

NOTE Confidence: 0.95125258

00:26:46.478 --> 00:26:48.950 maximizing happiness or well being.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8261758183333333

00:26:52.640 --> 00:26:55.384 One utilitarian bioethicist argues,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8261758183333333

00:26:55.384 --> 00:26:58.098 for example, that health is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8261758183333333

00:26:58.098 --> 00:26:59.436 not intrinsically valuable,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8261758183333333

00:26:59.440 --> 00:27:00.973 only instrumentally valuable,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8261758183333333

00:27:00.973 --> 00:27:05.729 a resource that allows us to do what we want.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:08.110 --> 00:27:10.040 This way of thinking about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:10.040 --> 00:27:12.566 health rejects the distinction  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:12.566 --> 00:27:14.802 between healing and enhancing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:14.802 --> 00:27:17.238 It leads to the view that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:17.238 --> 00:27:19.884 parents have not only a duty to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:19.884 --> 00:27:21.524 promote their Children's Health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:21.524 --> 00:27:24.793 That they may be morally obligated to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:24.793 --> 00:27:26.849 genetically modify their children,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9566843816666667

00:27:26.850 --> 00:27:28.656 provided it can be done safely.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:31.040 --> 00:27:33.680 But it's a mistake to think of health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:33.680 --> 00:27:38.408 in wholly instrumental terms as a way of

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:38.408 --> 00:27:42.080 maximizing something else good health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:42.080 --> 00:27:46.586 Like good character is a constitutive

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:46.586 --> 00:27:49.590 element of human flourishing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:49.590 --> 00:27:53.046 And although more health is better than less,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:53.050 --> 00:27:55.906 at least within a certain range,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:55.910 --> 00:27:59.179 health is not the kind of good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:27:59.180 --> 00:28:02.668 That can be maximized.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:28:02.670 --> 00:28:06.558 Nobody aspires to be a virtuoso at health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93379676

00:28:06.560 --> 00:28:09.659 Except perhaps hypochondriac.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:12.200 --> 00:28:15.995 During the 1920s, eugenicists held

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:15.995 --> 00:28:19.790 health contests at state fairs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:19.790 --> 00:28:23.500 They awarded prizes to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:23.500 --> 00:28:25.726 so-called fittest families.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:25.730 --> 00:28:28.620 But this bizarre practice illustrates

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:28.620 --> 00:28:31.510 the folly of conceiving health

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:31.599 --> 00:28:34.648 as something to be maximized in,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:34.648 --> 00:28:37.988 and, in purely instrumental terms.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:37.990 --> 00:28:40.042 Unlike the talents and traits that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:40.042 --> 00:28:42.770 bring success in a competitive society,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:42.770 --> 00:28:46.430 health is a bounded good.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:46.430 --> 00:28:49.909 Parents can seek it for their children  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:49.910 --> 00:28:53.492 without the risk of being drawn  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:53.492 --> 00:28:58.620 into an ever escalating arms race.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:28:58.620 --> 00:29:02.484 So how does this connect up with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:02.484 --> 00:29:05.530 my argument against meritocracy?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:05.530 --> 00:29:08.350 The flaw, the moral defect in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:08.350 --> 00:29:10.300 both and unbridled,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:10.300 --> 00:29:12.296 unbridled meritocratic competition that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:12.296 --> 00:29:15.290 persuades at the successful their success,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:15.290 --> 00:29:19.349 is their own doing and the big from Mastery  
NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:19.349 --> 00:29:23.346 and Dominion reflected in the drive for.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:23.350 --> 00:29:26.778 Genetic engineering to enhance.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:26.780 --> 00:29:30.690 Human capacities what they share.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:30.690 --> 00:29:32.850 Is the idea?

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:32.850 --> 00:29:35.730 That ideally at least.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:35.730 --> 00:29:38.436 We are to be fully free.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:38.440 --> 00:29:41.180 We must think of ourselves.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:41.180 --> 00:29:43.920 As self made and self

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:43.920 --> 00:29:47.560 sufficient moral agents.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:47.560 --> 00:29:49.240 And.

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:49.240 --> 00:29:50.952 But this misses something

NOTE Confidence: 0.885659723

00:29:50.952 --> 00:29:52.664 important about our humanity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9073729

00:29:54.720 --> 00:30:00.188 The problem. What it misses rather.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9073729

00:30:00.190 --> 00:30:04.075 Is an appreciation of the gifted character.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:06.530 --> 00:30:09.470 Of human powers and achievements.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:09.470 --> 00:30:12.355 To acknowledge the giftedness of

NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:12.355 --> 00:30:15.626 our talents is to recognize that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:15.626 --> 00:30:19.580 they are not wholly our own doing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:19.580 --> 00:30:21.648 Nor even fully ours,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:21.648 --> 00:30:24.750 despite the efforts we expend to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:24.850 --> 00:30:27.680 develop and to exercise them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:27.680 --> 00:30:30.632 It's also to recognize that not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:30.632 --> 00:30:34.229 everything in the world is open to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:34.229 --> 00:30:38.567 any use we may desire or devise an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:38.567 --> 00:30:41.252 appreciation of the giftedness of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:41.252 --> 00:30:45.250 life conduces to a certain humility.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:45.250 --> 00:30:48.550 And this humility, should I think,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:48.550 --> 00:30:51.748 lead us to question the harsh  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:51.748 --> 00:30:53.347 ethic of success.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:53.350 --> 00:30:57.370 That arises in a competitive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:30:57.370 --> 00:31:00.417 meritocratic society, such as ours,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:31:00.417 --> 00:31:02.333 that persuades the successful

NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:02.333 --> 00:31:04.910 they've done it on their own,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:04.910 --> 00:31:07.678 just as it should lead us to question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:07.680 --> 00:31:09.730 The drive.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:09.730 --> 00:31:12.590 To employ genetic engineering  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:12.590 --> 00:31:16.986 to go beyond health to enhance.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:16.986 --> 00:31:20.058 Our capacities, our talents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:20.060 --> 00:31:22.610 or those of our children?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:22.610 --> 00:31:24.110 That it seems to me,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:24.110 --> 00:31:27.254 is the common thread between the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:27.254 --> 00:31:30.279 case against the tyranny of merit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:30.280 --> 00:31:32.600 And the case against perfection  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:32.600 --> 00:31:36.944 understood is the drive to engineer  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:36.944 --> 00:31:42.356 our way to greater cognitive and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:42.356 --> 00:31:45.744 other capacities than health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926  
00:31:45.744 --> 00:31:48.120 itself would require.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.812945926

00:31:48.120 --> 00:31:50.040 Mark what do you think?

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:31:52.950 --> 00:31:54.790 Oh, this, this ought to be a piece of cake.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:31:54.790 --> 00:31:56.110 Michael, this is no problem.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:31:56.110 --> 00:31:57.489 I I should have seen this coming,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:31:57.490 --> 00:31:59.182 which is each time I thought wait a

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:31:59.182 --> 00:32:00.670 minute I can I can have something to

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:00.670 --> 00:32:02.302 say about that and then three sentences

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:02.302 --> 00:32:04.150 later you actually anticipated my

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:04.150 --> 00:32:06.550 concern and addressed it beautifully.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:06.550 --> 00:32:07.957 So I have a couple comments that

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:07.957 --> 00:32:09.548 that I can make and open it up.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:09.550 --> 00:32:11.647 But I I, I think what you say is

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:11.647 --> 00:32:13.000 extremely insightful and I don't

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:13.000 --> 00:32:15.210 take issue with any of it obviously.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:15.210 --> 00:32:16.426 I mean it's not my place to take

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:16.426 --> 00:32:17.690 issue with it, but a couple of points.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:17.690 --> 00:32:19.571 I read a really good book recently which I

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:19.571 --> 00:32:21.077 recommend everybody says book here it is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:21.080 --> 00:32:23.246 Here is the case against perfection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:23.250 --> 00:32:24.685 By Michael Sandel. So I read this

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:24.685 --> 00:32:25.739 and what's interesting about this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:25.740 --> 00:32:27.430 This is your penultimate book.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:27.430 --> 00:32:29.425 Yes this was not penultimate but not

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:29.425 --> 00:32:31.102 the most recent. Of course come.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:31.102 --> 00:32:33.849 But but in this I can see the seeds

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:33.849 --> 00:32:35.754 of the tyranny of meritocracy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:35.760 --> 00:32:37.922 Yes, in which you wrote here and

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:37.922 --> 00:32:39.431 in particular one of the things

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:39.431 --> 00:32:41.125 that many things comma but one of

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:41.125 --> 00:32:42.988 the things that didn't request you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:42.990 --> 00:32:44.684 touched on it tonight was about gift

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:44.684 --> 00:32:46.902 in this and I think that's such a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:46.902 --> 00:32:48.940 beautiful concept. And I absolutely agree.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:48.940 --> 00:32:51.256 I think that to paraphrase you that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:51.256 --> 00:32:53.080 our natural talents are the result  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:53.136 --> 00:32:53.988 of good fortune.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:53.990 --> 00:32:56.030 The genetic lottery and it's therefore  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:56.030 --> 00:32:58.060 a conceit to think we're entitled  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:32:58.060 --> 00:33:00.188 to the full measure of bounty as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:00.188 --> 00:33:01.746 you put it on that stem.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:01.750 --> 00:33:02.941 From these talents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:02.941 --> 00:33:05.323 there's an obligation to share with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:05.323 --> 00:33:07.479 those who lack comparable gifts.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:07.480 --> 00:33:08.488 I quite agree, and this is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:08.490 --> 00:33:11.270 I mean this to me was reminiscent of of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:11.270 --> 00:33:14.110 a Bible verse I learned as a as a young man,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:14.110 --> 00:33:16.387 which was those to whom much has been given.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:16.390 --> 00:33:20.295 Much will be expected that that the idea of

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:20.295 --> 00:33:22.488 sharing this and the idea of gifted this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:22.490 --> 00:33:23.159 though to me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:23.159 --> 00:33:23.828 had its limits,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:23.830 --> 00:33:25.258 which I'll get to in a second.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:25.260 --> 00:33:27.660 And I think it has to do with with the

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:27.729 --> 00:33:30.006 role of parents in all of this and in

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:30.006 --> 00:33:32.540 in the in the talk that you gave here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:32.540 --> 00:33:34.676 So to some extent I wonder if this

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:34.676 --> 00:33:36.744 doesn't come down to the common good

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:36.744 --> 00:33:38.647 because everything you say I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:38.647 --> 00:33:40.837 speaks beautifully for the common good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:40.840 --> 00:33:41.455 And it speaks,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:41.455 --> 00:33:42.890 I think of a of a largely

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:42.950 --> 00:33:43.980 communitarian ethic.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:43.980 --> 00:33:45.960 Let's take a look at how to build a world,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:45.960 --> 00:33:48.392 how to build a society that's really going  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:48.392 --> 00:33:51.025 to be the best for all of us overall.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:51.030 --> 00:33:53.886 And and I think that that that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:53.890 --> 00:33:55.036 makes perfect sense,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:55.036 --> 00:33:58.350 but as a physician and as a parent,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:58.350 --> 00:33:59.785 one could look at things and say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:33:59.790 --> 00:34:00.358 well, really,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:34:00.358 --> 00:34:02.630 my obligation isn't to make a better world.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:34:02.630 --> 00:34:04.070 I realize that if I make the world  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:34:04.070 --> 00:34:05.329 this much better for everybody,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:34:05.330 --> 00:34:06.710 that's good for my kids too.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:34:06.710 --> 00:34:08.790 But if I can make it this much  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89172307

00:34:08.790 --> 00:34:09.889 better for my kids,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:09.890 --> 00:34:13.859 and there is, I think perhaps that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:13.860 --> 00:34:16.350 That tension between our obligations

NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:16.350 --> 00:34:19.520 to society overall to mankind overall,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:19.520 --> 00:34:21.230 and our obligations to our  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:21.230 --> 00:34:22.940 individual kids and as physicians,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:22.940 --> 00:34:27.570 our obligations to our individual.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:27.570 --> 00:34:29.010 Patience, I would say that that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:29.010 --> 00:34:30.976 one of the points you made which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:30.976 --> 00:34:32.240 I just raised parenthetically,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:32.240 --> 00:34:34.058 I thought was right on the money was the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:34.058 --> 00:34:35.682 idea of essential workers and all of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:35.682 --> 00:34:37.599 a sudden people had to say well who's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:37.599 --> 00:34:39.210 really essential here and who ain't now.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:39.210 --> 00:34:40.470 In fairness, a lot of people who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:40.470 --> 00:34:41.909 were home working on their computers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:41.910 --> 00:34:43.506 They were essential to for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:34:43.506 --> 00:34:44.570 functioning of our society.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:44.570 --> 00:34:47.190 No doubt. Nevertheless, I mean,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:47.190 --> 00:34:49.382 it's the hope that this opens the window  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:49.382 --> 00:34:51.417 to better pay and better dignity for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:51.417 --> 00:34:53.533 people who do things that aren't as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:53.533 --> 00:34:55.423 honored in our culture in worldwide,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:55.430 --> 00:34:56.938 and so that that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:56.938 --> 00:34:58.446 Looking at I mean,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:34:58.450 --> 00:35:00.730 this pandemic has been very much a game  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:00.730 --> 00:35:02.900 changer in so many ways for all of us,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:02.900 --> 00:35:04.637 and so part of what we spend a lot  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:04.637 --> 00:35:06.541 of time wondering is how is the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:06.541 --> 00:35:08.623 world gonna stay changed even as we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:08.623 --> 00:35:10.153 eventually get through the pandemic?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:10.160 --> 00:35:12.015 How are things going to stay changed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:12.015 --> 00:35:13.709 and one can hope that that's one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143

00:35:13.709 --> 00:35:15.368 way as as a a new appreciation

NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:15.368 --> 00:35:17.125 for the people who who,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:17.125 --> 00:35:19.820 who as you say deliver the packages.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:19.820 --> 00:35:22.556 The people who stopped to grocery store etc.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:22.560 --> 00:35:23.946 People whom for whom we absolutely  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:23.946 --> 00:35:25.381 depend on and people who had  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:25.381 --> 00:35:26.536 to put themselves at increased  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:26.536 --> 00:35:27.908 risk compared to so many others.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.955448492857143  
00:35:27.910 --> 00:35:29.254 In order to keep the wheels turning.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032  
00:35:31.310 --> 00:35:33.975 But getting back to my concern about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032  
00:35:33.975 --> 00:35:35.588 the parents view, the individualistic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032  
00:35:35.588 --> 00:35:37.758 view versus the communitarian view,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032  
00:35:37.760 --> 00:35:40.394 which is that I think that what parents  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032  
00:35:40.394 --> 00:35:43.040 want when we look at the idea of giftedness,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032  
00:35:43.040 --> 00:35:45.058 and I think with parents may  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032  
00:35:45.060 --> 00:35:48.356 want and it maybe is not so much  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:35:48.360 --> 00:35:50.400 to accept them as they are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:35:50.400 --> 00:35:52.129 Of course I think that parents should

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:35:52.129 --> 00:35:53.418 accept their children as they are,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:35:53.420 --> 00:35:55.850 but I think that there's also a what we

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:35:55.850 --> 00:35:58.215 really want is to maximize any parent wants

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:35:58.215 --> 00:36:00.045 us to maximize their child's happiness.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:00.050 --> 00:36:01.466 In the long run, in the short run,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:01.470 --> 00:36:05.630 but most especially in the long run so.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:05.630 --> 00:36:07.050 And openness to the Unbidden,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:07.050 --> 00:36:08.690 as you quote Bill may,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:08.690 --> 00:36:10.640 and saying is perhaps countered

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:10.640 --> 00:36:14.294 by an eagerness to optimize and to

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:14.294 --> 00:36:16.219 optimize specifically our children's

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:16.219 --> 00:36:17.086 lives as individuals,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:17.086 --> 00:36:19.550 and how there might be some tension there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:19.550 --> 00:36:19.938 which is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:19.938 --> 00:36:21.490 if I can use some of this specifically,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:21.490 --> 00:36:23.680 the genetic engineering or other things,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:23.680 --> 00:36:26.320 if I can capitalize on these

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:26.320 --> 00:36:28.080 things for my child.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:28.080 --> 00:36:30.462 Do I have as a parent some kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:30.462 --> 00:36:32.688 of obligation to my child over

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:32.688 --> 00:36:35.194 and above the obligations I have

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:35.194 --> 00:36:37.299 to the Community to society?

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:37.300 --> 00:36:38.794 And I think the short answer

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:38.794 --> 00:36:40.200 that for many people is yes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:40.200 --> 00:36:41.784 I have a greater obligation to

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:41.784 --> 00:36:44.019 my kid and I have to the world.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:44.020 --> 00:36:45.718 And if that's so, then again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:45.720 --> 00:36:48.276 that openness to the unbidden may

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:48.276 --> 00:36:50.583 be tempered by countered by an

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:50.583 --> 00:36:52.498 eagerness to optimize their lives,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:52.500 --> 00:36:53.700 and specifically what parents

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:53.700 --> 00:36:54.900 want for their kids.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:54.900 --> 00:36:56.500 I think, is that happiness,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:56.500 --> 00:36:58.220 and sometimes that equates

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:58.220 --> 00:36:59.510 to financial wealth.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:36:59.510 --> 00:37:00.722 Sometimes that equates to all sorts

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:00.722 --> 00:37:02.158 of things, but ultimately for some,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:02.158 --> 00:37:03.186 if they say well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:03.190 --> 00:37:04.415 I think that my child has a

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:04.415 --> 00:37:05.430 good shot at happiness.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:05.430 --> 00:37:07.425 If he's 5 foot 7 inches tall,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:07.430 --> 00:37:09.398 but he has a better shot of happiness

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:09.398 --> 00:37:11.060 if he's 6 feet tall, I'm so.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:11.060 --> 00:37:11.510 Then then,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:11.510 --> 00:37:13.818 if I have the means to give him to

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:13.818 --> 00:37:15.323 optimize his happiness that way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:15.330 --> 00:37:17.418 and my somehow obligated to him,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:17.420 --> 00:37:19.548 even though if we all thought that way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:19.550 --> 00:37:21.250 it would be less good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:21.250 --> 00:37:23.010 I mean, there this requires,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:23.010 --> 00:37:23.930 I guess what I'm saying,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:23.930 --> 00:37:26.054 I think is what you're recommending

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:26.054 --> 00:37:27.470 rings true to me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:27.470 --> 00:37:29.198 but I think it may run counter to the.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:29.200 --> 00:37:30.820 Instincts of many individuals,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:30.820 --> 00:37:32.845 specifically with regard to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:32.845 --> 00:37:34.725 obligation of parents and even the

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:34.725 --> 00:37:36.642 regard to the obligation of physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:36.642 --> 00:37:38.418 to their individual patients.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:38.420 --> 00:37:40.240 So I'm I'm with you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:40.240 --> 00:37:41.983 With that one caveat that I think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:41.983 --> 00:37:43.498 that tension is going to exist  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:43.500 --> 00:37:44.884 for those two groups.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:44.884 --> 00:37:46.960 Parents and and health care providers  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:47.019 --> 00:37:48.719 who looked at the individual.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:48.720 --> 00:37:49.800 I thank you so much.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:49.800 --> 00:37:51.632 This was an absolute Tour de force and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:51.632 --> 00:37:53.428 I I will tell you that, truthfully,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:53.428 --> 00:37:54.537 I'm writing things down, saying,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:54.537 --> 00:37:55.636 well, I've got an answer for that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:55.640 --> 00:37:57.278 And then you gave me the answer for that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:37:57.280 --> 00:38:00.285 So this was a real exercise for me.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:38:00.290 --> 00:38:02.122 I appreciate the chance to speak and I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:38:02.122 --> 00:38:04.128 want to turn it over to our moderator,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:38:04.130 --> 00:38:05.219 Sarah and Sarah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080032

00:38:05.219 --> 00:38:07.760 Why don't you take us from here?

NOTE Confidence: 0.536664

00:38:07.760 --> 00:38:09.465 Great, well thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.536664

00:38:09.465 --> 00:38:12.850 Thank you so much to both of you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:12.850 --> 00:38:14.884 Not that there were, really, I I.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:14.884 --> 00:38:16.892 I would just echo that there were so many

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:16.892 --> 00:38:18.704 points that really resonated with me.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:18.710 --> 00:38:22.526 But before we open it up, I I just I.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:22.526 --> 00:38:24.590 I think it's it's very noteworthy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:24.590 --> 00:38:25.990 What would particularly resonated

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:25.990 --> 00:38:28.376 with me was your comment that not

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:28.376 --> 00:38:30.378 everything in the world is is open

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:30.378 --> 00:38:32.768 to use and and when I think about

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:32.768 --> 00:38:35.188 using in this sense I I'm really

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:35.188 --> 00:38:37.552 thinking about the concept of almost

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:37.552 --> 00:38:39.800 exploitation and the reason I will

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:39.800 --> 00:38:42.048 say that this is particularly salient

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:42.048 --> 00:38:44.624 to me is I I just returned from.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:44.630 --> 00:38:46.802 A really life changing trip in

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:46.802 --> 00:38:51.980 Antarctica a few days ago and it was.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:51.980 --> 00:38:55.013 It it was a time of a lot of

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:55.013 --> 00:38:57.000 reassessment of of my privilege,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:57.000 --> 00:38:59.718 and also of my my responsibilities

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:38:59.718 --> 00:39:01.530 of of environmental stewardship

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:01.606 --> 00:39:04.181 and planetary stewardship and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:04.181 --> 00:39:06.241 particularly how that's commensurate

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:06.241 --> 00:39:08.370 with with the excessive amount of

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:08.370 --> 00:39:10.350 privilege I have with respect to

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:10.350 --> 00:39:12.396 the average human on the planet.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:12.400 --> 00:39:15.921 And I, I think that you know that

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:15.921 --> 00:39:17.373 that really dovetails nicely with

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:17.373 --> 00:39:20.336 this with the concept of of having

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:20.340 --> 00:39:23.020 some degree of of humility.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:23.020 --> 00:39:25.879 And you know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:25.880 --> 00:39:27.472 Providing a really important

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:27.472 --> 00:39:32.120 balance to this sort of very human.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:32.120 --> 00:39:34.844 Instinct to sort of conquer and

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:34.844 --> 00:39:37.150 dominate and exploit you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:37.150 --> 00:39:39.495 every time we find a natural resource,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:39.500 --> 00:39:40.468 we think about how.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:40.468 --> 00:39:41.678 How can we exploit this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:41.680 --> 00:39:43.180 To make money,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:43.180 --> 00:39:45.680 you know whether that's drilling

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:45.680 --> 00:39:48.661 for oil or wailing or cutting down

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:48.661 --> 00:39:51.020 forests so that we can so that we

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:51.020 --> 00:39:53.015 can herd beef so that we can sell

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:53.015 --> 00:39:55.039 it to people who want to eat it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:55.040 --> 00:39:56.252 And you know it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:56.252 --> 00:39:59.402 it it really we we have not been good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:39:59.402 --> 00:40:01.976 stewards of of the planet and I think.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:01.980 --> 00:40:04.260 You know that that actually dovetails  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:04.260 --> 00:40:07.116 with this idea of the idea of giftedness,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:07.116 --> 00:40:09.939 in that I think that that you can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:09.939 --> 00:40:12.564 almost frame the the idea the the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:12.564 --> 00:40:14.029 counterweight to meritocracy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:14.030 --> 00:40:17.207 as almost a sort of stewardship of 1's gifts,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:17.210 --> 00:40:19.250 meaning that rather than thinking well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:19.250 --> 00:40:22.050 you know I I'm gifted or you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:22.050 --> 00:40:24.710 I'm I'm smart, I'm hardworking,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:24.710 --> 00:40:26.334 all of my success is my own doing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:26.334 --> 00:40:27.989 and I therefore I deserve it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:27.990 --> 00:40:29.490 But rather thinking well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:29.490 --> 00:40:31.740 you know I've I've been born  
NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:31.811 --> 00:40:33.200 into this privilege.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:33.200 --> 00:40:35.800 Where you know I had all of these

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:35.800 --> 00:40:38.050 advantage given advantages given to me?

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:38.050 --> 00:40:41.083 What are my duties to give back to really

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:41.083 --> 00:40:44.217 serve as the best possible steward of these,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:44.220 --> 00:40:45.668 the the natural lottery,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:45.668 --> 00:40:47.840 these genetic resources or these societal

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:47.899 --> 00:40:49.927 resources that were bestowed upon me?

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:49.930 --> 00:40:51.799 And so I think there's a common

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:51.799 --> 00:40:53.820 thread of this idea of stewardship.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:53.820 --> 00:40:55.644 The the one other thing that I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:55.644 --> 00:40:57.767 is also really particularly salient is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:57.770 --> 00:40:58.466 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:40:58.466 --> 00:41:00.554 in our very hyper polarized world.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:41:00.560 --> 00:41:02.030 I think it's important when we,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:41:02.030 --> 00:41:03.566 when we push back against certain.

