

WEBVTT

NOTE duration: "01:25:55.755"

NOTE Confidence: 0.9390817

00:00:00.160 --> 00:00:01.520 See all of you, for

NOTE Confidence: 0.9390817

00:00:01.520 --> 00:00:03.120 coming. Thank you so much,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9390817

00:00:03.120 --> 00:00:04.160 and, of course, welcome to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9390817

00:00:04.160 --> 00:00:05.040 the folks who are watching

NOTE Confidence: 0.9390817

00:00:05.040 --> 00:00:06.259 on Zoom as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9743995

00:00:06.559 --> 00:00:07.680 And we've got we've got

NOTE Confidence: 0.9743995

00:00:07.680 --> 00:00:08.800 quite a crowd tonight, and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9743995

00:00:08.800 --> 00:00:09.460 I'm delighted.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:11.200 --> 00:00:12.400 My name is Mark Mercurio.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:12.400 --> 00:00:13.280 I'm the co director of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:13.280 --> 00:00:14.865 the program for biomedical ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:15.105 --> 00:00:15.985 And in a minute, I'm

NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:15.985 --> 00:00:16.945 gonna talk about our guest

NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:16.945 --> 00:00:18.145 speaker tonight who is doctor

NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:18.145 --> 00:00:19.904 Farr Kurland. But first, just  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:19.904 --> 00:00:21.185 a little bit of, housekeeping  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:21.185 --> 00:00:22.545 stuff. If you wanna apply  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:22.545 --> 00:00:24.064 for CME, it's not a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:24.064 --> 00:00:25.505 really difficult application, but there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:25.505 --> 00:00:26.724 is the number to text  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571371

00:00:26.785 --> 00:00:27.925 for CME credit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9878915

00:00:28.560 --> 00:00:29.440 For the students who are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9878915

00:00:29.440 --> 00:00:31.380 on the biomedical ethics concentration,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9380587

00:00:32.640 --> 00:00:33.760 we have sign up sheets  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9380587

00:00:33.760 --> 00:00:35.360 here so you get credit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9380587

00:00:35.360 --> 00:00:36.900 for having attended this seminar.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9903667

00:00:37.280 --> 00:00:38.559 And, don't do it during  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9903667

00:00:38.559 --> 00:00:39.200 the talk. So if you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9903667

00:00:39.200 --> 00:00:40.079 haven't done it yet, just  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9903667

00:00:40.079 --> 00:00:41.760 please come up afterwards and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9903667

00:00:41.760 --> 00:00:43.059 sign your name on there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9903667

00:00:43.175 --> 00:00:44.555 and don't take my pen.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9802616

00:00:45.895 --> 00:00:47.095 We're gonna have about a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9802616

00:00:47.095 --> 00:00:48.775 forty five minute lecture by

NOTE Confidence: 0.9802616

00:00:48.775 --> 00:00:49.675 doctor Kirlin.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93980694

00:00:50.215 --> 00:00:51.034 After that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9850723

00:00:51.655 --> 00:00:53.255 I'm gonna invite questions, and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9850723

00:00:53.255 --> 00:00:54.535 I'll moderate a session where

NOTE Confidence: 0.9850723

00:00:54.535 --> 00:00:55.195 you folks,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9198112

00:00:55.575 --> 00:00:56.550 can ask him,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9412498

00:00:56.950 --> 00:00:58.309 questions and talk, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9412498

00:00:58.309 --> 00:00:59.190 we'll have a a group

NOTE Confidence: 0.9412498

00:00:59.190 --> 00:00:59.690 conversation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9646359

00:01:00.230 --> 00:01:01.190 And I think it's gonna

NOTE Confidence: 0.9646359

00:01:01.190 --> 00:01:01.989 go very well. And it's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9646359

00:01:01.989 --> 00:01:03.030 six thirty, and no matter  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9646359

00:01:03.030 --> 00:01:04.390 what, who's talking or what's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9646359

00:01:04.390 --> 00:01:05.830 going on, I will stop  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9646359

00:01:05.830 --> 00:01:07.270 it, no later than six  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9646359

00:01:07.270 --> 00:01:07.770 thirty.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:08.069 --> 00:01:09.690 So fair warning on that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:09.845 --> 00:01:11.205 Let me introduce speaker tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:11.205 --> 00:01:12.005 Someone who I wanted to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:12.005 --> 00:01:12.805 bring here for a long  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:12.805 --> 00:01:14.565 time, and and I think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:14.565 --> 00:01:15.845 that this is, this is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:15.845 --> 00:01:17.444 a wonderful opportunity for us.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:17.444 --> 00:01:18.405 So thank you so much  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:18.405 --> 00:01:20.084 for coming, Farrah. Doctor Farrah  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:20.084 --> 00:01:21.365 Kurland, MD, is the the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9548072

00:01:21.365 --> 00:01:22.825 Josiah Trent professor

NOTE Confidence: 0.975265  
00:01:23.205 --> 00:01:24.185 of medical humanities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9285396  
00:01:24.620 --> 00:01:25.819 in the Trent Center for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9285396  
00:01:25.819 --> 00:01:27.660 Bioethics, Humanities, and History of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9285396  
00:01:27.660 --> 00:01:29.340 Medicine and co director of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9285396  
00:01:29.340 --> 00:01:30.940 the Theology, Medicine, and Culture  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9285396  
00:01:30.940 --> 00:01:31.440 Initiative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99937695  
00:01:31.900 --> 00:01:32.959 at Duke University.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9609069  
00:01:33.500 --> 00:01:34.620 Doctor Kirilin has worked to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9609069  
00:01:34.620 --> 00:01:35.920 bring attention to the intersection  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9609069  
00:01:35.980 --> 00:01:37.660 of medicine, ethics, ethics, and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9609069  
00:01:37.660 --> 00:01:38.160 theology.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9812634  
00:01:38.825 --> 00:01:39.944 In two thousand twelve, he  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9812634  
00:01:39.944 --> 00:01:40.905 helped to found both the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9812634  
00:01:40.905 --> 00:01:42.665 University of Chicago's program on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9812634  
00:01:42.665 --> 00:01:43.725 medicine and religion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96000457

00:01:44.105 --> 00:01:45.545 and the annual conference on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96000457

00:01:45.545 --> 00:01:46.525 medicine and religion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9590494

00:01:46.905 --> 00:01:48.585 Since two thousand fifteen, through  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9590494

00:01:48.585 --> 00:01:49.405 Duke University,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.991045

00:01:49.785 --> 00:01:50.765 divinity school,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97027874

00:01:51.240 --> 00:01:52.920 the TMC initiative, he and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97027874

00:01:52.920 --> 00:01:54.860 colleagues have brought graduate theologic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97027874

00:01:54.920 --> 00:01:56.780 training to those whose vocations  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97027874

00:01:56.920 --> 00:01:57.820 to health care.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97066873

00:01:59.000 --> 00:02:00.120 Starting in twenty twenty three,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97066873

00:02:00.120 --> 00:02:02.040 doctor Koehrling also is working  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97066873

00:02:02.040 --> 00:02:03.720 with colleagues across North America  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97066873

00:02:03.720 --> 00:02:05.615 to develop the Hippocratic Society,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97066873

00:02:05.615 --> 00:02:06.735 so something we talked about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97066873

00:02:06.735 --> 00:02:07.875 just briefly earlier,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9976

00:02:08.975 --> 00:02:10.655 an association whose mission is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9976  
00:02:10.655 --> 00:02:11.555 forming clinicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:11.855 --> 00:02:13.375 in the practice and pursuit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:13.375 --> 00:02:14.735 of good medicine. And this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:14.735 --> 00:02:16.014 is something we're talking about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:16.014 --> 00:02:17.294 maybe, opening a chapter here  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:17.294 --> 00:02:18.575 at Yale. So that conversation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:18.575 --> 00:02:20.480 began today. More to come.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:20.620 --> 00:02:21.900 He is coauthor with Chris  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9737091  
00:02:21.900 --> 00:02:22.400 Tolleson  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8819891  
00:02:22.780 --> 00:02:23.900 of The Way of Medicine,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8819891  
00:02:23.900 --> 00:02:25.520 Ethics in the Healing Profession.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97339517  
00:02:26.460 --> 00:02:27.340 This is a book. He's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97339517  
00:02:27.419 --> 00:02:28.460 well, he's also author of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97339517  
00:02:28.460 --> 00:02:29.340 more than one hundred and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97339517  
00:02:29.340 --> 00:02:30.880 fifty articles and book chapters,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9727401

00:02:31.419 --> 00:02:32.940 in addressing the moral and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9727401

00:02:32.940 --> 00:02:34.080 spiritual dimensions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96121836

00:02:34.445 --> 00:02:36.205 of medical practice. Doctor Kerlin  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96121836

00:02:36.205 --> 00:02:37.585 got his MD from UNC  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98882157

00:02:38.125 --> 00:02:39.405 and did his residency and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98882157

00:02:39.405 --> 00:02:39.905 fellowship.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9844555

00:02:40.445 --> 00:02:42.125 He's an internal medicine physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9844555

00:02:42.125 --> 00:02:43.645 at the University of Chicago  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9844555

00:02:43.645 --> 00:02:44.605 where he was on faculty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9844555

00:02:44.605 --> 00:02:46.525 for many years before moving  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9844555

00:02:46.525 --> 00:02:47.264 to Duke.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9323493

00:02:48.160 --> 00:02:49.600 Doctor Curlin is very well  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9323493

00:02:49.600 --> 00:02:51.300 known in bioethics circles,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8733114

00:02:52.080 --> 00:02:52.480 and,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9481767

00:02:53.360 --> 00:02:54.320 and this is a subject  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9481767

00:02:54.320 --> 00:02:55.120 I don't think we have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9481767  
00:02:55.120 --> 00:02:56.480 broached at least in a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9481767  
00:02:56.480 --> 00:02:58.320 long time here, specifically that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9481767  
00:02:58.320 --> 00:02:58.820 intersection  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440689  
00:02:59.280 --> 00:03:00.100 of conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8378991  
00:03:00.480 --> 00:03:01.860 a religion, and medicine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94300854  
00:03:02.875 --> 00:03:04.155 And there's nobody I can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94300854  
00:03:04.155 --> 00:03:05.455 think of, more  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97444016  
00:03:05.835 --> 00:03:07.115 qualified to speak to us  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97444016  
00:03:07.115 --> 00:03:07.915 about this for a little  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97444016  
00:03:07.915 --> 00:03:09.115 bit. So with that, please  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97444016  
00:03:09.115 --> 00:03:10.315 join me in welcoming doctor  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97444016  
00:03:10.315 --> 00:03:11.055 Farr Kurland.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.66090375  
00:03:13.035 --> 00:03:13.535 Okay.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9553231  
00:03:16.780 --> 00:03:18.780 Thank you. I'm I'm honored  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9553231  
00:03:18.780 --> 00:03:20.240 and delighted to be here  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93765366

00:03:21.180 --> 00:03:22.400 with you this evening.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99186885

00:03:25.340 --> 00:03:25.840 And,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9942927

00:03:26.620 --> 00:03:27.900 I hope this our our  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9942927

00:03:27.900 --> 00:03:29.580 time together will will,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95468473

00:03:30.139 --> 00:03:30.885 shed light,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9697895

00:03:31.444 --> 00:03:32.424 more than heat.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9866771

00:03:33.044 --> 00:03:33.924 But I do wanna dig  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9866771

00:03:33.924 --> 00:03:34.424 into  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97660923

00:03:35.605 --> 00:03:36.965 a debate and a discussion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97660923

00:03:36.965 --> 00:03:38.325 that has been a point  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97660923

00:03:38.325 --> 00:03:39.525 of some dispute within the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97660923

00:03:39.525 --> 00:03:40.424 field of medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99822235

00:03:40.724 --> 00:03:41.845 and the field of medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99822235

00:03:41.845 --> 00:03:42.345 ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98585534

00:03:43.450 --> 00:03:44.510 Consider these cases.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9825761

00:03:45.130 --> 00:03:46.730 Mister Anderson is a fifty

NOTE Confidence: 0.9825761

00:03:46.730 --> 00:03:47.770 year old man with symptoms

NOTE Confidence: 0.9825761

00:03:47.770 --> 00:03:49.950 of bronchitis who requests antibiotics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9991729

00:03:50.890 --> 00:03:52.970 His physician refuses to prescribe

NOTE Confidence: 0.9991729

00:03:52.970 --> 00:03:53.470 them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9905264

00:03:55.210 --> 00:03:56.650 Miss Parker, a nineteen year

NOTE Confidence: 0.9905264

00:03:56.650 --> 00:03:58.190 old woman with gender dysphoria,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9242156

00:03:59.085 --> 00:04:00.525 requests referral to the gender

NOTE Confidence: 0.9242156

00:04:00.525 --> 00:04:01.025 clinic.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99949306

00:04:01.325 --> 00:04:03.265 Her physician refuses to make

NOTE Confidence: 0.99949306

00:04:03.405 --> 00:04:04.145 the referral.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99888796

00:04:05.645 --> 00:04:06.605 What do we make of

NOTE Confidence: 0.99888796

00:04:06.605 --> 00:04:07.105 these

NOTE Confidence: 0.9993495

00:04:07.405 --> 00:04:07.905 refusals?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9968271

00:04:09.565 --> 00:04:11.005 Two decades ago, colleagues and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9968271

00:04:11.005 --> 00:04:13.105 I surveyed a representative national

NOTE Confidence: 0.97825444

00:04:14.030 --> 00:04:15.470 sample of US, of US  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97825444

00:04:15.470 --> 00:04:17.230 physicians from all specialties, and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97825444

00:04:17.230 --> 00:04:18.450 we asked them the following.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9862317

00:04:19.070 --> 00:04:20.510 If a patient requests a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9862317

00:04:20.510 --> 00:04:22.190 legal medical procedure, but the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9862317

00:04:22.190 --> 00:04:24.190 patient's physician objects to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9862317

00:04:24.190 --> 00:04:26.110 procedure for religious or moral  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9862317

00:04:26.110 --> 00:04:26.610 reasons,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99264383

00:04:27.675 --> 00:04:28.875 One, would it be ethical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99264383

00:04:28.875 --> 00:04:30.255 for the physician to plainly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99264383

00:04:30.315 --> 00:04:31.755 describe to the patient why  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99264383

00:04:31.755 --> 00:04:32.875 he or she objects to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99264383

00:04:32.875 --> 00:04:34.014 the requested procedure?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9533805

00:04:34.635 --> 00:04:35.995 Sixty three percent of US  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9533805

00:04:35.995 --> 00:04:37.294 physicians said yes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9863433

00:04:38.714 --> 00:04:40.154 Two, does the physician have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9863433

00:04:40.154 --> 00:04:41.595 an obligation to present all

NOTE Confidence: 0.9863433

00:04:41.595 --> 00:04:43.380 possible options to the patient,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9663588

00:04:43.940 --> 00:04:45.700 including information about obtaining the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9663588

00:04:45.700 --> 00:04:46.600 requested procedure?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9954003

00:04:47.460 --> 00:04:49.320 Eighty six percent said yes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99828285

00:04:50.260 --> 00:04:51.540 Three, does the physician have

NOTE Confidence: 0.99828285

00:04:51.540 --> 00:04:52.820 an obligation to refer the

NOTE Confidence: 0.99828285

00:04:52.820 --> 00:04:54.580 patient to someone who does

NOTE Confidence: 0.99828285

00:04:54.580 --> 00:04:56.200 not object to the requested

NOTE Confidence: 0.99828285

00:04:56.260 --> 00:04:56.760 procedure?

NOTE Confidence: 0.99891615

00:04:57.525 --> 00:04:58.745 Seventy one percent

NOTE Confidence: 0.912822

00:04:59.045 --> 00:04:59.945 said yes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99463606

00:05:00.645 --> 00:05:02.025 And we found that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9744975

00:05:02.485 --> 00:05:02.985 irreligious

NOTE Confidence: 0.9001607

00:05:03.605 --> 00:05:04.885 physicians, that is to say

NOTE Confidence: 0.9001607

00:05:04.885 --> 00:05:07.065 those with no religious affiliation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9001607

00:05:07.205 --> 00:05:08.725 or or rarely or never  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9001607

00:05:08.725 --> 00:05:10.105 attend religious services,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9920823

00:05:11.220 --> 00:05:12.740 were least likely to believe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9920823

00:05:12.740 --> 00:05:14.339 that doctors may describe their  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9920823

00:05:14.339 --> 00:05:15.479 objections to patients.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99886924

00:05:16.099 --> 00:05:17.220 They were most likely to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99886924

00:05:17.220 --> 00:05:19.139 believe that physicians must present  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99886924

00:05:19.139 --> 00:05:19.880 all options  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9536842

00:05:20.500 --> 00:05:21.539 as well as to believe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9536842

00:05:21.539 --> 00:05:22.199 that physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99929166

00:05:22.819 --> 00:05:23.639 must refer.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9636581

00:05:24.645 --> 00:05:25.765 That study was published in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9636581

00:05:25.765 --> 00:05:26.825 the New England Journal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4449893

00:05:27.205 --> 00:05:27.705 and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9848803

00:05:28.325 --> 00:05:29.765 the subsequent years have brought

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848803  
00:05:29.765 --> 00:05:31.925 an escalating drumbeat of calls  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9848803  
00:05:31.925 --> 00:05:33.385 for the profession of medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92519057  
00:05:33.845 --> 00:05:35.385 and the state if necessary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92519057  
00:05:35.445 --> 00:05:36.645 to reign in what has  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92519057  
00:05:36.645 --> 00:05:37.445 come to be called  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9350044  
00:05:38.040 --> 00:05:38.839 what have come to be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9350044  
00:05:38.839 --> 00:05:39.740 called conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99727577  
00:05:40.520 --> 00:05:41.020 objections  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87910014  
00:05:41.640 --> 00:05:43.100 or I think more accurately  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7123818  
00:05:43.720 --> 00:05:44.220 conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99821806  
00:05:44.600 --> 00:05:45.100 refusals  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9956253  
00:05:45.560 --> 00:05:46.779 by medical practitioners.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98990077  
00:05:47.800 --> 00:05:49.020 A twenty seventeen  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90527165  
00:05:49.560 --> 00:05:51.880 Nijam essay by Ronit Stahl  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90527165  
00:05:51.880 --> 00:05:53.180 and Ezekiel Emanuel,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.986902

00:05:53.615 --> 00:05:55.215 Doctor Emanuel, some of you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.986902

00:05:55.215 --> 00:05:56.415 may recall, had been the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.986902

00:05:56.415 --> 00:05:58.335 most prominent physician in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.986902

00:05:58.335 --> 00:05:59.235 Obama administration.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9496497

00:06:00.735 --> 00:06:01.855 Their essay in, in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9496497

00:06:01.855 --> 00:06:03.295 New England Journal captures the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9496497

00:06:03.295 --> 00:06:05.055 thinking of these critics of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9496497

00:06:05.055 --> 00:06:05.555 conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99912405

00:06:06.175 --> 00:06:06.675 refusals.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9374849

00:06:07.720 --> 00:06:08.460 They write,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9098203

00:06:09.080 --> 00:06:10.220 health care providers  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9149625

00:06:10.760 --> 00:06:11.820 note that language.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9653073

00:06:12.680 --> 00:06:13.480 We'll come back to that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9653073

00:06:13.480 --> 00:06:15.160 language of provider. But health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9653073

00:06:15.160 --> 00:06:16.839 care providers have a primary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9653073

00:06:16.839 --> 00:06:18.860 interest to promote the well-being

NOTE Confidence: 0.9653073

00:06:19.080 --> 00:06:19.820 of patients.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98681

00:06:20.685 --> 00:06:21.964 This defines what they call

NOTE Confidence: 0.98681

00:06:21.964 --> 00:06:23.665 the physician's role morality,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96165276

00:06:24.525 --> 00:06:26.305 which requires they continue

NOTE Confidence: 0.9977425

00:06:26.925 --> 00:06:29.565 offering and providing accepted medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.9977425

00:06:29.565 --> 00:06:30.065 interventions

NOTE Confidence: 0.9166247

00:06:30.605 --> 00:06:32.305 in accordance with patients'

NOTE Confidence: 0.9963199

00:06:32.765 --> 00:06:34.065 reasoned decisions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99981326

00:06:35.620 --> 00:06:36.440 Are they right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.94185376

00:06:37.620 --> 00:06:39.080 Let's consider that together.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99945575

00:06:39.539 --> 00:06:41.240 Starting with the fact that

NOTE Confidence: 0.99690306

00:06:41.779 --> 00:06:43.080 physicians commonly

NOTE Confidence: 0.93237865

00:06:43.380 --> 00:06:45.400 refuse to provide clinical interventions

NOTE Confidence: 0.93237865

00:06:45.460 --> 00:06:46.599 that patients request.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9799272

00:06:47.555 --> 00:06:49.335 This is often overlooked, but,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97779125

00:06:49.955 --> 00:06:51.315 they do. And they do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97779125

00:06:51.315 --> 00:06:52.695 so even when those interventions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97779125

00:06:52.835 --> 00:06:53.575 are legal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9984253

00:06:53.955 --> 00:06:55.395 and permitted by the medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9984253

00:06:55.395 --> 00:06:55.895 profession.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9391304

00:06:56.995 --> 00:06:58.855 Now for centuries, of course,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9777204

00:07:00.050 --> 00:07:02.229 in, the the medical ethics,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9306283

00:07:02.529 --> 00:07:04.050 realm, physicians who took the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9306283

00:07:04.050 --> 00:07:05.190 Hippocratic oath  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95647943

00:07:05.569 --> 00:07:06.930 promised to act for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95647943

00:07:06.930 --> 00:07:08.370 benefit of the sick according  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95647943

00:07:08.370 --> 00:07:09.750 to my ability and judgment,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92149955

00:07:10.370 --> 00:07:12.050 to refuse requests for deadly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92149955

00:07:12.050 --> 00:07:13.509 drugs and abortive patients,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97102207

00:07:14.354 --> 00:07:15.955 to practice in purity and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97102207

00:07:15.955 --> 00:07:17.474 holiness, to guard my life

NOTE Confidence: 0.97102207

00:07:17.474 --> 00:07:18.914 and art, and to enter

NOTE Confidence: 0.97102207

00:07:18.914 --> 00:07:20.115 houses for the benefit of

NOTE Confidence: 0.97102207

00:07:20.115 --> 00:07:21.955 the sick remaining free of

NOTE Confidence: 0.97102207

00:07:21.955 --> 00:07:23.875 all intentional injustice and all

NOTE Confidence: 0.97102207

00:07:23.875 --> 00:07:24.375 mischief.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9810653

00:07:27.210 --> 00:07:28.810 So for for the history

NOTE Confidence: 0.9810653

00:07:28.810 --> 00:07:30.090 of medicine, there has been,

NOTE Confidence: 0.985563

00:07:30.890 --> 00:07:33.210 some profession to refuse certain

NOTE Confidence: 0.985563

00:07:33.210 --> 00:07:34.110 kinds of requests.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99004364

00:07:34.490 --> 00:07:36.330 But in all eras, including

NOTE Confidence: 0.99004364

00:07:36.330 --> 00:07:36.990 the present,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9885858

00:07:37.610 --> 00:07:39.450 physicians refuse things they believe

NOTE Confidence: 0.9885858

00:07:39.450 --> 00:07:40.670 will harm patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.9985253

00:07:41.305 --> 00:07:42.664 and refuse things they believe

NOTE Confidence: 0.9985253

00:07:42.664 --> 00:07:44.604 are not medically indicated.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9851362

00:07:45.944 --> 00:07:47.785 Surgeons refuse to operate when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9851362

00:07:47.785 --> 00:07:49.384 they believe a surgery is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9851362

00:07:49.384 --> 00:07:50.764 unlikely to be successful,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9995833

00:07:51.544 --> 00:07:52.044 and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9896653

00:07:52.824 --> 00:07:54.264 they refuse in those cases  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9896653

00:07:54.264 --> 00:07:55.465 whether or not all of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9896653

00:07:55.465 --> 00:07:56.845 their colleagues agree.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9996448

00:07:57.760 --> 00:07:58.979 Primary care physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.954961

00:07:59.600 --> 00:08:01.620 frequently refuse requests for antibiotics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.954961

00:08:01.680 --> 00:08:02.800 when they think the patient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.954961

00:08:02.800 --> 00:08:03.940 has a common cold  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628651

00:08:04.720 --> 00:08:05.840 as we see in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628651

00:08:05.840 --> 00:08:07.139 case of mister Anderson.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95308834

00:08:08.160 --> 00:08:09.440 We might say, I think,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95308834

00:08:09.440 --> 00:08:10.419 without controversy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9839603

00:08:11.014 --> 00:08:13.755 that doctors have always refused

NOTE Confidence: 0.9839603

00:08:13.815 --> 00:08:15.335 request to do things that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9839603

00:08:15.335 --> 00:08:17.014 they believe are inconsistent with

NOTE Confidence: 0.9839603

00:08:17.014 --> 00:08:18.235 their professional obligations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.962893

00:08:19.495 --> 00:08:21.575 Inconsistent that is with good

NOTE Confidence: 0.962893

00:08:21.575 --> 00:08:22.075 medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99589044

00:08:23.095 --> 00:08:23.595 So

NOTE Confidence: 0.9756915

00:08:24.700 --> 00:08:25.900 insofar as that's true, it

NOTE Confidence: 0.9756915

00:08:25.900 --> 00:08:27.180 seems to me that critics

NOTE Confidence: 0.9756915

00:08:27.180 --> 00:08:28.080 of conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.9995148

00:08:28.540 --> 00:08:29.040 refusals

NOTE Confidence: 0.99918985

00:08:29.660 --> 00:08:31.600 cannot be bothered by refusals

NOTE Confidence: 0.90718794

00:08:32.059 --> 00:08:32.880 per se,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9995095

00:08:33.740 --> 00:08:34.800 but only by

NOTE Confidence: 0.9995964

00:08:35.179 --> 00:08:35.679 conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.99715596

00:08:36.140 --> 00:08:37.820 refusals. That must be the

NOTE Confidence: 0.99715596

00:08:37.820 --> 00:08:38.320 key.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9173754

00:08:39.485 --> 00:08:41.165 Well, then what makes a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9173754

00:08:41.165 --> 00:08:41.665 refusal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9970714

00:08:42.205 --> 00:08:42.705 conscientious?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9265708

00:08:43.965 --> 00:08:45.965 The term conscientious means according  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9265708

00:08:45.965 --> 00:08:47.025 to Merriam Webster,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9967165

00:08:47.485 --> 00:08:49.325 governed by or conforming to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9967165

00:08:49.325 --> 00:08:50.945 the dictates of conscience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99197435

00:08:52.230 --> 00:08:53.750 What's the conscience? Well, the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99197435

00:08:53.750 --> 00:08:55.050 conscience is simply  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9188902

00:08:55.429 --> 00:08:56.490 the human faculty.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96268857

00:08:57.910 --> 00:08:59.110 Most people would call this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96268857

00:08:59.110 --> 00:09:00.730 the human faculty of reason,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96268857

00:09:00.950 --> 00:09:02.390 but the human faculty that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96268857

00:09:02.390 --> 00:09:03.929 judges the moral quality,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8933635

00:09:04.390 --> 00:09:05.770 the goodness or badness

NOTE Confidence: 0.94001436  
00:09:06.415 --> 00:09:08.195 of one's own actions,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987012  
00:09:08.895 --> 00:09:09.395 either  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9985664  
00:09:09.934 --> 00:09:10.755 past actions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97487193  
00:09:11.295 --> 00:09:12.515 or future actions,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94984984  
00:09:12.975 --> 00:09:14.035 foreseen actions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9860534  
00:09:14.815 --> 00:09:16.335 To say it's that faculty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9860534  
00:09:16.335 --> 00:09:18.095 that judged whether it was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9860534  
00:09:18.095 --> 00:09:19.295 all things considered a good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9860534  
00:09:19.295 --> 00:09:20.460 thing for you to come  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9860534  
00:09:20.620 --> 00:09:21.980 to this talk versus do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9860534  
00:09:21.980 --> 00:09:22.940 something else that you might  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9860534  
00:09:22.940 --> 00:09:23.520 have done.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9848737  
00:09:23.900 --> 00:09:25.440 To say a physician's refusal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9848737  
00:09:25.500 --> 00:09:27.200 is conscientious then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9664106  
00:09:27.580 --> 00:09:28.620 is simply to say that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9664106

00:09:28.620 --> 00:09:30.140 the refusal is based on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9664106

00:09:30.140 --> 00:09:31.280 the physician's judgment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98513603

00:09:32.059 --> 00:09:33.520 about what he or she  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98513603

00:09:33.660 --> 00:09:34.540 ought to do in a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98513603

00:09:34.540 --> 00:09:35.440 given case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99749976

00:09:35.945 --> 00:09:36.925 all things considered.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99491113

00:09:38.745 --> 00:09:41.165 Critics of conscientious refusals invariably  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99491113

00:09:41.464 --> 00:09:43.485 treat conscience as something other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99491113

00:09:43.785 --> 00:09:45.005 than what I just described.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9709436

00:09:46.184 --> 00:09:47.804 They tend to treat conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9709436

00:09:47.865 --> 00:09:49.065 not as a faculty of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9709436

00:09:49.065 --> 00:09:49.565 reason,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993031

00:09:50.410 --> 00:09:51.450 but as a set of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993031

00:09:51.450 --> 00:09:53.150 arbitrary and idiosyncratic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9953389

00:09:53.770 --> 00:09:54.830 personal values.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.974608

00:09:55.610 --> 00:09:57.450 So Ronit Stahl and Ezekiel

NOTE Confidence: 0.974608  
00:09:57.450 --> 00:09:59.690 Emanuel equate conscience with appeal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.974608  
00:09:59.690 --> 00:10:00.510 to, quote,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9529502  
00:10:00.890 --> 00:10:02.970 personal religious or moral beliefs,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9529502  
00:10:02.970 --> 00:10:03.645 end quote.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9588822  
00:10:04.125 --> 00:10:05.825 The American Congress of Obstetricians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9588822  
00:10:05.965 --> 00:10:06.625 and Gynecologists,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83055997  
00:10:07.165 --> 00:10:07.665 ACOG,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97611225  
00:10:08.605 --> 00:10:10.925 associates conscientiousness with a need  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97611225  
00:10:10.925 --> 00:10:11.804 to be able to sleep  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97611225  
00:10:11.804 --> 00:10:13.485 at night and a defense  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97611225  
00:10:13.485 --> 00:10:13.985 against  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9968246  
00:10:14.365 --> 00:10:15.265 moral disintegration.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98251164  
00:10:16.845 --> 00:10:18.304 With conscience so construed,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99932444  
00:10:19.100 --> 00:10:20.559 the physician who acts  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99984115  
00:10:21.100 --> 00:10:21.600 conscientiously  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99768937

00:10:22.300 --> 00:10:23.679 is focused on himself.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9952772

00:10:24.620 --> 00:10:26.140 He's focused on his personal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9952772

00:10:26.140 --> 00:10:26.640 values,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99948335

00:10:27.179 --> 00:10:28.780 his own needs to maintain  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99948335

00:10:28.780 --> 00:10:29.280 integrity  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9617511

00:10:30.059 --> 00:10:31.580 rather than being focused on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9617511

00:10:31.580 --> 00:10:32.320 the good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99096453

00:10:32.940 --> 00:10:34.300 and what is required of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99096453

00:10:34.300 --> 00:10:36.135 him in in the situation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99096453

00:10:36.275 --> 00:10:37.815 that he faces.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.967692

00:10:38.595 --> 00:10:40.434 And in this construal, he  
NOTE Confidence: 0.967692

00:10:40.434 --> 00:10:41.495 looks like this,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9979039

00:10:41.955 --> 00:10:43.654 an entitled white guy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9823524

00:10:44.434 --> 00:10:46.275 acting self protective and self  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9823524

00:10:46.275 --> 00:10:47.815 righteous at the same time.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.895122

00:10:50.200 --> 00:10:51.559 So Stalin and Emmanuel contend

NOTE Confidence: 0.895122  
00:10:51.559 --> 00:10:53.160 that to follow conscience in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.895122  
00:10:53.160 --> 00:10:54.620 refusing a patient's request,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98363674  
00:10:55.320 --> 00:10:56.700 as they put it, violates  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98363674  
00:10:56.760 --> 00:10:58.540 the central tenet of professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98363674  
00:10:58.760 --> 00:11:00.279 role morality in the field  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98363674  
00:11:00.279 --> 00:11:00.940 of medicine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99880517  
00:11:01.475 --> 00:11:03.255 The patient comes first.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86701775  
00:11:04.115 --> 00:11:06.295 Physicians' personal commitments they add  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86701775  
00:11:06.595 --> 00:11:08.995 cannot outweigh outweigh the interests  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86701775  
00:11:08.995 --> 00:11:09.655 of patients.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9720691  
00:11:12.675 --> 00:11:14.115 These construals of what the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9720691  
00:11:14.115 --> 00:11:15.815 conscience is and does,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9107535  
00:11:16.720 --> 00:11:18.100 I think, are misconstruals,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99953234  
00:11:19.040 --> 00:11:19.700 and they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994015  
00:11:20.160 --> 00:11:21.860 lead critics to make unsupportable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994015

00:11:22.160 --> 00:11:22.660 claims.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991895

00:11:23.600 --> 00:11:24.420 Some claim  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9775467

00:11:25.040 --> 00:11:26.580 that a clinician who refuses  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9775467

00:11:26.720 --> 00:11:28.960 a patient's request thereby allows  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9775467

00:11:28.960 --> 00:11:29.905 the clinician's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97628427

00:11:30.845 --> 00:11:32.525 conscience to trump the patient's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97628427

00:11:32.525 --> 00:11:33.025 conscience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9835683

00:11:34.684 --> 00:11:36.625 But this is a contradiction  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9835683

00:11:36.925 --> 00:11:38.465 in terms if the conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9835683

00:11:38.525 --> 00:11:39.965 is the faculty that judges  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9835683

00:11:39.965 --> 00:11:41.105 one's own actions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99274904

00:11:42.949 --> 00:11:44.009 Then consciences  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99826366

00:11:44.309 --> 00:11:45.769 cannot trump one another  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97492504

00:11:46.149 --> 00:11:48.470 for no two consciences judge  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97492504

00:11:48.470 --> 00:11:50.389 the same thing. Your conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97492504

00:11:50.389 --> 00:11:52.490 judges your actions. My conscience

NOTE Confidence: 0.97492504

00:11:52.550 --> 00:11:53.690 judges my actions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9723483

00:11:56.625 --> 00:11:57.905 Same thing. So the patient's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9723483

00:11:57.905 --> 00:11:59.685 conscience judges the patient's actions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9723483

00:11:59.825 --> 00:12:01.825 the clinician's conscience judges their

NOTE Confidence: 0.9723483

00:12:01.825 --> 00:12:02.325 action.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99932164

00:12:03.105 --> 00:12:04.485 Each can object

NOTE Confidence: 0.9773215

00:12:04.945 --> 00:12:06.485 to how the other acts,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96276945

00:12:07.025 --> 00:12:08.005 but these objections,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9612964

00:12:08.305 --> 00:12:09.425 which are important, these you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9612964

00:12:09.425 --> 00:12:10.625 can have an ethical objection

NOTE Confidence: 0.9612964

00:12:10.625 --> 00:12:11.820 to how another one acts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9612964

00:12:11.820 --> 00:12:12.700 You may believe that what

NOTE Confidence: 0.9612964

00:12:12.700 --> 00:12:13.840 they're doing is wrong.

NOTE Confidence: 0.986523

00:12:14.220 --> 00:12:15.740 But these objections are not

NOTE Confidence: 0.986523

00:12:15.740 --> 00:12:16.880 conscientious objections.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9944647

00:12:20.220 --> 00:12:21.660 They are moral objections of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9944647

00:12:21.660 --> 00:12:22.559 another type.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94915277

00:12:23.020 --> 00:12:25.260 The conscience judges one's own  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94915277

00:12:25.260 --> 00:12:25.760 actions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9988507

00:12:26.780 --> 00:12:27.280 Now  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9626804

00:12:27.875 --> 00:12:29.395 some claim that physicians should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9626804

00:12:29.395 --> 00:12:32.274 distinguish personal personal conscience from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9626804

00:12:32.274 --> 00:12:33.335 professional conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9583041

00:12:33.714 --> 00:12:35.335 or that physician should balance  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9583041

00:12:35.475 --> 00:12:37.154 one or both against other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9583041

00:12:37.154 --> 00:12:38.675 considerations in deciding what to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9583041

00:12:38.675 --> 00:12:39.975 do in a given case.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9583041

00:12:40.195 --> 00:12:41.235 So for example, in this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9583041

00:12:41.235 --> 00:12:41.975 way of thinking,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993267

00:12:42.360 --> 00:12:43.820 one might have a professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9885917

00:12:44.279 --> 00:12:46.200 conscience that counsels one to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9885917

00:12:46.200 --> 00:12:48.779 refuse antibiotics to mister Anderson

NOTE Confidence: 0.9628046

00:12:49.400 --> 00:12:50.920 and a personal conscience that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9628046

00:12:50.920 --> 00:12:52.779 counsels one to prescribe them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9840398

00:12:54.279 --> 00:12:55.400 Or one might have a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9840398

00:12:55.400 --> 00:12:55.900 conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.9995427

00:12:56.279 --> 00:12:57.660 objection to referring

NOTE Confidence: 0.964081

00:12:58.014 --> 00:12:59.295 miss Parker to the gender

NOTE Confidence: 0.964081

00:12:59.295 --> 00:12:59.795 clinic,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9409158

00:13:00.415 --> 00:13:02.014 but balance that against a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9409158

00:13:02.014 --> 00:13:04.334 punitive professional obligation to make

NOTE Confidence: 0.9409158

00:13:04.334 --> 00:13:05.074 the referral.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9919589

00:13:06.495 --> 00:13:07.855 This whole way of thinking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9919589

00:13:07.855 --> 00:13:10.255 however, can make sense only

NOTE Confidence: 0.9919589

00:13:10.255 --> 00:13:11.535 if the conscience is a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9919589

00:13:11.535 --> 00:13:12.434 set of values.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9939349

00:13:13.500 --> 00:13:14.300 Then one could have a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9939349

00:13:14.300 --> 00:13:15.280 professional conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9951171

00:13:15.660 --> 00:13:17.580 a personal conscience, perhaps others  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9951171

00:13:17.580 --> 00:13:18.320 as well.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99820554

00:13:18.940 --> 00:13:20.300 One could use some other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99820554

00:13:20.300 --> 00:13:21.440 rational faculty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9746685

00:13:21.980 --> 00:13:23.420 to weigh up these different  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9746685

00:13:23.420 --> 00:13:25.485 consciences, one against the other,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98629963

00:13:25.964 --> 00:13:27.404 or to weigh the judgments  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98629963

00:13:27.404 --> 00:13:29.184 of conscience against other considerations.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9881947

00:13:29.964 --> 00:13:31.165 One might even, in this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9881947

00:13:31.165 --> 00:13:31.985 way of thinking,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9740806

00:13:32.524 --> 00:13:34.045 have a reason to act  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9740806

00:13:34.045 --> 00:13:35.184 against conscience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991327

00:13:35.885 --> 00:13:36.385 But  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99882126

00:13:37.245 --> 00:13:38.385 none of these considerations

NOTE Confidence: 0.9966693  
00:13:39.610 --> 00:13:40.670 or none of these construals  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92963207  
00:13:41.210 --> 00:13:42.030 make sense  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99683326  
00:13:42.890 --> 00:13:43.850 in light of what the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99683326  
00:13:43.850 --> 00:13:44.910 conscience is.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97539043  
00:13:46.250 --> 00:13:47.929 The faculty of reason that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97539043  
00:13:47.929 --> 00:13:49.550 renders the final judgment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97261256  
00:13:49.929 --> 00:13:51.530 as regards what one ought  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97261256  
00:13:51.530 --> 00:13:53.050 to do or ought not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97261256  
00:13:53.050 --> 00:13:54.910 to do, all things considered.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994017  
00:13:56.065 --> 00:13:56.804 That is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96694416  
00:13:57.184 --> 00:13:58.545 the conscience is the faculty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96694416  
00:13:58.545 --> 00:14:00.084 that renders the final judgment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96694416  
00:14:00.225 --> 00:14:01.584 about whether one should, all  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96694416  
00:14:01.584 --> 00:14:03.425 things considered, prescribe the antibiotics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96694416  
00:14:03.425 --> 00:14:04.404 to mister Anderson  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9335745

00:14:04.865 --> 00:14:06.385 or whether one should, all  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9335745

00:14:06.385 --> 00:14:08.144 things considered, refer miss Parker  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9335745

00:14:08.144 --> 00:14:09.205 to the gender clinic.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9750113

00:14:09.820 --> 00:14:11.519 And so understood, an individual  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9750113

00:14:11.740 --> 00:14:13.120 has but one conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9711704

00:14:13.820 --> 00:14:15.740 and integrity requires that her  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9711704

00:14:15.740 --> 00:14:17.339 conscience cannot be split into  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9711704

00:14:17.339 --> 00:14:17.839 components.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96967125

00:14:18.540 --> 00:14:19.740 She cannot take up her  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96967125

00:14:19.740 --> 00:14:21.420 judgment of conscience as one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96967125

00:14:21.420 --> 00:14:22.959 consideration among others.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9948078

00:14:23.895 --> 00:14:25.495 While a physician might well  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9948078

00:14:25.495 --> 00:14:26.635 have reason to reconsider  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9740777

00:14:27.175 --> 00:14:28.315 an initial judgment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9490779

00:14:29.255 --> 00:14:30.535 much as a jury might  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9490779

00:14:30.535 --> 00:14:32.715 reconsider its initial judgment after

NOTE Confidence: 0.9320503

00:14:33.095 --> 00:14:34.295 hearing you know, the judgment

NOTE Confidence: 0.9320503

00:14:34.295 --> 00:14:35.575 made after hearing the prosecution,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9320503

00:14:35.575 --> 00:14:37.255 it might reasonably reconsider after

NOTE Confidence: 0.9320503

00:14:37.255 --> 00:14:38.235 hearing the defense.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:41.370 --> 00:14:42.730 It can never be right

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:42.730 --> 00:14:44.410 to act against conscience just

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:44.410 --> 00:14:45.370 as it can never never

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:45.370 --> 00:14:46.750 be right for a jury

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:46.810 --> 00:14:48.569 to declare innocent one that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:48.569 --> 00:14:50.589 it, is persuaded as guilty

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:50.649 --> 00:14:51.850 or declared guilty one is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9410481

00:14:51.850 --> 00:14:53.069 persuaded as innocent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98926234

00:14:53.370 --> 00:14:55.065 For in doing so, one

NOTE Confidence: 0.98926234

00:14:55.065 --> 00:14:56.745 is acting contrary to one's

NOTE Confidence: 0.98926234

00:14:56.745 --> 00:14:58.585 final judgment about how one

NOTE Confidence: 0.98926234

00:14:58.585 --> 00:14:59.945 ought to act. That's a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98926234

00:14:59.945 --> 00:15:01.485 paradigm case, it seems,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997062

00:15:02.185 --> 00:15:03.405 of acting unreasonably.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9977324

00:15:04.905 --> 00:15:05.645 In the meantime,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9838195

00:15:06.265 --> 00:15:07.885 as these cases make clear,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9908274

00:15:08.700 --> 00:15:09.500 we all know that in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9908274

00:15:09.500 --> 00:15:11.680 our morally plural world, conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9908274

00:15:11.820 --> 00:15:12.320 persons,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9537979

00:15:12.780 --> 00:15:14.780 so people acting according to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9537979

00:15:14.780 --> 00:15:15.980 what how they believe they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9537979

00:15:15.980 --> 00:15:16.720 should act,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9899188

00:15:17.740 --> 00:15:19.840 can and do disagree.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986973

00:15:20.964 --> 00:15:21.945 And such disagreements  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706404

00:15:22.645 --> 00:15:24.024 highlight an important point,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9971716

00:15:24.485 --> 00:15:25.545 which is that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9979376

00:15:26.645 --> 00:15:28.325 the fact that my refusal

NOTE Confidence: 0.9979376  
00:15:28.325 --> 00:15:29.305 of mister Anderson  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99662316  
00:15:29.765 --> 00:15:31.545 or miss Parker is conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.940414  
00:15:32.645 --> 00:15:34.005 does that that's good that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.940414  
00:15:34.005 --> 00:15:35.445 it's conscientious because it should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.940414  
00:15:35.445 --> 00:15:36.265 not be otherwise,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9955087  
00:15:37.020 --> 00:15:38.060 but that does not imply  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9955087  
00:15:38.060 --> 00:15:39.520 that my refusal is justified.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9901563  
00:15:40.220 --> 00:15:41.660 The conscience as a human  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9901563  
00:15:41.660 --> 00:15:43.520 faculty is both limited  
NOTE Confidence: 0.898705  
00:15:44.060 --> 00:15:44.800 and fallible,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9857789  
00:15:45.340 --> 00:15:46.780 just as human vision is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9857789  
00:15:46.780 --> 00:15:47.920 limited and fallible.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9877603  
00:15:48.380 --> 00:15:49.660 That I see something or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9877603  
00:15:49.660 --> 00:15:50.700 I think I see something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9877603  
00:15:50.700 --> 00:15:51.740 does not mean that I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9877603

00:15:51.740 --> 00:15:52.480 see clearly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99250716

00:15:53.035 --> 00:15:53.775 or correctly.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9854249

00:15:54.875 --> 00:15:56.075 And yet, just as one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9854249

00:15:56.075 --> 00:15:57.115 cannot keep a car on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9854249

00:15:57.115 --> 00:15:58.095 the road without  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99403316

00:15:58.555 --> 00:16:00.075 driving according to what one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99403316

00:16:00.075 --> 00:16:00.575 sees,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99816287

00:16:01.275 --> 00:16:03.855 one cannot practice medicine well  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9721905

00:16:04.235 --> 00:16:06.335 without practicing according to conscience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9505895

00:16:07.620 --> 00:16:09.300 Without practicing according to how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9505895

00:16:09.300 --> 00:16:10.340 one is best one can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9505895

00:16:10.340 --> 00:16:11.640 tell ought to practice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98890525

00:16:12.900 --> 00:16:14.740 And specifically, a physician cannot  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98890525

00:16:14.740 --> 00:16:16.600 discern whether she should accommodate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98890525

00:16:16.660 --> 00:16:17.400 or refuse  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95774966

00:16:17.940 --> 00:16:19.640 the request of mister Anderson,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95774966

00:16:19.860 --> 00:16:21.560 miss Parker, or anyone else

NOTE Confidence: 0.9972204

00:16:22.035 --> 00:16:24.295 except by exercising her conscience

NOTE Confidence: 0.9722918

00:16:24.834 --> 00:16:26.295 and following its judgments.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99946827

00:16:27.394 --> 00:16:27.894 So

NOTE Confidence: 0.9491894

00:16:28.514 --> 00:16:30.855 if refusing patient requests is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9491894

00:16:31.154 --> 00:16:32.195 part and parcel of good

NOTE Confidence: 0.9491894

00:16:32.195 --> 00:16:32.695 medicine

NOTE Confidence: 0.9886963

00:16:34.070 --> 00:16:35.110 and if the conscience is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9886963

00:16:35.110 --> 00:16:36.310 the faculty of reason a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9886963

00:16:36.310 --> 00:16:38.330 physician uses when judging whether

NOTE Confidence: 0.9886963

00:16:38.470 --> 00:16:39.830 she should or should not

NOTE Confidence: 0.9886963

00:16:39.830 --> 00:16:41.290 refuse a particular request,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9918725

00:16:42.149 --> 00:16:43.270 then it seems to me

NOTE Confidence: 0.9918725

00:16:43.270 --> 00:16:46.010 critics cannot reasonably oppose conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.9918725

00:16:46.310 --> 00:16:47.690 refusals per se.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9661409

00:16:48.845 --> 00:16:49.805 Well, so what then is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9661409

00:16:49.805 --> 00:16:51.665 the problem? Why all this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.950021

00:16:52.765 --> 00:16:53.885 why are folks so stirred  
NOTE Confidence: 0.950021

00:16:53.885 --> 00:16:55.665 out about conscientious refusals?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99982744

00:16:56.365 --> 00:16:57.105 The problem  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88162977

00:16:57.485 --> 00:16:59.565 as Stahl and Emmanuel put  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88162977

00:16:59.565 --> 00:17:01.245 it is that physicians are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88162977

00:17:01.245 --> 00:17:02.065 not conscripts.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99912655

00:17:03.300 --> 00:17:04.420 No one is compelled to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99912655

00:17:04.420 --> 00:17:05.320 become a physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9232606

00:17:05.700 --> 00:17:06.980 and in choosing to become  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9232606

00:17:06.980 --> 00:17:07.640 a physician,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87614256

00:17:08.020 --> 00:17:08.840 one willingly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98900414

00:17:09.140 --> 00:17:10.420 we should be able to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98900414

00:17:10.420 --> 00:17:12.340 presume, one willingly takes on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98900414

00:17:12.340 --> 00:17:13.080 the responsibilities

NOTE Confidence: 0.9992352

00:17:13.460 --> 00:17:14.820 that go with being a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9992352

00:17:14.820 --> 00:17:15.320 physician.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8527982

00:17:16.875 --> 00:17:18.475 What Stahl and Emmanuel call

NOTE Confidence: 0.8527982

00:17:18.475 --> 00:17:19.775 physician's role morality?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9921039

00:17:20.795 --> 00:17:22.494 We would not countenance teachers

NOTE Confidence: 0.91208094

00:17:23.275 --> 00:17:25.035 who refuse to grade their

NOTE Confidence: 0.91208094

00:17:25.035 --> 00:17:25.935 students' work.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9929691

00:17:26.795 --> 00:17:28.494 We would not countenance attorneys

NOTE Confidence: 0.9929691

00:17:28.555 --> 00:17:29.835 who refuse to defend their

NOTE Confidence: 0.9929691

00:17:29.835 --> 00:17:31.295 clients before the court.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93912107

00:17:32.160 --> 00:17:33.200 Why then would we allow

NOTE Confidence: 0.93912107

00:17:33.200 --> 00:17:35.040 physicians to refuse what patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.93912107

00:17:35.040 --> 00:17:35.540 request?

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355676

00:17:36.960 --> 00:17:38.080 Here we arrive at the

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355676

00:17:38.080 --> 00:17:39.140 root of the problem.

NOTE Confidence: 0.994555

00:17:40.800 --> 00:17:43.140 If conscientious refusals characteristically

NOTE Confidence: 0.92883563

00:17:43.520 --> 00:17:44.020 involve

NOTE Confidence: 0.9964297

00:17:44.345 --> 00:17:46.425 physicians refusing to fulfill some

NOTE Confidence: 0.9964297

00:17:46.425 --> 00:17:48.445 aspect of their genuine obligations

NOTE Confidence: 0.9964297

00:17:48.585 --> 00:17:49.325 as physicians,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99491626

00:17:50.425 --> 00:17:52.425 then such refusals indicate that

NOTE Confidence: 0.99491626

00:17:52.425 --> 00:17:54.045 with respect to that aspect,

NOTE Confidence: 0.902051

00:17:55.225 --> 00:17:56.845 they cannot in good conscience

NOTE Confidence: 0.9843099

00:17:57.145 --> 00:17:58.045 be physicians.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9918939

00:17:59.040 --> 00:18:00.100 And if that's true,

NOTE Confidence: 0.77156085

00:18:00.640 --> 00:18:01.840 Emanuel and Stahl seems to

NOTE Confidence: 0.77156085

00:18:01.840 --> 00:18:02.660 me are right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9808698

00:18:03.200 --> 00:18:04.320 They should not be doctors

NOTE Confidence: 0.9808698

00:18:04.320 --> 00:18:05.440 as they put it, or

NOTE Confidence: 0.9808698

00:18:05.440 --> 00:18:06.480 they should at least avoid

NOTE Confidence: 0.9808698

00:18:06.480 --> 00:18:07.680 areas of medicine in which

NOTE Confidence: 0.9808698  
00:18:07.680 --> 00:18:09.440 they can anticipate that patients  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9808698  
00:18:09.440 --> 00:18:10.740 will request interventions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.942308  
00:18:11.440 --> 00:18:12.480 that they cannot in good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.942308  
00:18:12.480 --> 00:18:13.700 conscience provide.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734281  
00:18:15.345 --> 00:18:16.565 If that's true.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9792385  
00:18:17.105 --> 00:18:18.645 To know whether it's true,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9943007  
00:18:19.105 --> 00:18:20.545 we need criteria by which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9943007  
00:18:20.545 --> 00:18:22.385 we can distinguish refusals that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9943007  
00:18:22.385 --> 00:18:23.925 are consistent with physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7764404  
00:18:24.305 --> 00:18:25.365 professional obligations  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9852341  
00:18:26.225 --> 00:18:28.305 from refusals that contradict such  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9852341  
00:18:28.305 --> 00:18:28.805 obligations.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89395595  
00:18:30.040 --> 00:18:31.100 Define such criteria,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9604483  
00:18:31.640 --> 00:18:33.020 we have to figure out  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9604483  
00:18:33.240 --> 00:18:35.000 what in fact physicians are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9604483

00:18:35.000 --> 00:18:37.080 obligated to do. And here's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9604483

00:18:37.080 --> 00:18:37.820 the rub.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99491

00:18:39.480 --> 00:18:41.560 The physician refusals that occasion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99491

00:18:41.560 --> 00:18:42.060 controversy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999317

00:18:43.145 --> 00:18:44.125 do so precisely  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99334717

00:18:44.505 --> 00:18:45.965 because they unmask  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9984186

00:18:46.424 --> 00:18:48.424 deep disagreements about what medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9984186

00:18:48.424 --> 00:18:49.244 is for.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95136136

00:18:50.265 --> 00:18:52.365 They they unmask deep disagreements  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95136136

00:18:52.664 --> 00:18:55.005 about what physicians reasonably profess  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95136136

00:18:55.225 --> 00:18:56.205 when they profess  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98089623

00:18:56.825 --> 00:18:58.340 to be physicians.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9487331

00:19:00.640 --> 00:19:02.340 Now, is there any  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9797279

00:19:02.799 --> 00:19:04.880 agreement, any consensus about what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9797279

00:19:04.880 --> 00:19:06.720 medicine is for that could  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9797279

00:19:06.720 --> 00:19:08.179 give us a starting point?

NOTE Confidence: 0.97740847

00:19:08.799 --> 00:19:09.760 Something that we can all

NOTE Confidence: 0.97740847

00:19:09.760 --> 00:19:12.480 agree physicians simply must commit

NOTE Confidence: 0.97740847

00:19:12.480 --> 00:19:12.980 to

NOTE Confidence: 0.939312

00:19:13.335 --> 00:19:14.294 if they are to continue

NOTE Confidence: 0.939312

00:19:14.294 --> 00:19:15.515 being physicians.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97086287

00:19:17.015 --> 00:19:18.054 Well, it had it has

NOTE Confidence: 0.97086287

00:19:18.054 --> 00:19:19.414 been self evident, it seems

NOTE Confidence: 0.97086287

00:19:19.414 --> 00:19:21.095 to me, to people from

NOTE Confidence: 0.97086287

00:19:21.095 --> 00:19:22.855 virtually every culture and moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.97086287

00:19:22.855 --> 00:19:23.355 tradition,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9698882

00:19:23.895 --> 00:19:25.835 religious and otherwise, throughout history

NOTE Confidence: 0.99757826

00:19:26.910 --> 00:19:28.770 that physicians, if nothing else,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99757826

00:19:28.910 --> 00:19:30.430 are obligated to care for

NOTE Confidence: 0.99757826

00:19:30.430 --> 00:19:31.890 the sick and the injured

NOTE Confidence: 0.9091261

00:19:32.430 --> 00:19:33.570 seeking to restore

NOTE Confidence: 0.9949506

00:19:34.110 --> 00:19:35.410 their bodily health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997415

00:19:36.510 --> 00:19:38.770 This universally recognized obligation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9787871

00:19:39.645 --> 00:19:41.005 still provides, I think, a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9787871

00:19:41.005 --> 00:19:42.525 powerful criterion by which we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9787871

00:19:42.525 --> 00:19:44.145 can discern that some refusals,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8968061

00:19:44.925 --> 00:19:45.825 however conscientious,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9996009

00:19:46.605 --> 00:19:47.345 are incompatible  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9742118

00:19:47.645 --> 00:19:49.105 with being a medical professional.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986794

00:19:50.525 --> 00:19:51.265 For example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.995745

00:19:51.910 --> 00:19:53.430 suppose a physician refuses to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.995745

00:19:53.430 --> 00:19:54.810 care for patients with HIV  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9354293

00:19:55.750 --> 00:19:57.430 because the physician doesn't like  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9354293

00:19:57.430 --> 00:19:57.930 homosexuals,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97882044

00:19:59.190 --> 00:20:00.630 or for black patients because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97882044

00:20:00.630 --> 00:20:01.609 of racial bigotry,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9802067

00:20:02.070 --> 00:20:03.670 or for criminals because of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9802067  
00:20:03.670 --> 00:20:05.290 revulsion at their crimes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98840576  
00:20:06.255 --> 00:20:07.955 Such refusals, it seems,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8797746  
00:20:08.335 --> 00:20:09.555 violate physicians'  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9809136  
00:20:10.255 --> 00:20:10.755 constitutive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9601854  
00:20:11.455 --> 00:20:12.675 professional obligation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99801743  
00:20:13.375 --> 00:20:13.875 to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9992918  
00:20:14.255 --> 00:20:15.775 preserve and restore the health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9992918  
00:20:15.775 --> 00:20:16.575 of the one who is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9992918  
00:20:16.575 --> 00:20:17.075 sick  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9935185  
00:20:17.455 --> 00:20:18.975 without regard to the patient's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9935185  
00:20:18.975 --> 00:20:19.715 other characteristics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9899346  
00:20:21.359 --> 00:20:22.720 That seems to me a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9899346  
00:20:22.720 --> 00:20:23.859 genuinely consensus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994963  
00:20:24.880 --> 00:20:25.380 idea.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9848493  
00:20:26.560 --> 00:20:27.840 This obligation to seek the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9848493

00:20:27.840 --> 00:20:30.100 patient's health does not, however,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9890394

00:20:30.800 --> 00:20:32.320 provide a criterion by which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9890394

00:20:32.320 --> 00:20:33.060 one can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99643123

00:20:33.475 --> 00:20:34.934 condemn the sorts of conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99643123

00:20:34.994 --> 00:20:36.855 refusals that have stirred controversies  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650194

00:20:37.554 --> 00:20:38.674 over the past couple of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650194

00:20:38.674 --> 00:20:39.174 decades.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98187006

00:20:40.195 --> 00:20:40.695 Rather,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9988842

00:20:41.554 --> 00:20:43.254 over the past two generations,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9961105

00:20:44.034 --> 00:20:45.394 physicians have come to use  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9961105

00:20:45.394 --> 00:20:46.294 medical technology  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9964072

00:20:47.200 --> 00:20:48.480 in all sorts of ways  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9964072

00:20:48.480 --> 00:20:50.020 that are not obviously  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9977824

00:20:50.640 --> 00:20:52.420 directed to preserving and restoring  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9977824

00:20:52.560 --> 00:20:53.380 patient health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97219914

00:20:54.320 --> 00:20:55.220 And the paradigmatic

NOTE Confidence: 0.99922234

00:20:55.760 --> 00:20:57.300 example of such interventions

NOTE Confidence: 0.9615754

00:20:57.760 --> 00:20:59.460 is perhaps the least controversial,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91138995

00:21:00.000 --> 00:21:01.140 namely contraceptives.

NOTE Confidence: 0.996997

00:21:02.404 --> 00:21:03.784 In nineteen seventy nine,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9915139

00:21:04.085 --> 00:21:05.524 two decades after the FDA

NOTE Confidence: 0.9915139

00:21:05.524 --> 00:21:07.784 approved the first oral contraceptive,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84453243

00:21:08.325 --> 00:21:10.005 my old mentor, Mark Siegler

NOTE Confidence: 0.84453243

00:21:10.005 --> 00:21:10.904 and Anne Dudley,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942468

00:21:11.605 --> 00:21:12.404 and mentors, I should say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942468

00:21:12.404 --> 00:21:13.605 Mark Siegler and Anne Dudley

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942468

00:21:13.605 --> 00:21:14.105 Goldblatt

NOTE Confidence: 0.96399516

00:21:14.750 --> 00:21:16.030 wrote the following. And I

NOTE Confidence: 0.96399516

00:21:16.030 --> 00:21:17.250 should say they wrote this

NOTE Confidence: 0.96399516

00:21:17.390 --> 00:21:18.290 having no

NOTE Confidence: 0.9988961

00:21:18.830 --> 00:21:19.330 ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.9022689

00:21:20.430 --> 00:21:21.810 opposition to contraceptives.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9532636

00:21:24.430 --> 00:21:25.890 They wrote the oral contraceptive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9532636

00:21:25.950 --> 00:21:27.570 medication was the first prescription  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9532636

00:21:27.630 --> 00:21:28.910 drug that was and is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9532636

00:21:28.910 --> 00:21:30.445 in effect a self prescribed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9532636

00:21:30.445 --> 00:21:30.945 treatment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9063241

00:21:31.725 --> 00:21:33.585 Patients, I e medical consumers  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9063241

00:21:33.644 --> 00:21:35.105 desiring elective medication  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96595794

00:21:35.644 --> 00:21:37.404 demanded that physicians prescribe the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96595794

00:21:37.404 --> 00:21:39.965 contraceptive pill. Other popularly self  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96595794

00:21:39.965 --> 00:21:41.804 prescribed medications soon followed and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96595794

00:21:41.804 --> 00:21:42.605 came to be seen as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96595794

00:21:42.605 --> 00:21:44.820 appropriate solutions or treatments for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96595794

00:21:44.820 --> 00:21:46.440 problems previously considered  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89927566

00:21:46.980 --> 00:21:48.520 individual or social concerns,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9708077

00:21:49.220 --> 00:21:50.340 but in any case, not

NOTE Confidence: 0.9708077  
00:21:50.340 --> 00:21:51.559 biological abnormalities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91261065  
00:21:51.859 --> 00:21:53.619 or specific diseases. I'd say  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91261065  
00:21:53.619 --> 00:21:54.520 they could have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9928136  
00:21:55.059 --> 00:21:55.799 that last  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9109284  
00:21:56.804 --> 00:21:58.164 clause, they could've said, but  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9109284  
00:21:58.164 --> 00:21:58.904 in any case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9984215  
00:21:59.205 --> 00:21:59.945 not clearly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9761365  
00:22:00.325 --> 00:22:02.345 deficits in or injuries to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99971807  
00:22:02.804 --> 00:22:03.784 bodily health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.957103  
00:22:05.524 --> 00:22:07.365 Examples of such practices include,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.957103  
00:22:07.365 --> 00:22:08.644 in our time, the practices  
NOTE Confidence: 0.957103  
00:22:08.644 --> 00:22:10.024 of medical aid in dying,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97191775  
00:22:10.780 --> 00:22:12.859 making short children taller or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97191775  
00:22:12.859 --> 00:22:14.160 fast athletes faster,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95991826  
00:22:14.780 --> 00:22:16.619 reshaping buttocks and breasts and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95991826

00:22:16.619 --> 00:22:17.680 noses and chins,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9137378

00:22:18.300 --> 00:22:20.480 otherwise changing secondary sex characteristics,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84641

00:22:20.940 --> 00:22:22.635 helping bay people have babies,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98597246

00:22:23.115 --> 00:22:24.575 using in vitro fertilization,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.959631

00:22:25.515 --> 00:22:26.795 helping them not have babies  
NOTE Confidence: 0.959631

00:22:26.795 --> 00:22:27.675 in a a number of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.959631

00:22:27.675 --> 00:22:29.435 different ways, and and so  
NOTE Confidence: 0.959631

00:22:29.435 --> 00:22:29.935 on.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999694

00:22:31.275 --> 00:22:32.815 It's not surprising that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9981607

00:22:33.355 --> 00:22:35.580 physicians took up these not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9981607

00:22:35.580 --> 00:22:37.660 so obviously health directed uses  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9981607

00:22:37.660 --> 00:22:38.720 of medical technologies.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95031655

00:22:40.059 --> 00:22:41.359 Physicians had the expertise  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98266894

00:22:41.980 --> 00:22:43.419 and the legal authority to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98266894

00:22:43.419 --> 00:22:44.559 manipulate the body,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99967396

00:22:45.419 --> 00:22:47.340 and patients wanted what the

NOTE Confidence: 0.99967396

00:22:47.340 --> 00:22:49.919 physicians could lawfully provide.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9765143

00:22:50.994 --> 00:22:52.934 Along the way, however, minorities

NOTE Confidence: 0.9765143

00:22:52.994 --> 00:22:54.355 of physicians have refused to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9765143

00:22:54.355 --> 00:22:55.494 engage in these practices,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9888737

00:22:56.355 --> 00:22:57.794 arguing that the practices are

NOTE Confidence: 0.9888737

00:22:57.794 --> 00:22:59.075 not required by or or

NOTE Confidence: 0.9888737

00:22:59.075 --> 00:22:59.895 even contradict

NOTE Confidence: 0.70105624

00:23:00.595 --> 00:23:01.095 doctors'

NOTE Confidence: 0.9993445

00:23:01.554 --> 00:23:02.615 professional obligations

NOTE Confidence: 0.998139

00:23:03.155 --> 00:23:03.975 as healers.