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:41:03.570 --> 00:41:05.950 Instincts to make sure that we're framing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:41:05.950 --> 00:41:07.770 not just in a way that appeals

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:41:07.770 --> 00:41:09.310 to like minded individuals,

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:41:09.310 --> 00:41:11.812 but also framing in a way that those who

NOTE Confidence: 0.621896254

00:41:11.812 --> 00:41:13.678 disagree with us can understand.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:13.680 --> 00:41:15.510 And I think stewardship helps with

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:15.510 --> 00:41:17.490 that as well because I think a lot

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:17.490 --> 00:41:19.259 of times sort of a more conservative

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:19.259 --> 00:41:21.163 rebuttal to this idea of, well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:21.163 --> 00:41:23.620 you know we should be cognizant of the the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:23.685 --> 00:41:25.904 role that luck and the genetic lottery.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:25.910 --> 00:41:27.840 And you know, unfair societal

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:27.840 --> 00:41:29.770 privilege plays in our success.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:29.770 --> 00:41:31.919 That's not to deny that that hard

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:31.919 --> 00:41:33.580 work isn't essential for success.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:33.580 --> 00:41:35.477 In most cases, hard work is necessary,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:35.480 --> 00:41:38.280 it's just it's simply not sufficient for

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:38.280 --> 00:41:40.436 most people and and sort of reframing

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:40.436 --> 00:41:42.564 that in a way where we do acknowledge

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:42.564 --> 00:41:44.478 the important role of hard work,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:44.480 --> 00:41:46.808 but but acknowledge it in a way that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:46.808 --> 00:41:49.210 that we should feel grateful for our

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:49.210 --> 00:41:52.007 ability to work hard and and see that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:52.007 --> 00:41:54.275 as something where we're proud of it

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:54.280 --> 00:41:57.540 and we want to give back to share in our

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:41:57.624 --> 00:42:00.557 bounty rather than to sort of hoard,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:00.560 --> 00:42:02.632 I think is a way that maybe we

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:02.632 --> 00:42:04.259 could bring some more people.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:04.260 --> 00:42:05.790 Into that umbrella because I I

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:05.790 --> 00:42:07.846 think that it's it's so common we

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:07.846 --> 00:42:09.476 hear divisive language and people

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:09.476 --> 00:42:10.580 just automatically bristle.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:10.580 --> 00:42:11.730 It's like, oh, you can't.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:11.730 --> 00:42:12.942 You can't talk about the role  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:12.942 --> 00:42:14.530 of luck or the genetic lottery,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:14.530 --> 00:42:16.315 because then you're saying hard  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:16.315 --> 00:42:17.386 work isn't important.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:17.390 --> 00:42:18.657 And I think no one saying that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:18.660 --> 00:42:20.586 But it's really important that we're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:20.586 --> 00:42:22.655 cognizant of of our framing when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:22.655 --> 00:42:24.460 when trying to convince others.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:24.460 --> 00:42:26.148 And obviously I know you're aware of that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:26.150 --> 00:42:28.478 But anyway, that came up.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:28.478 --> 00:42:30.624 So I I am going to take the liberty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:30.624 --> 00:42:32.328 of asking the first question before  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:32.328 --> 00:42:34.119 we launch into into moderating.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:34.120 --> 00:42:36.736 Which is to specifically when you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:36.736 --> 00:42:38.910 mentioned about the importance of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:38.910 --> 00:42:41.437 renewing the dignity of work and sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:41.437 --> 00:42:43.657 of centering this in our politics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:43.660 --> 00:42:45.658 I was wondering if you could speak in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:45.658 --> 00:42:47.580 little bit more detail on a policy level,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:47.580 --> 00:42:50.020 how you envision doing this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:50.020 --> 00:42:51.885 Obviously it's going to be

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:51.885 --> 00:42:53.004 probably related to,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:53.010 --> 00:42:53.576 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:53.576 --> 00:42:55.840 changing the way that that payments are made,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:55.840 --> 00:42:57.180 or perhaps a tax code,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:57.180 --> 00:42:58.980 but I'd love to hear sort of more

NOTE Confidence: 0.9433349

00:42:58.980 --> 00:43:00.869 of your specific thoughts in that

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:00.880 --> 00:43:03.823 day. Well, thank you thanks to both of you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:03.830 --> 00:43:09.660 To Mark and Sarah for these generous and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:09.660 --> 00:43:12.968 also illuminating reflections and adjust  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:12.968 --> 00:43:15.760 if before getting to the dignity of work,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:15.760 --> 00:43:18.640 Sarah, if I could just.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:18.640 --> 00:43:20.800 Say about your notion of stewardship,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:20.800 --> 00:43:23.120 I think this contrast.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:23.120 --> 00:43:26.296 Is very important and it's it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:26.296 --> 00:43:27.400 a way of construing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:27.400 --> 00:43:29.335 What I've described is the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:29.335 --> 00:43:30.496 ethic of giftedness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:30.500 --> 00:43:33.988 To treat our talents.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:33.990 --> 00:43:35.840 To regard ourselves not as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:35.840 --> 00:43:37.690 the owners of our talents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:37.690 --> 00:43:41.266 but rather as the stewards of our talents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:41.270 --> 00:43:43.825 which not only implies that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:43.825 --> 00:43:45.869 they aren't fully only.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:43:45.870 --> 00:43:47.506 Exclusively ours.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:43:47.506 --> 00:43:50.764 But the the fruits of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:43:50.764 --> 00:43:53.850 exercise of our talents, Sarah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:43:53.850 --> 00:43:56.097 We have an obligation to share the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:43:56.097 --> 00:43:58.670 fruits of the exercise of our talent,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:43:58.670 --> 00:44:01.106 but also that there are there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:01.106 --> 00:44:03.786 are certain duties that go along  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:03.786 --> 00:44:05.730 with regard with stewardship.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:05.730 --> 00:44:07.368 And in the case of talents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:07.370 --> 00:44:09.449 it would be the the duty to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:09.449 --> 00:44:10.994 cultivate our talents and to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:10.994 --> 00:44:12.764 deploy them for the common good,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:12.770 --> 00:44:15.430 not only for our own.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:15.430 --> 00:44:16.330 Individual benefit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:16.330 --> 00:44:19.930 And I think you're right to extend this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667  
00:44:20.011 --> 00:44:23.307 to the whole way of thinking about the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:23.307 --> 00:44:26.310 environment and climate change to treat.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:26.310 --> 00:44:28.885 The natural world that we

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:28.885 --> 00:44:31.429 inhabit and that we share,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:31.430 --> 00:44:35.210 not from the standpoint of ownership or

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:35.210 --> 00:44:38.937 mastery or dominion or use unfettered use,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:38.940 --> 00:44:41.992 but from the from an ethic of

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:41.992 --> 00:44:44.544 stewardship that also carries with

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:44.544 --> 00:44:47.419 it certain duties and obligations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:47.420 --> 00:44:51.284 So I think that's a really important

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:51.284 --> 00:44:53.960 elaboration of what I was describing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:53.960 --> 00:44:55.950 Is the ethic of giftedness

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:55.950 --> 00:44:57.542 As for the dignity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758052136666667

00:44:57.550 --> 00:44:58.330 Of work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:00.490 --> 00:45:07.110 1. I think to renew the dignity of work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:07.110 --> 00:45:11.650 Means beginning with a recognition.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:11.650 --> 00:45:14.010 That work is not only a way of

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:14.010 --> 00:45:16.018 making a living. It's also.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:16.018 --> 00:45:18.846 A way of contributing to the common

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:18.846 --> 00:45:21.272 good and winning social recognition

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:21.272 --> 00:45:25.940 and esteem for doing so, I think.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:25.940 --> 00:45:29.100 One source of the resentment that has given

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:29.100 --> 00:45:32.456 rise to the polarization in our society.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:32.460 --> 00:45:37.240 Is it not only the wage technician as such?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:37.240 --> 00:45:40.390 But for for a great many workers.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:40.390 --> 00:45:43.258 For four decades.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:43.260 --> 00:45:45.054 But also the sense that the

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:45.054 --> 00:45:46.500 work that many people do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:46.500 --> 00:45:47.900 and here I'm thinking people

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:47.900 --> 00:45:49.020 without a college degree,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:49.020 --> 00:45:52.562 a sense that the that the work

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:52.562 --> 00:45:56.272 many people do is not recognized

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:56.272 --> 00:45:59.036 or appreciated or valued.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:45:59.040 --> 00:46:03.278 400 in the way it should be that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:03.278 --> 00:46:06.124 we have so valorised professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:06.124 --> 00:46:08.420 degrees in advanced degrees,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:08.420 --> 00:46:11.138 and the kinds of work associated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:11.138 --> 00:46:12.497 with those credentials.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:12.500 --> 00:46:14.909 That we have,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:14.909 --> 00:46:17.888 maybe unwittingly devalued and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:17.888 --> 00:46:20.160 failed adequately to recognize  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:20.160 --> 00:46:22.432 and appreciate and honor.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:22.440 --> 00:46:27.720 The the forms of work and of contribution.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:27.720 --> 00:46:30.990 That do not involve or require.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:30.990 --> 00:46:33.770 Professional credentials so advanced degrees,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:33.770 --> 00:46:36.311 and I think this is part of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:36.311 --> 00:46:39.219 the one of the ways in which.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:39.220 --> 00:46:41.512 Meritocratic attitudes toward success.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:41.512 --> 00:46:45.521 Have narrowed our notion of what counts

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:45.521 --> 00:46:48.425 as contribution to the common good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:48.430 --> 00:46:49.918 We often assume that the money

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:49.918 --> 00:46:51.895 people make is the measure of their

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:51.895 --> 00:46:53.445 contribution to the common good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:53.450 --> 00:46:55.920 The measure of their merit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:55.920 --> 00:46:58.000 But this is a mistake.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:46:58.000 --> 00:47:01.660 I mean, nobody really believes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:01.660 --> 00:47:04.740 That a hedge fund manager makes a

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:04.740 --> 00:47:06.761 contribution. Whose social value?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:06.761 --> 00:47:11.329 Is 1000 times greater than that of a nurse?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:11.330 --> 00:47:12.942 Or a school teacher,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:12.942 --> 00:47:15.360 even though that's what the labor

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:15.435 --> 00:47:19.010 market measure would indicate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:19.010 --> 00:47:20.678 But if that's true,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:20.678 --> 00:47:23.904 if the market is a poor measure  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:23.904 --> 00:47:26.388 of genuine social value.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:26.390 --> 00:47:29.570 Then that suggests that we we should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:29.570 --> 00:47:31.820 no longer outsource our moral judgments  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:31.820 --> 00:47:33.668 about social value to markets.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:33.670 --> 00:47:35.810 We need to reclaim.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:35.810 --> 00:47:36.880 Those judgments,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:36.880 --> 00:47:38.880 as democratic citizens and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:38.880 --> 00:47:40.880 deliberate publicly about them,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:40.880 --> 00:47:43.308 which raises the question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:43.308 --> 00:47:46.950 What actual policy debates might prompt?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:46.950 --> 00:47:48.452 More explicit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:48.452 --> 00:47:53.146 Debate about what really counts as a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:53.146 --> 00:47:55.954 valuable contribution to the common good.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:55.960 --> 00:47:58.557 Well, here are a couple of examples.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:47:58.560 --> 00:48:01.756 This is not a policy agenda,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:01.756 --> 00:48:04.787 but a couple of examples of what

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:04.787 --> 00:48:07.916 it would mean to debate more

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:07.916 --> 00:48:10.153 explicitly what really counts

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:10.153 --> 00:48:12.437 as a valuable contribution.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:12.440 --> 00:48:13.976 The tax system.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:13.976 --> 00:48:18.092 Yeah, and tax policy is 1 area we should.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:18.092 --> 00:48:19.156 We should be debating.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:19.160 --> 00:48:20.408 For example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:20.408 --> 00:48:24.314 why is it that we tax earnings from labor

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:24.314 --> 00:48:27.439 at a higher rate than we tax earnings

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:27.439 --> 00:48:29.559 from dividends and capital gains?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:29.560 --> 00:48:30.760 Why is that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:30.760 --> 00:48:33.160 And what does that say and