NOTE Confidence: 0.881213

00:23:05.890 --> 00:23:08.130 Stalin Emmanuel represent a growing

NOTE Confidence: 0.881213

00:23:08.130 --> 00:23:09.190 chorus of figures,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95440066

00:23:09.650 --> 00:23:11.490 within the profession, prominent figures

NOTE Confidence: 0.95440066

00:23:11.490 --> 00:23:12.390 in many cases,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97656786

00:23:13.010 --> 00:23:14.530 arguing that these refusals have

NOTE Confidence: 0.97656786

00:23:14.530 --> 00:23:15.990 just gone on too long.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97656786

00:23:16.210 --> 00:23:17.570 And the doctors must now  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97656786

00:23:17.570 --> 00:23:19.570 provide or facilitate access to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97656786

00:23:19.570 --> 00:23:20.869 the full range of legal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97656786

00:23:21.135 --> 00:23:23.075 and professionally accepted medical interventions,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91300493

00:23:23.615 --> 00:23:24.115 notwithstanding  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99890727

00:23:24.415 --> 00:23:25.555 their moral obligations  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99837345

00:23:26.095 --> 00:23:27.075 to doing so.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99649066

00:23:29.055 --> 00:23:30.275 So why then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8961543

00:23:31.695 --> 00:23:33.795 why then does this course  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99101794

00:23:34.590 --> 00:23:36.510 not condemn the physician's refusal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99101794

00:23:36.510 --> 00:23:38.109 to prescribe for mister Anderson  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99101794

00:23:38.109 --> 00:23:39.650 the antibiotics he requests?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9041371

00:23:40.590 --> 00:23:41.630 Why does that not stir  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9041371

00:23:41.630 --> 00:23:42.130 controversy?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99131227

00:23:43.230 --> 00:23:44.510 Why is it that refusing

NOTE Confidence: 0.99131227

00:23:44.510 --> 00:23:46.190 miss Parker's request for referral

NOTE Confidence: 0.99131227

00:23:46.190 --> 00:23:47.869 to the gender clinic stir

NOTE Confidence: 0.99131227

00:23:47.869 --> 00:23:48.690 more outrage?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9825249

00:23:50.445 --> 00:23:52.605 Here, critics of conscientious refusals

NOTE Confidence: 0.9825249

00:23:52.605 --> 00:23:54.065 introduce a new distinction

NOTE Confidence: 0.98136854

00:23:54.684 --> 00:23:56.045 according to which the physician

NOTE Confidence: 0.98136854

00:23:56.045 --> 00:23:58.145 who refuses mister Anderson's request

NOTE Confidence: 0.9889279

00:23:58.684 --> 00:23:59.424 is justified

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914929

00:23:59.965 --> 00:24:01.325 because he does so for

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914929

00:24:01.325 --> 00:24:03.869 medical or professional reasons and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914929

00:24:03.869 --> 00:24:05.710 thereby upholds the physician's role

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914929

00:24:05.710 --> 00:24:06.210 morality.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9484866

00:24:07.630 --> 00:24:09.150 In contrast, the physician who

NOTE Confidence: 0.9484866

00:24:09.150 --> 00:24:10.910 refuses miss Parker's request for

NOTE Confidence: 0.9484866

00:24:10.910 --> 00:24:11.869 a referral to the general

NOTE Confidence: 0.9484866

00:24:11.869 --> 00:24:12.369 clinic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9850709

00:24:12.830 --> 00:24:14.530 is unjustly, at least presumptively,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9850709

00:24:14.590 --> 00:24:15.890 is unjustly allowing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99398065

00:24:16.275 --> 00:24:18.275 personal and private concerns to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99398065

00:24:18.275 --> 00:24:20.035 intrude upon what should be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99398065

00:24:20.035 --> 00:24:20.615 a strictly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999275

00:24:21.155 --> 00:24:21.655 professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9969853

00:24:21.955 --> 00:24:22.455 consideration.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99457

00:24:24.355 --> 00:24:25.815 It's difficult to overstate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99910617

00:24:26.195 --> 00:24:27.494 the importance of this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9596264

00:24:27.875 --> 00:24:29.494 distinction, this putative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99837434

00:24:29.795 --> 00:24:30.295 distinction  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9875969

00:24:31.090 --> 00:24:32.290 between the personal and the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9875969

00:24:32.290 --> 00:24:32.790 professional.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9434958

00:24:33.330 --> 00:24:35.350 Indeed, every criticism of conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9434958

00:24:35.570 --> 00:24:37.010 refusals that I have read

NOTE Confidence: 0.9434958

00:24:37.010 --> 00:24:38.130 and I have read many,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9434958

00:24:38.130 --> 00:24:39.030 maybe most,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9654546

00:24:40.450 --> 00:24:40.950 everyone

NOTE Confidence: 0.9991743

00:24:41.570 --> 00:24:43.090 invokes and leans heavily on

NOTE Confidence: 0.9991743

00:24:43.090 --> 00:24:43.750 this distinction.

NOTE Confidence: 0.77818197

00:24:45.785 --> 00:24:47.385 Stalin and Emmanuel capture the

NOTE Confidence: 0.77818197

00:24:47.385 --> 00:24:48.684 now conventional thinking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96795154

00:24:51.145 --> 00:24:52.665 in this way. Physicians may

NOTE Confidence: 0.96795154

00:24:52.665 --> 00:24:54.105 believe what they will in

NOTE Confidence: 0.96795154

00:24:54.105 --> 00:24:56.205 their private lives, they write.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95976055

00:24:56.505 --> 00:24:57.465 But in their role as

NOTE Confidence: 0.95976055

00:24:57.465 --> 00:24:58.950 health care professionals, they must

NOTE Confidence: 0.95976055

00:24:58.950 --> 00:25:00.730 provide the appropriate interventions

NOTE Confidence: 0.9968573

00:25:01.350 --> 00:25:02.090 as specified

NOTE Confidence: 0.9996105

00:25:02.470 --> 00:25:03.850 by the medical profession.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99874157

00:25:04.869 --> 00:25:05.750 So in this way of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99874157

00:25:05.750 --> 00:25:06.250 thinking,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897743

00:25:07.030 --> 00:25:09.030 physicians who conscientiously refuse a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897743

00:25:09.030 --> 00:25:09.929 patient's request  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862787

00:25:10.549 --> 00:25:12.570 thereby allow personal biases,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96987087

00:25:13.705 --> 00:25:15.305 to interfere with their professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96987087

00:25:15.305 --> 00:25:17.145 obligations and particularly the obligation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96987087

00:25:17.145 --> 00:25:18.605 to respect patient autonomy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97962177

00:25:19.385 --> 00:25:20.744 But here's the challenge. How  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97962177

00:25:20.744 --> 00:25:21.805 does one judge  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9928742

00:25:22.425 --> 00:25:23.705 whether one is refusing a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9928742

00:25:23.705 --> 00:25:24.685 patient request  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9995845

00:25:24.985 --> 00:25:26.525 for reasons that are sufficiently  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99943876

00:25:27.225 --> 00:25:28.445 medical or professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99403113

00:25:29.210 --> 00:25:30.670 rather than merely personal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99876165

00:25:32.330 --> 00:25:34.109 Critics of conscientious refusals

NOTE Confidence: 0.9540896  
00:25:34.410 --> 00:25:36.350 have provided, in my judgment,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9540896  
00:25:36.570 --> 00:25:37.550 no nonarbitrary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9652939  
00:25:38.010 --> 00:25:40.190 standard to guide such judgments.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9996  
00:25:41.475 --> 00:25:43.015 Rather than asking whether  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96475774  
00:25:43.715 --> 00:25:45.095 doing what the patient requests  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96475774  
00:25:45.155 --> 00:25:46.915 is required by a physician's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96475774  
00:25:46.915 --> 00:25:48.535 commitment to the patient's health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994867  
00:25:49.795 --> 00:25:50.855 they set aside  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999255  
00:25:51.315 --> 00:25:52.275 the question of what the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999255  
00:25:52.275 --> 00:25:53.575 patient's health requires  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9720169  
00:25:54.760 --> 00:25:55.500 and instead  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95529747  
00:25:56.200 --> 00:25:58.059 insist physicians show that their  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95529747  
00:25:58.119 --> 00:26:00.039 refusals are not influenced by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95529747  
00:26:00.039 --> 00:26:01.020 personal values,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94137925  
00:26:01.400 --> 00:26:02.679 particularly that not that they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94137925

00:26:02.679 --> 00:26:03.799 have, say, let's say, some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94137925

00:26:03.799 --> 00:26:04.780 religious value  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95733994

00:26:05.400 --> 00:26:07.240 that or religious commitments that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95733994

00:26:07.240 --> 00:26:07.740 might  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9730396

00:26:08.119 --> 00:26:09.100 line up with,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99643826

00:26:09.885 --> 00:26:10.945 their refusal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678478

00:26:13.244 --> 00:26:14.785 But alleging that a refusal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678478

00:26:14.845 --> 00:26:16.285 is based on merely personal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678478

00:26:16.285 --> 00:26:17.725 values, it seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9678478

00:26:17.725 --> 00:26:18.625 only begs  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997375

00:26:18.925 --> 00:26:19.665 the relevant  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9452207

00:26:20.045 --> 00:26:21.185 question, the relevant  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89979434

00:26:21.565 --> 00:26:23.025 medical ethical question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99142593

00:26:23.690 --> 00:26:24.890 And that is, is the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99142593

00:26:24.890 --> 00:26:27.150 refusal consistent with one's professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99142593

00:26:27.369 --> 00:26:27.869 obligations?

NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:26:29.850 --> 00:26:31.850 In these debates, everything turns

NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:26:31.850 --> 00:26:32.970 on how we define the

NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:26:32.970 --> 00:26:34.750 substance of our professional obligations

NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:26:34.890 --> 00:26:35.390 because

NOTE Confidence: 0.99746543

00:26:35.929 --> 00:26:36.890 at the heart of every

NOTE Confidence: 0.99746543

00:26:36.890 --> 00:26:38.429 controversy about what physician

NOTE Confidence: 0.9987449

00:26:38.765 --> 00:26:40.065 about physician refusals

NOTE Confidence: 0.96442646

00:26:40.525 --> 00:26:42.285 lies a debate about what

NOTE Confidence: 0.96442646

00:26:42.285 --> 00:26:42.785 medicine

NOTE Confidence: 0.99859834

00:26:43.245 --> 00:26:44.065 is for.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87088674

00:26:45.005 --> 00:26:47.265 Disputes about conscientious refusals reflect

NOTE Confidence: 0.87088674

00:26:47.405 --> 00:26:48.065 at root

NOTE Confidence: 0.9829725

00:26:48.925 --> 00:26:50.685 two rival accounts of what

NOTE Confidence: 0.9829725

00:26:50.685 --> 00:26:52.500 medicine is for and what

NOTE Confidence: 0.9829725

00:26:52.500 --> 00:26:53.000 physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.9938997

00:26:53.300 --> 00:26:54.440 reasonably profess.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9527751

00:26:57.300 --> 00:26:58.660 On what my colleague, Chris  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9527751

00:26:58.660 --> 00:26:59.780 Tolleson, and I call the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9527751

00:26:59.780 --> 00:27:01.240 provider of services model,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99963075

00:27:01.700 --> 00:27:03.560 a medical professional is obligated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99963075

00:27:03.619 --> 00:27:04.760 to provide interventions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8466206

00:27:05.140 --> 00:27:06.280 that patients request  
NOTE Confidence: 0.997036

00:27:07.115 --> 00:27:08.655 so long as the interventions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.997036

00:27:08.715 --> 00:27:09.455 are legal,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97153103

00:27:10.234 --> 00:27:11.055 are feasible,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97072935

00:27:11.755 --> 00:27:13.515 meaning you have the means  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97072935

00:27:13.515 --> 00:27:14.555 to bring them about, they're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97072935

00:27:14.555 --> 00:27:15.455 technically feasible,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99865407

00:27:16.155 --> 00:27:18.015 and are consistent with patient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99865407

00:27:18.075 --> 00:27:18.575 well-being  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9990753

00:27:19.840 --> 00:27:20.660 where well-being

NOTE Confidence: 0.9887866  
00:27:21.200 --> 00:27:23.300 is understood principally in terms  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9887866  
00:27:23.440 --> 00:27:24.980 of the patient's considered  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94713247  
00:27:25.600 --> 00:27:26.660 informed preferences  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9948869  
00:27:27.040 --> 00:27:27.860 being satisfied.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9824998  
00:27:28.800 --> 00:27:29.720 Now if that seems like  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9824998  
00:27:29.720 --> 00:27:30.900 a bit of a caricature,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9950911  
00:27:32.080 --> 00:27:33.200 of maybe the way you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9950911  
00:27:33.200 --> 00:27:34.320 practice or the way people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9950911  
00:27:34.320 --> 00:27:35.300 around you practice,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99781495  
00:27:35.815 --> 00:27:36.795 I think it's because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9541787  
00:27:37.255 --> 00:27:38.695 although the provider of services  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9541787  
00:27:38.695 --> 00:27:39.815 model has been growing in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9541787  
00:27:39.815 --> 00:27:41.175 influence over the past two  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9541787  
00:27:41.175 --> 00:27:41.675 generations,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571158  
00:27:42.455 --> 00:27:43.895 it still coexists with a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9571158

00:27:43.895 --> 00:27:45.515 traditional vision of medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89298797

00:27:46.295 --> 00:27:47.915 that still guides physicians'  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9554268

00:27:48.215 --> 00:27:50.055 intuitions and practices in many,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9554268

00:27:50.055 --> 00:27:51.115 if not most  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99407077

00:27:51.580 --> 00:27:52.400 clinical domains.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9683431

00:27:53.260 --> 00:27:54.880 According to that traditional vision,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98537534

00:27:55.180 --> 00:27:55.980 which we call the way  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98537534

00:27:55.980 --> 00:27:56.640 of medicine,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9911635

00:27:57.820 --> 00:27:59.040 medicine is a paradigmatic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.6786932

00:27:59.340 --> 00:27:59.840 practice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98073906

00:28:01.340 --> 00:28:02.220 And we could talk later  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98073906

00:28:02.220 --> 00:28:03.020 if you want about what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98073906

00:28:03.020 --> 00:28:04.220 makes something a practice, but  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98073906

00:28:04.220 --> 00:28:05.705 it's a practice that's elevated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98073906

00:28:05.705 --> 00:28:06.825 to a profession because of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98073906

00:28:06.825 --> 00:28:07.965 its social importance

NOTE Confidence: 0.95519185

00:28:09.705 --> 00:28:11.065 that aims at the health

NOTE Confidence: 0.95519185

00:28:11.065 --> 00:28:11.885 of the patient.

NOTE Confidence: 0.998638

00:28:13.065 --> 00:28:14.205 On the way of medicine,

NOTE Confidence: 0.998638

00:28:14.505 --> 00:28:16.285 a medical practitioner is professionally

NOTE Confidence: 0.998638

00:28:16.345 --> 00:28:17.865 obligated to seek the patient's

NOTE Confidence: 0.998638

00:28:17.865 --> 00:28:18.365 health

NOTE Confidence: 0.95440274

00:28:18.950 --> 00:28:20.070 and to refuse to act

NOTE Confidence: 0.95440274

00:28:20.070 --> 00:28:21.670 contrary to the patient's health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95440274

00:28:21.670 --> 00:28:22.790 at least to do so

NOTE Confidence: 0.95440274

00:28:22.869 --> 00:28:24.170 refuse to do so intentionally.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98733205

00:28:25.910 --> 00:28:26.950 The way of medicine has

NOTE Confidence: 0.98733205

00:28:26.950 --> 00:28:28.309 much in its favor. I'm

NOTE Confidence: 0.98733205

00:28:28.309 --> 00:28:30.309 gonna list five reasons to

NOTE Confidence: 0.98733205

00:28:30.309 --> 00:28:31.510 prefer it to the provider

NOTE Confidence: 0.98733205

00:28:31.510 --> 00:28:32.650 of services model.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99872327

00:28:33.734 --> 00:28:34.234 First,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97919685

00:28:34.695 --> 00:28:35.655 the way a medicine is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97919685

00:28:35.655 --> 00:28:37.095 supported by the considered opinions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97919685

00:28:37.095 --> 00:28:38.775 of wise practitioners of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97919685

00:28:38.775 --> 00:28:40.715 art for thousands of years.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96613264

00:28:41.575 --> 00:28:42.075 Aristotle,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.986092

00:28:42.375 --> 00:28:43.835 just to pick one example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.986092

00:28:44.055 --> 00:28:45.735 Aristotle's whose father was a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.986092

00:28:45.735 --> 00:28:46.235 physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9674393

00:28:46.615 --> 00:28:48.280 wrote, now as there are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9674393

00:28:48.280 --> 00:28:50.460 many actions, arts, and sciences,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9674393

00:28:50.760 --> 00:28:53.080 their ends or purposes are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9674393

00:28:53.080 --> 00:28:53.580 many.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99922085

00:28:53.960 --> 00:28:55.080 The end of the medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99922085

00:28:55.080 --> 00:28:56.300 art is health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90721446

00:28:56.760 --> 00:28:57.900 as that of shipbuilding

NOTE Confidence: 0.99778825

00:28:58.600 --> 00:28:59.500 is a vessel.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9380451

00:29:01.435 --> 00:29:03.115 So Aristotle took this claim

NOTE Confidence: 0.9380451

00:29:03.115 --> 00:29:04.235 about the end of medicine

NOTE Confidence: 0.9380451

00:29:04.235 --> 00:29:05.435 that its purpose is the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9380451

00:29:05.435 --> 00:29:06.335 patient's health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.98183936

00:29:07.195 --> 00:29:08.475 as a starting point, as

NOTE Confidence: 0.98183936

00:29:08.475 --> 00:29:09.915 as something that is known

NOTE Confidence: 0.98183936

00:29:09.915 --> 00:29:11.515 immediately by both, as he

NOTE Confidence: 0.98183936

00:29:11.515 --> 00:29:12.475 would put it, the many

NOTE Confidence: 0.98183936

00:29:12.475 --> 00:29:13.375 and the wise.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9963124

00:29:14.390 --> 00:29:14.890 Similarly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9540217

00:29:15.269 --> 00:29:16.630 the Hippocratic oath, as we

NOTE Confidence: 0.9540217

00:29:16.630 --> 00:29:18.070 saw earlier, includes a promise

NOTE Confidence: 0.9540217

00:29:18.070 --> 00:29:19.830 to enter homes only on

NOTE Confidence: 0.9540217

00:29:19.830 --> 00:29:21.669 behalf of the sick. Implying

NOTE Confidence: 0.9540217

00:29:21.669 --> 00:29:23.510 that medicine's fundamental aim, its

NOTE Confidence: 0.9540217

00:29:23.510 --> 00:29:24.490 fundamental purpose,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87435013

00:29:24.950 --> 00:29:26.309 its rise on detre, that

NOTE Confidence: 0.87435013

00:29:26.309 --> 00:29:27.284 that the thing we should

NOTE Confidence: 0.87435013

00:29:27.284 --> 00:29:28.485 expect of anyone who puts

NOTE Confidence: 0.87435013

00:29:28.485 --> 00:29:29.605 themselves forward as a medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.87435013

00:29:29.605 --> 00:29:30.105 practitioners

NOTE Confidence: 0.975995

00:29:30.884 --> 00:29:31.845 is to act so as

NOTE Confidence: 0.975995

00:29:31.845 --> 00:29:33.044 to restore the health that

NOTE Confidence: 0.975995

00:29:33.044 --> 00:29:34.504 is imperiled in the sick.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9946208

00:29:34.965 --> 00:29:36.664 Countless practitioners of medicine

NOTE Confidence: 0.9704235

00:29:36.965 --> 00:29:38.485 before and after have made

NOTE Confidence: 0.9704235

00:29:38.485 --> 00:29:40.745 the patient's health their goal.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95116174

00:29:41.360 --> 00:29:42.820 It's the first reason. Second,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95116174

00:29:43.120 --> 00:29:43.860 and related,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99494755

00:29:44.160 --> 00:29:45.120 the way of medicine is

NOTE Confidence: 0.99494755

00:29:45.120 --> 00:29:46.320 affirmed by the practices of

NOTE Confidence: 0.99494755

00:29:46.320 --> 00:29:48.160 physicians and patients across diverse

NOTE Confidence: 0.99494755

00:29:48.160 --> 00:29:48.900 moral communities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9858362

00:29:49.200 --> 00:29:50.260 religious and otherwise.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9351268

00:29:51.360 --> 00:29:52.660 As I already noted,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9773658

00:29:52.960 --> 00:29:54.560 today, medical technologies can be

NOTE Confidence: 0.9773658

00:29:54.560 --> 00:29:56.260 applied toward many different goals

NOTE Confidence: 0.98251796

00:29:56.765 --> 00:29:59.005 with respect to which different

NOTE Confidence: 0.98251796

00:29:59.005 --> 00:30:00.845 moral communities and traditions have

NOTE Confidence: 0.98251796

00:30:00.845 --> 00:30:01.585 long disagreed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9744103

00:30:02.765 --> 00:30:03.665 Questions like

NOTE Confidence: 0.9623305

00:30:03.965 --> 00:30:06.065 having children or avoiding children,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99596214

00:30:06.525 --> 00:30:08.205 taking on suffering or avoiding

NOTE Confidence: 0.99596214

00:30:08.205 --> 00:30:08.705 suffering,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9510288

00:30:09.200 --> 00:30:10.720 changing one's bodily appearance and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9510288

00:30:10.720 --> 00:30:11.700 for what reasons.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98298776

00:30:12.000 --> 00:30:13.280 If medicine were understood as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98298776

00:30:13.280 --> 00:30:14.720 a practice of pursuing those  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98298776

00:30:14.720 --> 00:30:15.220 goals,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.997454

00:30:15.920 --> 00:30:16.960 there would be no shared  
NOTE Confidence: 0.997454

00:30:16.960 --> 00:30:17.860 medical profession  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9496836

00:30:18.400 --> 00:30:19.700 any more than there is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9496836

00:30:19.760 --> 00:30:21.300 a shared clergy profession.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99283624

00:30:22.784 --> 00:30:24.065 The commitment to seek healing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99283624

00:30:24.065 --> 00:30:24.865 for those who are sick  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99283624

00:30:24.865 --> 00:30:26.385 and injured, however, is central  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99283624

00:30:26.385 --> 00:30:27.044 to Judaism,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994918

00:30:27.664 --> 00:30:28.164 Christianity,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.993225

00:30:28.625 --> 00:30:30.325 Islam, and other world religions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993027

00:30:30.705 --> 00:30:32.225 It is championed equally by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993027

00:30:32.225 --> 00:30:33.345 those who do not consider

NOTE Confidence: 0.9993027

00:30:33.345 --> 00:30:34.965 themselves religious at all.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99150145

00:30:35.345 --> 00:30:35.845 Indeed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99755806

00:30:36.640 --> 00:30:38.480 despite having arguments with colleagues

NOTE Confidence: 0.99755806

00:30:38.480 --> 00:30:40.320 about this this subject over

NOTE Confidence: 0.99755806

00:30:40.320 --> 00:30:41.919 two decades, I have yet

NOTE Confidence: 0.99755806

00:30:41.919 --> 00:30:42.820 to meet colleagues

NOTE Confidence: 0.8739496

00:30:43.120 --> 00:30:44.880 who challenge the notion that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8739496

00:30:44.880 --> 00:30:47.140 one of physicians central concerns,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8739496

00:30:47.200 --> 00:30:48.020 central commitments

NOTE Confidence: 0.9260675

00:30:48.640 --> 00:30:50.260 is the patient's health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9633446

00:30:52.175 --> 00:30:53.695 Third, the way of medicine

NOTE Confidence: 0.9633446

00:30:53.695 --> 00:30:55.455 fits the particular vulnerability to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9633446

00:30:55.455 --> 00:30:57.695 injury, illness, and death that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9633446

00:30:57.695 --> 00:30:58.675 patients face.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99973667

00:30:59.295 --> 00:31:00.735 Those who are clearly sick

NOTE Confidence: 0.99973667

00:31:00.735 --> 00:31:01.475 or injured  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99169934

00:31:01.775 --> 00:31:03.075 do not need control  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9970631

00:31:03.535 --> 00:31:04.735 so much as they need  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9970631

00:31:04.735 --> 00:31:05.235 help.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991345

00:31:06.220 --> 00:31:07.340 And in order to entrust  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991345

00:31:07.340 --> 00:31:08.720 themselves to medical practitioners,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997564

00:31:09.259 --> 00:31:11.279 they must have confidence that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997564

00:31:11.340 --> 00:31:13.100 the practitioners will seek to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997564

00:31:13.100 --> 00:31:13.919 heal them  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9964649

00:31:14.220 --> 00:31:15.679 and not to harm them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9882887

00:31:16.059 --> 00:31:17.279 Without such trust,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96787286

00:31:17.580 --> 00:31:18.940 seems to me, physicians cannot  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96787286

00:31:18.940 --> 00:31:19.759 do their work.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9882616

00:31:21.245 --> 00:31:22.685 And I recognize it remains  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9882616

00:31:22.685 --> 00:31:24.705 necessary to define health further.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9947901

00:31:25.325 --> 00:31:26.445 In our book, we spend

NOTE Confidence: 0.9947901  
00:31:26.445 --> 00:31:28.045 the first chapter considering what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9947901  
00:31:28.045 --> 00:31:29.265 health is. I welcome  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9327921  
00:31:29.965 --> 00:31:31.165 you reading the book if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9327921  
00:31:31.165 --> 00:31:31.905 you'd like,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9685497  
00:31:32.445 --> 00:31:33.325 or we can dig into  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9685497  
00:31:33.325 --> 00:31:34.045 it in the q and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9685497  
00:31:34.045 --> 00:31:35.440 a. But for the present  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9685497  
00:31:35.440 --> 00:31:37.120 purposes, the key distinction is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9685497  
00:31:37.120 --> 00:31:38.160 that in the provider of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9685497  
00:31:38.160 --> 00:31:39.140 services model,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9940372  
00:31:40.000 --> 00:31:41.460 health is only a subjective  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9940372  
00:31:41.680 --> 00:31:43.140 and socially constructed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81391907  
00:31:43.440 --> 00:31:43.940 concept.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92460495  
00:31:44.640 --> 00:31:45.760 So so we might say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92460495  
00:31:45.760 --> 00:31:47.280 well, your health is one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92460495

00:31:47.280 --> 00:31:48.720 thing, but my health is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92460495

00:31:48.720 --> 00:31:50.515 another or, you know, your  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92460495

00:31:50.515 --> 00:31:52.055 truth, my truth kind of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98375136

00:31:53.955 --> 00:31:55.075 thing. Whereas in the way  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98375136

00:31:55.075 --> 00:31:56.515 of medicine, health is meant  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98375136

00:31:56.515 --> 00:31:58.215 in an objective sense  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7952912

00:31:58.835 --> 00:32:00.035 as the sense of an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7952912

00:32:00.035 --> 00:32:00.535 observable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92941535

00:32:01.555 --> 00:32:03.495 characteristic of living things,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650212

00:32:04.010 --> 00:32:05.770 what Leon Kass describes as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650212

00:32:05.770 --> 00:32:06.970 the well working of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650212

00:32:06.970 --> 00:32:07.470 organism  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99403256

00:32:08.010 --> 00:32:08.830 as a whole.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9686385

00:32:09.370 --> 00:32:10.510 Health so understood  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98428077

00:32:10.810 --> 00:32:12.830 grounds medical practice, we think.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98428077

00:32:13.130 --> 00:32:14.570 It is the end that

NOTE Confidence: 0.98428077

00:32:14.570 --> 00:32:16.350 medical practitioners must prioritize

NOTE Confidence: 0.9195857

00:32:17.290 --> 00:32:18.510 because it is objective,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97904813

00:32:19.684 --> 00:32:20.965 real, something in the world

NOTE Confidence: 0.97904813

00:32:20.965 --> 00:32:22.325 that does not is not

NOTE Confidence: 0.97904813

00:32:22.325 --> 00:32:23.785 just made up by us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97904813

00:32:24.085 --> 00:32:25.125 It's the sort of thing

NOTE Confidence: 0.97904813

00:32:25.125 --> 00:32:27.125 about which medical practitioners can

NOTE Confidence: 0.97904813

00:32:27.125 --> 00:32:28.585 develop genuine expertise

NOTE Confidence: 0.9654975

00:32:29.684 --> 00:32:31.445 and can therefore exercise a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9654975

00:32:31.445 --> 00:32:31.945 certain

NOTE Confidence: 0.9988722

00:32:32.325 --> 00:32:34.345 valid authority of expertise.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9899599

00:32:37.110 --> 00:32:37.610 Fourth,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848056

00:32:37.990 --> 00:32:39.029 the way of medicine has

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848056

00:32:39.029 --> 00:32:40.549 a better account of how

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848056

00:32:40.549 --> 00:32:42.090 the personal and the professional

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848056

00:32:42.389 --> 00:32:43.210 fit together.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99892807

00:32:44.470 --> 00:32:46.070 Without any objective standard by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99892807

00:32:46.070 --> 00:32:47.269 which to determine whether an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99892807

00:32:47.269 --> 00:32:48.809 action is sufficiently professional,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9969013

00:32:49.585 --> 00:32:50.705 proponents of the provider of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9969013

00:32:50.705 --> 00:32:52.645 services model draw idiosyncratic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9765548

00:32:53.105 --> 00:32:55.345 and arbitrary lines between the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9765548

00:32:55.345 --> 00:32:57.345 professional and the personal. So  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9765548

00:32:57.345 --> 00:32:58.005 for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9921945

00:32:58.705 --> 00:32:59.205 ACOG  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99608886

00:32:59.825 --> 00:33:01.925 contends that physicians must refuse  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99938786

00:33:02.670 --> 00:33:04.190 policies that require them to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99938786

00:33:04.190 --> 00:33:05.090 report undocumented  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871635

00:33:05.550 --> 00:33:07.170 patients to immigration authorities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:08.030 --> 00:33:08.670 By the way, I would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:08.670 --> 00:33:09.870 agree with them about that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:09.870 --> 00:33:10.990 But they they they must

NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:10.990 --> 00:33:12.990 refuse that because such policies

NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:12.990 --> 00:33:14.850 conflict with other professional norms,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:14.990 --> 00:33:16.190 including as they put it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:16.190 --> 00:33:17.550 the primary principle of non

NOTE Confidence: 0.95612895

00:33:17.550 --> 00:33:18.050 maleficence.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9557784

00:33:19.285 --> 00:33:20.825 In the same piece, however,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9874208

00:33:21.605 --> 00:33:23.125 ACOG takes it for granted

NOTE Confidence: 0.9874208

00:33:23.125 --> 00:33:25.045 that physicians must refer patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.9874208

00:33:25.045 --> 00:33:25.705 for abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.97124386

00:33:26.485 --> 00:33:28.405 and ignores altogether well known

NOTE Confidence: 0.97124386

00:33:28.405 --> 00:33:28.905 arguments

NOTE Confidence: 0.99820876

00:33:29.365 --> 00:33:30.965 that abortion violates the same

NOTE Confidence: 0.99820876

00:33:30.965 --> 00:33:31.465 principle

NOTE Confidence: 0.95371735

00:33:31.820 --> 00:33:33.420 of non maleficence. I realize

NOTE Confidence: 0.95371735

00:33:33.420 --> 00:33:34.460 that's a subject of deep  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95371735

00:33:34.460 --> 00:33:35.520 dispute and argument,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9791199

00:33:35.900 --> 00:33:37.740 but Aycock just skips over  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9791199

00:33:37.740 --> 00:33:38.320 the argument,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8776864

00:33:39.020 --> 00:33:39.820 in and I think a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8776864

00:33:39.820 --> 00:33:40.720 kind of arbitrary,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99898154

00:33:41.340 --> 00:33:41.840 way.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7053314

00:33:42.540 --> 00:33:43.440 Stalin Emmanuel  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8755451

00:33:44.425 --> 00:33:45.965 claimed that physicians might  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99975777

00:33:46.265 --> 00:33:46.765 justifiably  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9701082

00:33:47.145 --> 00:33:48.525 refuse assisted suicide,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99488455

00:33:49.385 --> 00:33:51.225 a practice that Ezekiel Emanuel  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99488455

00:33:51.225 --> 00:33:53.065 happens to have publicly opposed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99488455

00:33:53.065 --> 00:33:53.725 for decades  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:33:54.345 --> 00:33:56.105 because they argue or because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:33:56.105 --> 00:33:57.730 they claim the practice is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:33:57.730 --> 00:33:59.570 currently controversial and subject to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:33:59.570 --> 00:34:00.690 debate about whether it is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:34:00.690 --> 00:34:02.210 medically appropriate. So they say

NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:34:02.210 --> 00:34:03.250 since for that reason, you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:34:03.250 --> 00:34:05.170 can refuse that. However, they

NOTE Confidence: 0.9420854

00:34:05.170 --> 00:34:06.630 do not acknowledge that abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.9948402

00:34:07.170 --> 00:34:09.170 or medicalized gender transition are

NOTE Confidence: 0.9948402

00:34:09.170 --> 00:34:10.310 similarly controversial

NOTE Confidence: 0.9417402

00:34:10.690 --> 00:34:12.050 and subject to similar debate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9417402

00:34:12.050 --> 00:34:13.435 And they say, therefore, if

NOTE Confidence: 0.9417402

00:34:13.435 --> 00:34:14.555 you all refer for those,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9417402

00:34:14.555 --> 00:34:15.114 you need to be out

NOTE Confidence: 0.9417402

00:34:15.114 --> 00:34:16.175 of go out of medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9963403

00:34:17.755 --> 00:34:18.815 Professional responsibilities

NOTE Confidence: 0.93518287

00:34:19.194 --> 00:34:20.875 thus emerge this concept of

NOTE Confidence: 0.93518287

00:34:20.875 --> 00:34:21.775 professional responsibilities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9696923

00:34:22.474 --> 00:34:24.255 emerges as sufficiently malleable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99153554

00:34:24.635 --> 00:34:26.160 to rule out whatever a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99153554

00:34:26.160 --> 00:34:28.180 writer dislikes and to require  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99153554

00:34:28.319 --> 00:34:29.859 what the writer affirms.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99328434

00:34:31.040 --> 00:34:32.719 Similarly, in seeking to say  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99328434

00:34:32.719 --> 00:34:33.859 more about the professional,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:35.119 --> 00:34:36.719 proponents of the provider services  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:36.719 --> 00:34:38.235 model often look to public  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:38.315 --> 00:34:40.075 and professional opinion in arbitrary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:40.075 --> 00:34:41.515 and self contradictory ways, it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:41.515 --> 00:34:42.475 seems to me. So on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:42.475 --> 00:34:44.075 the one hand, they'll refer  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:44.075 --> 00:34:45.515 to a standard of care  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97616184

00:34:45.515 --> 00:34:46.335 and a consensus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98992234

00:34:47.355 --> 00:34:48.715 as establishing the scope of

NOTE Confidence: 0.98992234

00:34:48.715 --> 00:34:50.155 what physicians must do. You

NOTE Confidence: 0.98992234

00:34:50.155 --> 00:34:51.195 must refer for this because

NOTE Confidence: 0.98992234

00:34:51.195 --> 00:34:52.410 that's the standard of care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98992234

00:34:52.650 --> 00:34:53.789 In the next breath,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9995207

00:34:54.089 --> 00:34:55.130 they will refer to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9995207

00:34:55.130 --> 00:34:56.349 absence of consensus

NOTE Confidence: 0.9984079

00:34:56.969 --> 00:34:58.569 as the reason physicians also

NOTE Confidence: 0.9984079

00:34:58.569 --> 00:34:59.390 must refer

NOTE Confidence: 0.67368305

00:34:59.930 --> 00:35:00.430 because

NOTE Confidence: 0.9779117

00:35:01.289 --> 00:35:02.569 they'll say, you may have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9779117

00:35:02.569 --> 00:35:03.930 personally opposed that, but many

NOTE Confidence: 0.9779117

00:35:03.930 --> 00:35:05.049 people disagree with you. Therefore,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9779117

00:35:05.049 --> 00:35:05.849 it wouldn't be right for

NOTE Confidence: 0.9779117

00:35:05.849 --> 00:35:07.049 you to allow your views

NOTE Confidence: 0.9779117

00:35:07.049 --> 00:35:07.789 to trump.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914872

00:35:08.864 --> 00:35:10.645 In a particularly curious turn,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9393702

00:35:11.265 --> 00:35:13.205 Stowell and Emmanuel claim that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9393702

00:35:13.344 --> 00:35:15.605 quote, health care professionals voluntarily  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9393702

00:35:15.745 --> 00:35:17.025 choose their roles and thus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9393702

00:35:17.025 --> 00:35:19.105 become obligated to provide, perform,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9393702

00:35:19.105 --> 00:35:20.885 and refer patients for interventions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99140275

00:35:21.344 --> 00:35:22.945 according to the standards of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99140275

00:35:22.945 --> 00:35:24.480 the profession, end quote.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8586364

00:35:24.940 --> 00:35:26.000 Yet they then,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9921763

00:35:26.300 --> 00:35:27.520 a few sentences later,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9401215

00:35:27.820 --> 00:35:28.320 lament  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9967902

00:35:28.700 --> 00:35:29.680 that the organizations  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9979698

00:35:30.540 --> 00:35:31.600 that most authoritatively  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9095185

00:35:31.980 --> 00:35:33.340 establish the standards of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9095185

00:35:33.340 --> 00:35:33.840 profession,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:34.700 --> 00:35:36.219 quote, all tend to accept

NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:36.219 --> 00:35:38.219 rather than question conscientious objection

NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:38.219 --> 00:35:39.805 in health care. So they're

NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:39.805 --> 00:35:41.245 they're saying we must follow

NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:41.245 --> 00:35:42.445 the standards of profession, and

NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:42.445 --> 00:35:43.565 we'll admit that the standards

NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:43.565 --> 00:35:44.685 of profession tend to allow

NOTE Confidence: 0.95281374

00:35:44.685 --> 00:35:45.825 conscientious refusals.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8697178

00:35:49.165 --> 00:35:50.445 ACOG as well as Stalin

NOTE Confidence: 0.8697178

00:35:50.445 --> 00:35:52.705 Emmanuel acknowledge deep social disagreement

NOTE Confidence: 0.8697178

00:35:52.844 --> 00:35:54.465 about whether abortion is permissible,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9713257

00:35:54.900 --> 00:35:56.260 yet both claim that abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.9713257

00:35:56.260 --> 00:35:57.780 is standard medical practice and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9713257

00:35:57.780 --> 00:35:59.160 therefore cannot be refused.

NOTE Confidence: 0.91392237

00:35:59.780 --> 00:36:01.299 Although abortion is politically and

NOTE Confidence: 0.91392237

00:36:01.299 --> 00:36:03.700 culturally contested, Stalin Emanuel write,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91392237

00:36:03.700 --> 00:36:05.559 it is not medically controversial.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9796728

00:36:07.155 --> 00:36:08.435 So again, in the absence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9796728

00:36:08.435 --> 00:36:09.795 of clarity about the professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9796728

00:36:09.795 --> 00:36:10.855 commitments of medicine,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98763216

00:36:11.395 --> 00:36:13.315 proponents sometimes rely on and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98763216

00:36:13.315 --> 00:36:15.495 sometimes disavow claims of consensus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991595

00:36:15.875 --> 00:36:16.695 and controversy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9610783

00:36:17.315 --> 00:36:18.835 adopting, it seems to us,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9610783

00:36:18.835 --> 00:36:20.195 a kind of whatever works  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9610783

00:36:20.195 --> 00:36:20.695 strategy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9846503

00:36:20.995 --> 00:36:22.859 in an attempt to press  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9846503

00:36:22.859 --> 00:36:24.480 their desired shape of conformity  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9846503

00:36:24.619 --> 00:36:25.519 onto the profession.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.935054

00:36:26.539 --> 00:36:27.739 The way of medicine by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.935054

00:36:27.739 --> 00:36:28.239 contrast  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96513754

00:36:28.779 --> 00:36:30.799 distinguishes not between the professional

NOTE Confidence: 0.96513754

00:36:30.940 --> 00:36:31.759 and the personal,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914534

00:36:32.380 --> 00:36:34.079 but between that which fulfills

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914534

00:36:34.140 --> 00:36:35.440 the physician's profession

NOTE Confidence: 0.99600434

00:36:35.844 --> 00:36:37.364 and that which departs from

NOTE Confidence: 0.99600434

00:36:37.364 --> 00:36:38.905 or contradicts that profession.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9752338

00:36:39.525 --> 00:36:40.905 And in an important sense,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9752338

00:36:41.045 --> 00:36:42.725 this merely distinguishes the reasonable

NOTE Confidence: 0.9752338

00:36:42.725 --> 00:36:43.545 from the unreasonable

NOTE Confidence: 0.9857809

00:36:44.085 --> 00:36:45.625 with attention to the particular

NOTE Confidence: 0.9857809

00:36:45.685 --> 00:36:47.625 vocation of practitioners of medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95591646

00:36:48.719 --> 00:36:49.219 Fifth,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99116975

00:36:49.840 --> 00:36:51.280 in contrast with the provider

NOTE Confidence: 0.99116975

00:36:51.280 --> 00:36:52.880 services model, the way of

NOTE Confidence: 0.99116975

00:36:52.880 --> 00:36:54.800 medicine presents a workable, peaceable

NOTE Confidence: 0.99116975

00:36:54.800 --> 00:36:56.260 approach to living with disagreement

NOTE Confidence: 0.9424489

00:36:57.440 --> 00:36:58.960 with the pluralism that defines  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9424489

00:36:58.960 --> 00:36:59.700 our age.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8248776

00:37:00.320 --> 00:37:01.840 Stalin and Emmanuel speaking for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8248776

00:37:01.840 --> 00:37:03.780 the provider services model write,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94543225

00:37:04.455 --> 00:37:06.215 Healthcare professionals who are unwilling  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94543225

00:37:06.215 --> 00:37:07.815 to accept these limits to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94543225

00:37:07.815 --> 00:37:09.594 conscientious refusals that is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96141624

00:37:10.855 --> 00:37:11.835 have two choices.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9767676

00:37:12.375 --> 00:37:13.655 Select an area of medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9767676

00:37:13.655 --> 00:37:14.775 such as radiology that will  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9767676

00:37:14.775 --> 00:37:15.975 not put them in situations  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9767676

00:37:15.975 --> 00:37:17.255 that conflict with their personal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9767676

00:37:17.255 --> 00:37:18.730 morality, or if there's no  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9767676

00:37:18.730 --> 00:37:20.510 such area, leave the profession.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9790868

00:37:22.090 --> 00:37:23.630 If the profession of medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9790868

00:37:23.690 --> 00:37:25.130 follows this logic to its

NOTE Confidence: 0.9790868  
00:37:25.130 --> 00:37:25.630 conclusion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9979232  
00:37:25.930 --> 00:37:27.130 it will have to drum  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9979232  
00:37:27.130 --> 00:37:27.630 out  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9976157  
00:37:28.090 --> 00:37:29.390 those who have the audacity  
NOTE Confidence: 0.987712  
00:37:30.094 --> 00:37:31.795 to refuse interventions because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99766374  
00:37:32.494 --> 00:37:34.335 those interventions are not required  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99766374  
00:37:34.335 --> 00:37:36.015 by or conducive to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99766374  
00:37:36.015 --> 00:37:36.914 patient's health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9037044  
00:37:38.015 --> 00:37:39.055 This is seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9037044  
00:37:39.055 --> 00:37:40.994 a recipe for a homogeneous  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9037044  
00:37:41.135 --> 00:37:43.075 and authoritarian health care profession,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91626585  
00:37:43.739 --> 00:37:45.180 One held together by the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91626585  
00:37:45.180 --> 00:37:47.520 forcible imposition of external norms,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91626585  
00:37:47.739 --> 00:37:49.200 the norms of legally permitted,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9512113  
00:37:49.500 --> 00:37:50.880 the technologically feasible,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99259055

00:37:51.180 --> 00:37:52.719 and what the patient desires.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914687

00:37:53.100 --> 00:37:54.540 And physicians unwilling to work

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914687

00:37:54.540 --> 00:37:56.380 within these constraints would have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9914687

00:37:56.380 --> 00:37:56.960 to go.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90921104

00:37:58.105 --> 00:37:58.925 Perhaps paradoxically,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9972956

00:37:59.785 --> 00:38:00.985 the way of medicine has

NOTE Confidence: 0.9972956

00:38:00.985 --> 00:38:01.965 much more flexibility.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99406314

00:38:03.065 --> 00:38:04.745 Seems clear that there is

NOTE Confidence: 0.99406314

00:38:04.745 --> 00:38:06.265 no way to recover or

NOTE Confidence: 0.99406314

00:38:06.265 --> 00:38:07.725 forge a new full agreement

NOTE Confidence: 0.99406314

00:38:07.864 --> 00:38:08.585 on the part of all

NOTE Confidence: 0.99406314

00:38:08.585 --> 00:38:10.364 physicians regarding the moral obligations

NOTE Confidence: 0.9714353

00:38:10.905 --> 00:38:11.965 of medical practitioners.

NOTE Confidence: 0.999632

00:38:13.140 --> 00:38:13.640 But

NOTE Confidence: 0.97588986

00:38:14.180 --> 00:38:15.640 if we imagine a profession

NOTE Confidence: 0.97588986

00:38:15.780 --> 00:38:17.539 structured even minimally on a

NOTE Confidence: 0.97588986  
00:38:17.539 --> 00:38:19.079 commitment to patient's health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9553431  
00:38:19.460 --> 00:38:20.819 then the then the profession  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9553431  
00:38:20.819 --> 00:38:22.520 would allow conscientious refusals  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706087  
00:38:22.980 --> 00:38:24.980 where reason dispute exists about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706087  
00:38:24.980 --> 00:38:26.760 whether an intervention is consistent  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9995914  
00:38:27.140 --> 00:38:28.280 with that goal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98233926  
00:38:29.035 --> 00:38:30.415 Patients like mister Anderson  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9551522  
00:38:30.795 --> 00:38:32.315 and miss Parker then would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9551522  
00:38:32.315 --> 00:38:33.435 would not be surprised to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9551522  
00:38:33.435 --> 00:38:34.955 encounter clinicians who make clear  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9551522  
00:38:34.955 --> 00:38:36.255 in so many words  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98882115  
00:38:36.635 --> 00:38:37.835 that they do not believe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98882115  
00:38:37.835 --> 00:38:39.114 that what the patient seeks  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98882115  
00:38:39.114 --> 00:38:40.315 is what the clinician should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98882115  
00:38:40.315 --> 00:38:41.055 be doing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9901998

00:38:42.000 --> 00:38:43.219 Patients in some areas,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97818893

00:38:43.520 --> 00:38:44.980 particularly rural areas,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9989929

00:38:45.360 --> 00:38:46.800 may struggle to find clinicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9989929

00:38:46.800 --> 00:38:48.320 who will provide interventions that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9989929

00:38:48.320 --> 00:38:49.460 are available elsewhere.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9732719

00:38:50.400 --> 00:38:52.160 The profession would sustain in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9732719

00:38:52.160 --> 00:38:53.460 its ranks an ongoing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99976945

00:38:53.840 --> 00:38:55.360 debate about what good medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99976945

00:38:55.360 --> 00:38:55.860 requires.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97269744

00:38:56.614 --> 00:38:58.055 The presence of differences would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97269744

00:38:58.055 --> 00:39:00.055 push people to consider why  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97269744

00:39:00.055 --> 00:39:01.255 they are making the choices  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97269744

00:39:01.255 --> 00:39:01.914 they make  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9796622

00:39:02.454 --> 00:39:04.214 rather than taking practices for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9796622

00:39:04.214 --> 00:39:04.714 granted.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99911904

00:39:05.414 --> 00:39:06.934 And physicians would represent the

NOTE Confidence: 0.99911904  
00:39:06.934 --> 00:39:08.315 diversity of moral communities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9715035  
00:39:08.775 --> 00:39:09.835 found in a society,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9529052  
00:39:10.510 --> 00:39:11.489 religious and otherwise.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99685645  
00:39:11.870 --> 00:39:12.910 And the range of choices  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99685645  
00:39:12.910 --> 00:39:14.190 among philosophies of care would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99685645  
00:39:14.190 --> 00:39:16.130 reflect the ongoing moral disagreements  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99685645  
00:39:16.270 --> 00:39:17.250 among those communities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433295  
00:39:18.350 --> 00:39:19.550 When people like Stahl and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433295  
00:39:19.550 --> 00:39:21.390 Emmanuel insist that physicians put  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9433295  
00:39:21.390 --> 00:39:22.050 their professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99732816  
00:39:22.350 --> 00:39:23.489 obligations first,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999465  
00:39:23.950 --> 00:39:24.850 we would insist  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97636557  
00:39:25.335 --> 00:39:26.455 that they make an argument  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97636557  
00:39:26.455 --> 00:39:27.835 to show how the physician's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97636557  
00:39:27.895 --> 00:39:29.435 commitment to the patient's health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97636557

00:39:29.575 --> 00:39:30.795 objectively construed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92428905

00:39:31.494 --> 00:39:33.335 requires physicians to participate in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92428905

00:39:33.335 --> 00:39:34.875 the intervention and question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9882563

00:39:36.295 --> 00:39:37.335 The way of medicine does  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9882563

00:39:37.335 --> 00:39:38.770 not ask physicians to set  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9882563

00:39:38.770 --> 00:39:39.270 aside  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9996864

00:39:39.570 --> 00:39:41.410 their religious or other moral  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9996864

00:39:41.410 --> 00:39:41.910 commitments  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9171057

00:39:42.450 --> 00:39:43.590 because they are punitively  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997361

00:39:43.890 --> 00:39:44.390 personal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9898784

00:39:45.170 --> 00:39:46.770 The practice of medicine, in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9898784

00:39:46.770 --> 00:39:48.050 fact, has been developed and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9898784

00:39:48.050 --> 00:39:50.050 enriched by religious communities throughout  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9898784

00:39:50.050 --> 00:39:50.550 history.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999216

00:39:50.930 --> 00:39:51.730 And on the way of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999216

00:39:51.730 --> 00:39:52.230 medicine,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9994487

00:39:53.035 --> 00:39:54.715 public and professional authorities would

NOTE Confidence: 0.9994487

00:39:54.715 --> 00:39:55.215 expect

NOTE Confidence: 0.9884917

00:39:55.915 --> 00:39:57.515 and would welcome religious and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9884917

00:39:57.515 --> 00:39:59.435 other moral communities to develop

NOTE Confidence: 0.9884917

00:39:59.435 --> 00:40:01.695 distinctive medical institutions and practices.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95820045

00:40:02.475 --> 00:40:04.235 They would tolerate diverse moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.95820045

00:40:04.235 --> 00:40:06.155 and religious views if those

NOTE Confidence: 0.95820045

00:40:06.155 --> 00:40:07.775 are not essentially unjust.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9595362

00:40:09.050 --> 00:40:10.170 That seems a far cry

NOTE Confidence: 0.9595362

00:40:10.170 --> 00:40:12.010 from the provider services models

NOTE Confidence: 0.94095767

00:40:12.330 --> 00:40:13.150 service models

NOTE Confidence: 0.87083817

00:40:13.610 --> 00:40:16.190 increasingly aggressive intolerance of disagreement.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99339384

00:40:20.664 --> 00:40:21.464 Let me close with just

NOTE Confidence: 0.99339384

00:40:21.464 --> 00:40:23.085 some brief notes on contending

NOTE Confidence: 0.99339384

00:40:23.224 --> 00:40:25.065 conscientiously for good medicine in

NOTE Confidence: 0.99339384

00:40:25.065 --> 00:40:25.805 our time

NOTE Confidence: 0.97413135

00:40:26.184 --> 00:40:27.065 since I know there are

NOTE Confidence: 0.97413135

00:40:27.065 --> 00:40:28.444 some students here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96450603

00:40:29.384 --> 00:40:30.585 I I propose that health

NOTE Confidence: 0.96450603

00:40:30.585 --> 00:40:33.005 care professionals should strive conscientiously

NOTE Confidence: 0.9218092

00:40:33.864 --> 00:40:35.305 to preserve and restore their

NOTE Confidence: 0.9218092

00:40:35.305 --> 00:40:36.125 patients' health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9772058

00:40:36.840 --> 00:40:38.120 And in so doing, to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9772058

00:40:38.120 --> 00:40:39.180 contend conscientiously

NOTE Confidence: 0.995136

00:40:40.040 --> 00:40:41.020 for good medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90662783

00:40:41.480 --> 00:40:42.540 In some contexts,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9992194

00:40:43.080 --> 00:40:43.580 practicing

NOTE Confidence: 0.9855051

00:40:44.120 --> 00:40:45.900 this way will require courage,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9962328

00:40:46.200 --> 00:40:47.260 even great courage.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9854114

00:40:47.640 --> 00:40:48.140 Trailblazers

NOTE Confidence: 0.989483

00:40:48.440 --> 00:40:50.300 must sometimes walk alone.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94562596

00:40:51.065 --> 00:40:53.065 As, Martin Luther King Junior  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94562596

00:40:53.065 --> 00:40:53.565 said,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97707826

00:40:54.905 --> 00:40:55.785 there comes a time when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97707826

00:40:55.785 --> 00:40:56.985 one must take a position  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97707826

00:40:56.985 --> 00:40:58.265 that is neither safe nor  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97707826

00:40:58.265 --> 00:40:59.785 politic nor popular, but he  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97707826

00:40:59.785 --> 00:41:01.325 must take it because conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97707826

00:41:01.465 --> 00:41:03.325 tells him it is right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993514

00:41:03.785 --> 00:41:05.325 And this does not mean  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99799454

00:41:06.060 --> 00:41:07.920 necessarily setting out to persuade  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99799454

00:41:08.140 --> 00:41:09.420 all of your colleagues that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99799454

00:41:09.420 --> 00:41:10.480 they are in error.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98454094

00:41:11.739 --> 00:41:12.700 Some are called to that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98454094

00:41:12.700 --> 00:41:13.200 task,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9676008

00:41:13.580 --> 00:41:14.960 but certainly not all.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95324314  
00:41:15.660 --> 00:41:17.100 Nor do I recommend fighting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95324314  
00:41:17.100 --> 00:41:18.540 for one's rights like fighting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95324314  
00:41:18.540 --> 00:41:19.545 for a right of conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96336466  
00:41:20.424 --> 00:41:21.325 which I think is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9241826  
00:41:21.785 --> 00:41:23.625 too easily interpreted and twisted  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9241826  
00:41:23.625 --> 00:41:25.484 into privileging physicians rights  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97451615  
00:41:25.864 --> 00:41:26.924 over those of patients.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9779158  
00:41:27.545 --> 00:41:28.045 Rather,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96013147  
00:41:28.905 --> 00:41:29.964 I encourage clinicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9990933  
00:41:30.505 --> 00:41:32.525 and trainees to practice medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9990933  
00:41:32.665 --> 00:41:33.724 according to reason  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9981707  
00:41:34.170 --> 00:41:35.369 and to be prepared to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9981707  
00:41:35.369 --> 00:41:36.190 give an account  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99689573  
00:41:36.569 --> 00:41:37.849 of why you do what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99689573  
00:41:37.849 --> 00:41:38.510 you do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.5906199

00:41:39.130 --> 00:41:39.630 including  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9891564

00:41:40.250 --> 00:41:41.869 why you refuse to do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9891564

00:41:42.010 --> 00:41:43.390 what you refuse to do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99205005

00:41:45.530 --> 00:41:46.730 Be committed to the central  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99205005

00:41:46.730 --> 00:41:47.549 good of medicine,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9945574

00:41:47.930 --> 00:41:49.069 the patient's health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9998088

00:41:50.305 --> 00:41:51.665 Do nothing contrary to that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9998088

00:41:51.665 --> 00:41:52.165 good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97487754

00:41:52.545 --> 00:41:53.905 and align your practice in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97487754

00:41:53.905 --> 00:41:55.205 harmony with it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94307005

00:41:55.905 --> 00:41:57.825 Cultivate the virtues that are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94307005

00:41:57.825 --> 00:41:59.445 essential to good medicine and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98627

00:42:01.505 --> 00:42:02.465 be a physician and a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98627

00:42:02.465 --> 00:42:04.325 healer, not merely a technician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98627

00:42:04.465 --> 00:42:05.364 or a provider.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9982659

00:42:06.390 --> 00:42:07.829 In short, be a good

NOTE Confidence: 0.9982659  
00:42:07.829 --> 00:42:08.329 physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85793465  
00:42:08.630 --> 00:42:09.930 practicing good medicine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9977942  
00:42:10.710 --> 00:42:11.910 Doing so will bring good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9977942  
00:42:11.910 --> 00:42:13.270 to your patients and good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9977942  
00:42:13.270 --> 00:42:13.849 to yourself.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986826  
00:42:14.549 --> 00:42:15.849 It may also persuade  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991108  
00:42:16.230 --> 00:42:18.010 your colleagues and patients.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8826662  
00:42:18.864 --> 00:42:20.065 I think the bay most  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8826662  
00:42:20.065 --> 00:42:22.005 basic truths like the truth  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8826662  
00:42:22.065 --> 00:42:23.844 as I see it that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99847335  
00:42:24.305 --> 00:42:25.445 medicine is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880057  
00:42:26.225 --> 00:42:26.725 essentially  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9578971  
00:42:27.344 --> 00:42:28.465 for the health of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9578971  
00:42:28.465 --> 00:42:28.965 patient.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9458125  
00:42:29.665 --> 00:42:31.205 These are often better demonstrated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9458125

00:42:31.425 --> 00:42:32.965 in practice than an argument.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97126085

00:42:33.930 --> 00:42:35.450 By pursuing their patients' health

NOTE Confidence: 0.97126085

00:42:35.450 --> 00:42:36.890 in time tested ways that

NOTE Confidence: 0.97126085

00:42:36.890 --> 00:42:38.410 respect the purposes and limits

NOTE Confidence: 0.97126085

00:42:38.410 --> 00:42:39.070 of medicine,

NOTE Confidence: 0.993621

00:42:39.609 --> 00:42:41.130 clinicians will show forth a

NOTE Confidence: 0.993621

00:42:41.130 --> 00:42:41.869 better way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9884567

00:42:42.250 --> 00:42:43.050 a way that has an

NOTE Confidence: 0.9884567

00:42:43.050 --> 00:42:44.589 integrity and even a beauty

NOTE Confidence: 0.9320104

00:42:44.890 --> 00:42:46.349 that may win over those

NOTE Confidence: 0.9320104

00:42:46.489 --> 00:42:47.390 who at present

NOTE Confidence: 0.9938131

00:42:48.015 --> 00:42:49.775 are somewhat captive to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9938131

00:42:49.775 --> 00:42:51.234 provider of services model.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97702235

00:42:52.575 --> 00:42:53.934 I'll stop there, and we'd

NOTE Confidence: 0.97702235

00:42:53.934 --> 00:42:55.154 be happy to take questions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.75360405

00:43:00.530 --> 00:43:01.810 There's more of just, like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75360405

00:43:01.810 --> 00:43:03.190 capsaicin Sure. Tables.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8198675

00:43:04.330 --> 00:43:04.830 So,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99616784

00:43:06.369 --> 00:43:07.910 what we're gonna do next,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91129315

00:43:08.609 --> 00:43:09.009 is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8926119

00:43:09.410 --> 00:43:11.170 Amir and, as Karen, I

NOTE Confidence: 0.8926119

00:43:11.170 --> 00:43:12.290 got some mics, gonna have

NOTE Confidence: 0.8926119

00:43:12.290 --> 00:43:13.489 some mics, and I'm gonna

NOTE Confidence: 0.8926119

00:43:13.489 --> 00:43:14.770 call you. Please wait until

NOTE Confidence: 0.8926119

00:43:14.770 --> 00:43:15.570 I call you, and then

NOTE Confidence: 0.8926119

00:43:15.570 --> 00:43:16.310 wait until,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9615355

00:43:16.925 --> 00:43:18.045 either Amir. So you guys

NOTE Confidence: 0.9615355

00:43:18.045 --> 00:43:18.844 keep an eye on me

NOTE Confidence: 0.9615355

00:43:18.844 --> 00:43:19.805 because I wanna kinda mix

NOTE Confidence: 0.9615355

00:43:19.805 --> 00:43:20.525 it up who gets to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9615355

00:43:20.525 --> 00:43:21.565 ask a question or make

NOTE Confidence: 0.9615355

00:43:21.565 --> 00:43:22.225 a comment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776837

00:43:23.645 --> 00:43:24.364 We have a lot of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776837

00:43:24.364 --> 00:43:25.645 students here, PA students and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776837

00:43:25.645 --> 00:43:26.605 medical students. I wanna make  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776837

00:43:26.605 --> 00:43:27.244 sure at least some of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776837

00:43:27.244 --> 00:43:28.445 these questions and comments come  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776837

00:43:28.445 --> 00:43:29.265 from you guys,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9730317

00:43:29.730 --> 00:43:30.530 But there's a lot of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9730317

00:43:30.530 --> 00:43:31.489 folks here who might wanna  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9730317

00:43:31.489 --> 00:43:32.230 say something.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96992123

00:43:34.850 --> 00:43:35.969 You know, and and I'll  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96992123

00:43:35.969 --> 00:43:37.170 I'll take the liberty of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96992123

00:43:37.170 --> 00:43:38.310 of the first comment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9716093

00:43:38.690 --> 00:43:40.390 and then and then question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94930094

00:43:40.850 --> 00:43:41.890 The a comment would be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94930094

00:43:41.890 --> 00:43:43.525 that that you raise an

NOTE Confidence: 0.94930094  
00:43:43.525 --> 00:43:44.425 interesting concern  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9536123  
00:43:46.405 --> 00:43:47.785 that, by using the model,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9407822  
00:43:48.085 --> 00:43:48.805 and I forgive me if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9407822  
00:43:48.805 --> 00:43:49.685 I can't recall the model.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9407822  
00:43:49.685 --> 00:43:50.885 The model that Emmanuel was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9407822  
00:43:50.885 --> 00:43:52.405 proposing, we're we're a bit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9407822  
00:43:52.405 --> 00:43:53.145 more technician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93253344  
00:43:53.445 --> 00:43:54.185 and provider,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96365356  
00:43:55.660 --> 00:43:56.940 that we run the risk  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96365356  
00:43:56.940 --> 00:43:59.360 of a monolithic and authoritarian  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9934019  
00:44:00.140 --> 00:44:00.640 profession.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95766234  
00:44:01.180 --> 00:44:02.700 And just one comment, which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95766234  
00:44:02.700 --> 00:44:03.680 is that sometimes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91080785  
00:44:04.540 --> 00:44:05.440 the physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9988929  
00:44:06.060 --> 00:44:08.080 that a patient presents to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96609503

00:44:09.715 --> 00:44:10.915 may actually, in a in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96609503

00:44:10.915 --> 00:44:12.435 a grand sense, represent the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96609503

00:44:12.435 --> 00:44:12.935 profession  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93968093

00:44:13.475 --> 00:44:14.755 and may, in fact, therefore,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93968093

00:44:14.755 --> 00:44:15.494 be monolithic.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99978083