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:33.160 --> 00:48:36.630 reflect about the dignity of work?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:36.630 --> 00:48:38.828 There are lots of debates about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:38.828 --> 00:48:41.104 tax code having to do with fairness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:41.104 --> 00:48:45.880 And who can best bear the burden of taxation?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:45.880 --> 00:48:47.788 Those arguments about distributive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:47.788 --> 00:48:50.173 justice and fairness are important,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:50.180 --> 00:48:52.262 but they're not the only questions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:52.262 --> 00:48:53.303 to be asked.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:53.310 --> 00:48:55.205 Question I'm suggesting we should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:55.205 --> 00:48:57.622 ask about tax policy and other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:48:57.622 --> 00:49:00.204 policies is what's the expressive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:49:00.204 --> 00:49:02.859 significance about what we value,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6730602

00:49:02.860 --> 00:49:06.668 and in particular about the dignity of work?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:06.670 --> 00:49:10.390 Here's another kind of example.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:10.390 --> 00:49:12.028 An economist whom I quote in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:12.028 --> 00:49:13.698 book in the tyranny of Merit,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:13.700 --> 00:49:18.480 calculated that the federal government  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:18.480 --> 00:49:23.988 spends 164 roughly \$164 billion a year.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:23.990 --> 00:49:28.660 Helping people. Go to college.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:28.660 --> 00:49:34.338 And about 1.1 billion helping people who want

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:34.338 --> 00:49:39.358 to go to vocational or technical training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:39.358 --> 00:49:41.674 Forms of learning.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:41.680 --> 00:49:44.380 162 I think to 1.1 billion

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:44.380 --> 00:49:46.180 that's a vast disproportion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:46.180 --> 00:49:47.940 We woefully under invest.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:47.940 --> 00:49:50.580 In those forms of learning and

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:50.663 --> 00:49:53.489 which most people depend to prepare

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:53.489 --> 00:49:56.089 themselves for the world of work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:56.090 --> 00:49:58.330 And here I'm thinking of community colleges

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:49:58.330 --> 00:50:01.369 as well as vocational and technical training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:01.370 --> 00:50:03.939 It's not only a matter of funding.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:03.940 --> 00:50:07.470 It also reflects the steep

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:07.470 --> 00:50:09.588 hierarchy of prestige.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:09.590 --> 00:50:12.236 That we've created and bought into.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:12.240 --> 00:50:14.900 Between the higher education.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:14.900 --> 00:50:17.160 Especially prestigious private universities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:17.160 --> 00:50:21.010 And those forms of learning on what,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:21.010 --> 00:50:23.620 on which most of our fellow  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:23.620 --> 00:50:24.925 citizens actually depend.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:24.930 --> 00:50:29.039 So finding ways to reverse that steep  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:29.039 --> 00:50:32.492 hierarchy of prestige in the way we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:32.492 --> 00:50:35.554 invest in education and in the way  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:35.554 --> 00:50:38.168 we regard those who perform work.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:38.168 --> 00:50:39.872 Dependent on those different  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:39.872 --> 00:50:41.960 forms of of education,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:41.960 --> 00:50:44.368 I think would be another way of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94140377

00:50:44.368 --> 00:50:46.410 prompting this broader debate, Sarah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93000359

00:50:48.230 --> 00:50:49.378 Thank you so much.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:50:51.390 --> 00:50:54.750 Wonderful, and I absolutely agree.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:50:54.750 --> 00:50:57.641 I'm going to move on to our

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:50:57.641 --> 00:50:59.406 first Q&A from the audience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:50:59.406 --> 00:51:03.389 So this is a long one, so brace yourself.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:03.390 --> 00:51:05.830 Wouldn't the arguments against enhancement

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:05.830 --> 00:51:08.270 based on inequality apply equally

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:08.338 --> 00:51:10.293 to enhancements derived from books

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:10.293 --> 00:51:12.900 or tutoring or exercise in training,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:12.900 --> 00:51:15.322 or any resource requiring way we improve

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:15.322 --> 00:51:17.858 ourselves and don't all modes of enhancement,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:17.860 --> 00:51:20.880 social or biological require resources?

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:20.880 --> 00:51:22.565 It seems the primary lesion

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:22.565 --> 00:51:23.576 is not enhancement,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:23.580 --> 00:51:26.380 but excessive inequalities of resource.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:26.380 --> 00:51:27.800 Equally, I'm struggling to understand

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:27.800 --> 00:51:30.019 how life as a gift argues against

NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:30.019 --> 00:51:31.507 enhancement without at least.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:31.510 --> 00:51:31.997 Similarly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:31.997 --> 00:51:33.945 arguing against genetic engineering  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:33.945 --> 00:51:36.380 to remove serious life limiting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:36.446 --> 00:51:38.566 conditions such as cystic fibrosis  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:38.570 --> 00:51:40.930 both seem to be driven by a somewhat  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:40.930 --> 00:51:42.169 problematic notion of natural,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.910071236

00:51:42.170 --> 00:51:43.858 more assertive than established.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:51:45.750 --> 00:51:50.480 Well, it's certainly true that we do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:51:50.480 --> 00:51:53.690 need some notion of natural human  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:51:53.690 --> 00:51:56.220 flourishing natural human capacity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:51:56.220 --> 00:51:59.376 In order to make any distinction  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:51:59.376 --> 00:52:02.460 between health on the one hand.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:02.460 --> 00:52:06.340 And enhancement on the other.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:06.340 --> 00:52:10.281 Now I I certainly don't and and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:10.281 --> 00:52:12.523 didn't assert, merely assert a

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:12.523 --> 00:52:14.378 conception of the natural that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:14.380 --> 00:52:16.809 as I mentioned in the in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:16.809 --> 00:52:18.820 talk and mentioned in the book.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:18.820 --> 00:52:20.590 This what's natural?

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:20.590 --> 00:52:23.274 That's a contested concept.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:23.274 --> 00:52:26.930 It's not biologically defined.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:26.930 --> 00:52:29.930 It's it's a normative question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:29.930 --> 00:52:31.904 And it's a normative question that

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:31.904 --> 00:52:34.513 we need to debate and reflect on not

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:34.513 --> 00:52:36.228 only within the medical community,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:36.230 --> 00:52:39.446 but more broadly in civic life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:39.450 --> 00:52:42.299 So I think the question it's important

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:42.299 --> 00:52:45.760 to ask how can we reason about what

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:45.760 --> 00:52:51.240 counts as health and what counts as.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:51.240 --> 00:52:54.440 Curing disease or repairing

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:54.440 --> 00:52:58.202 injury as against. Bulking up.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:52:58.202 --> 00:53:01.607 To hit 75 home runs.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:01.610 --> 00:53:04.418 It isn't self happening and we need to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:04.418 --> 00:53:06.987 reason about that and argue about that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:06.990 --> 00:53:11.106 And As for intervening to deal with.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:11.110 --> 00:53:13.458 Abilities such as cystic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:13.458 --> 00:53:15.806 fibrosis fibrosis there too.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:15.810 --> 00:53:18.336 We do need a conception of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:18.336 --> 00:53:21.529 what it what is it to restore?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:21.530 --> 00:53:24.250 Natural human function or flourishing?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:24.250 --> 00:53:25.570 We can't get away from that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:25.570 --> 00:53:28.958 but to discuss any account of natural  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:28.958 --> 00:53:30.630 human function or flourishing,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:30.630 --> 00:53:33.305 though these are in some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:33.305 --> 00:53:34.910 respects medical categories.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:34.910 --> 00:53:37.976 They are also moral categories because

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:37.976 --> 00:53:40.957 the answers will reflect different

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:40.957 --> 00:53:43.418 conceptions of what it is to be

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:43.418 --> 00:53:47.560 a human person. So this actually.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:47.560 --> 00:53:51.019 Highlights the continuity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:51.020 --> 00:53:54.152 Rather than the division of intellectual

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:54.152 --> 00:53:56.660 labor between medical decision making

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:53:56.660 --> 00:54:00.100 and biomedical ethics on the one hand,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:00.100 --> 00:54:02.730 and normative and civic debate

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:02.730 --> 00:54:05.360 and reflection on the other,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:05.360 --> 00:54:07.380 I see these as continuous,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:07.380 --> 00:54:12.910 not as separate specialized compartments.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:12.910 --> 00:54:16.863 Which is not to say that that I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:16.863 --> 00:54:19.775 there's a fixed definition for for the

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:19.775 --> 00:54:22.145 natural or or for human flourishing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:22.150 --> 00:54:25.838 It is to say that what counts as is

NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:25.838 --> 00:54:29.782 health and what counts as a justifiable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:29.782 --> 00:54:32.638 medical intervention is a human question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.866780794

00:54:32.638 --> 00:54:34.498 not only a biological 1.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:36.390 --> 00:54:38.980 OK, great, this question sort  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:38.980 --> 00:54:41.629 of dovetails with some of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:41.629 --> 00:54:43.807 issues brought up in the last.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:43.810 --> 00:54:45.808 Please say more about the moral  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:45.808 --> 00:54:47.140 difference between parental attempts  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:47.190 --> 00:54:48.830 to genetically modify their children  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:48.830 --> 00:54:50.470 for success in meritocracy and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:50.522 --> 00:54:52.257 parental attempts to educate their  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90789201125

00:54:52.257 --> 00:54:53.992 children for success in meritocracy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:54:54.580 --> 00:54:55.723 Well, it depends.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:54:55.723 --> 00:54:58.009 It can be a thin line.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:54:58.010 --> 00:55:02.035 It depends whether the education  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:55:02.035 --> 00:55:04.450 is purely instrumental.

NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:04.450 --> 00:55:06.970 Simply to get in simply for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:06.970 --> 00:55:09.882 sake of making more money or for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:09.882 --> 00:55:12.072 accruing the the private benefits  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:12.072 --> 00:55:14.630 that go with winning admission.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:14.630 --> 00:55:17.330 To a college or university.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:17.330 --> 00:55:19.610 That's how the education is serving,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:19.610 --> 00:55:23.439 and if that's what animates the education.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:23.440 --> 00:55:26.690 Then it is instrumental and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:26.690 --> 00:55:30.869 objectified in the same kind of way.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:30.870 --> 00:55:34.386 As a genetic intervention would be.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:34.390 --> 00:55:36.166 Not all education.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:36.166 --> 00:55:38.534 Is of that kind.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:38.540 --> 00:55:41.840 Not all education is purely instrumental.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:41.840 --> 00:55:44.594 Purely for the sake of maximizing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:55:44.594 --> 00:55:46.860 the future earning capacity of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:55:46.860 --> 00:55:48.984 the child or the young person.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:55:48.990 --> 00:55:51.540 When parents educate their children or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:55:51.540 --> 00:55:53.980 promote and support their education,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:55:53.980 --> 00:55:58.516 ideally they're doing so at least in part.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:55:58.520 --> 00:56:01.838 For the to cultivate in the child.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:01.840 --> 00:56:05.968 A love of learning for its own sake.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:05.970 --> 00:56:07.677 For its intrinsic.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:07.677 --> 00:56:11.091 Benefits to make the child to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:11.091 --> 00:56:14.139 open the child to learning.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:14.140 --> 00:56:17.002 That will enable them better to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:17.002 --> 00:56:18.910 develop their human capacities,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:18.910 --> 00:56:22.130 their inquisitiveness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:22.130 --> 00:56:26.378 And to to make them fuller human beings.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:26.380 --> 00:56:29.257 Now, if that's what education aims at,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:29.260 --> 00:56:31.300 and I think it it should,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:56:31.300 --> 00:56:34.892 then it's quite different

NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:34.892 --> 00:56:37.586 from genetic manipulation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:37.590 --> 00:56:39.246 Because it's not.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:39.246 --> 00:56:42.006 It's no longer purely instrumental.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:42.010 --> 00:56:45.226 It's no longer objectifying the child.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:45.230 --> 00:56:48.680 Even making the child an object,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:48.680 --> 00:56:50.250 an instrument of its own,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:50.250 --> 00:56:51.999 future earnings stream.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:51.999 --> 00:56:54.914 That's what's objectionable about both.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:54.920 --> 00:56:57.296 So I would agree that sometimes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:57.296 --> 00:56:59.094 some forms of education,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:56:59.094 --> 00:57:02.106 especially the kind of cram courses  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:57:02.106 --> 00:57:05.125 and tutoring for the sake of learning  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:57:05.125 --> 00:57:08.700 the tricks on entrance exams.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:57:08.700 --> 00:57:09.890 The better to get in,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889  
00:57:09.890 --> 00:57:13.750 the better to get a good job and so on.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:57:13.750 --> 00:57:17.005 If they're done in the same spirit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:57:17.005 --> 00:57:21.450 as genetic fix would would reflect,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:57:21.450 --> 00:57:22.905 then I think they're morally  
NOTE Confidence: 0.753966138888889

00:57:22.905 --> 00:57:24.360 problematic in the same way.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:26.330 --> 00:57:28.559 It makes sense.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:28.560 --> 00:57:31.626 Continuing along the theme of education,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:31.630 --> 00:57:34.140 we have another great question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:34.140 --> 00:57:36.234 The need to share our gifts  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:36.234 --> 00:57:38.070 and bounty translates from many  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:38.070 --> 00:57:40.681 students into a need to fight social  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:40.681 --> 00:57:42.155 injustices in medical schools.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:42.155 --> 00:57:44.345 Commitment to a variety of causes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:44.345 --> 00:57:46.830 has become its own measure of merit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:46.830 --> 00:57:49.049 How do you reconcile the need to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:49.049 --> 00:57:50.820 restrain hubris with the concomitant  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:50.820 --> 00:57:53.082 need to share with others and

NOTE Confidence: 0.89163178

00:57:53.082 --> 00:57:55.219 demonstrate merit by fighting injustice?

NOTE Confidence: 0.4412502

00:58:00.430 --> 00:58:01.538 You think that there?

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:05.040 --> 00:58:07.670 Raining and recognizing our obligations

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:07.670 --> 00:58:11.160 to those less fortunate than ourselves,

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:11.160 --> 00:58:15.365 and therefore to obligations to to

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:15.365 --> 00:58:17.435 serve social justice, I think there

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:17.435 --> 00:58:20.239 is a close connection between them,

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:20.240 --> 00:58:25.784 and so I would say that the

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:25.784 --> 00:58:28.280 moral education that emphasizes

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:28.280 --> 00:58:31.735 the contingency of our gifts or

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:31.735 --> 00:58:33.745 Sarah to go to your distinction.

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:33.750 --> 00:58:35.980 It emphasizes how a stewardship

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:35.980 --> 00:58:38.740 relation to our talents and gifts,

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:38.740 --> 00:58:41.320 rather than an ownership relation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:41.320 --> 00:58:43.618 is conducive to social justice into

NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:43.618 --> 00:58:45.979 a greater sense of obligation to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:45.979 --> 00:58:48.611 those who may lack the talents that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:48.611 --> 00:58:50.887 the society or the opportunities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.913423691818182

00:58:50.887 --> 00:58:53.538 that the society happens to reward.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:58:56.320 --> 00:58:57.372 Yeah, I'm you know.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:58:57.372 --> 00:58:59.360 I'm reminded as as as you speak.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:58:59.360 --> 00:59:01.446 I'm I'm taken back to that time  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:01.446 --> 00:59:03.569 almost 20 years ago when I took  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:03.569 --> 00:59:05.298 your course and you know, I,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:05.298 --> 00:59:07.244 I believe you summed it up very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:07.244 --> 00:59:09.222 succinctly as as the concept of doing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:09.222 --> 00:59:11.400 the right thing for the right reason.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:11.400 --> 00:59:13.776 And I, I think that distinction  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:13.776 --> 00:59:15.810 is is really critical here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:15.810 --> 00:59:17.434 You know, as simple as that sounds,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273

00:59:17.440 --> 00:59:18.684 it it really it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273  
00:59:18.684 --> 00:59:20.239 It's really a very powerful  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273  
00:59:20.239 --> 00:59:22.244 concept that you know doing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273  
00:59:22.244 --> 00:59:23.872 things because they're they're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273  
00:59:23.872 --> 00:59:25.827 intrinsically the right thing to do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273  
00:59:25.830 --> 00:59:27.314 Rather than because of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273  
00:59:27.314 --> 00:59:28.427 their instrumental value,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.870155392727273  
00:59:28.430 --> 00:59:31.160 is is a really critical concept here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:32.630 --> 00:59:34.982 Well, Sarah, in response to this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:34.982 --> 00:59:36.882 with Michael's comment was is that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:36.882 --> 00:59:38.220 I think one is relevant to that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:38.220 --> 00:59:41.920 Much necessarily follows from the other.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:41.920 --> 00:59:45.296 Which is to say that once one accepts  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:45.296 --> 00:59:48.835 the notion of that we are not that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:48.835 --> 00:59:51.195 we have not earned all of our gifts,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798  
00:59:51.200 --> 00:59:54.364 that that in fact that we are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

00:59:54.364 --> 00:59:55.704 the benefactors of the genetic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

00:59:55.704 --> 00:59:57.409 lottery or the financial lottery,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

00:59:57.410 --> 00:59:58.768 or we are lucky with the parents  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

00:59:58.768 --> 01:00:00.191 we had or with the circumstances  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:00.191 --> 01:00:01.516 where we were born etc.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:01.520 --> 01:00:04.264 Once if if one can get students  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:04.264 --> 01:00:05.992 or others to accept that premise,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:06.000 --> 01:00:07.520 which I think is a very good premise  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:07.520 --> 01:00:09.599 and I agree with it that we're here  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:09.599 --> 01:00:11.717 largely because of our good fortune,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:11.720 --> 01:00:13.256 that we have these talents largely  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:13.256 --> 01:00:14.710 because of our good fortune.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:14.710 --> 01:00:16.442 Economic, genetic circumstances, whatever.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:16.442 --> 01:00:19.412 Then it's then if one doesn't move  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:19.412 --> 01:00:21.284 from that into an appreciation for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:21.284 --> 01:00:23.670 the need for greater social justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:23.670 --> 01:00:25.584 then something is missing and someone

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:25.584 --> 01:00:27.350 is just general moral compass.

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:27.350 --> 01:00:29.318 If you actually believe everything I

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:29.318 --> 01:00:32.110 have I earned, I deserved just me.

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:32.110 --> 01:00:35.884 Then I think it's totally moral as to say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:35.884 --> 01:00:38.390 Therefore, I'm not obligated to share it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:38.390 --> 01:00:40.854 I think once one accepts that I didn't

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:40.854 --> 01:00:42.689 actually get all this on my own,

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:42.690 --> 01:00:44.426 that that I don't deserve all this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:44.430 --> 01:00:45.429 then I think.

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:45.429 --> 01:00:47.427 Most folks with a sound moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:47.427 --> 01:00:49.399 compass will then say therefore,

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:49.400 --> 01:00:50.960 I really have an obligation to share it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:50.960 --> 01:00:52.640 I really have an obligation to make

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:52.640 --> 01:00:54.107 this road easier for other people

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:54.107 --> 01:00:55.493 who didn't get the same gifts  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:55.493 --> 01:00:56.976 who didn't have the same luck.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:56.980 --> 01:00:57.832 I'm so it follows,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:57.832 --> 01:00:59.662 but I think it starts with the premise  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:00:59.662 --> 01:01:01.613 that's really in both of the books, right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:01.613 --> 01:01:03.104 And it was in and so beautifully  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:03.104 --> 01:01:04.406 presented in your talk, Michael,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:04.406 --> 01:01:08.240 it starts with the premise that it's not all.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:08.240 --> 01:01:10.739 It's not all earned, and it's not.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:10.740 --> 01:01:11.005 Therefore,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:11.005 --> 01:01:12.595 we don't deserve all the bounty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:12.595 --> 01:01:14.048 as you put in the book.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:14.050 --> 01:01:16.246 From what we from those gifts.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:16.250 --> 01:01:16.982 Once that premise.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:16.982 --> 01:01:19.414 So I think that in terms of trying to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:19.414 --> 01:01:21.406 teach the students about social justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:21.410 --> 01:01:23.290 I think 90% of it would be to

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:23.290 --> 01:01:24.969 get not just the students,

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:24.970 --> 01:01:27.077 but all of us to appreciate that

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:27.077 --> 01:01:28.312 first fundamental point that

NOTE Confidence: 0.59001798

01:01:28.312 --> 01:01:29.926 that Michael made in his talk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9360625

01:01:31.060 --> 01:01:31.850 Absolutely.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:34.900 --> 01:01:36.880 So kind of following from that

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:36.880 --> 01:01:39.277 I think we have another question

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:39.277 --> 01:01:41.856 that nicely moves us along.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:41.856 --> 01:01:47.177 So in a society where we do not value merit,

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:47.180 --> 01:01:49.235 what drives us to succeed

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:49.235 --> 01:01:50.879 and what defines success?

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:50.880 --> 01:01:52.715 How do concepts of laziness

NOTE Confidence: 0.914640339230769

01:01:52.715 --> 01:01:54.183 versus hard work change?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:01:57.350 --> 01:02:01.454 Well, I'm not suggesting that we should not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:01.460 --> 01:02:04.405 Value merit understood as meaning  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:04.405 --> 01:02:07.890 the exercise of our talents for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:07.890 --> 01:02:10.536 the sake of the common good,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:10.540 --> 01:02:13.528 that's a way of understanding merit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:13.530 --> 01:02:16.776 The question is whether we consider  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:16.776 --> 01:02:20.692 our success our own doing the the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:20.692 --> 01:02:23.597 question is whether we consider.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:23.600 --> 01:02:27.000 The exercise of our merit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:27.000 --> 01:02:29.828 A ground for thinking that we deserve  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:29.828 --> 01:02:32.079 the benefits that flow deserve.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:32.080 --> 01:02:33.002 As individuals,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:33.002 --> 01:02:35.768 the benefits that flow from it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:35.770 --> 01:02:39.005 So valuing merit in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:39.005 --> 01:02:41.593 sense of appreciating people,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:41.600 --> 01:02:43.120 cultivating their talents for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:43.120 --> 01:02:45.588 the sake of the comment, would.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:45.588 --> 01:02:51.110 That is not something that I'm criticizing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:51.110 --> 01:02:52.541 To the contrary,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:52.541 --> 01:02:55.403 but that's a very different way

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:55.403 --> 01:02:58.180 of valuing merit than believing

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:02:58.180 --> 01:03:01.610 that my success is my own doing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:01.610 --> 01:03:03.654 and I therefore deserve.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:03.654 --> 01:03:06.209 As an individual that benefits

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:06.209 --> 01:03:08.479 that flow from it now,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:08.479 --> 01:03:11.580 you might think there or the questioner

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:11.673 --> 01:03:17.720 might worry that loosening the hold.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:17.720 --> 01:03:22.340 Of the conviction.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:22.340 --> 01:03:25.595 That our success is our own doing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:25.600 --> 01:03:28.810 And we therefore deserve the benefits

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:28.810 --> 01:03:32.279 that flow from it will lead people

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:32.279 --> 01:03:36.470 to be lazy or to fail to exercise.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:36.470 --> 01:03:39.630 Their talents and gifts.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:39.630 --> 01:03:42.018 I'm skeptical about that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:42.018 --> 01:03:45.616 Because I think what really motivates  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:45.616 --> 01:03:48.626 people are motivated by extrinsic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:48.626 --> 01:03:52.246 rewards to work hard to make money to win,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:52.250 --> 01:03:54.854 honor and recognition.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:54.854 --> 01:03:59.194 But also by intrinsic rewards.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:03:59.200 --> 01:04:02.116 To feel that they are fulfilling  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:02.116 --> 01:04:04.482 an important mission in curing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:04.482 --> 01:04:07.188 the sick or healing the injured  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:07.188 --> 01:04:09.780 or contributing generally to the.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:09.780 --> 01:04:13.140 To the common good. So.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:13.140 --> 01:04:15.300 I I think.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:15.300 --> 01:04:19.620 That loosening the hold of individualistic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:19.751 --> 01:04:24.677 notions of moral desert deserving Ness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:24.680 --> 01:04:27.938 I think that might diminish the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:27.938 --> 01:04:30.110 incentives that animate some.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:30.110 --> 01:04:33.798 I think it actually would clear the way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:33.800 --> 01:04:35.555 Four in place.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:35.555 --> 01:04:38.278 Greater emphasis on more intrinsic

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:38.278 --> 01:04:40.698 sources of satisfaction and of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:40.698 --> 01:04:43.021 motivation in cultivating our guests

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:43.021 --> 01:04:45.536 and contributing to the common good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:45.536 --> 01:04:47.600 It's an open question,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:47.600 --> 01:04:52.560 but it seems to me that the individualistic

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:52.560 --> 01:04:55.880 notion of merit and its success,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:55.880 --> 01:04:58.529 the ownership notion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:04:58.530 --> 01:05:04.730 Of our talents that Sarah identified is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:04.730 --> 01:05:05.560 Actually corrosive,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:05.560 --> 01:05:08.050 not only of the common good,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:08.050 --> 01:05:11.080 but if the intrinsic satisfactions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:11.080 --> 01:05:15.150 That we derive when we.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:15.150 --> 01:05:16.680 When we work to contribute  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:16.680 --> 01:05:17.904 to the common good,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:17.910 --> 01:05:20.300 and when we win recognition.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657866875