00:44:16.035 --> 00:44:17.955 So when that physician is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99978083

00:44:17.955 --> 00:44:20.215 reluctant or refuses to mention  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9954999

00:44:20.675 --> 00:44:22.275 other options that that physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9954999

00:44:22.275 --> 00:44:23.734 can't provide by conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88381577

00:44:24.810 --> 00:44:26.489 That patient may present may  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88381577

00:44:26.489 --> 00:44:26.989 present  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9424402

00:44:27.290 --> 00:44:28.670 themselves, may see  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99824375

00:44:29.130 --> 00:44:29.710 a monolithic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:30.170 --> 00:44:32.010 structure to them, and and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:32.010 --> 00:44:33.050 in fact, then not have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:33.050 --> 00:44:34.010 access to other things that

NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:34.010 --> 00:44:34.730 they might have. In other

NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:34.730 --> 00:44:35.850 words, they might not proceed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:35.850 --> 00:44:36.810 As you say, it's different

NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:36.810 --> 00:44:38.090 in rural areas versus urban

NOTE Confidence: 0.93523896

00:44:38.090 --> 00:44:39.795 areas and and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9705752

00:44:40.835 --> 00:44:42.035 But I I share your

NOTE Confidence: 0.9705752

00:44:42.035 --> 00:44:43.415 concern about a monolithic

NOTE Confidence: 0.97928953

00:44:44.114 --> 00:44:45.234 profession, but I worry about

NOTE Confidence: 0.97928953

00:44:45.234 --> 00:44:47.155 sometimes the individual physician can

NOTE Confidence: 0.97928953

00:44:47.155 --> 00:44:48.194 present that. Yeah. I don't

NOTE Confidence: 0.97928953

00:44:48.194 --> 00:44:48.994 know if I'm making my

NOTE Confidence: 0.97928953

00:44:48.994 --> 00:44:50.355 point clear on that. Well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9935521

00:44:52.275 --> 00:44:53.474 I'll respond at least to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9935521

00:44:53.474 --> 00:44:54.535 one one

NOTE Confidence: 0.99892664

00:44:55.230 --> 00:44:55.969 aspect of

NOTE Confidence: 0.99114764

00:44:56.350 --> 00:44:58.750 that. I'm not arguing that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99114764

00:44:58.750 --> 00:45:00.830 physicians should hide things from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99114764

00:45:00.830 --> 00:45:01.330 patients.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9696165

00:45:01.790 --> 00:45:02.830 It seems to me one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9696165

00:45:02.830 --> 00:45:04.110 of the virtues that's essential  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9696165

00:45:04.110 --> 00:45:05.070 to good medicine is the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9696165

00:45:05.070 --> 00:45:05.969 virtue of candor,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97703284

00:45:06.830 --> 00:45:08.270 which would include forth being  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97703284

00:45:08.270 --> 00:45:09.869 forthcoming about the reality of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97703284

00:45:10.030 --> 00:45:11.714 for example, if one knows  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97703284

00:45:11.714 --> 00:45:13.335 that most of one's colleagues  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99631757

00:45:14.355 --> 00:45:16.535 would offer a particular intervention  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99631757

00:45:16.755 --> 00:45:17.954 that one thinks is not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99631757

00:45:17.954 --> 00:45:18.775 a good intervention,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9969551

00:45:19.075 --> 00:45:19.875 it seems to me you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9969551

00:45:19.875 --> 00:45:20.835 have an obligation to be

NOTE Confidence: 0.9969551

00:45:20.835 --> 00:45:22.674 honest candid about that. You've

NOTE Confidence: 0.9969551

00:45:22.674 --> 00:45:23.555 come to see me. You've

NOTE Confidence: 0.9969551

00:45:23.555 --> 00:45:24.755 asked for that. Let me

NOTE Confidence: 0.9969551

00:45:24.755 --> 00:45:25.974 explain to you why

NOTE Confidence: 0.9618413

00:45:26.360 --> 00:45:27.800 in my judgment or or

NOTE Confidence: 0.9618413

00:45:27.800 --> 00:45:28.760 why I I can't in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9618413

00:45:28.760 --> 00:45:29.420 good conscience

NOTE Confidence: 0.9390142

00:45:29.800 --> 00:45:31.020 provide that for you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9174417

00:45:31.880 --> 00:45:33.480 And then explain if insofar

NOTE Confidence: 0.9174417

00:45:33.480 --> 00:45:34.219 as the patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.97119474

00:45:34.680 --> 00:45:35.820 wants to hear it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:36.280 --> 00:45:37.480 why why you why you

NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:37.480 --> 00:45:39.045 think that's the case. I

NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:39.045 --> 00:45:40.165 appreciate this. So my second

NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:40.165 --> 00:45:40.964 question, and I promise to

NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:40.964 --> 00:45:42.005 open it up after this,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:42.005 --> 00:45:43.204 because as the, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:43.204 --> 00:45:44.484 the students will gather because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:44.484 --> 00:45:45.765 the the students who've been  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:45.765 --> 00:45:46.724 paying attention, which is, you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:46.724 --> 00:45:48.244 know, some some portion of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:48.325 --> 00:45:48.964 Two or three of them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:48.964 --> 00:45:49.605 Yeah. I'm I'm sure they're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:49.605 --> 00:45:50.565 all paying attention. I've been  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:50.565 --> 00:45:51.444 paying attention to the things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:51.444 --> 00:45:52.724 I've asked them. They'll recognize  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:52.724 --> 00:45:54.190 that that much of what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:54.190 --> 00:45:55.469 you say resonates with things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:55.469 --> 00:45:56.670 that I've said and some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:56.670 --> 00:45:57.790 of it does not. And  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:57.790 --> 00:45:59.230 that's that's cool. That's what

NOTE Confidence: 0.93191963

00:45:59.230 --> 00:46:00.450 makes the world go round.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82890195

00:46:01.310 --> 00:46:01.810 Your

NOTE Confidence: 0.9535839

00:46:02.110 --> 00:46:03.330 the notion of conscience,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97559565

00:46:04.270 --> 00:46:05.390 part of my struggle with

NOTE Confidence: 0.97559565

00:46:05.390 --> 00:46:06.530 that is so if someone,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593135

00:46:07.015 --> 00:46:09.035 out of conscience feels that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593135

00:46:09.094 --> 00:46:11.015 for example, referring a nineteen

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593135

00:46:11.015 --> 00:46:12.695 year old to a transgender

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593135

00:46:12.695 --> 00:46:13.975 clinic and conscience feels that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593135

00:46:13.975 --> 00:46:15.735 not, supportive of that patient's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593135

00:46:15.735 --> 00:46:16.235 health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80804086

00:46:18.695 --> 00:46:19.755 based on conscience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9316413

00:46:21.430 --> 00:46:23.430 Sometimes, perhaps, I worry. I

NOTE Confidence: 0.9316413

00:46:23.430 --> 00:46:24.710 think we all worry that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9316413

00:46:24.710 --> 00:46:25.750 it may be based on

NOTE Confidence: 0.9316413

00:46:25.750 --> 00:46:27.350 that that conscience itself may  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9316413

00:46:27.350 --> 00:46:28.330 be founded upon,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96624875

00:46:30.310 --> 00:46:32.489 not necessarily the patient's well-being,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96624875

00:46:32.630 --> 00:46:34.090 but rather certain prejudices.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9846233

00:46:34.815 --> 00:46:35.855 And that we don't want  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9846233

00:46:35.855 --> 00:46:37.535 those prejudices to actually dictate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9846233

00:46:37.535 --> 00:46:38.494 what the patient is or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9846233

00:46:38.494 --> 00:46:38.994 isn't,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95535713

00:46:39.695 --> 00:46:40.734 what's made available to that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95535713

00:46:40.734 --> 00:46:41.855 patient. I think you've kinda  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95535713

00:46:41.855 --> 00:46:42.815 responded to that. But the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95535713

00:46:42.815 --> 00:46:44.015 bigger my bigger question about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95535713

00:46:44.015 --> 00:46:44.515 consciences,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.919955

00:46:44.815 --> 00:46:46.255 but a little study of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.919955

00:46:46.255 --> 00:46:46.755 history.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99681616

00:46:47.055 --> 00:46:49.250 I mean, American physicians in

NOTE Confidence: 0.99681616  
00:46:49.250 --> 00:46:50.230 the nineteenth century,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9961448  
00:46:52.050 --> 00:46:53.730 some had no trouble doing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9961448  
00:46:53.730 --> 00:46:54.710 experimental surgery  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9997499  
00:46:55.010 --> 00:46:55.830 on slaves  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:46:56.210 --> 00:46:57.330 because they were not really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:46:57.330 --> 00:46:59.010 human beings. And just as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:46:59.010 --> 00:47:00.765 German physicians in the twentieth  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:47:00.765 --> 00:47:02.385 century, not all, but some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:47:02.444 --> 00:47:03.964 had no trouble doing similar  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:47:03.964 --> 00:47:05.885 things to, Jews and others  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:47:05.885 --> 00:47:07.405 in the camps because they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:47:07.405 --> 00:47:08.684 were not really human beings.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9660155  
00:47:08.684 --> 00:47:10.464 And their conscience told them  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99721515  
00:47:10.765 --> 00:47:12.330 that this was actually okay.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476  
00:47:12.730 --> 00:47:13.930 So and it wasn't that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476

00:47:13.930 --> 00:47:15.210 they thought I I don't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476

00:47:15.210 --> 00:47:16.489 think I don't believe that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476

00:47:16.489 --> 00:47:17.130 they woke up in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476

00:47:17.130 --> 00:47:18.330 morning and said, these are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476

00:47:18.330 --> 00:47:19.530 actually people, and what I'm  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476

00:47:19.530 --> 00:47:20.570 doing here is a horrible  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98753476

00:47:20.570 --> 00:47:21.070 thing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97673565

00:47:21.770 --> 00:47:22.969 I think their conscience told  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97673565

00:47:22.969 --> 00:47:24.250 them just like the conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97673565

00:47:24.250 --> 00:47:25.290 of a Yale physician who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97673565

00:47:25.290 --> 00:47:26.810 does something does an experiment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97673565

00:47:26.810 --> 00:47:27.465 on a rabbit,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99160695

00:47:28.105 --> 00:47:29.065 doesn't worry about it the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99160695

00:47:29.065 --> 00:47:29.705 same way they would if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99160695

00:47:29.705 --> 00:47:30.665 they did an experiment on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99160695

00:47:30.665 --> 00:47:32.105 a person. So my fear

NOTE Confidence: 0.99160695

00:47:32.105 --> 00:47:32.905 is not that they went

NOTE Confidence: 0.99160695

00:47:32.905 --> 00:47:34.445 against their conscience. They acted,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99160695

00:47:34.505 --> 00:47:35.405 I think, often

NOTE Confidence: 0.95678717

00:47:35.705 --> 00:47:37.625 consistent with their conscience in

NOTE Confidence: 0.95678717

00:47:37.625 --> 00:47:39.305 doing things that some of

NOTE Confidence: 0.95678717

00:47:39.305 --> 00:47:41.705 their contemporaries and hopefully all

NOTE Confidence: 0.95678717

00:47:41.705 --> 00:47:42.585 of us now look back

NOTE Confidence: 0.95678717

00:47:42.585 --> 00:47:43.500 and say, well, that was

NOTE Confidence: 0.95678717

00:47:43.500 --> 00:47:44.460 really a bad thing to

NOTE Confidence: 0.95678717

00:47:44.460 --> 00:47:44.960 do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99182665

00:47:45.260 --> 00:47:45.760 So

NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:46.060 --> 00:47:47.420 I I worry about just

NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:47.420 --> 00:47:48.700 relying on my own conscience

NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:48.700 --> 00:47:49.580 because I worry that my

NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:49.580 --> 00:47:50.960 own conscience may in fact

NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:51.020 --> 00:47:52.380 be that imperfect just as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:52.380 --> 00:47:54.060 those of the American physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:54.060 --> 00:47:54.780 in the past and the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:54.780 --> 00:47:56.060 German physicians in the past.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:56.060 --> 00:47:57.260 And I'm sure some physicians  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96328187

00:47:57.260 --> 00:47:58.000 in the present  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96785283

00:47:58.985 --> 00:48:00.665 act according to their conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96785283

00:48:00.665 --> 00:48:01.625 but in ways that I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96785283

00:48:01.625 --> 00:48:02.605 would find abhorrent.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9057759

00:48:03.385 --> 00:48:04.585 Yeah. Well, that that you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9057759

00:48:04.585 --> 00:48:05.385 put a few things on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9057759

00:48:05.385 --> 00:48:06.685 the table there first.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98379517

00:48:08.745 --> 00:48:09.385 The conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.971021

00:48:09.705 --> 00:48:11.719 as I said, that that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.971021

00:48:11.719 --> 00:48:13.500 a judgment is conscientious,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9613572

00:48:14.839 --> 00:48:16.200 does not mean it's true.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9613572

00:48:16.200 --> 00:48:17.719 It can be horrific. I

NOTE Confidence: 0.9613572

00:48:17.719 --> 00:48:18.520 mean, I think it was

NOTE Confidence: 0.9613572

00:48:18.520 --> 00:48:20.200 Eichmann who con I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.9613572

00:48:20.200 --> 00:48:21.239 it was Eichmann who in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9613572

00:48:21.239 --> 00:48:21.900 the trials

NOTE Confidence: 0.9660939

00:48:22.280 --> 00:48:23.260 confessed that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9989988

00:48:25.094 --> 00:48:25.594 he

NOTE Confidence: 0.96071225

00:48:25.975 --> 00:48:27.734 had let some Jews go

NOTE Confidence: 0.96071225

00:48:27.734 --> 00:48:29.515 free because of family connections,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99857414

00:48:30.614 --> 00:48:32.055 and then was troubled by

NOTE Confidence: 0.99857414

00:48:32.055 --> 00:48:33.494 the fact that he had

NOTE Confidence: 0.99857414

00:48:33.494 --> 00:48:35.895 not been fully ruthless in

NOTE Confidence: 0.99857414

00:48:35.895 --> 00:48:37.195 executing the plan.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9126927

00:48:37.655 --> 00:48:40.380 So consciences can become horribly

NOTE Confidence: 0.9126927

00:48:40.380 --> 00:48:40.880 formed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99375355

00:48:41.340 --> 00:48:42.700 And so the the the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577723

00:48:43.420 --> 00:48:44.940 that egg judgment, that you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577723

00:48:44.940 --> 00:48:46.780 act according to conscience is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577723

00:48:46.780 --> 00:48:48.540 necessary, I think, for moral  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577723

00:48:48.540 --> 00:48:50.140 action, for ethical action. If  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577723

00:48:50.140 --> 00:48:51.020 you're doing what you think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577723

00:48:51.020 --> 00:48:52.000 you shouldn't do,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9794124

00:48:52.464 --> 00:48:53.665 you're you're not getting off  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9794124

00:48:53.665 --> 00:48:54.565 the ground ethically.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95699215

00:48:54.864 --> 00:48:56.005 But it's not sufficient.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295

00:48:56.545 --> 00:48:58.065 And so which is partly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295

00:48:58.065 --> 00:48:59.425 why we all have a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295

00:48:59.425 --> 00:49:01.204 responsibility to form our consciences  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295

00:49:01.344 --> 00:49:03.105 according to the truth insofar  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295

00:49:03.105 --> 00:49:04.224 as we are able. And  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295

00:49:04.224 --> 00:49:05.105 if you think about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295  
00:49:05.344 --> 00:49:06.704 something like the the German  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9788295  
00:49:06.704 --> 00:49:07.204 physicians,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993354  
00:49:07.969 --> 00:49:09.109 it seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91648984  
00:49:09.489 --> 00:49:11.089 from the history, there there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91648984  
00:49:11.089 --> 00:49:11.589 was,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7785995  
00:49:13.650 --> 00:49:14.390 more than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9589092  
00:49:14.690 --> 00:49:15.829 everybody just thought  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89434236  
00:49:16.289 --> 00:49:16.789 conscientiously,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734805  
00:49:17.250 --> 00:49:18.369 sure, we can kill, you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734805  
00:49:18.369 --> 00:49:19.170 know, we can kill this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734805  
00:49:19.170 --> 00:49:20.690 whole class of people. There  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734805  
00:49:20.690 --> 00:49:22.049 was a sense of you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734805  
00:49:22.049 --> 00:49:23.510 are told from outside  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97991323  
00:49:24.045 --> 00:49:25.244 what you're supposed to do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97991323  
00:49:25.244 --> 00:49:26.364 to preserve the health of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97991323

00:49:26.364 --> 00:49:27.025 the Volk,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9109768

00:49:27.565 --> 00:49:28.605 and then we start to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9109768

00:49:28.605 --> 00:49:30.125 rationalize our behavior and our  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9109768

00:49:30.125 --> 00:49:31.645 conscious become numb. And pretty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9109768

00:49:31.645 --> 00:49:32.785 soon, they become  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99235475

00:49:33.244 --> 00:49:34.944 deeply corrupted and and deformed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735225

00:49:35.325 --> 00:49:36.765 such that we are troubled  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735225

00:49:36.765 --> 00:49:38.224 by letting some go free.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735225

00:49:38.510 --> 00:49:39.790 That can happen. So I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735225

00:49:39.869 --> 00:49:41.390 I'm not putting forward the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735225

00:49:41.390 --> 00:49:41.890 conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99942017

00:49:42.589 --> 00:49:43.869 as the only standard to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99942017

00:49:43.869 --> 00:49:44.849 which we hold ourselves.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.924553

00:49:45.390 --> 00:49:46.510 I am saying though that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.924553

00:49:46.510 --> 00:49:47.329 in the end,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98545265

00:49:47.630 --> 00:49:49.309 the only resource for getting

NOTE Confidence: 0.98545265  
00:49:49.309 --> 00:49:50.930 out of those situations also  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98545265  
00:49:51.069 --> 00:49:52.510 is that someone recognizes they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98545265  
00:49:52.510 --> 00:49:53.170 are wrong  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97342914  
00:49:53.575 --> 00:49:54.614 and says I'm not gonna  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97342914  
00:49:54.614 --> 00:49:55.495 do them just because I'm  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97342914  
00:49:55.495 --> 00:49:57.015 told they're everybody says this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97342914  
00:49:57.015 --> 00:49:57.755 is the standard.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.974953  
00:49:58.135 --> 00:49:59.015 I refuse to do it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.974953  
00:49:59.015 --> 00:50:00.055 because as best I can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.974953  
00:50:00.055 --> 00:50:02.395 tell, it is not ethical.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9958796  
00:50:03.335 --> 00:50:04.555 And that's that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94342  
00:50:05.335 --> 00:50:07.195 having people among our profession  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94342  
00:50:07.335 --> 00:50:08.520 and and having a profession  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94342  
00:50:08.520 --> 00:50:10.140 that welcomes that kind of,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9992301  
00:50:11.000 --> 00:50:12.300 that kind of posture  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98952556

00:50:12.760 --> 00:50:13.580 keeps us  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96732926

00:50:13.880 --> 00:50:15.239 not just taking for granted  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96732926

00:50:15.239 --> 00:50:16.920 practices that may ten, fifteen,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96732926

00:50:16.920 --> 00:50:18.360 twenty years from now be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96732926

00:50:18.360 --> 00:50:19.320 things we look back on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96732926

00:50:19.320 --> 00:50:20.200 and think, how in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96732926

00:50:20.200 --> 00:50:21.239 world did we get involved  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96732926

00:50:21.239 --> 00:50:21.820 in that?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.900727

00:50:22.194 --> 00:50:23.414 Well, that I mean, that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:24.275 --> 00:50:25.315 there's no doubt. I mean,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:25.315 --> 00:50:26.114 that's a fair point because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:26.114 --> 00:50:27.155 there's no doubt there's something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:27.155 --> 00:50:28.194 we're doing now, more than  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:28.194 --> 00:50:29.635 one thing, that we're gonna  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:29.635 --> 00:50:30.674 look back in twenty years  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:30.674 --> 00:50:31.474 and say, well, that was

NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:31.474 --> 00:50:32.355 a mistake. I mean, we

NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:32.355 --> 00:50:33.155 look back now from what

NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:33.155 --> 00:50:34.035 we did twenty years ago

NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:34.035 --> 00:50:34.755 and say, well, that was

NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:34.755 --> 00:50:35.580 a mistake. Not just a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:35.580 --> 00:50:37.180 mistake scientifically, but sometimes a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9826651

00:50:37.180 --> 00:50:39.280 mistake ethically as well. So,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99926716

00:50:40.380 --> 00:50:41.040 I guess

NOTE Confidence: 0.96087825

00:50:41.580 --> 00:50:42.620 we have to think about

NOTE Confidence: 0.96087825

00:50:42.620 --> 00:50:44.300 what then the safeguards are

NOTE Confidence: 0.96087825

00:50:44.300 --> 00:50:45.920 to consciences that are

NOTE Confidence: 0.99762654

00:50:46.300 --> 00:50:47.440 formed badly.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9387834

00:50:47.755 --> 00:50:48.635 That's right. So it seems

NOTE Confidence: 0.9387834

00:50:48.635 --> 00:50:50.474 to just jump there. In

NOTE Confidence: 0.9387834

00:50:50.474 --> 00:50:51.435 the end, there through the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9387834

00:50:51.435 --> 00:50:52.635 political process, we have to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9387834

00:50:52.635 --> 00:50:53.375 set boundaries.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99479085

00:50:53.755 --> 00:50:54.635 It seems to me the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99479085

00:50:54.635 --> 00:50:55.994 reasonable boundaries that are set  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99479085

00:50:55.994 --> 00:50:56.815 by authorities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9969604

00:50:57.915 --> 00:50:59.775 are ones that are around  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9969604

00:50:59.994 --> 00:51:00.155 the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97202724

00:51:01.030 --> 00:51:02.470 holding people accountable to act  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97202724

00:51:02.470 --> 00:51:03.510 in ways that are conducive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97202724

00:51:03.510 --> 00:51:04.490 to patient's health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99682486

00:51:04.950 --> 00:51:06.010 Objectively understood.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9872202

00:51:06.870 --> 00:51:08.070 They should not be setting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9872202

00:51:08.070 --> 00:51:10.150 boundaries of you must do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9872202

00:51:10.150 --> 00:51:11.430 everything that people ask of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9872202

00:51:11.430 --> 00:51:11.930 you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918

00:51:12.310 --> 00:51:13.270 But when you see a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:13.270 --> 00:51:15.110 doctor watching someone bleed out  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:15.110 --> 00:51:17.035 and just ignoring it, that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:17.035 --> 00:51:18.315 that clearly is and then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:18.315 --> 00:51:19.435 they they can't say, well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:19.435 --> 00:51:20.635 I conscientiously thought it would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:20.635 --> 00:51:21.195 be a good idea to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:21.195 --> 00:51:22.715 let them bleed out. That  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:22.715 --> 00:51:24.555 can't that can't justify that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:24.555 --> 00:51:25.755 action. I'm not proposing that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689918  
00:51:25.755 --> 00:51:26.415 it does.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577952  
00:51:26.875 --> 00:51:27.675 I hear you. So let  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577952  
00:51:27.675 --> 00:51:28.475 me let me let me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577952  
00:51:28.475 --> 00:51:30.075 start. This gentleman right here,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577952  
00:51:30.075 --> 00:51:30.875 we'll start with if we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9577952  
00:51:30.875 --> 00:51:32.780 could bring the mic there.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99013585

00:51:33.719 --> 00:51:34.520 Thank you for your speech,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99013585

00:51:34.520 --> 00:51:35.640 doctor. Wait one second. There  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99013585

00:51:35.640 --> 00:51:36.440 you go. Hold it up  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99013585

00:51:36.440 --> 00:51:37.560 close. Thank you for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99013585

00:51:37.560 --> 00:51:38.600 speech, doctor. I wanted to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99013585

00:51:38.600 --> 00:51:39.500 make two points.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9945419

00:51:40.120 --> 00:51:40.600 First,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95467913

00:51:40.920 --> 00:51:41.739 you framed,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9998684

00:51:42.360 --> 00:51:42.860 consciousness  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9879005

00:51:43.160 --> 00:51:44.520 in as a negative freedom,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9879005

00:51:44.520 --> 00:51:45.480 the right to not do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9879005

00:51:45.480 --> 00:51:45.980 something,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:46.585 --> 00:51:47.705 as a physician, or the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:47.705 --> 00:51:49.165 right to withhold a service.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:49.305 --> 00:51:50.765 Do you believe your ideas  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:50.825 --> 00:51:52.105 extend in terms of a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:52.105 --> 00:51:53.305 positive freedom, the right to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:53.305 --> 00:51:54.925 provide a service, even if

NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:55.065 --> 00:51:56.665 the authorities, perhaps, are not

NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:56.665 --> 00:51:58.105 allowed to make it more,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9650507

00:51:58.425 --> 00:51:58.925 topical?

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:51:59.730 --> 00:52:01.090 Perhaps you are in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:01.090 --> 00:52:02.930 state that is, that has

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:02.930 --> 00:52:04.870 outlawed gender affirming care abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:04.930 --> 00:52:07.010 and physician assisted suicide. Putting

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:07.010 --> 00:52:08.370 aside the legal risks of

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:08.370 --> 00:52:09.250 doing this, do you believe

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:09.250 --> 00:52:10.770 that consciousness extends to do

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:10.770 --> 00:52:12.050 that? And on the second

NOTE Confidence: 0.96977186

00:52:12.050 --> 00:52:12.550 point,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9611799

00:52:12.850 --> 00:52:14.070 we often bring up,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97691345

00:52:14.904 --> 00:52:16.505 American physicians and German physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.97691345

00:52:16.505 --> 00:52:17.625 during World War two. I

NOTE Confidence: 0.97691345

00:52:17.625 --> 00:52:18.904 just wanna we often forget,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:19.224 --> 00:52:20.984 the Japanese physicians in unit

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:20.984 --> 00:52:22.025 seven thirty one, if you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:22.025 --> 00:52:22.904 guys wanna look that up

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:22.904 --> 00:52:24.505 in experimentation on the Chinese.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:24.505 --> 00:52:25.704 So just wanna bring that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:25.704 --> 00:52:27.005 up as well. Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:27.224 --> 00:52:28.269 And we we should also

NOTE Confidence: 0.9495867

00:52:28.269 --> 00:52:29.410 mention them in the US.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9184043

00:52:29.950 --> 00:52:30.769 I I think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.77827036

00:52:31.469 --> 00:52:33.010 engaging some pretty awful,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9313303

00:52:33.549 --> 00:52:34.510 behavior with,

NOTE Confidence: 0.98781055

00:52:35.630 --> 00:52:37.950 forced sterilization of the the

NOTE Confidence: 0.98781055

00:52:37.950 --> 00:52:39.170 the so called unfit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9472865

00:52:40.215 --> 00:52:41.175 North Carolina was one of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9472865

00:52:41.175 --> 00:52:42.955 the leading states and sterilized

NOTE Confidence: 0.9815439

00:52:43.255 --> 00:52:44.695 a few thousand women against

NOTE Confidence: 0.9815439

00:52:44.695 --> 00:52:45.355 their will.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9443292

00:52:46.455 --> 00:52:47.655 That was supported by our

NOTE Confidence: 0.9443292

00:52:47.655 --> 00:52:49.575 Supreme Court. Justice Oliver Wendell

NOTE Confidence: 0.9443292

00:52:49.575 --> 00:52:51.655 Holmes famously said three generations

NOTE Confidence: 0.9443292

00:52:51.655 --> 00:52:52.955 of imbeciles is enough.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9955954

00:52:53.655 --> 00:52:54.155 So

NOTE Confidence: 0.9520294

00:52:56.270 --> 00:52:57.469 the the the answer to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9520294

00:52:57.469 --> 00:52:58.349 your first question, which is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9520294

00:52:58.349 --> 00:53:00.210 an important one, is this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99904424

00:53:00.510 --> 00:53:01.010 So

NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:01.310 --> 00:53:02.190 first of all, there's the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:02.190 --> 00:53:03.550 question the the question of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:03.550 --> 00:53:05.469 what is one morally obligated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:05.469 --> 00:53:07.230 to do, and I proposed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:07.230 --> 00:53:08.270 to you that one is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:08.430 --> 00:53:10.609 if is definitely morally obligated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:10.670 --> 00:53:12.185 to do all that one's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9619269

00:53:12.185 --> 00:53:12.685 conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8622051

00:53:15.625 --> 00:53:16.525 that that one's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9872459

00:53:16.985 --> 00:53:17.485 conscience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89809436

00:53:18.105 --> 00:53:19.864 determines and judges one must  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89809436

00:53:19.864 --> 00:53:20.364 do,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907

00:53:21.145 --> 00:53:22.745 and also to refuse what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907

00:53:22.745 --> 00:53:24.825 one conscience judges one must  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907

00:53:24.825 --> 00:53:26.610 not do. Again, that's that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907

00:53:26.690 --> 00:53:27.730 not to say that you're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907

00:53:27.970 --> 00:53:29.010 what decisions you make are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907

00:53:29.010 --> 00:53:29.970 going to be good, but

NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907  
00:53:29.970 --> 00:53:31.010 that's a condition for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97389907  
00:53:31.010 --> 00:53:32.630 possibility of them being good.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9988646  
00:53:33.330 --> 00:53:34.770 That being said, there's a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9988646  
00:53:34.770 --> 00:53:36.150 second question about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.82532126  
00:53:36.610 --> 00:53:37.670 when should authorities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9756711  
00:53:38.770 --> 00:53:40.370 limit what you are allowed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9756711  
00:53:40.370 --> 00:53:40.935 to do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:41.815 --> 00:53:42.775 And it seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:42.775 --> 00:53:44.455 that the very possibility of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:44.455 --> 00:53:45.415 a free society is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:45.415 --> 00:53:48.055 basic political philosophy issue is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:48.055 --> 00:53:49.975 that negative rights, the negative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:49.975 --> 00:53:51.415 right of conscience is much  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:51.415 --> 00:53:52.935 more expansive than a positive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97032857  
00:53:52.935 --> 00:53:53.280 right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98835045

00:53:53.760 --> 00:53:54.560 So it seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98835045

00:53:54.560 --> 00:53:55.219 the states  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9389286

00:53:55.840 --> 00:53:57.219 have good reason to,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991744

00:53:58.800 --> 00:54:00.020 be very hesitant  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99915314

00:54:00.320 --> 00:54:01.520 to come in and force  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99915314

00:54:01.520 --> 00:54:02.800 people to do something that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99915314

00:54:02.800 --> 00:54:03.940 they believe is wrong.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987369

00:54:04.800 --> 00:54:06.000 It does not follow that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987369

00:54:06.000 --> 00:54:07.635 the state has the same  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987369

00:54:07.635 --> 00:54:09.235 limitation that the state must  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987369

00:54:09.235 --> 00:54:10.275 allow people to do the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987369

00:54:10.275 --> 00:54:11.155 full range of things they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987369

00:54:11.155 --> 00:54:12.055 think are right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95664006

00:54:13.155 --> 00:54:14.035 And so this and I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95664006

00:54:14.035 --> 00:54:15.235 realized that can seem like,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95664006

00:54:15.235 --> 00:54:16.755 well, you're not being fair.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95664006  
00:54:16.755 --> 00:54:18.135 You're you wanna have your,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96687156  
00:54:18.675 --> 00:54:19.475 you wanna have,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90763617  
00:54:20.275 --> 00:54:21.635 what's the right analogy? Anyway,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90763617  
00:54:21.635 --> 00:54:21.875 you want  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:22.809 --> 00:54:24.010 yeah. Well, something like that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:24.010 --> 00:54:25.049 but it's I'm actually thinking,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:25.049 --> 00:54:26.170 you know, it's good for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:26.569 --> 00:54:27.690 what you you some people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:27.690 --> 00:54:28.489 would think, well, if you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:28.489 --> 00:54:29.849 believe in if you believe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:29.849 --> 00:54:31.049 conscience is so important, then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94493616  
00:54:31.049 --> 00:54:31.869 you should support  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9638841  
00:54:32.730 --> 00:54:34.665 the state allowing the conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9638841  
00:54:34.825 --> 00:54:36.425 person to provide abortions, let's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9638841  
00:54:36.425 --> 00:54:37.705 say, or to do to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9638841

00:54:37.705 --> 00:54:38.605 provide assisted,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9749146

00:54:39.065 --> 00:54:40.285 medical aid in dying.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9781525

00:54:40.745 --> 00:54:41.545 And it seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9781525

00:54:41.545 --> 00:54:43.225 that that it doesn't follow,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9781525

00:54:43.225 --> 00:54:44.425 that that that the negative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9781525

00:54:44.425 --> 00:54:45.545 right does not imply the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9781525

00:54:45.545 --> 00:54:47.480 the positive right. But that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9626158

00:54:47.940 --> 00:54:49.460 even taking into consideration in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9626158

00:54:49.460 --> 00:54:51.080 terms of a physician's obligation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9928275

00:54:51.460 --> 00:54:52.420 for the patient's health and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9928275

00:54:52.420 --> 00:54:53.700 well-being. If the physician is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9928275

00:54:53.700 --> 00:54:54.200 convinced  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:54:54.500 --> 00:54:55.380 that to do this is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:54:55.380 --> 00:54:56.739 necessary for the patient's health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:54:56.739 --> 00:54:57.940 and well-being, you think that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:54:57.940 --> 00:54:59.300 the prescriptions of the state

NOTE Confidence: 0.98573893

00:54:59.300 --> 00:55:00.015 should still,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9871153

00:55:00.575 --> 00:55:02.575 trump? No. No. I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.9871153

00:55:02.575 --> 00:55:04.094 that there are situations in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9871153

00:55:04.094 --> 00:55:06.114 which a physician may determine

NOTE Confidence: 0.99391794

00:55:07.055 --> 00:55:08.575 she may determine that the

NOTE Confidence: 0.99391794

00:55:08.575 --> 00:55:09.535 state has told me I

NOTE Confidence: 0.99391794

00:55:09.535 --> 00:55:10.734 cannot do this, but I

NOTE Confidence: 0.99391794

00:55:10.734 --> 00:55:11.234 must.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94205546

00:55:11.934 --> 00:55:13.474 And and and, hopefully,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:13.830 --> 00:55:15.510 in those cases, she's using

NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:15.510 --> 00:55:17.110 good judgment. Her conscience is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:17.110 --> 00:55:18.870 well formed. And and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:18.870 --> 00:55:20.710 usually, if that's happening, that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:20.710 --> 00:55:21.670 a sign that the state

NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:21.670 --> 00:55:22.870 policy there's something wrong with

NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:22.870 --> 00:55:23.910 it. It's it's an unjust  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:23.910 --> 00:55:25.190 policy if that's happening very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9667171

00:55:25.190 --> 00:55:25.690 often.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9341373

00:55:28.185 --> 00:55:29.645 So but then the question  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9341373

00:55:29.864 --> 00:55:31.545 the question kinda becomes what's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9341373

00:55:31.545 --> 00:55:32.585 the substance? I mean, is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9341373

00:55:32.585 --> 00:55:33.545 she right or wrong? What  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9341373

00:55:33.625 --> 00:55:34.665 is the state right or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9341373

00:55:34.665 --> 00:55:35.785 or is that doctor right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9341373

00:55:35.785 --> 00:55:36.605 And that that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9934459

00:55:36.985 --> 00:55:38.205 in that case, it matters,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98182434

00:55:38.825 --> 00:55:39.864 you know, what the ethical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98182434

00:55:39.864 --> 00:55:41.465 issues at stake are. Thank  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98182434

00:55:41.465 --> 00:55:41.965 you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9279675

00:55:42.780 --> 00:55:43.820 UNC is in the house  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9279675

00:55:43.820 --> 00:55:45.600 here, doctor Hughes. Absolutely.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98928165

00:55:46.219 --> 00:55:46.960 Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99322593

00:55:47.980 --> 00:55:48.719 You've already

NOTE Confidence: 0.8671363

00:55:49.900 --> 00:55:51.760 allowed that you, want

NOTE Confidence: 0.9994447

00:55:52.219 --> 00:55:53.420 people who may have a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9994447

00:55:53.420 --> 00:55:55.500 conscientious objection to providing a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9994447

00:55:55.500 --> 00:55:56.560 particular procedure

NOTE Confidence: 0.9721388

00:55:57.340 --> 00:55:57.765 to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9582308

00:55:58.164 --> 00:55:59.224 inform the patient,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9820634

00:55:59.844 --> 00:56:01.285 of what the what the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9820634

00:56:01.285 --> 00:56:02.644 world is like out there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9820634

00:56:02.644 --> 00:56:03.684 what their choices are, what

NOTE Confidence: 0.9820634

00:56:03.684 --> 00:56:04.664 their options are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95717055

00:56:05.285 --> 00:56:06.565 And I'd like to just

NOTE Confidence: 0.95717055

00:56:06.565 --> 00:56:07.924 get you to elaborate on

NOTE Confidence: 0.95717055

00:56:07.924 --> 00:56:09.204 that a little bit further.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95717055

00:56:09.204 --> 00:56:10.484 You in your in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95717055

00:56:10.484 --> 00:56:11.765 paper that you published some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95717055

00:56:11.765 --> 00:56:12.904 time ago, you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98269767

00:56:13.710 --> 00:56:15.550 surveyed doctors about what their  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98269767

00:56:15.550 --> 00:56:16.910 obligations were or what the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98269767

00:56:16.910 --> 00:56:18.590 obligations of the profession should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98269767

00:56:18.590 --> 00:56:19.890 be. So  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9446878

00:56:20.349 --> 00:56:21.710 would would you be willing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9446878

00:56:21.710 --> 00:56:22.210 to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9895736

00:56:22.910 --> 00:56:23.890 to say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.876471

00:56:24.270 --> 00:56:26.050 for example, that a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98496836

00:56:26.694 --> 00:56:28.635 a physician who conscientiously  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871516

00:56:29.255 --> 00:56:29.755 objects  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9434538

00:56:30.614 --> 00:56:31.914 to, say,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9043948

00:56:32.214 --> 00:56:33.275 a gender transformation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90390384

00:56:34.855 --> 00:56:36.535 would still be obligated, and

NOTE Confidence: 0.90390384  
00:56:36.535 --> 00:56:37.815 it sounds like that person  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90390384  
00:56:37.815 --> 00:56:39.515 would be obligated to provide  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90390384  
00:56:39.655 --> 00:56:40.155 information  
NOTE Confidence: 0.895191  
00:56:40.775 --> 00:56:41.994 or would be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9513353  
00:56:42.630 --> 00:56:43.609 obligated to,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9987527  
00:56:44.549 --> 00:56:45.130 to note  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9876077  
00:56:45.670 --> 00:56:47.269 that there are other people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9876077  
00:56:47.269 --> 00:56:48.650 who would be supportive.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99778867  
00:56:49.670 --> 00:56:51.210 Is that conscientiously  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9871361  
00:56:51.750 --> 00:56:52.250 objective  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9990097  
00:56:52.789 --> 00:56:53.289 objecting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99852836  
00:56:53.589 --> 00:56:54.089 physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9921601  
00:56:55.025 --> 00:56:56.625 obligated any further? Are they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9921601  
00:56:56.625 --> 00:56:57.125 obligated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9980556  
00:56:58.065 --> 00:56:58.805 to refer?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986114

00:56:59.585 --> 00:57:01.925 Are they obligated to provide  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986114

00:57:01.985 --> 00:57:02.885 more specific  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91262335

00:57:03.185 --> 00:57:04.785 information in addition to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91262335

00:57:04.785 --> 00:57:05.285 information,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9906456

00:57:05.905 --> 00:57:08.165 perhaps, about why they object?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9655432

00:57:08.690 --> 00:57:10.130 But just so that there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9655432

00:57:10.130 --> 00:57:10.870 would be,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97379744

00:57:12.610 --> 00:57:14.530 just so we know what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97379744

00:57:14.530 --> 00:57:16.290 your standards would be, your  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97379744

00:57:16.290 --> 00:57:16.790 requirements  
NOTE Confidence: 0.980062

00:57:17.650 --> 00:57:19.430 for those who are conscientiously  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8959264

00:57:19.810 --> 00:57:21.190 objecting. And then,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99905115

00:57:23.175 --> 00:57:24.615 depending on what your response  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99905115

00:57:24.615 --> 00:57:25.115 is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9992386

00:57:25.495 --> 00:57:26.635 how would you distinguish  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9996235

00:57:27.575 --> 00:57:29.095 the end result of your

NOTE Confidence: 0.9996235

00:57:29.095 --> 00:57:30.955 recommendations from the end result

NOTE Confidence: 0.8318884

00:57:32.135 --> 00:57:34.155 of Emmanuel and his colleagues'

NOTE Confidence: 0.979635

00:57:34.535 --> 00:57:35.035 position?

NOTE Confidence: 0.99960893

00:57:35.710 --> 00:57:36.770 Okay. Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98294747

00:57:38.030 --> 00:57:39.810 The late, Dan Brock

NOTE Confidence: 0.6987734

00:57:40.670 --> 00:57:42.290 of medical office at Harvard,

NOTE Confidence: 0.99880016

00:57:43.310 --> 00:57:44.270 wrote a piece in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.99880016

00:57:44.270 --> 00:57:45.230 collection that I had the

NOTE Confidence: 0.99880016

00:57:45.230 --> 00:57:46.370 privilege of editing

NOTE Confidence: 0.9967047

00:57:47.150 --> 00:57:48.370 about twenty years ago

NOTE Confidence: 0.39145353

00:57:48.750 --> 00:57:49.250 and

NOTE Confidence: 0.97764415

00:57:49.725 --> 00:57:50.845 in which he talked about

NOTE Confidence: 0.97764415

00:57:50.845 --> 00:57:52.065 the conventional compromise,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9592118

00:57:52.925 --> 00:57:54.205 which he was for. And

NOTE Confidence: 0.9592118

00:57:54.205 --> 00:57:55.565 he said the conventional compromise

NOTE Confidence: 0.9592118

00:57:55.565 --> 00:57:56.305 is that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9864172

00:57:56.845 --> 00:57:58.225 we we we socially  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95504653

00:57:58.525 --> 00:58:00.385 and and politically and publicly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986339

00:58:02.125 --> 00:58:02.625 value  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99789184

00:58:03.570 --> 00:58:05.410 people having space to act  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99789184

00:58:05.410 --> 00:58:06.470 according to conscience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98288643

00:58:07.170 --> 00:58:08.310 We don't wanna be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.967999

00:58:08.690 --> 00:58:10.370 coercing people into doing things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.967999

00:58:10.370 --> 00:58:11.490 that they believe are wrong.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.967999

00:58:11.490 --> 00:58:13.410 It's generally good for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.967999

00:58:13.410 --> 00:58:14.230 body politic.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99753773

00:58:14.690 --> 00:58:15.190 But  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9447123

00:58:16.035 --> 00:58:17.474 we have the the professional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9447123

00:58:17.474 --> 00:58:19.015 medicine has a social contract,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8192804

00:58:20.035 --> 00:58:20.855 at least implicitly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99973184

00:58:21.714 --> 00:58:22.454 that requires

NOTE Confidence: 0.99880946

00:58:22.755 --> 00:58:24.535 the profession to make available

NOTE Confidence: 0.99880946

00:58:24.595 --> 00:58:25.575 the full range

NOTE Confidence: 0.99957746

00:58:26.115 --> 00:58:26.934 of interventions

NOTE Confidence: 0.9428242

00:58:27.234 --> 00:58:28.674 that the law permits and

NOTE Confidence: 0.9428242

00:58:28.674 --> 00:58:30.194 that people, the public may

NOTE Confidence: 0.9428242

00:58:30.194 --> 00:58:32.030 want. So the conventional compromise

NOTE Confidence: 0.9428242

00:58:32.030 --> 00:58:33.310 is you don't have to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9428242

00:58:33.310 --> 00:58:34.210 do the thing

NOTE Confidence: 0.98022

00:58:34.830 --> 00:58:36.110 that's being asked, but you

NOTE Confidence: 0.98022

00:58:36.110 --> 00:58:37.630 do have to refer. And

NOTE Confidence: 0.98022

00:58:37.630 --> 00:58:38.290 the referral,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90407634

00:58:38.670 --> 00:58:40.190 Brock argued, is a way

NOTE Confidence: 0.90407634

00:58:40.190 --> 00:58:41.570 of honoring that

NOTE Confidence: 0.99942446

00:58:41.950 --> 00:58:42.930 social contract.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9725446

00:58:43.595 --> 00:58:44.714 I think that's not I

NOTE Confidence: 0.9725446

00:58:44.714 --> 00:58:46.234 think that's wrong. And here's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9725446

00:58:46.234 --> 00:58:47.515 why here's why I disagree

NOTE Confidence: 0.9725446

00:58:47.515 --> 00:58:48.075 with with,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9283638

00:58:48.555 --> 00:58:49.615 professor Brock.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9586053

00:58:50.714 --> 00:58:51.674 It seems to me that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9586053

00:58:51.674 --> 00:58:52.734 the social contract,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95777506

00:58:53.275 --> 00:58:54.654 insofar as there's a reasonable

NOTE Confidence: 0.95777506

00:58:54.714 --> 00:58:56.555 social contract, is not that

NOTE Confidence: 0.95777506

00:58:56.555 --> 00:58:58.255 we must provide all

NOTE Confidence: 0.96558654

00:58:58.890 --> 00:59:00.829 legal things that are possible,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95565635

00:59:01.450 --> 00:59:02.170 all the things that the

NOTE Confidence: 0.95565635

00:59:02.170 --> 00:59:03.130 state has not taken the

NOTE Confidence: 0.95565635

00:59:03.130 --> 00:59:04.109 time to outlaw.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9627786

00:59:05.609 --> 00:59:07.049 But in fact, that what

NOTE Confidence: 0.9627786

00:59:07.049 --> 00:59:08.170 what we have a social

NOTE Confidence: 0.9627786

00:59:08.170 --> 00:59:09.289 contract to do is to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9627786  
00:59:09.289 --> 00:59:10.190 show up for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99533224  
00:59:10.650 --> 00:59:12.329 and discipline ourselves to be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99533224  
00:59:12.329 --> 00:59:13.069 able to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99603194  
00:59:13.565 --> 00:59:14.365 care for those who are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99603194  
00:59:14.365 --> 00:59:15.185 sick or injured  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98135  
00:59:15.485 --> 00:59:16.685 in a reasonable way using  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98135  
00:59:16.685 --> 00:59:18.205 the means available, seeking to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98135  
00:59:18.205 --> 00:59:19.485 preserve and restore their health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98135  
00:59:19.485 --> 00:59:20.605 That's what the public expects  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98135  
00:59:20.605 --> 00:59:21.665 of us as doctors.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99888724  
00:59:22.045 --> 00:59:22.545 So  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9833894  
00:59:23.245 --> 00:59:24.285 to answer the first part  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9833894  
00:59:24.285 --> 00:59:25.325 of your question, it seems  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9833894  
00:59:25.325 --> 00:59:26.340 to me that I have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9833894  
00:59:26.340 --> 00:59:27.620 an obligation, first of all,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9833894

00:59:27.620 --> 00:59:28.820 to all patients as I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9833894

00:59:28.820 --> 00:59:30.260 do to all persons to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9833894

00:59:30.260 --> 00:59:31.320 be a truth teller.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98295975

00:59:31.620 --> 00:59:33.220 So in my interaction with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98295975

00:59:33.220 --> 00:59:34.260 the patient, I should neither  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98295975

00:59:34.260 --> 00:59:35.060 be I should not be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98295975

00:59:35.060 --> 00:59:35.940 acting in a way that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98295975

00:59:35.940 --> 00:59:36.440 deceptive,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99969566

00:59:37.140 --> 00:59:38.420 and I should not fail  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99969566

00:59:38.420 --> 00:59:39.300 to say things that I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99969566

00:59:39.300 --> 00:59:40.600 think a reasonable person  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9743708

00:59:41.295 --> 00:59:42.175 should would would want to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9743708

00:59:42.175 --> 00:59:42.675 know.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94927984

00:59:43.135 --> 00:59:44.015 How far you go in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94927984

00:59:44.015 --> 00:59:44.734 that, it seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94927984

00:59:44.734 --> 00:59:45.615 as a matter of judgment

NOTE Confidence: 0.94927984

00:59:45.615 --> 00:59:46.335 as is the case in

NOTE Confidence: 0.94927984

00:59:46.335 --> 00:59:47.454 much of medicine. What's a

NOTE Confidence: 0.94927984

00:59:47.454 --> 00:59:48.755 reasonable person standard?

NOTE Confidence: 0.94659805

00:59:49.055 --> 00:59:50.835 I don't think a doctor,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:51.775 --> 00:59:53.055 for example, I'm a hospice

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:53.055 --> 00:59:54.900 and palliative medicine doctor. When

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:54.900 --> 00:59:55.940 people are facing the end

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:55.940 --> 00:59:56.579 of their life and they

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:56.579 --> 00:59:57.299 say, I don't know what

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:57.299 --> 00:59:58.740 what are my options. I

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:58.740 --> 00:59:59.540 don't tell them one of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

00:59:59.540 --> 01:00:00.500 your options is to drive

NOTE Confidence: 0.9687326

01:00:00.500 --> 01:00:02.099 to California and be be,

NOTE Confidence: 0.94250053

01:00:02.740 --> 01:00:04.660 undergo assisted suicide or drive

NOTE Confidence: 0.94250053

01:00:04.660 --> 01:00:05.960 to Canada and be euthanized

NOTE Confidence: 0.94250053

01:00:06.180 --> 01:00:07.299 or fly to Switzerland and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94250053

01:00:07.299 --> 01:00:08.260 be I don't tell them  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94250053

01:00:08.260 --> 01:00:09.299 that because I don't think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94250053

01:00:09.299 --> 01:00:09.765 that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8947448

01:00:10.164 --> 01:00:11.684 belongs in the reasonable person  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8947448

01:00:11.684 --> 01:00:13.045 standard. Now if they said  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8947448

01:00:13.045 --> 01:00:14.404 what about as my patients  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8947448

01:00:14.404 --> 01:00:14.904 have?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657623

01:00:15.365 --> 01:00:16.484 What about that, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657623

01:00:16.484 --> 01:00:17.365 anything you can do to,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657623

01:00:17.365 --> 01:00:19.065 like, make things go faster?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9402964

01:00:19.444 --> 01:00:20.484 I'll say, tell me, are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9402964

01:00:20.484 --> 01:00:21.464 you talking about,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.988411

01:00:21.845 --> 01:00:22.505 you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97197

01:00:23.010 --> 01:00:25.010 hastening your death intentionally? Yeah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97197

01:00:25.010 --> 01:00:26.450 I'd like that. Then I

NOTE Confidence: 0.97197  
01:00:26.450 --> 01:00:27.750 then I explain to them,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.998444  
01:00:28.370 --> 01:00:28.870 well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:29.250 --> 01:00:30.370 why I won't do that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:30.370 --> 01:00:31.330 and and why, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:31.330 --> 01:00:32.050 the fact that it's not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:32.050 --> 01:00:33.410 legal in North Carolina. If  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:33.410 --> 01:00:34.770 someone asks about assisted suicide,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:34.770 --> 01:00:35.650 I'm candid about the fact  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:35.650 --> 01:00:36.530 that that is legal in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96262294  
01:00:36.530 --> 01:00:37.365 a number of states.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98760176  
01:00:38.085 --> 01:00:39.045 You can pursue that if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98760176  
01:00:39.045 --> 01:00:39.705 you like.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993084  
01:00:40.085 --> 01:00:41.125 Here's why I'm not going  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993084  
01:00:41.125 --> 01:00:41.625 to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734695  
01:00:42.405 --> 01:00:43.685 cooperate with you in that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734695

01:00:43.685 --> 01:00:44.725 and why I hope you'll  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9734695

01:00:44.725 --> 01:00:45.225 reconsider.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96626276

01:00:45.685 --> 01:00:46.565 So it seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96626276

01:00:46.565 --> 01:00:47.525 we're we're held to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96626276

01:00:47.525 --> 01:00:49.365 standard of, again, act in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96626276

01:00:49.365 --> 01:00:50.405 a way that's consistent with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96626276

01:00:50.405 --> 01:00:51.065 their health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.83924526

01:00:52.320 --> 01:00:52.820 and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96033823

01:00:53.120 --> 01:00:54.400 and then we owe them  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96033823

01:00:54.400 --> 01:00:55.200 the things we owe to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96033823

01:00:55.200 --> 01:00:56.660 all human beings like truthfulness,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993925

01:00:57.760 --> 01:00:58.260 candor,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9281971

01:00:59.120 --> 01:00:59.940 being forthcoming,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99076325

01:01:01.520 --> 01:01:02.640 and that that seems to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99076325

01:01:02.640 --> 01:01:03.440 be what we what we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99076325

01:01:03.440 --> 01:01:03.940 owe.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99781585  
01:01:04.315 --> 01:01:06.015 So one potential problem  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99894273  
01:01:06.395 --> 01:01:07.215 with that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9567649  
01:01:07.835 --> 01:01:08.955 is is is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:09.915 --> 01:01:11.195 is the, you can give  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:11.195 --> 01:01:12.475 that to to doctor Siegel  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:12.475 --> 01:01:13.595 to ask next, would be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:13.595 --> 01:01:14.635 what I've called the savviness  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:14.635 --> 01:01:15.675 requirement. So here's the trouble  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:15.675 --> 01:01:16.875 with that example. So the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:16.875 --> 01:01:18.075 guy who's savvy enough to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97140235  
01:01:18.075 --> 01:01:19.535 know to ask about that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598  
01:01:19.940 --> 01:01:21.380 he gets more information about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598  
01:01:21.380 --> 01:01:22.820 that option. Right? He gets  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598  
01:01:22.820 --> 01:01:23.700 to he because he asks  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598  
01:01:23.700 --> 01:01:24.500 you, well, is there countries  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598

01:01:24.500 --> 01:01:25.300 where it's legal? Then you're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598

01:01:25.300 --> 01:01:26.020 gonna tell them about the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598

01:01:26.020 --> 01:01:27.220 countries where it's legal. The  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598

01:01:27.220 --> 01:01:28.420 guy who's not savvy enough  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598

01:01:28.420 --> 01:01:29.540 to ask that question. Maybe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9500598

01:01:29.540 --> 01:01:30.020 he doesn't,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97555065

01:01:30.420 --> 01:01:31.540 you know, not as good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97555065

01:01:31.540 --> 01:01:32.340 with the Internet. He doesn't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97555065

01:01:32.340 --> 01:01:33.220 have a cousin who's in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97555065

01:01:33.220 --> 01:01:34.625 the medical profession. The guy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97555065

01:01:34.625 --> 01:01:35.665 who's not savvy enough to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97555065

01:01:35.665 --> 01:01:36.484 ask the question  
NOTE Confidence: 0.991936

01:01:36.785 --> 01:01:38.405 gets fewer options  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99048626

01:01:38.944 --> 01:01:39.984 than the guy who's got  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99048626

01:01:40.145 --> 01:01:41.444 who's well read.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9955884

01:01:41.984 --> 01:01:43.184 It strikes me as an

NOTE Confidence: 0.9955884  
01:01:43.184 --> 01:01:44.464 injustice that one man gets  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9955884  
01:01:44.464 --> 01:01:45.765 more options than the other.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93821645  
01:01:46.065 --> 01:01:46.964 Yeah. Well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99848706  
01:01:47.510 --> 01:01:49.109 I mean, are you aware  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99848706  
01:01:49.109 --> 01:01:50.010 ever of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96556956  
01:01:50.470 --> 01:01:52.550 there being physicians who are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96556956  
01:01:52.550 --> 01:01:53.670 practicing in ways that you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96556956  
01:01:53.670 --> 01:01:55.109 don't think are good, but  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96556956  
01:01:55.109 --> 01:01:56.410 that patients could see?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9327548  
01:01:57.670 --> 01:01:58.509 My guess is you are.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9327548  
01:01:58.509 --> 01:01:59.530 At least I am.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9477671  
01:01:59.855 --> 01:02:00.734 And I've talked to surgeons  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9477671  
01:02:00.734 --> 01:02:01.615 who know there are surgeons  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9477671  
01:02:01.615 --> 01:02:02.414 who will do a procedure.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9477671  
01:02:02.414 --> 01:02:03.055 I think I just don't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9477671

01:02:03.135 --> 01:02:03.875 I think they're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98862296

01:02:04.414 --> 01:02:05.795 they shouldn't be doing that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.992023

01:02:07.214 --> 01:02:08.494 If if that's the case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.992023

01:02:08.494 --> 01:02:10.015 are you obligated to tell  
NOTE Confidence: 0.992023

01:02:10.015 --> 01:02:11.454 people this is one of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.992023

01:02:11.454 --> 01:02:12.194 your options?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98075175

01:02:12.780 --> 01:02:14.060 You're supposed to, like, take  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98075175

01:02:14.060 --> 01:02:15.500 in the full scope of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98075175

01:02:15.500 --> 01:02:16.000 possibilities?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993093

01:02:16.300 --> 01:02:17.580 To me, the person who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9993093

01:02:17.580 --> 01:02:18.880 doesn't bring this up  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9968056

01:02:19.260 --> 01:02:20.240 is not owed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9317465

01:02:21.180 --> 01:02:22.700 the suggestion you might wanna  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9317465

01:02:22.700 --> 01:02:23.680 go die by suicide  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344

01:02:24.460 --> 01:02:25.500 because that's not the sort  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344

01:02:25.500 --> 01:02:27.040 of suggestion the doctor owes

NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344  
01:02:27.234 --> 01:02:28.355 in out of her commitment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344  
01:02:28.355 --> 01:02:29.155 to act in a way  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344  
01:02:29.155 --> 01:02:30.695 that's conducive to patient health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344  
01:02:30.835 --> 01:02:31.795 If the physician asked me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344  
01:02:31.795 --> 01:02:33.095 about it, I'll tell them  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94820344  
01:02:33.155 --> 01:02:34.055 what I know.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9768585  
01:02:35.954 --> 01:02:36.454 But  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9322284  
01:02:36.755 --> 01:02:37.795 I don't think as a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9322284  
01:02:37.795 --> 01:02:39.494 physician, I owe people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9523183  
01:02:40.200 --> 01:02:41.480 knowledge about things they can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9523183  
01:02:41.480 --> 01:02:43.080 do that are not good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9523183  
01:02:43.080 --> 01:02:44.599 things to do or and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9523183  
01:02:44.599 --> 01:02:46.040 particularly not things that are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9523183  
01:02:46.040 --> 01:02:47.240 that are consistent with their  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9523183  
01:02:47.240 --> 01:02:47.740 health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191165

01:02:49.160 --> 01:02:50.680 That that so there is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93191165

01:02:50.680 --> 01:02:51.180 a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712626

01:02:51.800 --> 01:02:52.780 large dependence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9979597

01:02:53.240 --> 01:02:54.285 on the definition  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9551665

01:02:54.585 --> 01:02:56.125 on the definition of health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:02:56.505 --> 01:02:58.905 in in your scheme. Yeah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:02:58.905 --> 01:03:00.585 Absolutely. And and it because  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:03:00.585 --> 01:03:01.945 health can be the term  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:03:01.945 --> 01:03:03.545 can be defined. It's interesting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:03:03.545 --> 01:03:04.985 that in these debates, if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:03:04.985 --> 01:03:06.400 you'll pay attention, people tend  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:03:06.400 --> 01:03:07.280 to use the language of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:03:07.280 --> 01:03:09.300 well-being when they're criticizing conscientious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712569

01:03:09.440 --> 01:03:09.940 refusals.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99359655

01:03:10.240 --> 01:03:11.380 I think that's telling.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9703364

01:03:11.680 --> 01:03:13.380 They almost never will say

NOTE Confidence: 0.9703364

01:03:13.600 --> 01:03:15.120 you're obligated to act in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9703364

01:03:15.120 --> 01:03:16.080 a way that's consistent with

NOTE Confidence: 0.9703364

01:03:16.080 --> 01:03:17.360 the patient's health and that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9703364

01:03:17.360 --> 01:03:18.400 why you must refer them

NOTE Confidence: 0.9703364

01:03:18.400 --> 01:03:19.620 for medical aid in dying.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9585161

01:03:19.985 --> 01:03:20.945 They don't say that. They'll

NOTE Confidence: 0.9585161

01:03:20.945 --> 01:03:21.665 say who are you to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9585161

01:03:21.665 --> 01:03:23.265 say what's consistent with their

NOTE Confidence: 0.9585161

01:03:23.265 --> 01:03:23.765 well-being?