01:05:20.300 --> 01:05:23.366 And and esteem for having done so.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:25.580 --> 01:05:27.187 So is there a middle ground? Michael?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:27.187 --> 01:05:30.130 Is there a middle ground to be had where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:30.205 --> 01:05:32.676 one says that your your your success?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:32.680 --> 01:05:34.598 Your wealth is a is a combination  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:34.598 --> 01:05:36.955 is a result of a combination of your  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:36.955 --> 01:05:39.434 good luck and your hard work and and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:39.434 --> 01:05:41.336 therefore to some extent you still  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:41.336 --> 01:05:43.520 want to incentivize that hard work.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:43.520 --> 01:05:45.712 I I appreciate your point that for many  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:45.712 --> 01:05:48.401 of the incentive is going to be this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333

01:05:48.401 --> 01:05:51.656 internal satisfaction or the recognition,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333  
01:05:51.660 --> 01:05:53.268 but I think for many the the incentive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333  
01:05:53.268 --> 01:05:54.619 is still going to be economic.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333  
01:05:54.620 --> 01:05:56.910 So is is there a middle ground where we say.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333  
01:05:56.910 --> 01:05:59.100 That those who have greater luck  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333  
01:05:59.100 --> 01:06:01.947 as well as work hard should see  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333  
01:06:01.947 --> 01:06:04.117 a responsibility to share some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9378505633333333  
01:06:04.117 --> 01:06:06.590 as opposed to to surrender all.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.853665784375  
01:06:08.320 --> 01:06:11.048 Well, the middle ground mark I think has  
NOTE Confidence: 0.853665784375  
01:06:11.048 --> 01:06:14.246 to do above all with our stance toward.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.799722525  
01:06:17.910 --> 01:06:19.020 Tord effort  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275  
01:06:21.250 --> 01:06:24.226 to loosen the hold. As I am arguing,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275  
01:06:24.230 --> 01:06:27.150 we should loosen the hold of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275  
01:06:27.150 --> 01:06:29.390 idea that our success is our own.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275  
01:06:29.390 --> 01:06:32.770 Doing is not to embrace  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275  
01:06:32.770 --> 01:06:34.798 or encourage fatalism.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:06:34.800 --> 01:06:39.698 That there is no human agency that

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:06:39.698 --> 01:06:42.188 everything that happens to me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:06:42.190 --> 01:06:46.371 my fate in life is strictly a matter

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:06:46.371 --> 01:06:49.984 of the luck of the draw or the genetic

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:06:49.984 --> 01:06:53.255 lottery or the mysterious grace of

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:06:53.255 --> 01:06:56.420 God unrelated to anything I do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:06:56.420 --> 01:07:00.305 That would be a kind of fatalism.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:00.310 --> 01:07:03.004 That would be hard to reconcile

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:03.004 --> 01:07:06.060 with any notion of human agency.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:06.060 --> 01:07:08.340 What I'm arguing against is

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:08.340 --> 01:07:10.620 a kind of hyper agency.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:10.620 --> 01:07:12.620 Bound up with notions

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:12.620 --> 01:07:14.620 of mastery and dominion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:14.620 --> 01:07:18.328 and self sufficiency that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:18.330 --> 01:07:20.676 I think our corrosive not only

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:20.676 --> 01:07:22.240 of the common good,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:22.240 --> 01:07:25.810 but of any sense of indebtedness.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:25.810 --> 01:07:28.030 To say nothing of luck.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:28.030 --> 01:07:30.917 Now, how does strike the balance mark?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:30.917 --> 01:07:33.906 That's that's a hard question to answer.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:33.910 --> 01:07:36.946 One way to think about it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:36.950 --> 01:07:41.297 Is to ask ourselves how as parents.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:41.300 --> 01:07:44.510 Would we encourage our children?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:44.510 --> 01:07:48.075 Tu regarde either a great

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:48.075 --> 01:07:49.855 success that they had,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:49.860 --> 01:07:52.954 whether in sports or in school or

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:52.954 --> 01:07:55.978 on the playground or with friends.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:55.980 --> 01:07:58.955 And how would we encourage them to

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:07:58.955 --> 01:08:02.187 think about a setback or a failure?

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:08:02.190 --> 01:08:04.702 Now when we we do this naturally all

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:08:04.702 --> 01:08:07.170 the time, sometimes we wrestle with it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:08:07.170 --> 01:08:10.326 The answer is not always obvious.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:08:10.330 --> 01:08:14.818 But if our child enjoys a great success.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6052314275

01:08:14.820 --> 01:08:16.860 Winning a debate tournament.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.924848335

01:08:19.400 --> 01:08:21.724 Being getting good grades,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.924848335

01:08:21.724 --> 01:08:24.048 making the Deans list.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.924848335

01:08:24.050 --> 01:08:26.950 Winning a sports championship.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.924848335

01:08:26.950 --> 01:08:28.258 Pitching a no hitter.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:30.530 --> 01:08:34.702 We do think about what form of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:34.702 --> 01:08:37.689 praise and encouragement to convey.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:37.690 --> 01:08:40.448 And when we think about that Mark,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:40.450 --> 01:08:42.680 we always calibrating exactly the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:42.680 --> 01:08:44.910 balance that you're asking about.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:44.910 --> 01:08:47.670 We want the child to take  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:47.670 --> 01:08:49.696 pride in her achievement.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:49.696 --> 01:08:52.828 Let's say on the sports field.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8026575

01:08:52.830 --> 01:08:54.920 Without forgetting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:08:57.400 --> 01:09:01.168 The the child's indebtedness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:01.168 --> 01:09:06.370 And good fortune. And.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:06.370 --> 01:09:11.036 So the way we calibrate this with the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:11.036 --> 01:09:14.798 way we couch our praise and calibrate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:14.798 --> 01:09:17.766 our judgment shapes the message we sent.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:17.770 --> 01:09:22.072 It's a kind of moral teaching praise of kids.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:22.080 --> 01:09:26.378 And also helping them contend with failure.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:26.380 --> 01:09:30.511 Is one way that in human terms we calibrate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:30.511 --> 01:09:34.326 this this difficult balance all the time.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:34.326 --> 01:09:37.000 We don't want our children to believe.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:37.000 --> 01:09:39.238 That nothing they do will matter  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:39.240 --> 01:09:40.936 and how well they will fare in life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:40.940 --> 01:09:42.756 That's the pure fatalism.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:42.756 --> 01:09:46.811 But neither do we want them to believe that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571  
01:09:46.811 --> 01:09:51.399 every time they fall short it's their fault.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:09:51.400 --> 01:09:54.676 Or that every time they succeed.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:09:54.680 --> 01:09:56.408 It's thanks only.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:09:56.408 --> 01:09:59.288 To their effort in striving.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:09:59.290 --> 01:10:01.369 So I've not given a direct answer.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:01.370 --> 01:10:03.308 I suppose mark to your question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:03.310 --> 01:10:05.090 it's too difficult to question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:05.090 --> 01:10:07.718 but it's the kind of question we put to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:07.718 --> 01:10:09.246 ourselves, sometimes even unreflectively.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:09.246 --> 01:10:11.306 Whenever we're trying to figure  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:11.306 --> 01:10:13.646 out what to say either to console,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:13.650 --> 01:10:17.150 our child who's encountered a set back,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:17.150 --> 01:10:19.418 or to praise our child when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.767423731428571

01:10:19.418 --> 01:10:21.320 they've achieved some success, no.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:21.970 --> 01:10:23.570 No, I think that's a very insightful answer.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:23.570 --> 01:10:24.956 In fact, I mean and you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:24.956 --> 01:10:26.210 can't have it both ways.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:26.210 --> 01:10:27.986 As you point out, so that if I

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:27.986 --> 01:10:29.930 tell my child when he fails, well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:29.930 --> 01:10:31.750 you know it wasn't entirely your fault.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:31.750 --> 01:10:32.854 Then it seems that I can't

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:32.854 --> 01:10:33.830 really have it both ways,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:33.830 --> 01:10:35.405 that when he succeeds I can't say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:35.410 --> 01:10:37.566 Well, that's all entirely due to you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:37.570 --> 01:10:39.515 exactly, that there's the the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:39.515 --> 01:10:40.565 balance has got to be there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:40.570 --> 01:10:41.770 I think that's very insightful

NOTE Confidence: 0.9050695625

01:10:41.770 --> 01:10:43.110 answer actually, exactly.

NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:10:44.680 --> 01:10:46.516 I you know I would just piggyback on that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:10:46.520 --> 01:10:49.144 I think there's a natural tendency to want

NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:10:49.144 --> 01:10:52.239 to cast luck and skill as a false dichotomy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:10:52.240 --> 01:10:54.592 when in fact they're both interrelated

NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:10:54.592 --> 01:10:57.378 in in almost all of our outcomes,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:10:57.380 --> 01:10:59.188 perhaps to different degrees,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:10:59.188 --> 01:11:01.900 and certain outcomes may be more  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:01.978 --> 01:11:04.238 dependent on luck versus skill.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:04.240 --> 01:11:07.430 But for for most metrics I I think that it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:07.512 --> 01:11:10.648 overly simplistic to to cast them as being  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:10.648 --> 01:11:13.617 the product of just one versus the other.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:13.620 --> 01:11:15.384 And I and I think that recognition.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:15.390 --> 01:11:17.950 Can allow for room for both pride and a job.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:17.950 --> 01:11:20.990 Well done and for some humility and gratitude  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:20.990 --> 01:11:23.910 with respect to to those gifts that that we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:23.910 --> 01:11:26.188 have through no moral desert of our own,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:26.190 --> 01:11:28.692 but rather through the the genetic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:28.692 --> 01:11:32.570 lottery or through through society.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:32.570 --> 01:11:35.310 And you know the one other thing that that I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:11:35.373 --> 01:11:38.414 I would add to this discussion is, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:38.414 --> 01:11:41.078 it's it's interesting the the paradoxically,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:41.078 --> 01:11:43.514 even though we like to the defenders  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:43.514 --> 01:11:45.948 of the status quo may argue, Oh well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:45.948 --> 01:11:47.620 you know that it's important to keep things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:47.661 --> 01:11:49.469 as they are because they encourage hard work.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:49.470 --> 01:11:50.910 But but to your point,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:50.910 --> 01:11:52.158 earlier in in fact,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:52.158 --> 01:11:54.403 a lot of the financial incentives that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:54.403 --> 01:11:56.566 currently exist don't do that at all.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:56.570 --> 01:11:59.540 And you know to your point about why is it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:11:59.619 --> 01:12:02.805 that passive income is taxed at a lower rate?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:02.810 --> 01:12:04.518 Then labor related income.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:04.518 --> 01:12:07.526 That's actually a slap in the face  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:07.526 --> 01:12:09.722 to people who argue about the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:09.722 --> 01:12:12.120 the merits of of working hard.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:12.120 --> 01:12:14.576 What about the fact that you know the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:14.576 --> 01:12:17.030 relatively low taxation rates for estate tax?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:17.030 --> 01:12:17.836 Doesn't it?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:17.836 --> 01:12:19.448 That seem very even.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:19.450 --> 01:12:20.470 If and again, they're.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:20.470 --> 01:12:22.004 They're two separate questions, right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:22.004 --> 01:12:25.990 One is it is a meritocracy ethical at all,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:25.990 --> 01:12:28.702 and two if if it is ethical, it does.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:28.702 --> 01:12:30.538 Our system actually reward merit in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:30.538 --> 01:12:32.798 the way that we think it does, and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:32.798 --> 01:12:35.102 And I think that even if you you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:35.102 --> 01:12:37.091 accept the notion that you know  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:37.091 --> 01:12:38.726 merit based on hard work,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:38.730 --> 01:12:41.474 it is a reasonable metric to reward people.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:41.480 --> 01:12:41.748 Actually,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:12:41.748 --> 01:12:42.820 our system doesn't really

NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:42.820 --> 01:12:43.892 support that at all.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:43.900 --> 01:12:45.112 Our system,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:45.112 --> 01:12:48.017 it supports very entrenched wealth  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:48.017 --> 01:12:50.402 and and opportunity through a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:50.402 --> 01:12:53.090 taxation system that that actually,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:53.090 --> 01:12:54.434 you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:54.434 --> 01:12:57.122 enhances and and perpetuates  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:57.122 --> 01:12:58.466 generational wealth,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:12:58.470 --> 01:13:01.002 which is is very anti meritocratic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:13:01.002 --> 01:13:03.070 and and passive income and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:13:03.070 --> 01:13:05.470 So we don't actually have a system that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:13:05.470 --> 01:13:07.568 that rewards hard work above all else,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:13:07.570 --> 01:13:09.910 and if we did I I think it would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:13:09.910 --> 01:13:12.205 look very different both in terms  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556  
01:13:12.205 --> 01:13:14.604 of of taxation policies and also  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:14.604 --> 01:13:17.110 in terms of of dignity and respect  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:17.110 --> 01:13:19.850 for certain work that is very hard,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:19.850 --> 01:13:21.964 but that often isn't regarded very highly.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:21.970 --> 01:13:24.859 If it doesn't come along with a lot of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:24.859 --> 01:13:27.527 technical or professional skill or training.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:27.530 --> 01:13:28.096 Yeah,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:28.096 --> 01:13:29.768 well said thank you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:29.768 --> 01:13:32.581 This next question is is short but I think it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:32.581 --> 01:13:34.965 it kind of dovetails nicely with this idea.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:34.970 --> 01:13:37.064 How do these arguments relate to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:37.064 --> 01:13:39.070 the ongoing drug overdose epidemic,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:39.070 --> 01:13:40.888 which I I will add has  
NOTE Confidence: 0.874656195555556

01:13:40.888 --> 01:13:42.100 often been described as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89618678

01:13:42.175 --> 01:13:44.391 sort of an epidemic of of despair as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89618678

01:13:44.391 --> 01:13:46.868 as it certain populations who who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89618678

01:13:46.868 --> 01:13:49.689 may not feel that they have a lot of

NOTE Confidence: 0.89618678

01:13:49.689 --> 01:13:52.174 of dignity or purpose or or meaning.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:13:53.620 --> 01:13:56.326 This this is a closely connected

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:13:56.326 --> 01:13:58.834 to this very important book,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:13:58.834 --> 01:14:03.058 deaths of despair by two economists

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:03.060 --> 01:14:05.740 and case in Angus Deaton.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:05.740 --> 01:14:08.330 And what they found was that during

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:08.330 --> 01:14:10.626 these very same decades that I

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:10.626 --> 01:14:13.216 write about in the tyranny of merit,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:13.220 --> 01:14:17.504 essentially the last three to four decades.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:17.510 --> 01:14:20.502 Of finance driven globalization

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:20.502 --> 01:14:23.494 widening inequality wage stagnation

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:23.494 --> 01:14:26.569 for most working people,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:26.570 --> 01:14:29.190 there has been an upsurge

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:29.190 --> 01:14:31.286 in deaths of despair,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:31.290 --> 01:14:35.736 which is to say deaths due to suicide.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:35.736 --> 01:14:41.166 Alcohol abuse or drug overdose.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:41.170 --> 01:14:44.980 Among. Those and this is what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:44.980 --> 01:14:47.599 connects it to the tyranny of merit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:47.600 --> 01:14:51.434 This increase in deaths of despair  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:51.434 --> 01:14:53.990 disproportionately has taken place  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:54.085 --> 01:14:57.420 among those without college degrees.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:14:57.420 --> 01:15:02.095 Which reflects not only diminished  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:15:02.095 --> 01:15:03.965 economic prospects.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:15:03.970 --> 01:15:06.578 But also a sense.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:15:06.578 --> 01:15:09.186 Of demoralization and even  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:15:09.186 --> 01:15:12.092 humiliation by the system of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:15:12.092 --> 01:15:16.500 work and by the credential list,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:15:16.500 --> 01:15:19.698 prejudice and privilege.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84150523

01:15:19.700 --> 01:15:20.270 Of.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:22.670 --> 01:15:26.230 Of those on top.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:26.230 --> 01:15:30.050 It really excludes or devalues.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:30.050 --> 01:15:32.498 Appreciation for the kind of work

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:32.498 --> 01:15:36.443 that working people do so and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:36.443 --> 01:15:41.610 case and Deaton mentioned the the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:41.610 --> 01:15:44.730 powerful meritocratic pressures.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:44.730 --> 01:15:47.603 That seemed to be at work is

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:47.603 --> 01:15:51.268 certainly one factor in explaining.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:51.270 --> 01:15:53.850 The increase in deaths of despair

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:53.850 --> 01:15:56.210 among those without college degrees.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:15:56.210 --> 01:16:00.089 One of the most one of the deepest sources

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:00.089 --> 01:16:03.698 of the divide in our polarized society,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:03.698 --> 01:16:06.138 politically is between those with

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:06.138 --> 01:16:09.349 and those without a college degree.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:09.350 --> 01:16:13.328 We saw this in the voting for Donald Trump.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:13.330 --> 01:16:17.032 We saw this in the Brexit vote in Britain,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:17.032 --> 01:16:21.081 and sadly we see it in the.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:21.081 --> 01:16:23.836 Incidents of deaths of despair.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8850211675

01:16:23.840 --> 01:16:26.090 So I think there is a very close connection.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.760597875

01:16:28.790 --> 01:16:29.260 Thank you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:31.000 --> 01:16:32.620 Work we have some questions now.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:32.620 --> 01:16:36.316 Going back to two concerns about enhancement,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:36.320 --> 01:16:39.119 so we're going to shift a little bit here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:39.120 --> 01:16:41.108 You argue against enhancement  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:41.108 --> 01:16:43.096 of one child potential.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:43.100 --> 01:16:45.235 How does that influence the opposite action?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:45.240 --> 01:16:46.734 That is, a decision to terminate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:46.734 --> 01:16:47.730 a pregnancy when informed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:47.780 --> 01:16:48.900 of the genetic impairment,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:48.900 --> 01:16:50.408 such as Down syndrome?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:50.408 --> 01:16:51.916 What about pre implantation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:51.916 --> 01:16:54.289 decisions to use or not use a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.829001171666667

01:16:54.289 --> 01:16:55.844 genetically abnormal embryo in IVF,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687443231428571  
01:16:56.200 --> 01:17:01.030 right? Well, this is really an important.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.687443231428571  
01:17:01.030 --> 01:17:04.398 Question. And. It depends.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.687443231428571  
01:17:04.398 --> 01:17:08.608 I mean terminating a pregnancy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.880889121333334  
01:17:11.410 --> 01:17:14.714 On to avoid it goes back to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.880889121333334  
01:17:14.714 --> 01:17:18.052 discussion we were having about the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.880889121333334  
01:17:18.052 --> 01:17:20.620 distinction between a health related.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:23.750 --> 01:17:28.914 Ailment and. A kind of choice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:28.914 --> 01:17:32.940 now Down syndrome Down syndrome.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:32.940 --> 01:17:37.008 There are many who would argue.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:37.010 --> 01:17:38.741 Including parents of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:38.741 --> 01:17:41.049 children with Down syndrome.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:41.050 --> 01:17:46.680 That Down syndrome? Is.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:46.680 --> 01:17:52.022 Not inconsistent with leading. A.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:52.022 --> 01:17:55.874 A full and satisfying human life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125  
01:17:55.880 --> 01:17:58.526 With distinctive contributions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80292125

01:17:58.526 --> 01:18:02.054 And sources of joy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:04.450 --> 01:18:08.118 For the child and for the parents.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:08.120 --> 01:18:10.424 And many parents have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:10.424 --> 01:18:12.728 written and spoken movingly.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:12.730 --> 01:18:17.170 About what they had learned in human terms.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:17.170 --> 01:18:20.368 Raising a child with Down syndrome,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:20.370 --> 01:18:24.600 they would contest vigorously the notion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:24.600 --> 01:18:28.890 That this constitutes a health impairment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:28.890 --> 01:18:32.880 that justifies terminating a pregnancy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:32.880 --> 01:18:38.958 So. I think that. This is a.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:38.960 --> 01:18:42.460 This is morally complicated terrain.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:42.460 --> 01:18:47.710 Now there are other. Conditions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:47.710 --> 01:18:54.189 That cannot be described in a similar way.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871362445714286

01:18:54.190 --> 01:18:57.494 As blessings or as distinctive ways of being.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:18:59.970 --> 01:19:06.358 Clear, unambiguous, genetic abnormalities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:06.360 --> 01:19:08.709 That lead to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:08.710 --> 01:19:12.170 Serious health impairments and

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:12.170 --> 01:19:15.630 radically reduced life expectancy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:15.630 --> 01:19:18.612 That would be in a different category

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:18.612 --> 01:19:22.190 and the line is not clear and distinct,

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:22.190 --> 01:19:24.087 nor is it a merely biological line.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:24.090 --> 01:19:27.490 This is back to our discussion about what

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:27.490 --> 01:19:29.979 constitutes Health and Human flourishing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:29.980 --> 01:19:34.226 But terminating a pregnancy?

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:34.226 --> 01:19:39.630 For the OR or selecting an IDF.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:39.630 --> 01:19:45.895 For. Let's say picking and choosing

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:45.895 --> 01:19:48.843 on consumerist like grounds.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:48.850 --> 01:19:50.656 Wanting a boy rather than a girl.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:50.660 --> 01:19:53.408 Let's say sex selection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:53.408 --> 01:19:56.843 To take one straightforward example.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:56.850 --> 01:19:59.608 That seems to me unrelated to health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:19:59.610 --> 01:20:03.246 That seems to me more like a eugenic choice,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.914373175

01:20:03.250 --> 01:20:05.020 more like a consumer choice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:07.530 --> 01:20:13.728 Where as selecting for against embryos  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:13.728 --> 01:20:18.779 with serious health related genetic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:18.779 --> 01:20:21.758 abnormalities, that's different.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:21.760 --> 01:20:24.118 Even though there may be borderline  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:24.118 --> 01:20:26.260 cases where we could debate,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:26.260 --> 01:20:30.698 you know what counts as a serious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:30.698 --> 01:20:34.080 health related genetic abnormality,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:34.080 --> 01:20:36.828 which I think morally.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:36.830 --> 01:20:40.148 Would be different from simply choosing if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:40.148 --> 01:20:46.110 if as if we if we could screen embryos for,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:46.110 --> 01:20:49.510 you know, IQ, let's say or athletic prowess.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:49.510 --> 01:20:52.030 If we could do that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:52.030 --> 01:20:54.630 Then it becomes really morally  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:54.630 --> 01:20:56.190 analogous to enhancement.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:20:56.190 --> 01:21:01.720 Then it becomes a kind of eugenic. Choice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:01.720 --> 01:21:04.667 Rather than a choice that is genuinely

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:04.667 --> 01:21:07.430 for the sake of the health of the child.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:07.430 --> 01:21:10.268 So sex selection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:10.270 --> 01:21:13.372 I would say purely preferential sex

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:13.372 --> 01:21:16.590 selection would fall on the the eugenic,

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:16.590 --> 01:21:18.486 not the health related

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:18.486 --> 01:21:20.450 or the medical purpose,

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:20.450 --> 01:21:23.150 and would be morally objectionable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:23.150 --> 01:21:25.505 I think terminating a pregnancy

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:25.505 --> 01:21:28.094 because you want a boy rather than a

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:28.094 --> 01:21:30.180 girl which happens in many parts of

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:30.180 --> 01:21:33.380 the world is morally objectionable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:33.380 --> 01:21:35.105 And it's clearly unrelated to

NOTE Confidence: 0.83770545875

01:21:35.105 --> 01:21:36.140 a medical purpose.

NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:21:38.290 --> 01:21:41.870 Down syndrome I, I think.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:21:41.870 --> 01:21:44.966 Well, I've I've spoken about the.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:21:44.970 --> 01:21:49.310 The moral argument against selecting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:21:49.310 --> 01:21:52.790 against a fetus with Down syndrome,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:21:52.790 --> 01:21:56.252 but there are other clear genetic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:21:56.252 --> 01:21:58.762 abnormalities that would be such  
NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:21:58.762 --> 01:22:01.162 significant impairments that they would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.709049054

01:22:01.162 --> 01:22:03.418 they would be in a different category.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.891356165238095

01:22:04.950 --> 01:22:07.435 And perhaps one way of measuring that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.891356165238095

01:22:07.435 --> 01:22:09.611 Michael just simply be the degree  
NOTE Confidence: 0.891356165238095

01:22:09.611 --> 01:22:11.356 of suffering when might anticipate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.891356165238095

01:22:11.356 --> 01:22:13.339 for the child. That you know.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091

01:22:14.840 --> 01:22:15.960 I think that would certainly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091

01:22:15.960 --> 01:22:17.260 be an important part of it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091

01:22:17.260 --> 01:22:19.492 That would be a very important part of it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091

01:22:19.492 --> 01:22:22.518 and and what parents have Down syndrome,

NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091  
01:22:22.520 --> 01:22:23.714 children emphasized.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091  
01:22:23.714 --> 01:22:27.296 Is the richness of the life  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091  
01:22:27.296 --> 01:22:30.950 and the happiness of the life.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091  
01:22:30.950 --> 01:22:33.718 So I think the.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091  
01:22:33.720 --> 01:22:35.448 I think the prospect of suffering  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091  
01:22:35.448 --> 01:22:37.066 is certainly a very important  
NOTE Confidence: 0.952070770909091  
01:22:37.066 --> 01:22:38.678 ingredient in the judgment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:40.380 --> 01:22:41.580 I I think you know.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:41.580 --> 01:22:44.170 Interestingly, a lot of disability  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:44.170 --> 01:22:47.880 advocates bring up the fact that healthy,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:47.880 --> 01:22:50.056 able bodied individuals grossly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:50.056 --> 01:22:53.320 overestimate the decrement in quality of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:53.404 --> 01:22:56.278 life that certain displays would play,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:56.280 --> 01:22:58.350 and that and that when,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892  
01:22:58.350 --> 01:23:00.800 when previously able bodied people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:00.800 --> 01:23:02.566 become disabled, they actually,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:02.566 --> 01:23:04.531 or they realize that actually  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:04.531 --> 01:23:06.243 does not really significantly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:06.243 --> 01:23:08.997 decrease their quality of life and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:09.000 --> 01:23:10.800 And this is something that's come up a lot.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:10.800 --> 01:23:14.328 In particular, during the COVID pandemic.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:14.330 --> 01:23:15.766 With disability advocates really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:15.766 --> 01:23:17.561 underscoring the importance not to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:17.561 --> 01:23:19.540 use quality of life considerations.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:19.540 --> 01:23:20.466 For example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:20.466 --> 01:23:23.244 in in in decisions about rationing,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:23.250 --> 01:23:24.308 scarce resources.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:24.308 --> 01:23:27.482 Because because of these sort of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:27.482 --> 01:23:29.898 institutional ableism of the medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:29.898 --> 01:23:32.448 profession and of society in general,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:32.450 --> 01:23:35.530 and so it's it's you know that while it it

NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:35.610 --> 01:23:38.544 it does seem like that would be a great,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:38.550 --> 01:23:42.039 or at least a helpful metric to use it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:42.039 --> 01:23:44.460 it too is really fraught with a lot of.

NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:44.460 --> 01:23:49.056 Of of Ablist thinking that that that those

NOTE Confidence: 0.915338892

01:23:49.056 --> 01:23:51.702 in the establishment are often prone to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:23:53.500 --> 01:23:56.029 Yes, and if I could just add Sarah this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:23:56.030 --> 01:23:58.628 the ableist prejudices

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:23:58.628 --> 01:24:01.226 that you're describing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:01.230 --> 01:24:02.814 Really have a long history and

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:02.814 --> 01:24:04.949 the name of that history is the

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:04.949 --> 01:24:06.639 history of the eugenics movement.

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:06.640 --> 01:24:10.105 And so I think we need to think very

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:10.105 --> 01:24:13.120 hard about the ablest prejudices

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:13.120 --> 01:24:18.120 and the the Providence of them in

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:18.120 --> 01:24:20.496 eugenic thinking and, and that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:20.496 --> 01:24:22.482 I think should should should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:22.482 --> 01:24:24.834 bring us up short in in failing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:24.834 --> 01:24:27.375 to reflect on those on ableist  
NOTE Confidence: 0.858770886666667

01:24:27.375 --> 01:24:29.083 prejudices in this context.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:30.240 --> 01:24:31.058 Absolutely alright.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:31.058 --> 01:24:34.330 Well we have only a few minutes left,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:34.330 --> 01:24:36.430 so one more question that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:36.430 --> 01:24:38.530 sort of piggybacks onto this?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:38.530 --> 01:24:39.780 It's a two part question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:39.780 --> 01:24:41.528 so it's it's a lot, but well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:41.528 --> 01:24:43.960 you can take a quick stab at it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:43.960 --> 01:24:45.572 A question regarding enhancement.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:45.572 --> 01:24:47.587 Many have suggested that generalized  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:47.587 --> 01:24:49.020 artificial intelligence is very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:49.020 --> 01:24:50.640 likely within the next century.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:50.640 --> 01:24:52.295 Some have suggested that enhancement

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:52.295 --> 01:24:54.090 of humans is important in order

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:54.090 --> 01:24:55.735 to be able to deal with impending

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:55.735 --> 01:24:56.974 artificial intelligence on anything

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:56.974 --> 01:24:58.559 approaching a basis of equality.

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:24:58.560 --> 01:25:00.254 Your thoughts, and then the second part.

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:25:00.260 --> 01:25:01.808 And I'll let you choose which

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:25:01.808 --> 01:25:03.620 which you want to address more,

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:25:03.620 --> 01:25:05.500 because again of our limitations,

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:25:05.500 --> 01:25:06.610 assuming that enhancement is coming

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:25:06.610 --> 01:25:08.200 for the sake of this discussion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:25:08.200 --> 01:25:10.384 do you have thoughts on how to address

NOTE Confidence: 0.941897017

01:25:10.384 --> 01:25:11.889 concerns regarding worsening inequity?

NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:14.170 --> 01:25:16.986 Well, I I'm aware that there are people

NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:16.986 --> 01:25:19.649 who who would make this argument,

NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:19.650 --> 01:25:23.850 since artificial intelligence is looming.

NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:23.850 --> 01:25:25.668 If we don't want our machines  
NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:25.668 --> 01:25:27.389 to be smarter than we are,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:27.390 --> 01:25:30.206 we'd better do what we can to enhance  
NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:30.210 --> 01:25:35.950 our own cognitive capacities, but.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:35.950 --> 01:25:39.734 1st. I think that we need to reflect  
NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:39.734 --> 01:25:42.112 on what artificial intelligence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:42.112 --> 01:25:46.718 consists in and what it can do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.859783651428571

01:25:46.720 --> 01:25:48.550 Whether it poses a threat?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:25:50.680 --> 01:25:55.308 2. Our own capacities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:25:55.310 --> 01:25:59.770 Really depends on the purposes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:25:59.770 --> 01:26:03.340 To which artificial intelligence is put?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:03.340 --> 01:26:06.550 If it's used to determine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:06.550 --> 01:26:08.580 Who should be convicted of a crime?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:08.580 --> 01:26:13.288 For example AI algorithmic?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:13.290 --> 01:26:16.083 Prediction models or if it's used to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:16.083 --> 01:26:18.569 determine how to grade the paper,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:18.570 --> 01:26:21.874 is the philosophy papers in my class,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:21.880 --> 01:26:23.952 or if it's used to determine whom

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:23.952 --> 01:26:26.037 to arrest her and where to send,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:26.040 --> 01:26:29.856 in what neighborhoods to send police.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:29.860 --> 01:26:33.412 Or if it's used to determine how better

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:33.412 --> 01:26:36.230 to target advertising to people so

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:36.230 --> 01:26:40.540 that they will consume more, I mean.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:40.540 --> 01:26:44.985 Or if it's used to to replace.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:44.990 --> 01:26:48.558 Workers rather than used.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:48.558 --> 01:26:53.920 To augment the productivity of workers.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:53.920 --> 01:26:57.226 There are a multitude of possible

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:26:57.226 --> 01:27:00.960 uses and purposes of AI technology,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:00.960 --> 01:27:05.258 and whether these weather AI is threatening.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:05.260 --> 01:27:08.028 Or whether it's liberating.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:08.030 --> 01:27:10.746 Depends not so much on the technology,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:10.750 --> 01:27:14.862 but on the purposes to which we put it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:14.862 --> 01:27:17.634 So I think once one recognizes that

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:17.634 --> 01:27:20.347 it's not a technological matter,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:20.350 --> 01:27:24.130 AI is coming as if it were a fact of nature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:24.130 --> 01:27:27.482 Only a technological development.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:27.482 --> 01:27:30.834 And we had better.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:30.840 --> 01:27:33.280 Better enhance our genetic

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:33.280 --> 01:27:36.330 cognitive capacities to keep up.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:36.330 --> 01:27:38.358 I think that misunderstands

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:38.358 --> 01:27:40.893 the role that human judgment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:40.900 --> 01:27:42.986 and I would say also going back

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:42.986 --> 01:27:45.279 to the common good civic judgment.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:45.280 --> 01:27:47.890 Could play in determining how

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:47.890 --> 01:27:51.100 exactly we want to develop AI

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:51.100 --> 01:27:53.590 technology and for what ends.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:53.590 --> 01:27:57.010 I would rather we focus our deliberation

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:27:57.010 --> 01:28:01.390 as democratic citizens on that question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:01.390 --> 01:28:06.251 Then assume that AI is a technologically

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:06.251 --> 01:28:08.556 determined force of nature to

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:08.556 --> 01:28:11.129 which we will have to adapt,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:11.130 --> 01:28:13.810 and that if we want to catch up and hold

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:13.877 --> 01:28:16.685 our own against these autonomous machines,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:16.690 --> 01:28:19.364 we'll have to crank up our own genetics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:19.364 --> 01:28:20.884 I think that's the wrong

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:20.884 --> 01:28:22.330 way to think about it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:22.330 --> 01:28:23.970 I think it's a disempowering.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:23.970 --> 01:28:27.520 Way to think about technology.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:27.520 --> 01:28:32.290 Both the technology of AI and the

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:32.290 --> 01:28:35.990 genetic technologies of enhancement,

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:35.990 --> 01:28:40.016 it assumes that technology is a

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:40.016 --> 01:28:43.920 determined force rather than and it

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:43.920 --> 01:28:48.784 forgets the importance of of our deciding.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:48.784 --> 01:28:53.200 Based on human and civic considerations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:53.200 --> 01:28:57.586 How technology should be used to

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:28:57.586 --> 01:29:00.140 advance human flourishing and

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:29:00.140 --> 01:29:01.940 to promote the common good?

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:29:01.940 --> 01:29:04.383 So that's how I suggest we we

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:29:04.383 --> 01:29:06.678 think about the prospect of AI.

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:29:06.680 --> 01:29:08.798 On the one hand and cognitive

NOTE Confidence: 0.7374601525

01:29:08.798 --> 01:29:10.210 enhancement on the other.

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369

01:29:10.870 --> 01:29:13.180 Well, thanks, that is beautifully said

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369

01:29:13.180 --> 01:29:16.341 and I and I think that's a perfect

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369

01:29:16.341 --> 01:29:18.866 note upon which to end because we

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369

01:29:18.866 --> 01:29:20.952 are actually a hair over our hearts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369

01:29:20.960 --> 01:29:23.704 Stop in fact, but I I'm really so

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369

01:29:23.704 --> 01:29:26.226 pleased and so grateful that that

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369

01:29:26.226 --> 01:29:28.426 we could have this discussion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:28.430 --> 01:29:29.750 Thank you so much again,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:29.750 --> 01:29:31.070 Professor Sandel for for taking  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:31.070 --> 01:29:32.590 the time to speak with us.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:32.590 --> 01:29:35.480 This was a really really enlightening and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:35.480 --> 01:29:38.330 and very important and timely discussion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:38.330 --> 01:29:41.340 And I'm so glad that that we could host you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:41.340 --> 01:29:44.728 Virtually, and I would like to thank  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:44.728 --> 01:29:46.918 everyone else for coming tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:46.918 --> 01:29:49.760 And since this is our last session  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:49.839 --> 01:29:51.419 of the calendar year,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:51.420 --> 01:29:53.940 I'd like to wish everyone a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:53.940 --> 01:29:55.640 happy holiday season as well.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:55.640 --> 01:29:57.607 And lots of health and happiness in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:57.607 --> 01:29:59.889 the New year and we look forward to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.927890548947369  
01:29:59.889 --> 01:30:02.149 seeing you then mark any less comments.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:03.380 --> 01:30:05.140 No, except thank you to both of you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:05.140 --> 01:30:06.455 Search for a wonderful job

NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:06.455 --> 01:30:07.770 tonight and it's leading this

NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:07.818 --> 01:30:08.870 conversation and Michael for

NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:08.870 --> 01:30:10.448 making the time to join us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:10.450 --> 01:30:11.360 It was a terrific night.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:11.360 --> 01:30:12.362 We're really grateful.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82653609625

01:30:12.362 --> 01:30:13.450 Thank you. Thank

NOTE Confidence: 0.78874302

01:30:13.460 --> 01:30:14.740 you, mark. Thank you, Sarah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78874302

01:30:14.740 --> 01:30:15.708 I've really enjoyed it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8321032

01:30:15.740 --> 01:30:16.668 Thank you so much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.46924833

01:30:18.310 --> 01:30:20.998 That bad? Goodnight