NOTE Confidence: 0.98364294

01:03:24.385 --> 01:03:25.505 Their well-being is something that

NOTE Confidence: 0.98364294

01:03:25.505 --> 01:03:26.945 only they could say and

NOTE Confidence: 0.98364294

01:03:26.945 --> 01:03:28.225 you're obligated to support their

NOTE Confidence: 0.98364294

01:03:28.225 --> 01:03:28.725 well-being

NOTE Confidence: 0.919482

01:03:29.265 --> 01:03:30.225 and that's why you should

NOTE Confidence: 0.919482

01:03:30.225 --> 01:03:31.185 refer them if they ask

NOTE Confidence: 0.919482

01:03:31.185 --> 01:03:31.845 you, etcetera.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9968503

01:03:32.540 --> 01:03:33.740 So but if you define  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9968503

01:03:33.740 --> 01:03:34.859 health such that it is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9968503

01:03:34.859 --> 01:03:35.599 open ended  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9503931

01:03:36.220 --> 01:03:36.960 and includes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92625576

01:03:38.060 --> 01:03:39.980 things that are contrary to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92625576

01:03:39.980 --> 01:03:41.920 the health defined more  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9728961

01:03:42.300 --> 01:03:43.260 narrowly as a kind of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9728961

01:03:43.260 --> 01:03:44.235 bodily well working,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508

01:03:44.715 --> 01:03:45.755 then you're right. It you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508

01:03:45.835 --> 01:03:46.555 then it would it would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508

01:03:46.555 --> 01:03:48.075 change things. Yes. So the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508

01:03:48.075 --> 01:03:49.195 next the next question will  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508

01:03:49.195 --> 01:03:50.875 be doctor Siegel, and then,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508

01:03:51.115 --> 01:03:52.235 I'm looking for a medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508

01:03:52.235 --> 01:03:53.355 student. Are you a PA

NOTE Confidence: 0.9618508  
01:03:53.355 --> 01:03:53.855 student?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9584137  
01:03:54.235 --> 01:03:55.195 Outstanding. If you would get  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9584137  
01:03:55.275 --> 01:03:56.155 give her the next mic,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9584137  
01:03:56.155 --> 01:03:57.030 and then after that,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:03:57.670 --> 01:03:58.870 doctor Latham, please. So let's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:03:58.870 --> 01:04:00.230 start with doctor Siegel. Yes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:00.230 --> 01:04:01.190 Then this lady here, then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:01.190 --> 01:04:02.550 doctor Latham. So we'll try  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:02.630 --> 01:04:03.350 and and I have and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:03.350 --> 01:04:04.230 I'm grateful. Be brief in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:04.230 --> 01:04:05.270 our response. You know what?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:05.270 --> 01:04:06.230 You're not the problem. I'm  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:06.230 --> 01:04:07.190 I'm the one who's talking  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:07.190 --> 01:04:07.990 too much up here, not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873  
01:04:07.990 --> 01:04:09.430 you. So so I'll I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873

01:04:09.430 --> 01:04:10.310 will ask you guys from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873

01:04:10.310 --> 01:04:11.190 now. Now that I've talked,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92927873

01:04:11.190 --> 01:04:12.255 now everybody's gotta be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9441289

01:04:12.815 --> 01:04:14.095 brief. So so, yeah, please  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9441289

01:04:14.095 --> 01:04:15.714 keep the questions relatively brief.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9441289

01:04:15.775 --> 01:04:16.595 I I will.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97800195

01:04:17.295 --> 01:04:18.575 So a few years ago,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97800195

01:04:18.575 --> 01:04:19.295 you I don't know if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97800195

01:04:19.295 --> 01:04:20.095 you remember, but you and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97800195

01:04:20.095 --> 01:04:21.134 I served on a committee  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97800195

01:04:21.134 --> 01:04:22.815 for the American Thoracic Society  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97800195

01:04:23.134 --> 01:04:24.335 Yes. Where we,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9960844

01:04:24.974 --> 01:04:26.355 wrote a set of guidelines  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7309259

01:04:26.734 --> 01:04:27.234 for,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9973016

01:04:28.020 --> 01:04:29.960 structures and policies to follow  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9113538

01:04:30.340 --> 01:04:32.440 to when issues of conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.9113538  
01:04:32.580 --> 01:04:33.880 objection come up.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:34.500 --> 01:04:35.540 And and at the time  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:35.540 --> 01:04:36.500 when we were doing this,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:36.500 --> 01:04:37.220 I I thought this is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:37.220 --> 01:04:38.020 like, one of these nice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:38.020 --> 01:04:38.900 things to put in place,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:38.900 --> 01:04:39.620 but I don't think it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:39.620 --> 01:04:40.900 really gonna come up that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95010525  
01:04:40.900 --> 01:04:41.400 often.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96981764  
01:04:42.100 --> 01:04:43.935 And and as you spoke  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96981764  
01:04:43.935 --> 01:04:44.435 about,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96235275  
01:04:45.135 --> 01:04:45.935 the issue of, well, you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96235275  
01:04:45.935 --> 01:04:46.975 shouldn't be in the profession  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96235275  
01:04:46.975 --> 01:04:49.215 if something happens. I realized  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96235275  
01:04:49.215 --> 01:04:50.835 that that the standards  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95683146

01:04:51.375 --> 01:04:52.895 of society and the standards  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95683146

01:04:52.895 --> 01:04:54.035 of medical care  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657364

01:04:54.335 --> 01:04:55.855 might, in fact, change quite  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9657364

01:04:55.855 --> 01:04:56.355 rapidly  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9925278

01:04:57.130 --> 01:04:58.330 before we know it. Right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9925278

01:04:58.330 --> 01:04:59.930 So if you work in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9925278

01:04:59.930 --> 01:05:00.430 UK  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:00.730 --> 01:05:02.490 right now, gender affirming care  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:02.490 --> 01:05:04.010 for children isn't a thing,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:04.010 --> 01:05:05.290 I think, anymore That's right.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:05.369 --> 01:05:06.890 Contrast to the US. And  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:06.890 --> 01:05:08.330 fifteen states have medical aid  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:08.330 --> 01:05:10.505 in dying. Connecticut happens not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:10.505 --> 01:05:11.305 to be one of them,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9769325

01:05:11.305 --> 01:05:12.125 but it could be,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99086666

01:05:12.745 --> 01:05:13.785 sometime. And, of course, who

NOTE Confidence: 0.99086666  
01:05:13.785 --> 01:05:15.225 knows what's gonna happen with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99086666  
01:05:15.225 --> 01:05:15.725 abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9823796  
01:05:16.745 --> 01:05:18.365 in the weeks ahead.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871176  
01:05:18.825 --> 01:05:20.425 So I I'm I'm hoping  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871176  
01:05:20.425 --> 01:05:21.640 that you might talk a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871176  
01:05:21.640 --> 01:05:23.320 little bit about structures that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871176  
01:05:23.320 --> 01:05:24.680 we could put in place  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871176  
01:05:24.680 --> 01:05:25.580 that would specifically  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99855185  
01:05:26.440 --> 01:05:28.380 allow physicians and the institutions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99855185  
01:05:28.520 --> 01:05:30.220 they work in to navigate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9729787  
01:05:30.920 --> 01:05:32.280 issues of conscience as they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9729787  
01:05:32.280 --> 01:05:33.640 might come up on a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9729787  
01:05:33.640 --> 01:05:35.100 daily basis in practice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9850787  
01:05:37.305 --> 01:05:37.805 Well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8537392  
01:05:41.464 --> 01:05:42.345 is there something you have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8537392

01:05:42.345 --> 01:05:43.185 in mind as a place  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8537392

01:05:43.185 --> 01:05:44.345 to Okay. So let's say  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8537392

01:05:44.345 --> 01:05:45.625 let's say you you wake  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8537392

01:05:45.625 --> 01:05:47.945 up tomorrow morning and you're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8537392

01:05:47.945 --> 01:05:49.325 a palliative care physician,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991854

01:05:49.865 --> 01:05:50.925 and you are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97937685

01:05:51.339 --> 01:05:53.119 deeply morally opposed to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9724835

01:05:53.500 --> 01:05:54.700 medical aid in dying, but  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9724835

01:05:54.700 --> 01:05:55.900 you happen to be on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9724835

01:05:55.900 --> 01:05:57.180 the faculty at a medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9724835

01:05:57.180 --> 01:05:57.680 center,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9375856

01:05:58.940 --> 01:06:00.619 where you live, work, own  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9375856

01:06:00.619 --> 01:06:01.680 a house and family.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9814952

01:06:02.540 --> 01:06:03.579 And now you're gonna have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9814952

01:06:03.579 --> 01:06:04.940 a whole series of patients  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9814952

01:06:04.940 --> 01:06:05.839 come to you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9748872

01:06:06.300 --> 01:06:08.005 and ask for medical aid

NOTE Confidence: 0.9748872

01:06:08.005 --> 01:06:09.525 in dying. And so the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9748872

01:06:09.525 --> 01:06:10.645 question is, what do you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9748872

01:06:10.645 --> 01:06:11.625 do now? Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93407416

01:06:12.405 --> 01:06:13.225 So good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9859938

01:06:14.405 --> 01:06:15.625 As part of the American

NOTE Confidence: 0.9859938

01:06:15.845 --> 01:06:16.825 political experiment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9953428

01:06:18.165 --> 01:06:19.685 for better and worse, we

NOTE Confidence: 0.9953428

01:06:19.685 --> 01:06:20.505 have had

NOTE Confidence: 0.81370664

01:06:22.020 --> 01:06:23.700 stronger than in most even

NOTE Confidence: 0.81370664

01:06:23.700 --> 01:06:25.380 including Western nations, a stronger

NOTE Confidence: 0.81370664

01:06:25.380 --> 01:06:26.440 emphasis on

NOTE Confidence: 0.8499183

01:06:26.740 --> 01:06:27.480 the state,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9387853

01:06:28.180 --> 01:06:29.780 on religious freedom, which has

NOTE Confidence: 0.9387853

01:06:29.780 --> 01:06:31.160 been interpreted to mean

NOTE Confidence: 0.9579688

01:06:31.620 --> 01:06:32.740 in the law to mean  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9579688

01:06:32.740 --> 01:06:34.315 the state cannot compel or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9579688

01:06:34.315 --> 01:06:35.595 coerce people to do things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9579688

01:06:35.595 --> 01:06:37.035 they believe are wrong. So  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9579688

01:06:37.035 --> 01:06:38.715 there's a strong tradition of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9579688

01:06:38.715 --> 01:06:39.695 that. And interestingly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96560276

01:06:40.315 --> 01:06:41.835 if you look at when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96560276

01:06:41.835 --> 01:06:43.455 when some practice that's controversial  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96560276

01:06:43.515 --> 01:06:44.635 like medical aid in dying  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96560276

01:06:44.635 --> 01:06:45.375 is passed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.82086116

01:06:45.675 --> 01:06:47.115 invariably in these states, say  
NOTE Confidence: 0.82086116

01:06:47.115 --> 01:06:47.615 California,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78860515

01:06:47.995 --> 01:06:48.895 Oregon, others,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93997985

01:06:49.329 --> 01:06:51.170 they include language that says  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93997985

01:06:51.170 --> 01:06:52.130 effectively you don't have to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93997985

01:06:52.130 --> 01:06:53.730 do this. Doctors don't nurses

NOTE Confidence: 0.93997985  
01:06:53.730 --> 01:06:54.770 don't have to cooperate in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93997985  
01:06:54.770 --> 01:06:56.150 this. It's only an option,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9742304  
01:06:56.530 --> 01:06:57.829 not something to be required.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93543476  
01:06:58.290 --> 01:06:59.329 But when what happens is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93543476  
01:06:59.329 --> 01:07:00.930 shortly after that, people start  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93543476  
01:07:00.930 --> 01:07:01.970 to argue it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706202  
01:07:02.415 --> 01:07:03.455 maybe the state didn't require  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706202  
01:07:03.455 --> 01:07:03.935 you to do it, but  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706202  
01:07:03.935 --> 01:07:04.734 it's wrong for you not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706202  
01:07:04.734 --> 01:07:05.455 to do it. As a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9706202  
01:07:05.455 --> 01:07:07.715 profession, we should we should,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98071826  
01:07:08.415 --> 01:07:10.035 push that. I I think,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98997587  
01:07:14.095 --> 01:07:15.855 the challenge that I encourage  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98997587  
01:07:15.855 --> 01:07:17.075 is is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994733  
01:07:17.799 --> 01:07:19.099 is to practice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9899313

01:07:20.519 --> 01:07:22.440 reasoning about and talking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.9899313

01:07:22.440 --> 01:07:23.720 with your colleagues and your

NOTE Confidence: 0.9899313

01:07:23.720 --> 01:07:24.220 patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.9355079

01:07:25.400 --> 01:07:26.519 why you practice the way

NOTE Confidence: 0.9355079

01:07:26.519 --> 01:07:28.039 you practice. And and I

NOTE Confidence: 0.9355079

01:07:28.200 --> 01:07:29.500 and it doesn't require

NOTE Confidence: 0.92919487

01:07:29.880 --> 01:07:30.779 a long discourses

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:31.079 --> 01:07:32.975 on lots of deep things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:33.195 --> 01:07:34.155 I will tell you I've

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:34.155 --> 01:07:35.855 told patients for for years

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:35.915 --> 01:07:36.955 when these issues come up

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:36.955 --> 01:07:37.835 about can't you make this

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:37.835 --> 01:07:39.755 go faster for for my

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:39.755 --> 01:07:41.115 mom. I don't like watching

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:41.115 --> 01:07:41.995 her like this. This is

NOTE Confidence: 0.97355217

01:07:41.995 --> 01:07:42.975 taking too long.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9905782  
01:07:43.755 --> 01:07:45.195 Ways that are respectful and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9905782  
01:07:45.195 --> 01:07:45.695 don't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9509946  
01:07:46.410 --> 01:07:47.770 don't suggest, you know, you're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9509946  
01:07:47.770 --> 01:07:48.809 some kind of horrible person  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9509946  
01:07:48.809 --> 01:07:49.609 because you're asking to do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9509946  
01:07:49.609 --> 01:07:50.410 something I can't in good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9509946  
01:07:50.410 --> 01:07:51.849 conscience do. But just just  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9509946  
01:07:51.849 --> 01:07:52.910 explain to them,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9744875  
01:07:54.329 --> 01:07:55.290 as I understand it, I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9744875  
01:07:55.290 --> 01:07:56.010 need to make sure I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9744875  
01:07:56.010 --> 01:07:56.890 act in a way that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9744875  
01:07:56.890 --> 01:07:58.670 consistent with your mom's health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98712903  
01:07:59.315 --> 01:08:00.355 And here's why I don't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98712903  
01:08:00.355 --> 01:08:01.715 think that is is something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98712903  
01:08:01.715 --> 01:08:02.595 that I can do or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98712903

01:08:02.595 --> 01:08:03.895 I'm I'm willing to do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98712903

01:08:04.035 --> 01:08:05.655 And I have found that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9943079

01:08:07.315 --> 01:08:07.815 patients,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999071

01:08:08.355 --> 01:08:09.255 family members,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9101097

01:08:09.795 --> 01:08:11.475 trainees that I'm training as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9101097

01:08:11.475 --> 01:08:13.415 bedside teaching all these years  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9101097

01:08:13.555 --> 01:08:14.295 and colleagues  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9981673

01:08:14.850 --> 01:08:15.590 get it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:15.970 --> 01:08:16.930 They may not agree with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:16.930 --> 01:08:18.530 it always, but they get  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:18.530 --> 01:08:20.050 it and they see that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:20.050 --> 01:08:21.330 I'm still committed. And this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:21.330 --> 01:08:22.930 I always encourage people, make  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:22.930 --> 01:08:24.370 clear you're committed to fulfilling  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:24.370 --> 01:08:25.830 your obligations as a physician.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:26.050 --> 01:08:27.330 You're not saying I wanna

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:27.330 --> 01:08:28.050 be a physician, but I

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:28.050 --> 01:08:28.930 don't wanna do what I

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:28.930 --> 01:08:30.045 know physicians ought to do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:30.125 --> 01:08:30.804 You're saying I wanna be

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:30.804 --> 01:08:31.885 a physician, and now physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:32.045 --> 01:08:33.085 some physicians are doing something

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:33.085 --> 01:08:33.804 that I I don't think

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:33.804 --> 01:08:34.844 is a good thing physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.93952906

01:08:34.844 --> 01:08:35.344 do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9867283

01:08:35.965 --> 01:08:37.324 People get that. They respect

NOTE Confidence: 0.9867283

01:08:37.324 --> 01:08:38.445 that. And if and if

NOTE Confidence: 0.9867283

01:08:38.445 --> 01:08:39.985 you continue in that way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9730458

01:08:41.005 --> 01:08:42.364 then you become a witness

NOTE Confidence: 0.9730458

01:08:42.364 --> 01:08:43.245 to a different way. So

NOTE Confidence: 0.9730458

01:08:43.245 --> 01:08:44.364 that means that people around

NOTE Confidence: 0.9730458

01:08:44.364 --> 01:08:45.564 you have to ask themselves,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9730458

01:08:45.564 --> 01:08:47.140 should I go go with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9730458

01:08:47.140 --> 01:08:47.800 that doctor's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96613884

01:08:48.100 --> 01:08:49.140 way? They don't they don't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96613884

01:08:49.140 --> 01:08:50.340 they don't participate. Or do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96613884

01:08:50.340 --> 01:08:51.380 I just go with the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96613884

01:08:51.380 --> 01:08:53.240 other? And that's that's healthy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:08:54.180 --> 01:08:55.780 to avoid a situation where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:08:55.780 --> 01:08:56.740 we just do things that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:08:56.740 --> 01:08:58.420 maybe judge thirty years later  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:08:58.420 --> 01:09:00.580 as wrong because everybody's doing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:09:00.580 --> 01:09:02.255 it. A practical thing would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:09:02.255 --> 01:09:04.094 be, say, our health care  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:09:04.094 --> 01:09:05.775 group had some physicians who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:09:05.775 --> 01:09:07.534 do, some physicians who don't,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88483334

01:09:07.534 --> 01:09:08.034 you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:08.574 --> 01:09:10.175 would presumably want the patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:10.175 --> 01:09:11.775 who come here to know

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:11.775 --> 01:09:13.455 which physician they're getting. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:13.455 --> 01:09:14.415 You might have to don't

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:14.415 --> 01:09:16.570 really give patients those choices.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:16.570 --> 01:09:17.530 You might you might have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:17.530 --> 01:09:19.050 to you might have to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9530767

01:09:19.050 --> 01:09:20.830 some way communicate that. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9789763

01:09:21.130 --> 01:09:22.350 Yes. Yes, please.

NOTE Confidence: 0.995933

01:09:24.250 --> 01:09:25.310 Hold it up close.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99938905

01:09:25.850 --> 01:09:27.210 So, I think we can

NOTE Confidence: 0.99938905

01:09:27.210 --> 01:09:29.064 all agree that there are

NOTE Confidence: 0.99938905

01:09:29.064 --> 01:09:30.285 some cases when

NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:30.745 --> 01:09:32.185 health we can all agree

NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:32.185 --> 01:09:34.185 that it's in someone's advantage.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:34.185 --> 01:09:35.305 Right? Like you mentioned, someone  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:35.305 --> 01:09:36.505 bleeding out, we all know  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:36.505 --> 01:09:37.225 you need to stop the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:37.225 --> 01:09:39.545 bleed. There's some blurry parts  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:39.545 --> 01:09:41.465 where it's transgender health care,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9829304

01:09:41.465 --> 01:09:41.965 abortions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.4617538

01:09:42.265 --> 01:09:42.765 where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9976624

01:09:43.939 --> 01:09:45.060 who are we to make  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9976624

01:09:45.060 --> 01:09:46.920 a judgment on someone's health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9976624

01:09:47.060 --> 01:09:48.680 when there is no concrete  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9976624

01:09:48.740 --> 01:09:50.500 evidence saying that it goes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9976624

01:09:50.500 --> 01:09:51.479 against their health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9431283

01:09:52.740 --> 01:09:54.100 when we might even have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9431283

01:09:54.100 --> 01:09:55.960 evidence that refusing someone  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9968392

01:09:56.685 --> 01:09:59.244 transgender affirming care goes against  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9968392

01:09:59.244 --> 01:09:59.744 their

NOTE Confidence: 0.90768486

01:10:00.284 --> 01:10:01.344 mental health being?

NOTE Confidence: 0.96188515

01:10:02.125 --> 01:10:04.445 Isn't it slightly patronizing then

NOTE Confidence: 0.96188515

01:10:04.445 --> 01:10:06.064 if we do refuse them

NOTE Confidence: 0.9792957

01:10:07.564 --> 01:10:08.604 some sort of health care

NOTE Confidence: 0.9792957

01:10:08.604 --> 01:10:10.380 because we don't think it

NOTE Confidence: 0.9792957

01:10:10.620 --> 01:10:11.580 is good for them, but

NOTE Confidence: 0.9792957

01:10:11.580 --> 01:10:12.939 there is no concrete evidence

NOTE Confidence: 0.9792957

01:10:12.939 --> 01:10:13.679 saying that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9722265

01:10:14.219 --> 01:10:15.580 And how would you then

NOTE Confidence: 0.9722265

01:10:15.580 --> 01:10:16.939 go about? Because we all

NOTE Confidence: 0.9722265

01:10:16.939 --> 01:10:17.979 try and not have that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9722265

01:10:17.979 --> 01:10:20.380 patronizing physician concept where who

NOTE Confidence: 0.9722265

01:10:20.380 --> 01:10:22.400 are we to determine that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97731674

01:10:22.805 --> 01:10:24.245 Yeah. I I'm glad you

NOTE Confidence: 0.97731674

01:10:24.245 --> 01:10:25.465 raised this question. So

NOTE Confidence: 0.97217834

01:10:26.325 --> 01:10:27.765 who are we to decide  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97217834

01:10:27.765 --> 01:10:28.965 that? It seems to me  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97217834

01:10:28.965 --> 01:10:30.085 we are the ones who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97217834

01:10:30.085 --> 01:10:31.125 are being asked to act  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97217834

01:10:31.125 --> 01:10:32.564 in a certain way. And  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97217834

01:10:32.564 --> 01:10:33.625 so we must  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97538716

01:10:33.925 --> 01:10:35.205 judge whether the way we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97538716

01:10:35.205 --> 01:10:35.865 are acting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9741282

01:10:36.560 --> 01:10:38.160 is consistent with how we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9741282

01:10:38.160 --> 01:10:38.980 ought to act.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.984211

01:10:39.440 --> 01:10:40.560 And in this case, it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.984211

01:10:40.560 --> 01:10:42.560 consistent with what we expect  
NOTE Confidence: 0.984211

01:10:42.560 --> 01:10:44.420 of ourselves as medical practitioners.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9916186

01:10:45.200 --> 01:10:46.320 That's a judgment each of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9916186

01:10:46.320 --> 01:10:47.300 us has to make.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99839497

01:10:48.160 --> 01:10:49.760 And just as a patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.99839497

01:10:49.760 --> 01:10:50.800 has to make a judgment

NOTE Confidence: 0.99839497

01:10:50.800 --> 01:10:51.700 about whether

NOTE Confidence: 0.9629485

01:10:52.005 --> 01:10:53.545 they ought to, in fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9629485

01:10:53.685 --> 01:10:55.225 seek some kind of intervention.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99698585

01:10:56.885 --> 01:10:57.845 So that's the who are

NOTE Confidence: 0.99698585

01:10:57.845 --> 01:10:58.585 we part.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9921657

01:11:00.405 --> 01:11:02.005 It is true that there

NOTE Confidence: 0.9921657

01:11:02.005 --> 01:11:02.805 are hard

NOTE Confidence: 0.81382847

01:11:03.205 --> 01:11:04.005 that there are there are

NOTE Confidence: 0.81382847

01:11:04.005 --> 01:11:05.125 obvious cases. You know, you

NOTE Confidence: 0.81382847

01:11:05.125 --> 01:11:05.865 have cancer,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9278498

01:11:06.540 --> 01:11:07.579 generally wanna get rid of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9278498

01:11:07.579 --> 01:11:08.079 it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89460975

01:11:08.780 --> 01:11:10.380 You're bleeding out, generally wanna

NOTE Confidence: 0.89460975

01:11:10.380 --> 01:11:12.300 stop that. Your septic, generally

NOTE Confidence: 0.89460975

01:11:12.300 --> 01:11:13.599 wanna kill the the bacteria.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689549

01:11:14.139 --> 01:11:14.939 There are things that are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689549

01:11:14.939 --> 01:11:16.300 really straightforward, and there are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9689549

01:11:16.300 --> 01:11:17.599 areas where it's blurry.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986682

01:11:18.219 --> 01:11:18.719 What  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9944545

01:11:19.715 --> 01:11:21.475 health requires, whether there's a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9944545

01:11:21.475 --> 01:11:22.455 dimension of health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98308545

01:11:22.995 --> 01:11:24.195 that's really at stake with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98308545

01:11:24.195 --> 01:11:26.135 a certain practice or not.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96123445

01:11:26.835 --> 01:11:27.795 It seems to me where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96123445

01:11:27.795 --> 01:11:29.075 it's blurry, we all the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96123445

01:11:29.075 --> 01:11:29.575 more  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9942947

01:11:30.275 --> 01:11:31.735 need to both  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9386973

01:11:32.520 --> 01:11:34.439 allow for clinicians to to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9386973

01:11:34.439 --> 01:11:35.559 have different come to different  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9386973

01:11:35.559 --> 01:11:36.059 judgments.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9993143  
01:11:37.000 --> 01:11:37.500 And  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92384493  
01:11:38.039 --> 01:11:38.780 as clinicians,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9732193  
01:11:39.800 --> 01:11:40.679 be be,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.972668  
01:11:41.960 --> 01:11:42.840 act in a way that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.972668  
01:11:42.840 --> 01:11:44.760 recognizes the blurriness and potentially  
NOTE Confidence: 0.972668  
01:11:44.760 --> 01:11:46.139 be be willing to flex,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9962774  
01:11:46.595 --> 01:11:47.475 you know, where you where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9962774  
01:11:47.475 --> 01:11:48.595 you're not certain that something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9962774  
01:11:48.595 --> 01:11:50.515 is problematic with respect to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9962774  
01:11:50.515 --> 01:11:51.415 someone's health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9711889  
01:11:52.515 --> 01:11:54.775 So something like referral for,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9711889  
01:11:54.915 --> 01:11:57.095 you know, the gender clinic,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173  
01:11:57.875 --> 01:11:58.755 I brought that up in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173  
01:11:58.755 --> 01:12:00.035 these cases just because it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173  
01:12:00.035 --> 01:12:01.475 it's a live question that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173

01:12:01.475 --> 01:12:02.790 being debated as as was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173

01:12:02.790 --> 01:12:04.470 noted here. And I I'll  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173

01:12:04.470 --> 01:12:05.270 just say I'm on the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173

01:12:05.270 --> 01:12:06.310 record as one who thinks  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173

01:12:06.310 --> 01:12:07.750 it's a the the gender  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97415173

01:12:07.750 --> 01:12:08.250 medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9964298

01:12:09.110 --> 01:12:10.490 project has been a mistake,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99576765

01:12:10.950 --> 01:12:12.630 particularly for young people. I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99576765

01:12:12.630 --> 01:12:14.630 think it is not the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99576765

01:12:14.630 --> 01:12:16.090 evidence is pretty clear  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9998895

01:12:16.725 --> 01:12:17.225 that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9972388

01:12:17.604 --> 01:12:19.284 we don't have evidence that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9972388

01:12:19.284 --> 01:12:20.665 medicalized gender transition  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776635

01:12:21.045 --> 01:12:22.564 improves mental health outcomes, which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776635

01:12:22.564 --> 01:12:23.864 is the point of it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776635

01:12:24.005 --> 01:12:25.445 in young people. And it

NOTE Confidence: 0.9776635

01:12:25.445 --> 01:12:26.985 clearly does medical harms,

NOTE Confidence: 0.91131586

01:12:27.525 --> 01:12:28.645 to people insofar as it

NOTE Confidence: 0.91131586

01:12:28.645 --> 01:12:29.145 blocks

NOTE Confidence: 0.99342024

01:12:29.604 --> 01:12:30.344 their maturation

NOTE Confidence: 0.99157524

01:12:30.645 --> 01:12:32.460 and makes people sterile while

NOTE Confidence: 0.99157524

01:12:32.460 --> 01:12:34.140 they're on cross sex hormones

NOTE Confidence: 0.99157524

01:12:34.140 --> 01:12:35.500 or puberty blockers and so

NOTE Confidence: 0.99157524

01:12:35.500 --> 01:12:36.000 on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.94002557

01:12:36.380 --> 01:12:37.740 That's my that's that's my

NOTE Confidence: 0.94002557

01:12:37.740 --> 01:12:39.100 judgment. But that I and

NOTE Confidence: 0.94002557

01:12:39.100 --> 01:12:39.740 I realized a lot of

NOTE Confidence: 0.94002557

01:12:39.740 --> 01:12:41.100 people disagree with that, particularly

NOTE Confidence: 0.94002557

01:12:41.100 --> 01:12:42.160 in the United States.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9732672

01:12:43.100 --> 01:12:44.300 Whether you agree or disagree,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9732672

01:12:44.300 --> 01:12:45.020 it seems to me the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9732672

01:12:45.020 --> 01:12:46.479 physician has got to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9967381

01:12:47.415 --> 01:12:48.535 has got to think and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9967381

01:12:48.535 --> 01:12:49.335 try to make a good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9967381

01:12:49.335 --> 01:12:49.835 judgment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97694325

01:12:50.295 --> 01:12:52.215 And if if the physician's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97694325

01:12:52.215 --> 01:12:52.715 judgments  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9813812

01:12:54.055 --> 01:12:56.615 become so clearly at odds  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9813812

01:12:56.615 --> 01:12:57.115 with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:12:57.575 --> 01:12:59.415 the collective's judgments about what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:12:59.415 --> 01:13:00.935 health requires, then the collective  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:00.935 --> 01:13:01.975 has got to discipline the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:01.975 --> 01:13:04.219 physician. I acknowledge that. But  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:04.219 --> 01:13:05.100 it seems to me they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:05.100 --> 01:13:06.380 should do so. If they're  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:06.380 --> 01:13:07.500 doing it reasonably, they'll do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:07.500 --> 01:13:08.800 so on the basis that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:09.020 --> 01:13:10.219 that action is not is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:10.219 --> 01:13:11.580 not consistent with a commitment

NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:11.580 --> 01:13:12.860 to the patient's health. Does

NOTE Confidence: 0.9719687

01:13:12.860 --> 01:13:13.920 that answer your question?

NOTE Confidence: 0.98596597

01:13:14.300 --> 01:13:15.735 Sort of. It doesn't make

NOTE Confidence: 0.98596597

01:13:15.735 --> 01:13:17.014 it I mean, it doesn't

NOTE Confidence: 0.98596597

01:13:17.014 --> 01:13:18.795 resolve the disagreements, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.98596597

01:13:19.014 --> 01:13:19.995 about these things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8841732

01:13:20.775 --> 01:13:21.995 Yes. Doctor Nathan.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9574712

01:13:24.534 --> 01:13:25.814 So I guess I have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9574712

01:13:25.814 --> 01:13:27.335 a kind of it in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9574712

01:13:27.335 --> 01:13:28.395 a way, it's a vocabulary

NOTE Confidence: 0.97227025

01:13:29.175 --> 01:13:29.675 question,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848154

01:13:30.620 --> 01:13:32.060 but it's probably more than

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848154

01:13:32.060 --> 01:13:33.820 that. Suppose I agree with

NOTE Confidence: 0.9848154

01:13:33.820 --> 01:13:35.340 you, which I don't, about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9848154

01:13:35.340 --> 01:13:36.560 your definition of health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9938116

01:13:37.340 --> 01:13:38.140 and I,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9872387

01:13:38.780 --> 01:13:39.280 am  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9986956

01:13:40.060 --> 01:13:40.800 a gerontologist  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97756225

01:13:41.260 --> 01:13:42.720 at a hospital in California.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999334

01:13:43.260 --> 01:13:44.800 And it's a religious hospital  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9098021

01:13:45.335 --> 01:13:47.435 where for explicitly religious reasons,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9098021

01:13:47.735 --> 01:13:49.354 certain services are not provided,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9098021

01:13:49.415 --> 01:13:50.875 like medical aid and dying  
NOTE Confidence: 0.7825746

01:13:51.335 --> 01:13:52.875 or for that matter vasectomy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.62764335

01:13:53.735 --> 01:13:54.235 K?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9975494

01:13:54.695 --> 01:13:56.554 And suppose that I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99458563

01:13:59.000 --> 01:14:00.120 want to break the rules  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99458563

01:14:00.120 --> 01:14:01.239 of the hospital where I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99458563

01:14:01.239 --> 01:14:02.300 have admitting privileges

NOTE Confidence: 0.9663654  
01:14:03.160 --> 01:14:04.540 and tell my patient  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99956125  
01:14:05.160 --> 01:14:06.140 about the opportunity  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99826103  
01:14:06.520 --> 01:14:08.200 at hospitals elsewhere in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99826103  
01:14:08.200 --> 01:14:08.700 area  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9938819  
01:14:09.080 --> 01:14:10.939 to get some of those  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9938819  
01:14:11.000 --> 01:14:11.500 services.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96021754  
01:14:12.915 --> 01:14:14.435 And, again, supposing as I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96021754  
01:14:14.435 --> 01:14:15.875 do not that I'm agreeing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96021754  
01:14:15.875 --> 01:14:17.074 with you on your definition  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96021754  
01:14:17.074 --> 01:14:18.854 of health. Am I allowed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96021754  
01:14:18.915 --> 01:14:19.574 to say  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99493676  
01:14:20.514 --> 01:14:22.215 that what I'm doing then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9697338  
01:14:22.994 --> 01:14:24.275 in telling my patient about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9697338  
01:14:24.275 --> 01:14:24.775 this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9995327  
01:14:26.040 --> 01:14:26.540 is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.91576934

01:14:26.920 --> 01:14:28.380 exercising my conscience?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999708

01:14:29.559 --> 01:14:30.840 Because it doesn't seem to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.999708

01:14:30.840 --> 01:14:32.460 be referred to your model  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99955255

01:14:32.840 --> 01:14:34.699 of medicine that is advancing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99955255

01:14:34.840 --> 01:14:35.340 health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.5436686

01:14:35.960 --> 01:14:36.460 It  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98663783

01:14:37.239 --> 01:14:38.679 can I say that for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98663783

01:14:38.679 --> 01:14:39.739 reasons of conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9595888

01:14:40.135 --> 01:14:42.475 I'm violating the Catholic hospital's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9994887

01:14:43.575 --> 01:14:44.075 rules  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897958

01:14:46.055 --> 01:14:47.335 in order to tell people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897958

01:14:47.335 --> 01:14:48.695 about procedures that are legal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897958

01:14:48.695 --> 01:14:50.215 in my state? Or can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897958

01:14:50.215 --> 01:14:51.095 I not or do I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897958

01:14:51.095 --> 01:14:52.055 have to call it something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9897958

01:14:52.055 --> 01:14:52.555 else

NOTE Confidence: 0.98735684  
01:14:52.870 --> 01:14:54.229 because I'm not thinking about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735684  
01:14:54.229 --> 01:14:56.070 advancing my patient's health when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735684  
01:14:56.070 --> 01:14:56.870 I want him to get  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98735684  
01:14:56.870 --> 01:14:57.530 a vasectomy?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880808  
01:14:58.229 --> 01:14:59.030 I want him to be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880808  
01:14:59.030 --> 01:14:59.750 able to get one if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880808  
01:14:59.750 --> 01:15:01.030 he wants it. No. Okay.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880808  
01:15:01.030 --> 01:15:01.910 I'm glad you brought this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880808  
01:15:01.910 --> 01:15:03.050 up. So  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99806803  
01:15:03.670 --> 01:15:04.650 if you believe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8334725  
01:15:05.935 --> 01:15:07.155 as all things considered  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95972955  
01:15:07.614 --> 01:15:08.735 that you must that it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95972955  
01:15:08.735 --> 01:15:09.535 is right, that you have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95972955  
01:15:09.535 --> 01:15:11.054 an ethical obligation to tell  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95972955  
01:15:11.054 --> 01:15:12.335 the patient about these services  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95972955

01:15:12.335 --> 01:15:13.935 offered at other hospital, then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95972955

01:15:13.935 --> 01:15:14.915 you must do that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96912026

01:15:15.775 --> 01:15:17.375 That that is that is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96912026

01:15:17.455 --> 01:15:18.814 you have I think that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96912026

01:15:18.814 --> 01:15:20.400 a sort of But would  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96912026

01:15:20.400 --> 01:15:21.280 you call it a matter  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96912026

01:15:21.280 --> 01:15:22.719 of conscience? Yeah. Absolutely. You  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96912026

01:15:22.719 --> 01:15:23.600 should say as a matter  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96912026

01:15:23.600 --> 01:15:24.180 of conscience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9984234

01:15:24.640 --> 01:15:25.680 I I have to break  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9984234

01:15:25.680 --> 01:15:27.219 this rule by this hospital.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9511374

01:15:27.920 --> 01:15:29.120 That is I mean, that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9511374

01:15:29.360 --> 01:15:30.960 the conscience is that that's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9511374

01:15:30.960 --> 01:15:32.400 this the example you give  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9511374

01:15:32.400 --> 01:15:33.620 just highlights that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9871786

01:15:34.025 --> 01:15:34.844 you can have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9691087

01:15:35.145 --> 01:15:36.744 conscientious people coming to judgments

NOTE Confidence: 0.9691087

01:15:36.744 --> 01:15:38.364 that are completely contradictory,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9762679

01:15:39.465 --> 01:15:40.344 and they could still be

NOTE Confidence: 0.9762679

01:15:40.344 --> 01:15:41.625 conscientious judgments. But what make

NOTE Confidence: 0.9762679

01:15:41.704 --> 01:15:42.824 what makes it conscientious is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9762679

01:15:42.824 --> 01:15:43.864 that it is your judgment

NOTE Confidence: 0.9762679

01:15:43.864 --> 01:15:44.744 about how you ought to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9762679

01:15:44.744 --> 01:15:46.185 act or not not to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9762679

01:15:46.185 --> 01:15:46.685 act.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:47.310 --> 01:15:48.670 Now the separate question is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:48.670 --> 01:15:50.429 whether the hospital owes you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:50.429 --> 01:15:51.949 some deference about that, you

NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:51.949 --> 01:15:53.790 know, which is separate. No.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:53.790 --> 01:15:54.590 I was I was just

NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:54.590 --> 01:15:55.869 really concerned because through your

NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:55.869 --> 01:15:57.090 talk, you seem to be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9881215

01:15:57.229 --> 01:15:59.409 pinning the idea of conscience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9995096

01:16:00.110 --> 01:16:01.250 What makes it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9776926

01:16:01.655 --> 01:16:03.755 a matter of conscientious objection,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99764925

01:16:05.175 --> 01:16:06.375 you seem to be pinning  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99764925

01:16:06.375 --> 01:16:07.115 it to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9595612

01:16:07.495 --> 01:16:09.255 this concept of advancing the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9595612

01:16:09.255 --> 01:16:11.015 patient's health. Oh, no. That  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9595612

01:16:11.095 --> 01:16:12.375 I I'm that's a mistake  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9595612

01:16:12.375 --> 01:16:13.415 that I if I did,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9595612

01:16:13.415 --> 01:16:14.455 I I certainly did not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9595612

01:16:14.455 --> 01:16:15.755 intend to apply that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9995558

01:16:16.800 --> 01:16:18.100 I think that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:18.640 --> 01:16:20.240 the the the conscious as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:20.240 --> 01:16:21.520 I would described, and then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:21.520 --> 01:16:23.220 the question comes for people

NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:23.439 --> 01:16:24.800 trying to maintain a profession

NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:24.800 --> 01:16:25.920 that has some coherence in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:25.920 --> 01:16:26.800 order and trying to make

NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:26.800 --> 01:16:27.920 sure people get what they

NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:27.920 --> 01:16:29.520 should get and that people

NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:29.520 --> 01:16:30.479 have the kind of freedom

NOTE Confidence: 0.9383766

01:16:30.479 --> 01:16:31.380 they should have.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99965054

01:16:31.825 --> 01:16:32.645 They have to

NOTE Confidence: 0.91012436

01:16:33.025 --> 01:16:35.025 ask, well, what what sorts

NOTE Confidence: 0.91012436

01:16:35.025 --> 01:16:36.805 of refusals should we allow?

NOTE Confidence: 0.91012436

01:16:37.025 --> 01:16:38.385 Consciousness refusals should we allow

NOTE Confidence: 0.91012436

01:16:38.385 --> 01:16:39.345 and what sort of shouldn't

NOTE Confidence: 0.91012436

01:16:39.345 --> 01:16:39.845 we?

NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:40.225 --> 01:16:41.185 And it seems to me

NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:41.185 --> 01:16:42.385 that the standard they should

NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:42.385 --> 01:16:43.765 use if they're being reasonable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:43.825 --> 01:16:45.845 is is that refusal compatible  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:45.905 --> 01:16:47.880 with a person's commitment to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:47.880 --> 01:16:49.080 to act according to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:49.080 --> 01:16:50.200 patient's health what the patient's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96557635

01:16:50.200 --> 01:16:50.860 health requires?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628572

01:16:51.640 --> 01:16:52.600 That if you if you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628572

01:16:52.600 --> 01:16:53.960 say we're going some other  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628572

01:16:53.960 --> 01:16:55.479 standard like, well, they that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628572

01:16:55.479 --> 01:16:57.000 refusal is only acceptable if  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628572

01:16:57.000 --> 01:16:57.500 it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.998953

01:16:59.385 --> 01:17:00.045 if it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99401104

01:17:00.665 --> 01:17:01.325 a really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95650697

01:17:02.265 --> 01:17:03.225 you know, it's a it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95650697

01:17:03.225 --> 01:17:04.525 for a medical reason  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9100317

01:17:05.225 --> 01:17:06.665 where you then define medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.9100317

01:17:06.665 --> 01:17:07.945 reason in this arbitrary ways

NOTE Confidence: 0.9100317

01:17:07.945 --> 01:17:08.845 that I described,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96705645

01:17:09.225 --> 01:17:10.265 then you're gonna end up

NOTE Confidence: 0.96705645

01:17:10.265 --> 01:17:11.064 with, as I think is

NOTE Confidence: 0.96705645

01:17:11.064 --> 01:17:12.345 the case now, a kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.96705645

01:17:12.345 --> 01:17:13.805 of unjust and arbitrary

NOTE Confidence: 0.99939936

01:17:15.330 --> 01:17:16.390 picking and choosing

NOTE Confidence: 0.98411274

01:17:17.410 --> 01:17:18.310 that is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9607341

01:17:18.850 --> 01:17:20.130 that it basically just reflects

NOTE Confidence: 0.9607341

01:17:20.130 --> 01:17:21.670 whatever peep the general sensibilities

NOTE Confidence: 0.9607341

01:17:21.729 --> 01:17:22.689 are of the people in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9607341

01:17:22.689 --> 01:17:23.189 power

NOTE Confidence: 0.93265

01:17:23.650 --> 01:17:24.390 rather than

NOTE Confidence: 0.99729115

01:17:24.850 --> 01:17:26.850 a principled recognition that some

NOTE Confidence: 0.99729115

01:17:26.850 --> 01:17:28.150 things are clearly required

NOTE Confidence: 0.9982791

01:17:28.770 --> 01:17:29.270 for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96322894

01:17:29.845 --> 01:17:30.564 attending to people who are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96322894

01:17:30.564 --> 01:17:31.385 sick and injured.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9971275

01:17:31.765 --> 01:17:32.645 And then there are areas  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9971275

01:17:32.645 --> 01:17:33.145 of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9018571

01:17:33.925 --> 01:17:36.005 disagreement and margin, which is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9018571

01:17:36.005 --> 01:17:37.845 not obviously required. And in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9018571

01:17:37.845 --> 01:17:38.985 those areas, we should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9959945

01:17:39.445 --> 01:17:40.905 we should allow people to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9959945

01:17:41.125 --> 01:17:42.085 refuse to do things they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9959945

01:17:42.085 --> 01:17:43.125 don't think are consistent with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9959945

01:17:43.125 --> 01:17:43.625 medicine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9644094

01:17:44.469 --> 01:17:45.429 So let me ask a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9644094

01:17:45.429 --> 01:17:46.409 question from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9858823

01:17:46.790 --> 01:17:48.570 the, Zoom audience, please.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9655962

01:17:49.270 --> 01:17:50.469 In the way of medicine

NOTE Confidence: 0.9655962

01:17:50.469 --> 01:17:52.070 model, how do patients who

NOTE Confidence: 0.9655962

01:17:52.070 --> 01:17:53.449 disagree with their physician

NOTE Confidence: 0.99720067

01:17:53.989 --> 01:17:54.729 move toward

NOTE Confidence: 0.99899966

01:17:55.270 --> 01:17:56.570 preserving their health?

NOTE Confidence: 0.90993947

01:17:59.155 --> 01:18:00.695 Good. Well, so

NOTE Confidence: 0.96967083

01:18:02.675 --> 01:18:03.495 in the model,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:03.795 --> 01:18:05.395 they they if if they

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:05.395 --> 01:18:06.995 encounter a physician who's practicing

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:06.995 --> 01:18:07.635 according to the way of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:07.635 --> 01:18:08.835 medicine, they they encounter a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:08.835 --> 01:18:10.515 physician who's committed to acting

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:10.515 --> 01:18:11.475 in a way that's consistent

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:11.475 --> 01:18:12.349 with their health, but they

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:12.349 --> 01:18:13.550 can have a disagreement about

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:13.550 --> 01:18:14.750 that. I mean, that frequently

NOTE Confidence: 0.9644544

01:18:14.750 --> 01:18:15.250 happens.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628345

01:18:15.869 --> 01:18:16.590 And then I think the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9628345

01:18:16.590 --> 01:18:18.289 patient makes their case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9953395

01:18:18.909 --> 01:18:20.110 and the physician, if she's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9953395

01:18:20.110 --> 01:18:20.849 a good physician,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9950755

01:18:21.150 --> 01:18:23.070 listens attentively and is willing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9950755

01:18:23.070 --> 01:18:23.809 to reconsider  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9735517

01:18:24.695 --> 01:18:26.075 if if there's new information  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9735517

01:18:26.135 --> 01:18:27.575 that is relevant that might  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9735517

01:18:27.575 --> 01:18:28.555 change her calculation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9932263

01:18:30.215 --> 01:18:31.275 And they negotiate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89045703

01:18:32.695 --> 01:18:33.895 a way to afford that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89045703

01:18:33.895 --> 01:18:35.275 they both can live with,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89045703

01:18:35.335 --> 01:18:36.135 that they both  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9376908

01:18:37.550 --> 01:18:38.290 you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:38.830 --> 01:18:40.030 Mark Seager used to call

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:40.030 --> 01:18:41.390 it the physician patient accommodation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:41.390 --> 01:18:41.870 I think it was a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:41.870 --> 01:18:43.550 helpful concept. They try to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:43.550 --> 01:18:44.990 negotiate a way forward that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:44.990 --> 01:18:46.430 they both think is involves

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:46.430 --> 01:18:47.230 both of them acting in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:47.230 --> 01:18:48.850 a way that's sensible. That's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:48.910 --> 01:18:51.070 that's good. And sometimes they

NOTE Confidence: 0.9593042

01:18:51.070 --> 01:18:51.570 can't.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98080194

01:18:52.095 --> 01:18:53.375 And in those cases, they

NOTE Confidence: 0.98080194

01:18:53.375 --> 01:18:55.155 peaceably sometimes have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9791405

01:18:55.695 --> 01:18:57.215 to separate, and the patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.9791405

01:18:57.215 --> 01:18:58.175 tries to find a different

NOTE Confidence: 0.9791405

01:18:58.175 --> 01:18:58.675 doctor.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80511016

01:19:00.655 --> 01:19:01.875 Yes. Alexis.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95992607

01:19:06.070 --> 01:19:06.870 Up here. Raise your hand  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95992607

01:19:06.870 --> 01:19:07.429 up high so we can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95992607

01:19:07.429 --> 01:19:08.090 find you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87433416

01:19:13.270 --> 01:19:14.010 I'm wondering,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99799407

01:19:14.870 --> 01:19:15.989 you know, as people have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99799407

01:19:15.989 --> 01:19:16.790 said, it seems like a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99799407

01:19:16.790 --> 01:19:17.750 lot of this depends on  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99799407

01:19:17.750 --> 01:19:19.050 this definition of health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99611735

01:19:19.365 --> 01:19:20.985 I'm wondering what happens,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9531059

01:19:21.765 --> 01:19:22.985 in a case where,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98688114

01:19:23.765 --> 01:19:24.965 say, the science has settled  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98688114

01:19:24.965 --> 01:19:26.485 the matter on a certain  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98688114

01:19:26.485 --> 01:19:27.625 procedure or intervention  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9326332

01:19:28.245 --> 01:19:29.685 being necessary for someone's health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9326332

01:19:29.685 --> 01:19:30.665 and yet still  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96565086

01:19:31.205 --> 01:19:33.625 somebody's religious beliefs or conscience

NOTE Confidence: 0.9665128  
01:19:34.689 --> 01:19:35.969 is an objection? How how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9665128  
01:19:35.969 --> 01:19:36.869 then do we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99833345  
01:19:37.170 --> 01:19:37.909 move forward?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:38.849 --> 01:19:39.969 So this is where I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:39.969 --> 01:19:41.889 think really the the details  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:41.889 --> 01:19:43.250 matter. Because there's wait. Go  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:43.250 --> 01:19:44.210 ahead, Alexa. Is there is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:44.210 --> 01:19:45.329 there some is there an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:45.329 --> 01:19:46.289 example that come to your  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:46.289 --> 01:19:47.585 mind? Well, I mean I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:47.585 --> 01:19:49.364 think the issue of abortion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9499046  
01:19:49.425 --> 01:19:51.445 perhaps I especially in America  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8000115  
01:19:51.985 --> 01:19:52.645 I think,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9191419  
01:19:53.905 --> 01:19:55.265 it's becoming clear like health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9191419  
01:19:55.344 --> 01:19:56.945 like a pregnancy is is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9191419

01:19:56.945 --> 01:19:58.385 not a health neutral event.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9191419

01:19:58.385 --> 01:19:59.985 Right? Like it could be,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95421296

01:20:02.160 --> 01:20:03.040 there are many cases where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95421296

01:20:03.040 --> 01:20:04.320 pregnancy could be highly detrimental  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95421296

01:20:04.320 --> 01:20:06.580 to someone's health and yet  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95421296

01:20:06.719 --> 01:20:07.460 an abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9443393

01:20:08.239 --> 01:20:09.600 you know, is potentially a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9443393

01:20:09.600 --> 01:20:11.219 settled matter as a necessary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9443393

01:20:11.360 --> 01:20:13.679 intervention. And yet still potentially  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9443393

01:20:13.679 --> 01:20:14.660 somebody's religious  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96573114

01:20:15.120 --> 01:20:16.179 beliefs about abortion,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97783333

01:20:17.685 --> 01:20:18.724 could come in conflict with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97783333

01:20:18.724 --> 01:20:19.224 that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99251974

01:20:21.125 --> 01:20:21.625 Yeah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99871576

01:20:22.564 --> 01:20:23.064 So  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9293378

01:20:23.764 --> 01:20:25.045 I will I I spent

NOTE Confidence: 0.9293378  
01:20:25.045 --> 01:20:25.945 a lot of time  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9989315  
01:20:26.405 --> 01:20:27.764 working in the area of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9989315  
01:20:27.764 --> 01:20:28.724 abortion for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9525764  
01:20:31.310 --> 01:20:33.070 I personally have not met  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9525764  
01:20:33.070 --> 01:20:34.510 or encountered a an OB  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9525764  
01:20:34.510 --> 01:20:35.010 GYN,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9358655  
01:20:36.510 --> 01:20:38.270 or other physician frankly that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9358655  
01:20:38.270 --> 01:20:40.450 would not act as necessary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9358655  
01:20:40.510 --> 01:20:41.950 to preserve a woman's health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9358655  
01:20:41.950 --> 01:20:43.650 including by ending the pregnancy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90236086  
01:20:44.145 --> 01:20:45.385 If there was a in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90236086  
01:20:45.385 --> 01:20:46.165 in their judgment,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9240116  
01:20:47.104 --> 01:20:48.805 a proportionally grave threat.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84514856  
01:20:51.665 --> 01:20:52.645 That being said,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93110746  
01:20:53.425 --> 01:20:55.104 abortions that are not medically  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93110746

01:20:55.104 --> 01:20:56.305 required, that are not matter

NOTE Confidence: 0.93110746

01:20:56.305 --> 01:20:57.365 of medical emergency,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9932546

01:20:58.225 --> 01:20:59.345 lots of people will not

NOTE Confidence: 0.9932546

01:20:59.345 --> 01:21:00.639 do. And it seems to

NOTE Confidence: 0.9932546

01:21:00.639 --> 01:21:02.099 me that they have

NOTE Confidence: 0.99876595

01:21:02.639 --> 01:21:03.219 a reasonable

NOTE Confidence: 0.9998753

01:21:03.679 --> 01:21:04.179 argument

NOTE Confidence: 0.9954191

01:21:04.880 --> 01:21:05.920 that they do not do

NOTE Confidence: 0.9954191

01:21:05.920 --> 01:21:06.739 that because

NOTE Confidence: 0.99878913

01:21:07.920 --> 01:21:08.420 pregnancy

NOTE Confidence: 0.95569015

01:21:08.880 --> 01:21:10.239 is a state of health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.95569015

01:21:10.239 --> 01:21:11.039 It is a it is

NOTE Confidence: 0.95569015

01:21:11.039 --> 01:21:12.320 brings it does bring real

NOTE Confidence: 0.95569015

01:21:12.320 --> 01:21:14.000 health risks. No question about

NOTE Confidence: 0.95569015

01:21:14.000 --> 01:21:16.135 it. People die from giving

NOTE Confidence: 0.95569015

01:21:16.135 --> 01:21:16.635 birth.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9970428

01:21:17.574 --> 01:21:18.635 But it is also

NOTE Confidence: 0.98299026

01:21:18.935 --> 01:21:20.534 a reflection of health and

NOTE Confidence: 0.98299026

01:21:20.534 --> 01:21:21.255 a state of health. And

NOTE Confidence: 0.98299026

01:21:21.255 --> 01:21:22.854 when someone is pregnant, continuing

NOTE Confidence: 0.98299026

01:21:22.854 --> 01:21:24.155 the pregnancy is what

NOTE Confidence: 0.99642247

01:21:24.695 --> 01:21:25.675 what we expect

NOTE Confidence: 0.9932808

01:21:26.295 --> 01:21:27.655 to happen in someone who's

NOTE Confidence: 0.9932808

01:21:27.655 --> 01:21:28.155 healthy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97227275

01:21:28.950 --> 01:21:29.910 And then, of course, that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.97227275

01:21:29.910 --> 01:21:30.870 that's before you get to

NOTE Confidence: 0.97227275

01:21:30.870 --> 01:21:31.830 the question of whether what

NOTE Confidence: 0.97227275

01:21:31.830 --> 01:21:32.870 obligations we owe to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.97227275

01:21:32.870 --> 01:21:33.370 fetus,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9493522

01:21:34.229 --> 01:21:34.729 which,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9564674

01:21:36.229 --> 01:21:37.430 if you could you'd consider

NOTE Confidence: 0.9564674

01:21:37.430 --> 01:21:38.710 the fetus a second patient,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9564674

01:21:38.710 --> 01:21:39.670 then you have a problem  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9564674

01:21:39.670 --> 01:21:40.550 of acting in a way  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9564674

01:21:40.550 --> 01:21:41.830 that's consistent with the fetus'  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9564674

01:21:41.830 --> 01:21:42.330 health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9669559

01:21:42.935 --> 01:21:44.215 So I I think in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9669559

01:21:44.215 --> 01:21:44.715 principle,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9991628

01:21:45.575 --> 01:21:46.795 if there's an area  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9301247

01:21:47.495 --> 01:21:49.275 where clear there's really clear  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9301247

01:21:49.335 --> 01:21:51.035 what health requires,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9171718

01:21:51.895 --> 01:21:53.814 then just it just that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9171718

01:21:53.814 --> 01:21:54.314 far,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99962044

01:21:54.695 --> 01:21:55.195 authorities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8116559

01:21:55.495 --> 01:21:55.995 have,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97770107

01:21:58.030 --> 01:21:59.870 they have good reason to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97770107

01:21:59.870 --> 01:22:01.070 make sure that that's happening

NOTE Confidence: 0.97770107  
01:22:01.070 --> 01:22:01.630 by all the people who  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97770107  
01:22:01.630 --> 01:22:03.070 put themselves forward as medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97770107  
01:22:03.070 --> 01:22:03.570 practitioners.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99919957  
01:22:04.270 --> 01:22:04.770 But  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880344  
01:22:05.550 --> 01:22:06.350 when you have a bunch  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880344  
01:22:06.350 --> 01:22:07.630 of medical practitioners saying, I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880344  
01:22:07.630 --> 01:22:08.350 don't think that's a good  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880344  
01:22:08.350 --> 01:22:09.630 idea, it's usually because it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9880344  
01:22:09.630 --> 01:22:10.610 not so obvious.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.95268905  
01:22:13.604 --> 01:22:14.505 But yeah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8955218  
01:22:15.045 --> 01:22:16.245 So if so just to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8955218  
01:22:16.245 --> 01:22:17.045 follow-up in that little bit.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8955218  
01:22:17.045 --> 01:22:18.325 So if pregnancy is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8955218  
01:22:18.325 --> 01:22:19.845 a reflection of health and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8955218  
01:22:19.845 --> 01:22:20.645 and I and I don't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8955218

01:22:20.645 --> 01:22:22.165 disagree, then it seems it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8955218

01:22:22.165 --> 01:22:23.305 would fall that infertility  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9974826

01:22:24.085 --> 01:22:24.585 is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8183226

01:22:25.205 --> 01:22:26.505 a reflection of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89330924

01:22:28.099 --> 01:22:29.320 a deficit in health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:29.699 --> 01:22:31.059 And then for, you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:31.059 --> 01:22:32.900 since infertility treatments, which you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:32.900 --> 01:22:34.020 which you cited earlier in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:34.020 --> 01:22:34.979 the talk, where this is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:34.979 --> 01:22:36.420 not something would necessarily be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:36.420 --> 01:22:37.860 needed to promote the patient's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:37.860 --> 01:22:39.780 health. If pregnancy is health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:39.780 --> 01:22:41.300 then infertility strikes me as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9440687

01:22:41.300 --> 01:22:42.465 treating infertility is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8705425

01:22:43.104 --> 01:22:44.545 promoting a patient's health. Yeah.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8705425

01:22:44.545 --> 01:22:45.744 And I I think this

NOTE Confidence: 0.8705425  
01:22:45.744 --> 01:22:46.224 gets,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9596192  
01:22:46.545 --> 01:22:47.985 into this issue. I think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9596192  
01:22:47.985 --> 01:22:49.824 you're right insofar as what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9596192  
01:22:49.824 --> 01:22:51.205 you're doing is seeking to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9596192  
01:22:51.505 --> 01:22:53.505 preserve or restore some aspects,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9596192  
01:22:53.505 --> 01:22:54.864 some dimension, some feature of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9596192  
01:22:54.864 --> 01:22:55.364 health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98871803  
01:22:55.665 --> 01:22:56.564 that would make  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9965663  
01:22:57.000 --> 01:22:58.219 pregnancy more possible.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98341537  
01:22:58.679 --> 01:22:59.800 What I spoke about was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98341537  
01:22:59.800 --> 01:23:00.939 in vitro fertilization,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94182646  
01:23:01.719 --> 01:23:03.559 which is actually in I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94182646  
01:23:03.559 --> 01:23:05.739 think doesn't end around health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9728068  
01:23:06.119 --> 01:23:07.719 to achieve a baby, which  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9728068  
01:23:07.719 --> 01:23:08.679 is a good thing. Babies  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9728068

01:23:08.679 --> 01:23:09.960 are good things. But it's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9728068

01:23:09.960 --> 01:23:11.179 not it doesn't go.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8228686

01:23:11.854 --> 01:23:12.354 IV  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9865252

01:23:12.735 --> 01:23:13.875 IVF doesn't go about,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99415386

01:23:14.814 --> 01:23:16.175 restoring an aspect of health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99415386

01:23:16.175 --> 01:23:18.035 It goes about working with,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9982114

01:23:18.655 --> 01:23:19.314 you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99861026

01:23:20.415 --> 01:23:20.915 the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99472886

01:23:21.215 --> 01:23:22.435 the whatever  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99598056

01:23:22.735 --> 01:23:23.854 limits of health that a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99598056

01:23:23.854 --> 01:23:24.675 person has  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99987245

01:23:25.270 --> 01:23:25.929 to try  
NOTE Confidence: 0.94672596

01:23:26.310 --> 01:23:28.250 to, you know, generate,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.98726416

01:23:29.350 --> 01:23:30.010 a baby.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9665254

01:23:32.630 --> 01:23:34.150 We have this gentleman right  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9665254

01:23:34.150 --> 01:23:35.189 here. We'll have the final

NOTE Confidence: 0.9665254

01:23:35.189 --> 01:23:36.409 question of the day, please.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9665254

01:23:36.469 --> 01:23:37.670 And I apologize to everybody

NOTE Confidence: 0.9665254

01:23:37.670 --> 01:23:38.710 else. Yeah. Please, the fellow

NOTE Confidence: 0.9665254

01:23:38.710 --> 01:23:39.530 in the gray

NOTE Confidence: 0.98125935

01:23:40.275 --> 01:23:41.895 shirt. And then I apologize

NOTE Confidence: 0.98125935

01:23:42.115 --> 01:23:43.235 to many others who had

NOTE Confidence: 0.98125935

01:23:43.235 --> 01:23:44.275 something they wanted to ask.

NOTE Confidence: 0.98125935

01:23:44.275 --> 01:23:45.795 Go ahead, please. Hi. In

NOTE Confidence: 0.98125935

01:23:45.795 --> 01:23:46.615 your model,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95004874

01:23:48.595 --> 01:23:50.595 how would, like, something like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.95004874

01:23:50.595 --> 01:23:51.955 for example, COVID vaccines, a

NOTE Confidence: 0.95004874

01:23:51.955 --> 01:23:52.995 lot of people had religious

NOTE Confidence: 0.95004874

01:23:52.995 --> 01:23:54.354 problems with COVID vaccines because

NOTE Confidence: 0.95004874

01:23:54.354 --> 01:23:54.960 of the way they were

NOTE Confidence: 0.95004874

01:23:55.040 --> 01:23:55.540 developed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.998279

01:23:55.920 --> 01:23:57.120 How would the science that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.998279

01:23:57.120 --> 01:23:57.780 is used  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9327431

01:23:58.400 --> 01:23:59.939 to come to treatments,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9875535

01:24:00.320 --> 01:24:01.380 like if a physician  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9611882

01:24:02.080 --> 01:24:03.360 objects the way that like  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9611882

01:24:03.360 --> 01:24:04.800 a treatment that is objectively  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9611882

01:24:04.800 --> 01:24:06.020 beneficial to patients  
NOTE Confidence: 0.884611

01:24:06.560 --> 01:24:07.300 is discovered,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97172064

01:24:08.225 --> 01:24:09.345 would your model allow for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97172064

01:24:09.345 --> 01:24:10.785 a physician to object it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97172064

01:24:10.785 --> 01:24:12.225 on those grounds? That's a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97172064

01:24:12.225 --> 01:24:12.885 good question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88851756

01:24:15.505 --> 01:24:16.005 So  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99463344

01:24:18.785 --> 01:24:20.064 the question of whether an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99463344

01:24:20.064 --> 01:24:21.665 action is consistent with or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.99463344

01:24:21.665 --> 01:24:22.725 conducive to

NOTE Confidence: 0.99836344  
01:24:23.120 --> 01:24:23.780 a patient's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90082115  
01:24:24.400 --> 01:24:25.620 health, I think is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.90082115  
01:24:25.680 --> 01:24:26.260 a central  
NOTE Confidence: 0.96369416  
01:24:26.800 --> 01:24:27.300 criterion  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9714238  
01:24:27.600 --> 01:24:28.960 in physician's judgment about how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9714238  
01:24:28.960 --> 01:24:30.000 they ought to act. It's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9714238  
01:24:30.000 --> 01:24:31.060 not the only criterion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9467407  
01:24:32.080 --> 01:24:33.439 There can be other criterions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9467407  
01:24:33.439 --> 01:24:34.180 like fairness,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9703794  
01:24:36.245 --> 01:24:37.625 you know, truth telling,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712177  
01:24:39.685 --> 01:24:41.205 fulfilling obligations you have that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712177  
01:24:41.205 --> 01:24:42.725 are you have particular kinds  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712177  
01:24:42.725 --> 01:24:44.165 of obligations to certain groups  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712177  
01:24:44.165 --> 01:24:45.145 and not to others.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97329605  
01:24:48.005 --> 01:24:49.200 The the question of, like,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97329605

01:24:49.360 --> 01:24:51.040 the provenance of a vaccine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97329605

01:24:51.120 --> 01:24:51.840 I know in in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97329605

01:24:51.840 --> 01:24:53.440 COVID thing, there was the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97329605

01:24:53.440 --> 01:24:54.720 there was the concern by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.97329605

01:24:54.720 --> 01:24:56.500 some that it was using,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9932618

01:24:57.520 --> 01:24:58.260 you know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.68865234

01:24:58.720 --> 01:24:59.220 effectively  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9810127

01:24:59.760 --> 01:25:00.960 the product of stem cells  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9810127

01:25:00.960 --> 01:25:02.365 that were originally harvested from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9810127

01:25:02.365 --> 01:25:04.225 a from a aborted fetus.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9051715

01:25:09.485 --> 01:25:10.365 It seemed to me in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9051715

01:25:10.365 --> 01:25:11.425 that case that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.987795

01:25:11.965 --> 01:25:12.465 the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295

01:25:12.925 --> 01:25:13.885 the way the way these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295

01:25:13.885 --> 01:25:14.845 are often thought of by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295

01:25:14.845 --> 01:25:15.689 people who care about these

NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295  
01:25:15.689 --> 01:25:16.489 sorts of things is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295  
01:25:16.489 --> 01:25:17.790 question of does your action  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295  
01:25:18.090 --> 01:25:19.390 involve a kind of cooperation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295  
01:25:19.530 --> 01:25:20.570 that makes you complicit in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.93888295  
01:25:20.570 --> 01:25:21.870 the evil that was done?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9933263  
01:25:22.489 --> 01:25:23.630 And in that case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9614687  
01:25:25.050 --> 01:25:26.489 it seemed to me pretty  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9614687  
01:25:26.489 --> 01:25:27.870 clear that it didn't,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9712274  
01:25:28.330 --> 01:25:28.830 personally.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9738006  
01:25:30.515 --> 01:25:32.115 And I don't know. I  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9738006  
01:25:32.115 --> 01:25:33.555 mean, I haven't seen a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9738006  
01:25:33.555 --> 01:25:34.835 case where a doctor is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9738006  
01:25:34.835 --> 01:25:36.835 refusing to provide vaccines based  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9738006  
01:25:36.835 --> 01:25:37.955 on that. There probably is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9738006  
01:25:37.955 --> 01:25:38.854 someone out there,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9983854

01:25:39.395 --> 01:25:39.895 but

NOTE Confidence: 0.9572856

01:25:43.380 --> 01:25:44.420 I'm not sure quite how

NOTE Confidence: 0.9572856

01:25:44.420 --> 01:25:45.479 that'd be handled, honestly.

NOTE Confidence: 0.99424285

01:25:46.580 --> 01:25:47.320 Good question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.96232945

01:25:47.939 --> 01:25:49.620 Well, this has been an

NOTE Confidence: 0.96232945

01:25:49.620 --> 01:25:51.140 incredible session. Thank you so

NOTE Confidence: 0.96232945

01:25:51.140 --> 01:25:52.520 much, Scott, for us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9989179

01:25:52.900 --> 01:25:53.640 Thank you.